



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

Trinity College Dublin

The University of Dublin

EQUALITY COMMITTEE

Approved Minutes

Meeting 16 March 2016, 2pm, Sports Centre Boardroom

Present: Chair (Dr C McCabe), Dr J Walsh, Mr M McKeown, Ms G Hegarty (GSU), Mr J Cumiskey, Ms S MacBride, Mr D Treanor, Dr M Cuypers, Ms S Brennan, Ms K O'Toole-Brennan, Mr C Clancy (SU), Secretary / Equality Officer (Ms A Crawford)

Apologies: Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Prof L Hogan), Dr Inmaculada Arnedillo-Sánchez, Prof M McCarron

Eqal/15-16/037

Opening

Chair

The Chair opened the meeting and apologies were taken.

Eqal/15-16/038

Minutes of the previous meeting

Chair

It was noted that Mr M McKeown was erroneously omitted from the list of members present at the previous meeting. The minutes of the previous Equality Committee meeting on 21 January 2016 were approved subject to this error being corrected.

Action: Equality Officer to amend minutes of 21 January 2016 meeting as advised, before publication.

Eqal/15-16/039

Matters arising

Chair

The committee were informed that the Dignity and Respect Policy must be approved by the HR committee before it can be approved by Board. It was agreed that the Dignity and Respect Policy, once approved by the HR committee, should be reviewed by the Equality Committee and presented to Board by the Equality Committee Chair.

The Chair reported to the committee on the Board's discussion of the 2014/15 Equality Data Monitoring Report at its meeting of 24 February 2016. It was noted that further discussion is expected to follow the presentation of the report entitled 'Gender and Trinity Staff: Trends in Populations, Recruitment and Progression' to the Board on 23 March 2016.

There were no other matters arising.

Action: Equality Officer to liaise with HR Committee Secretary to arrange the approval process of the Dignity and Respect Policy.

Eqal/15-16/040

Action call-over

Equality Officer

The Action Call-over was taken as read - all actions are completed or ongoing.

The following updates on ongoing actions were provided to the committee:

1. Regarding **Action Eqal/15-16/025 (b)**, a memorandum, including a full costing and estimate of costs that would be saved by the adoption of Boardpad by the Equality Committee, has been sent to the Secretary to the College for consideration.
2. Regarding **Action Eqal/15-16/026**, a revised draft of the Policy on ISL Provision is to be submitted to the next Equality Committee meeting on 18 May 2016.
3. Regarding **Action Eqal/15-16/027**, revision of the Diversity and Inclusion Strategy is ongoing. The committee noted the memorandum on this topic from the Director of Diversity and Inclusion. Members expressed interest in receiving further details of the external consultation that is being undertaken on the strategy.
4. Regarding **Action Eqal/15-16/028 (b)**, consultation with relevant groups representing the interests of older members of the Trinity community is ongoing. Committee members recommended direct engagement with the Registrar to explore whether a strategy is the best option for making Trinity a more age-friendly university.

Action (a): Equality Officer to obtain further details of external consultation on the Diversity and Inclusion Strategy, and circulate to the Equality Committee, if appropriate.

Action (b): Equality Officer to discuss age-friendly strategy options with the Registrar.

Matters for Discussion

Eqal/15-16/041

Equality Policy Implementation Plan

Equality Officer

The Equality Officer presented the draft Equality Policy Implementation Plan to the committee. The plan has been produced in accordance with the commitment in the revised Equality Policy to create an Annual Implementation Plan for the policy, and it is based on feedback received from the University community during the Equality Policy review in

Michaelmas Term 2015. The plan relates to March – August 2016; in September 2016 a new plan will be drafted for the 2016/17 academic year. The plan headings are:

1. Accessibility
2. Communications
3. Training
4. Collaboration
5. Local Engagement
6. Website
7. Data
8. Compliance
9. Specific Themes (accessibility, staff mental health and age)
10. Specific Needs (breastfeeding / lactation spaces and gender-neutral bathrooms)
11. Accuracy

The plan was approved while it was also recommended that some time-frames within the plan be extended, to be more achievable.

