

**University Of Dublin
Trinity College
Equality Committee**

Minutes of a meeting held on Monday 21st October 2013 at 2pm in Board Room, House 1

Present: Prof M Bourroche (Chair), The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Prof L Hogan)*, Ms S MacBride, Ms L Power, Ms Sarah Smith (GSU), Mr Stephen Garry (SU), Prof J Walsh**, Mr T Woods, Ms K O'Toole, Ms K Campos (secretary), Ms M Garvey (outgoing secretary).

Apologies: Mr D Treanor, Prof M McCarron, Mr J Munnely.

In attendance: Ms Claire Marshall (INTEGER Programme Manager)***

Present for: *Eqal/13-14/01-07, **Eqal/13-14/01-06, ***Eqal/13-14/05

Items for Board attention are denoted XXX

Eqal/13-14/01 Minutes The minutes of the previous meeting, 28th May 2013, were approved and signed.

Matters arising were discussed and minuted below:

Eqal/13-14/02 [Eqal/12-13/31] **Irish Sign Language (ISL) provision** Ms Power drew the Committee's attention to the need for clarifying the provision of funding for ISL supports and reasonable accommodation within College.

Action: Director of Disability Services, Ms Power and Ms Campos to investigate the provision of funding for ISL supports and reasonable accommodation.

Eqal/13-14/03 Action call-over

- 1) **Accessible Information Implementation Report.** The Chair advised she would seek another opportunity to raise the report at Board. Ms Mac Bride reported this item was on the agenda for discussion with the Dean of Graduate Studies. Prof Walsh suggested that he would raise the report at Council following this discussion with the Dean.
- 2) **Equality Monitoring Report.** The Report was circulated to Board in September. Ms Garvey advised that the recommendation to contact Principal Committees regarding gender balance had not yet been implemented, noting the Equality Committee was

addressing this imbalance in its own membership. The report findings had also been disseminated via Facebook, Twitter, and the equality website. Ms Garvey suggested there might be further opportunities throughout the year to use the statistics from the report for equality events and campaigns. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that Principal Committees did not have much scope to address gender balance given their representative nature and suggested the Committee constituencies should have greater awareness of gender balance in their nominations. The Chair also stressed the role of the Chairs and Secretaries in making constituencies aware of gender balance when seeking nominees.

Eqal/13-14/04 HR Committee items to discuss

Nothing to report, since no HR Committee has taken place since the last Committee meeting. Prof Walsh noted that the next HR Committee would take place on 31 October.

Eqal/13-14/05 Committee membership The Chair outlined the need to nominate a staff representative to fill the Committee vacancy, noting that more gender and faculty balance in the Committee would be desirable. The Chair outlined the profiles and interests expressed by three possible candidates, which were welcomed by the Committee. The Committee discussed the current Committee composition in terms of gender balance, Faculty and discipline, academic and administrative balance, and approved the nomination of Prof Leo Stassen (Dental Science).

Action:

Ms Campos to contact Prof Leo Stassen regarding his nomination.

Section A – Policy issues

Eqal/13-14/06 INTEGER Project and Baseline Report Briefing (circulated) Ms

XXX Marshall outlined the objective of the INTEGER project to create sustainable transformational change that will improve the career progression of women scientific researchers through the development of Gender Action Plans in research and higher education. Ms Marshall highlighted some key differences in the profile of male and female respondents to the survey of academic staff that was carried out for this project regarding contract status, family and partner status, or contentment with career achievement; and noted the culture of long hours of work amongst academic staff.

Ms Marshall discussed the recommendations contained in the report in the following key areas:

- **Female Representation in Trinity College:** Set targets for female representation; Implement activities to raise the profile of women academics; Academic Leadership Development Programme.
- **Promotions:** monitor the proportions of women who are applicants, shortlisted and successful in promotions and Fellowship; Notify potential candidates for promotion of their eligibility; Review procedures for promotion and Fellowship and ensure clear and transparent criteria; Introduce and/or extend tailored Mentoring Programmes for academic staff.
- **Research Supports:** Develop an Academic Portfolio; Develop an effective appraisal system; Run WiSER Seminar on Funding sources and applications; Establish an Early Career Research (ECR) Support Office; Formalise procedure for hiring early-career researchers.
- **Work-Life Balance Policy:** Introduce one-term sabbatical for academics returning from long-term leave; Extend paid paternity leave to 10 days; provide family-friendly supports for out-of-term & weekend events.
- **Workplace Culture:** Implement an orientation/induction process for new academic and research staff; Set up School Social Clubs.
- **Engagement of Decision-Makers:** Monitor appointments to College Committees and management posts by gender & seek better gender balance; Provide training for aspiring Heads of Discipline/School/Faculty Deans and College Officers; Commitment to gender equality through pledges by the College Senior Management Team.
- **Workload allocation:** Monitor workload models to ensure gender equity.
- **Gender-proofing of College Policies:** Gender-proof all College policies.
- **Data Monitoring:** Produce Key Performance Indicators to include gender; undertake longitudinal study of academic staff employed 1972/2012; Conduct exit interviews.
- **International Academic Community and Practice:** Benchmark against universities affiliated to the League of European Research Universities; Apply for Athena SWAN Bronze Award.

Ms Marshall stated that the development of an Early Career Research Support Office would be the first in Ireland. The ECR Support Office is to be modelled on the award-winning Postdoc Development Centre at Imperial College and a funding application has been made to the HEA. Ms Marshall advised that the targets for female representation

are achievable targets set following good practice in other institutions. Ms Marshall confirmed that the targets for each grade reflected the new academic grade terminology in College.

Prof Walsh welcomed and sought further information regarding the Career Development Framework contained in the Research Supports recommendation, noting that some Frameworks available were positive and others negative. Ms Marshall advised that a pilot model had been tested but feedback indicated it required further development. The Committee recommended that researchers should be involved at the early stage of developing the framework, and recommended consulting the Trinity Research Staff Association.

Ms Campos enquired whether the INTEGER project was working in collaboration with the National Network to Promote Recommendations for Gender Equality in Research and Career Outcomes (launched last year). Ms Marshall advised that these projects had developed independently but that they were now liaising more closely and it was envisaged that with their shared goals they would work in a complementary manner.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer discussed the recommendations regarding Promotions noting that work to review procedures was already taking place and that mentoring and staff development actions had already been initiated, although at an early stage. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer highlighted the importance of embedding the INTEGER perspective in emerging College initiatives and avoiding duplication – ensuring good cross-collaboration. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also noted that eligibility for promotion was a complex matter, and that any initiative to inform eligible candidates must ensure that possible candidates have a good understanding of what is expected for promotion and the likelihood of success, articulating thresholds of achievement. The Committee also discussed the recommendation for developing gender KPIs at an institutional and School level, what kind of indicators would be appropriate and the different responsibilities for KPIs at local and institutional level, and how these may act as incentives for change.

Ms Mac Bride suggested that further investigation into the cost of the Work Life Balance measures, such as extending paternity leave, needed to be carried out, bearing in mind that in the interest of equity the measure would have to apply to all staff in the future once it is introduced for certain Schools. Ms Marshall noted that at present the cost for

the extended leave was being shared in the pilot Schools as follows: one third funded by the Faculty, one third by the School, and one third by INTEGER. Ms O'Toole also drew the Committee's attention to the Transition Year Schools programme and how it may be relevant for INTEGER future projections.

The Chair thanked Ms Marshall for the very comprehensive report. She suggested that the format of the report might be reviewed before submission to Board to maximise its impact – for example including a summary of recommendations.

Action:

The INTEGER report to be submitted to Board for approval.

Equal/13-14/07 Fellowship: Gender, Faculty and School Analysis Report

XXX

The Chair outlined the key findings of this report which includes extensive data collated by the outgoing Equality Officer. The report found that eligible women academics were less likely to apply for Fellowship even when considering staff in the same grade. The report found that there was no appreciable difference in the success rates of men and women applying for Fellowship.

The report also includes an analysis of Fellowship applications and appointments by Faculty that highlights the under-representation of the Faculty of Health Sciences and over-representation of the Faculty of Engineering, Maths and Science. The report finds that there are fewer women in the Faculty of EMS, but they are more likely to be Fellows than their counterparts in other Faculties. The report also discusses some of the key issues arising in the INTEGER survey, such as the perception that the procedures around Fellowship are opaque.

The Chair presented the Recommendations of the report, which were welcomed by the Committee:

- Monitoring and reporting (by gender and faculty) on the numbers of academic staff eligible, applying and elected to Fellowship.
- Further qualitative research/consultation to identify and address the low application rate by women and in certain disciplines.
- Draft and issue clear and concise guidelines regarding the application and election process for Fellowship

- Hold annual staff information sessions about Fellowship.
- Mainstream and extend mentoring programmes.
- Female Fellows as role models to encourage applications.
- Fellows from under-represented Schools should encourage their colleagues to apply.
- The Central Fellowship Committee (CFC) should prioritize quality over quantity in assessing research.
- The CFC should give due consideration to evidence of applicants' contributions to the academic life of the College.
- The CFC should consider extending Fellowship to appropriate part-time staff categories.
- Ensure CFC members are aware of disciplinary differences in types of publications research outputs which influence citation metrics.
- Provide a briefing seminar on unconscious bias for all persons involved in the Fellowship election process.
- Allow the CFC to grant permission for a Fellow to nominate more than one colleague where appropriate.
- Apply the principles of gender balance to the nomination and election of Honorary Fellows.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer welcomed this overdue analysis of Fellowship and commended the report in particular for providing a Faculty/School analysis as well as a gender analysis of Fellowship. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the Schools identified by the report as being under-represented had a professional practice element, and suggested the recommendation should focus on extending the range of works that are considered research (as opposed to dissemination). The Chair concurred with the necessity of extending the definition of research and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer suggested that the Research Quality Metrics provided a comprehensive research definition which could be used as a starting point.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also highlighted that Fellowship was probably not fully understood or valued in College, where the focus is more on promotion, and suggested that Fellows needed to better articulate the value of Fellowship's role in College.

Action:

Ms Campos to circulate this report under section A to the next Board meeting.

Section B – Implementation issues

Equal/13-14/08 Equality Committee Annual Report 2013-2014

XXX

The Committee welcomed the report presented by Ms Garvey which outlines the main issues addressed during 2013-2014:

- Equality Fund: The Committee approved amendments to the Equality Fund Sub-Committee terms of reference and 14 staff and student projects were approved for 2013-2014 (the Equality Fund was discussed under a separate agenda item).
- Dignity and Respect/Accessibility Awareness for Capitalated Bodies: the Committee noted that the Equality Officer was liaising with Capitalated bodies further to the Committee's discussion of the equality and inclusion awareness training needs of students, specifically in relation to society activities, and the possibility of developing a statement/charter.
- Student Accommodation: the Committee welcomed the establishment of a working group reviewing accommodation allocation processes and chaired by the Dean of Students. The Committee drafted a submission for this group highlighting the need for a review of the allocation criteria and appeals process for clarity. Ms Garvey advised there was no further update from this working group at the time.
- Board request for Gender and Fellowship Report: this report was prepared by a working group established by the Committee. It has now been circulated to the Committee for approval and submission to Board (The item is discussed under a separate agenda entry).
- LEAD: the Committee noted that the LEAD eLearning programme was being implemented successfully. Ms Garvey provided the latest update of figures with over 600 registered participants and 350 staff having fully completed the programme. Ms Campos suggested that it would be beneficial to have a report from HR on progress regarding the objective of all staff sitting on interview panels having completed the programme by September 2013. Ms Power advised that HR was implementing this and reminding all members to complete the programme. The Chair drew attention to the ad-hoc nature of research staff appointment processes and suggested this would be an area

to address in further implementing LEAD. Ms Smith enquired whether LEAD might be of interest to students and was advised it was already fully available to students who could access it with their TCD e-mail address.

- Student parents: The Committee endorsed the policy “Supports for Student Parents, Student Carers and Students experiencing pregnancy”. Ms Garvey advised that the student parent society had recently been approved and the student welcome events had taken place.
- Dignity and Respect: the Committee approved 3 new Contact Persons and amended the role of the Contact person in the Dignity and Respect Policy Terms of Reference.
- Trans* Policy: The Equality Committee established a working group to develop a joint staff and student policy to support and protect transgender staff and students. Ms Garvey advised that the working group had convened and a first draft had been prepared.
- Part-time student service provision: the provision of services for part-time students continues to be a concern for the Committee.

The Committee welcomed and approved this report.

Action:

The Equality Committee Annual Report to be submitted to the next Board meeting together with the minutes (Ms Campos).

Eqal/13-14/09 Equality Committee Self-Evaluation: The Chair welcomed the updated self-evaluation (following from the review completed in 2012-2013) but regretted that only eight members had participated. The Committee discussed the statements which had not received full agreement by participants. With regards to the understanding of the Committee’s role it was felt that all members understood it well, including new members, thanks to the handbook developed last year, and that the challenge continued to be raising College awareness on the Committee’s role. Regarding the Committee’s advisory role to College the Chair noted the past difficulties due to the large agenda of Board meetings, but it was agreed that presenting key documents as Section A items allows more discussion. Regarding the Committee’s role in monitoring legal developments Ms Mac Bride was of the view that this was more of an executive function within the responsibility of the Secretary’s Office legal section and the Equality Officer. The Chair suggested that the Committee Terms of Reference might need to be reviewed in this regard.

The Committee also discussed whether there are an appropriate number of meetings, of appropriate duration and held at appropriate times, noting that the agenda was very often too full and items had to be postponed. The Committee suggested that a fifth meeting was not feasible this year but that it would be beneficial to have two meetings in the first term (one in September and one before the end of term) so that there were not such extended gaps between meetings, and this could be implemented next year.

Regarding the Committee's liaison with other Committees, it was felt that while documents were submitted via the appropriate channels to the appropriate Committees, the Committee could extend its communications to other Committees for whom it might be relevant and seek further engagement on key points – for example highlighting stakeholders for each agenda item.

Actions:

- Ms Campos to schedule two meetings in Michaelmas Term next year.
- The Committee to consider how each agenda item can best be disseminated – at Board and to other committees and stakeholders.

Equal/13-14/10 Equality Officer Report 2013/14

XXX

The Committee welcomed the Equality Officer report by Ms Garvey (outgoing Equality Officer) who reported on the following key activities during 2012-2013:

- The Equality Policy communication activities continued. Liaison with Capitated bodies (CSC, DUCAC and Publications) was on-going regarding training needs and a statement of commitment. Ms Garvey advised that the online equality policy self-evaluation tool had been put on hold due to timing to avoid a clash with the roll-out of the LEAD online programme.
- The College has exceeded the 3% target for the employment of people with disabilities for the first time reaching 3.7%. Ms Garvey noted changes to reporting which now permitted including staff who received accommodations but had not responded to the survey. Ms Garvey noted the overall response rate to the disability survey continued to be low.
- Ms Garvey reported that the diversity monitoring screen had not yet been activated in the e-recruitment system due to further delays with Core. Ms Campos suggested she would follow-up on this action with HR.

- Initiatives to support student parents continued to progress including a welcome event for student parents, an information website, the creation of a child-friendly area in the Buttery and provisional approval for the student parent society.
- Trans* policy: Ms Garvey advised work on the Trans* policy for staff and students was on-going.
- A Merit Bar a working group was established to report to the HR Committee following the Merit Bar report and Prof Walsh to report on any updates.
- National Network to promote Recommendations for Gender Equality in Research: Ms Garvey advised the network was launched and would continue to develop in 2013-2014 with the collaboration of the Equality Officer.
- INTEGER: this was discussed as a separate agenda item. The Equality Officer is a member of the Institution Implementation Team.
- Enhancing the experience of people with disabilities in the workplace: this IUA project received funding from the Equality Authority and will progress during 2013-2014.
- The LEAD equality eLearning programme implementation plan has been progressing successfully (over 350 staff have fully completed the programme to-date). The Equality Officer continued with dissemination activities, communications and meetings with area heads; facilitated sessions were also held. Ms Garvey advised she was liaising with Aurion regarding some adjustments to the programme reporting facilities.
- Dissemination: 30 events took place during International Women's Week, with 25 volunteers. The Monsters of Creation event was particularly successful and drew great attendance.

Challenges: Ms Garvey drew the Committees attention to the challenges faced during the year, mainly due to changes in staffing (Ms Garvey substituted Ms Campos during her career break) and changes in the composition of the Equality Committee, Equality Fund Sub-Committee and IUA Equality Network, although she noted these also provided an opportunity for new perspectives.

Future Plans: Ms Garvey highlighted the opportunities afforded by the INTEGER programme to progress gender equality, the Global Relations Strategy, the Equality Fund and external collaboration such as the IUA project.

Ms Mac Bride and the Committee thanked Ms Garvey for her work and contribution during her term as Equality Officer.

Action:

Ms Campos to follow-up on the implementation of the diversity e-recruitment screen with HR.

Equal/13-14/11 Equality Fund the Committee welcomed the Equality Fund report circulated with details of the 14 projects supported during 2012-2013. The Committee noted that the Equality Fund generated great creativity, participation and collaboration amongst staff and students for a relatively low investment.

Ms Garvey advised that the Equality Fund Showcase would take place during the Equality and Diversity Week in November and invited all members to attend. The Chair noted the value of the Equality Fund Showcase and suggested that members of Board and Annual Officers should be invited personally. Ms O'Toole suggested that a semi-permanent exhibition could be considered and the Committee discussed different options for disseminating the projects, including the possibility of recording the showcase. Ms Campos noted that the Equality Office would welcome the opportunity to collaborate with the SU regarding the new Equality and Diversity Week campaign.

Actions:

- Ms Campos to extend invitations to the Equality Fund Showcase
- The Equality Fund Sub-Committee to consider further options for disseminating projects, including an exhibition, filming etc.
- The SU Welfare Officer and Ms Campos to liaise regarding Equality and Diversity Week.

Equal/13-14/12 Dignity and Respect observations

Ms Power outlined some issues that had arisen in recent cases, such as missing and unclear information in complaints, or vague complaints. Ms Power suggested that it would be beneficial to develop a simple form to assist complainants. Ms Mac Bride suggested the Equal Status complaint as a model. The Committee welcomed the suggestion of the form and discussed the need to avoid excessive formality which would be a deterrent. Ms Power also noted the need for more trained investigators and the difficulties in maintaining a time-frame in some academic cases.

Action:

Ms Power to discuss and draft a complaint form in collaboration with Ms Campos and Ms Smith.

Section C – Matters for Noting

Nothing to report.

Any Other Business

Nothing to report.

Signed

Date