Staff training was discussed and it was proposed that completion of the Living Equality and Diversity (LEAD) programme should be made compulsory for all new staff, as part of their probation requirements. It was also noted that there is currently no systematic provision for students with serious long-term health difficulties, or for training staff in how to assist such students.

It was suggested that compliance of suppliers with the Equality Policy should be addressed by improved communication; of the fact that Trinity suppliers must be in compliance with Trinity policies, and of the mechanisms by which staff and students can give feedback relating to non-compliance.

The committee noted that one major theme arising during consultation on the Equality Policy review was staff mental health. It was proposed that some initiatives currently offered to students could be effectively applied to staff, e.g. Suicide Awareness workshops. The Employee Assistance Programme was praised and it was recommended that awareness

of the programme be further raised. It was noted that the Student Mental Health Policy has just been reviewed and members agreed that a policy on staff mental health should also be produced, whether jointly with the Student Mental Health Policy or as a separate document.

Action: Equality Officer to extend some timeframes in the Equality Policy Implementation Plan, and to address other issues discussed by the Committee (training, suppliers and staff mental health) in the 2016/17 Equality Policy Implementation Plan.

Equal/15-16/042

GLEN Workplace Equality Index

Equality Officer

The Equality Officer presented a report to the Committee on Trinity's performance in the inaugural Gay and Lesbian Equality Network (GLEN) Workplace Equality Index (WEI) in 2015, and plans for Trinity's 2016 application to the WEI.

Trinity's results were below average in each of the 5 sections of the WEI in 2015; however, Trinity was awarded a Special Recognition Award for trans* inclusion, and was the only public sector body to receive any award. The 2015 results, and feedback received from GLEN, are valuable for self-reflection. GLEN have highlighted areas in which Trinity can improve its inclusion of LGBT staff, and improve its WEI application form.

The committee welcomed the engagement with GLEN through the WEI process. It was also noted that GLEN's International Women's Day event, hosted by Trinity in the Dining Hall on 8 March 2016, was very successful and had double the attendance of GLEN's 2015 International Women's Day event.

Regarding the ongoing establishment of an LGBT staff network, more publicity was recommended, including an all-staff email about the upcoming meeting on 22 March 2016 for staff interested in the network. Members commented on the relative invisibility of LGBT staff and the importance of creating a (non-physical) space specifically for LGBT staff. Members suggested the network could form positive links with Rainbow Week, the student society QSoc and other Diversity Champions member organisations' networks, such as EY.

The possibility of a formal relationship with the Equality Committee, such as annual attendance by the network chair, was also discussed. However it was noted that the structure, objectives and activities of the network are matters for the network members to decide.

Action: Equality Officer to send an email to all staff informing them of the LGBT staff network meeting to be held on 22 March 2016

Equal/15-16/043

Gender-Neutral Bathrooms

SU Welfare Officer

Mr C Clancy, Welfare and Equality Officer of the Students' Union, updated the Committee on recent developments towards the improved provision of gender-neutral bathroom facilities in Trinity, which are being undertaken by Mr Clancy, the Equality Officer and the Director of Diversity and Inclusion in accordance with the Gender Identity and Gender Expression Policy and in response to need communicated by students.

- The Students' Union has documented the gender-neutral bathrooms known to students and made this information available online, however this is not a definitive list, and many of the bathrooms cannot be accessed at certain times / without a key
- Survey work is being undertaken by Estates and Facilities to ascertain the number and locations of gender-neutral bathrooms available on the main campus
- Provision will be improved in the short term by improved communication of existing facilities, and by installing new signage at existing gender-neutral bathrooms
- Research has begun into appropriate signage for gender-neutral bathrooms
- A possible minimum standard is suggested, that gender-neutral bathrooms not be more than one minute's walk away from any point on the main campus

The suggested minimum standard was considered by members to be unrealistic, and instead it was proposed that the minimum standard will vary depending on the layout of each building and the number of users. The Arts Building was highlighted as a priority area

due to the high volume of users of the building, and its current lack of any gender-neutral bathrooms.

Committee members noted that improved provision of gender-neutral bathrooms would be of benefit to students, staff and visitors alike. University College Cork and the University of Limerick were highlighted as examples of good practice in this area, and it was also recommended that international guidelines on the matter be researched.

It was agreed that a selection of the new enabled bathrooms in the Arts Building, not yet available for use, would be designated as “universal” bathrooms, which can be used by people of any gender or disability status – this arrangement is to be made on a trial basis and to be reviewed at a later date.

Regarding signage, a pictorial model is preferred (as this can be understood by non-English speakers), and one in which the figures are in a circle rather than a straight line (which may indicate a hierarchy). It was agreed that Housekeeping personnel should be involved in discussions about the Arts Building pilot from the very early stages.

In the longer term, funding will be sought for refurbishments, possibly through the small works fund. The information gathered about the available facilities will be made available long-term, e.g. on the College Maps webpage.

It was also noted that in the long term it would be desirable for baby-changing facilities to be provided in all bathrooms regardless of gender.

Action: Director of Disability Service and Equality Officer to liaise with Estates and Facilities regarding the designation of selected enabled bathrooms in the Arts Block as universal bathrooms.

The Equality Officer thanked the Committee for their comments on the report, 'Gender and Trinity Staff: Trends in Populations, Recruitment and Progression', made by email in advance of the report's circulation to Board on Wednesday 16 March. The Equality Officer also informed the Committee that another report (of which she was co-author), 'Chance of Reaching Chair Professor Level in Trinity: an Analysis of Gender Trends 2007-2014', was discussed by Council on 9 March 2016. It was explained that the newer 'Gender and Trinity Staff' report contains all the data presented in the earlier 'Chance of Reaching Chair Professor Level in Trinity' report, as well as further data.

Areas of concern arising from the key findings of the 'Gender and Trinity Staff' report were summarised as follows:

1. Gender divisions according to traditional norms, especially in Support areas
2. Low female representation in the most senior academic and administrative grades
3. Low female application numbers and low male success rates in academic recruitment
4. Low female application rates for promotion to Associate Professor and to Professor (Chair)
5. Lack of readily-available data on non-academic promotions

The committee's comments on these findings, and some draft recommendations suggested by the report working group, were sought.

Members suggested that there should be increased transparency around non-academic promotions. Similarly, the draft recommendations were felt to focus overly on women in academia, compared with issues pertaining to men and to administrative roles.

The vertical segregation (lower representation of women in more senior roles) in administration was considered particularly shocking given that the vast majority of administrative staff are female. It was recommended that mentoring should be provided to female administrative staff, as is already provided for female academic staff. Overall, the

principle was agreed that supports provided for academic staff should be provided to other staff, where relevant.

The University's new title of "professional" staff for all non-academic staff was welcomed. However it was also noted that research staff such as postdoctoral researchers might be more appropriately categorised as academic staff than professional staff.

Mr C Clancy left the meeting during this item, at 3.35pm.

Action: Equality Officer and Chair to review the recommendations arising from the Gender and Trinity Staff report, in light of the Committee's comments.

Matters for Noting

Equal/15-16/045

International Women's Week

Equality Officer

The Equality Officer reported to the Committee that International Women's Week was held 7 – 11 March 2016, comprising 28 events on the official timetable as well as free sports classes and an unknown number of local events. The Equality Officer thanked the 21 volunteers registered with the Equality Office as well as members of the Students' Union, DU Amnesty and the Dublin University Gender Equality Society for their support. Members noted the diverse range of events in International Women's Week 2016 and congratulated the Equality Officer on a successful week.

Any Other Business

Ms S MacBride

Ms MacBride reminded committee members of the deadline (16 March 2016) for applications to the Equality Champion Awards for Clubs and Societies, and noted that engagement with the awards by clubs and societies has been unexpectedly low, despite the awards programme being well-communicated.

Members recommended that the presentation of this year's awards be used as an opportunity for further publicity. It was also proposed that presenting information about the awards programme to DUCAC and CSC meetings would be an effective means of raising numbers of applications in future.

It was agreed that a long-term administrative base and funding for the programme must be found, following this year's pilot as an Equality Fund project administrated by Ms MacBride (College Solicitor) and sponsored by the Dean of Students.

Signed:

Date: