Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin

Minutes of the Critical Infrastructure Committee (CIC)

Tuesday, 18th June 2024, 10.00-13.00

Trinity Board Room

Present: Ms. T. Doyle (Chair), Bursar & Director of Strategic Innovation (Prof. E. Denny) (Secretary), Chief Operating Officer (Ms. O. Cunningham), Dean of Research (Prof. S. Ryan), Dean of Faculty of Health Sciences (Prof. B. O'Connell), Director of Campus Infrastructure (Mr. M. Clark), Director of IT Services (Mr. P. Magee), Librarian & College Archivist (Ms. H. Shenton), Ms. Mariana Silva, Ms. E. Culleton-Quinn, Mr. B. O'Hora

In Attendance Ms. C. Burke
Ms. V. Butler (Secretary to the College/Director of Governance)
Ms. S. Cleary (Minute-taker)

Apologies: Chief Financial Officer (Ms. L. Ryan), Mr. C. O'Connor, Mr. E. O'Donovan, Ms. A. Whitty, Mr. D. Quinn

One Undergraduate student representative vacancy to be filled.

CIC /23-24/ 45 **Welcome and Introductions**
The Chair welcomed Ms. Mariana Silva who joins the Critical Infrastructure Committee (CIC) as Postgraduate Student Representative.

CIC /23-24/ 46 **Declaration of Potential Conflicts of Interest**
None received.

CIC /23-24/ 47 **Members' Declaration**
The Secretary to the College/Director of Governance (the College Secretary) provided the CIC with an update on Members' Declarations that will be made by all Board and Principal Committee members at the start of the next academic year with wording recently approved by Board. The Bursar & Director of Strategic Innovation (the Bursar) reiterated that discussions and materials shared at CIC meetings are confidential and may contain commercially sensitive information.

CIC /23-24/ 48 **Minutes**
The Chair advised a minor addition had been requested for the 17th April 2024 draft minutes by a member and the minutes were approved with wording to be added incorporating this request. The minutes of the 20th February 2024 meeting were noted following electronic approval on 2nd May 2024.

CIC /23-24/ 49 **Matters arising from the Minutes**
Arising from a matter raised by a member, the Chief Operating Officer confirmed minutes of the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group would be circulated to the CIC.

CIC /23-24/ 50   **Work Programme 2024/25**

The CIC noted the memorandum from the Bursar dated 10th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance, setting out 2024/25 CIC meeting dates and the Work Programme 2024/25. CIC members are invited to submit additions or amendments to the Work Programme.

Action 50.1 – CIC members to submit additions or amendments to the CIC Work Programme 2024/25.

CIC /23-24/ 51   **Updates from other Principal Committees**

No significant items were noted by CIC members who are members of other Principal Committees of Board.

Strategy and Strategic Items

CIC /23-24/ 52   **Capital Projects Dashboard**

The Bursar presented the Capital Projects Dashboard for noting. She provided an update on the Dartry student accommodation project explaining that while the university is undertaking continued engagement, early and unofficial indications are that the project will not receive government funding at this time.

In response to a query from a member, the Bursar confirmed the university continues to negotiate with contractors on the E3 Learning Foundry project, with regular reporting being received by Finance Committee and Board.

CIC /23-24/ 53   **Draft Digital Projects Dashboard**

The Director of IT Services introduced the item with reference to his presentation dated 18th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance, presenting a proposed approach to this standing CIC agenda item which will cover projects beyond those managed by IT Services, and will highlight obsolescence and associated risks. Suggested criteria for inclusion on the dashboard was presented as well as a narrative report.

In response to queries from a member, the Director of IT Services confirmed any CIC member could nominate inclusion of a project where the criteria could lead to doubt over its inclusion, and further confirmed he has liaised with the Programme Management Office (PMO) on plans to automate the dashboard's reporting from the new ePPM system.

In response to a query from a member, the Director of IT Services undertook to work with the Librarian & College Archivist (the Librarian) and others to model the compounding effect of underinvestment in digital infrastructure, and bring this back to the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group and the CIC.

In response to queries from members, the Director of IT Services undertook to provide further detail on the timelines presented in the dashboard such as quarterly timelines, and confirmed the automated reporting from the ePPM will provide further increased granularity.

Action 53.1 – The Director of IT Services and the Librarian, with others, to model the compounding effect of underinvestment in digital infrastructure, and bring this back to the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group and the CIC.

Action 53.2 – The Director of IT Services to provide further detail on the timelines presented in the dashboard such as quarterly timelines.

CIC /23-24/ 54   **Cyber-Security Threat Dashboard**
The Director of IT Services presented the Cyber-Security Threat Dashboard for noting, drawing the CIC's attention to 'Trinity Account Hacked' being the highest cyber-security incident category year-to-date, and further updating the CIC that phishing attempts are showing a trend of doubling year-on-year.

In response to a query from a member who pointed out the dashboard is showing a snapshot in time, the Director of IT Services agreed to add comparative year-to-year data to the next meeting's dashboard.

Action 54.1 – The Director of IT Services to add comparative year-to-year data to the next CIC meeting's dashboard.

CIC /23-24/ 55   **Report from the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group**
The Chief Operating Officer (COO) provided a verbal update on the first meeting of the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group on 28th May 2024, noting that much of the meeting's business covered material previously brought to CIC such as the role of the Group. Its Terms of Reference was approved with some changes and will be submitted to the next CIC meeting for noting. The Group approved the IT and Cyber-Security Policy for submission to this CIC meeting and discussed the Digital Transformation Strategy. The minutes of future meetings of the Group will be submitted to the CIC for noting.

In response to a query from a member, the COO confirmed the Faculty Deans, Chief Officers and other Heads of areas provided nominees for membership to the Group, including in this case the Dean of the Faculty of Science, Technology, Engineering & Mathematics.

Action 55.1 – The COO to submit updated Terms of Reference of the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group to the next CIC meeting for noting.

Action 55.2 – The COO to submit minutes of future meetings of the Group to the CIC for noting.

Ms. Breda Walls, Director of Student Services, joined the meeting at this point.

CIC /23-24/ 56   **Iveagh Grounds**
The COO introduced the item with reference to her presentation dated June 2024 which had been circulated in advance, seeking approval to recommend to Board that the university submits an application under the Large Scale Sport Infrastructure Fund (LSSIF) Round 2 (2024) which has a tight deadline of 1st July 2024. There is potential for a €20m LSSIF grant and €9.9m of matched funding from the university to invest in the Iveagh Grounds, a valuable but deteriorating asset in an excellent location when compared to other sports grounds such as Santry. Improving its grounds and facilities will contribute to the transformative experience and well-being of students, staff and local communities as outlined in various university strategies including the Strategic Plan. This proposal has the endorsement and support of students and external bodies such as Dublin City Council, the Irish Wheelchair Association, and Athletics Ireland which will act as Application Sponsor.

In response to a query from a member and comments from other members, the COO confirmed there are no plans for a gym on the site for now but depending on the level of funding granted this is a future possibility. She noted the suggestion of possible involvement of external bodies located in Dublin 8 such as Sporting Liberties, and she further noted the positive benefit from a Health Sciences and St James's Hospital perspective.

In response to a query from a member, the COO confirmed the source of operating income will include payment for usage of grounds from bodies such as Athletics Ireland, and that any excess earned above operating costs is required to be reinvested in Iveagh Grounds.

In response to a query from a member and points raised by other members, the COO agreed the Santry grounds, which also contain an end-of-life book repository, will need future focus. She confirmed as a grass site the Santry grounds will continue to be used for competitive matches rather than training, agreed that Metrolink plans will feed into future plans for Santry, and further agreed that Smarter Travel initiatives will benefit both Santry and the Iveagh Grounds.

The CIC approved the request for onward submission to Board for approval.

Ms. Walls left the meeting at this point.

Ms. Edwina Hegarty, Programme Manager for Strategic Projects, joined the meeting at this point.

CIC /23-24/ 57   **Old Library Redevelopment Project**
The Bursar introduced the item with reference to her presentation dated 10th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance, seeking approval to recommend the presented changes in project scope to Board, and confirming there is currently no funding or financial ask.

The Bursar provided background to the project explaining its original scope, subsequent impacts from inflationary pressures, and from the assessment of logistical requirements and potential campus disruption. She outlined the priority areas the project will continue to focus on, the main one being fire safety for which the university has received government (€25m) and philanthropic funding, and the intention to further other project priorities such as structural improvements and the visitor experience in the face of a reduced scope which includes removal of the podium and mechanical environmental controls from the project. Further work to firm up the amended project scope will be performed by new Project Management and Quantity Surveyor (PMQS) and Design teams to be procured, with a tender to be issued in the first week of July.

On invitation from the Bursar, the Librarian further commented that difficult decisions have been required to reach this point. Her main focus has been the impact on the Library collections and maximising the number brought back to the Old Library. This will be helped by considering, in future, passive measures which include the planned book slips which the Librarian confirmed, in response to a query from a member, would not help 'look and smell' concerns.

In response to a query from a member, the Bursar confirmed the work on the podium was removed from scope due to the risk to structure and the logistical disruption caused in creating the link between the Old Library and the Berkeley Library, as well as its significant cost.

In response to a query from a member, the COO and the Programme Manager for Strategic Projects confirmed the interim exhibition held a 5-year planning permission with a possibility for extension.

The CIC approved the request for onward submission to Board for approval.

CIC /23-24/ 58   **E3 Learning Foundry Project**

The Programme Manager for Strategic Projects introduced the item with reference to her presentation dated 18th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance, providing background to the nature and design of the Martin Naughton E3 Learning Foundry building and associated enabling projects including the Zoology Building refurbishment. Flexibility, configurability and a strong sustainability ethos figure prominently in the project.

In response to queries from members, the Programme Manager for Strategic Projects confirmed the new building's space would be allocated to the three E3 Schools for the first three years before being made available to other Schools in the common pool ('Senior Lecturer's Pool') as has been done for similar projects, and that technical requirements had been worked into the project with plans for recruitment of new technical officers to maintain IT needs.

The CIC noted the progress of the project with main contract works being 90% complete, and an 810 additional student FTEs (Full-Time Equivalents) accommodated.

Ms. Hegarty left the meeting at this point.

Ms. Audrey Crosbie, Innovation Manager, and Mr. Neil Gordon, Campus Company Development Manager, joined the meeting at this point.

CIC /23-24/ 59   **Portal Project**

The Innovation Manager and Campus Company Development Manager introduced the item with reference to their presentation dated 18th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance. The Innovation Manager provided background to the Innovation & Enterprise unit which had formed out of university restructuring approximately one year ago, led by the Chief Innovation & Enterprise Officer who had provided her apologies to the CIC due to leave.

The Innovation Manager presented background to the Portal project which has been designed to be a gateway for the innovation community located in the 4GCQ building of the Trinity East site. She outlined its planned timeline for opening in March/April 2025, and informed CIC the new Laidlaw Library is planned to be open in the adjoining 3GCQ building in 2027. The Campus Company Development Manager gave further background on the project which will support the development of an innovation community and an entrepreneurial mindset, gave further detail on the building itself, and provided information on the project's targets such as providing 240 new desks as well as event spaces, a café and plaza.

In response to a query from a member, the Campus Company Development Manager confirmed the new desks will be available for students and researchers, as well as entrepreneurs who in this way will contribute to the business case, with a mix of people being important to the formation of an open innovation community.

In response to a query from a member who raised the issue of other organisations such as Google opening café spaces in nearby locations, the Campus Company Development Manager confirmed there is current engagement with interested potential café operators.

In response to a query from a member, the Innovation Manager confirmed all figures in the presentation exclude the Laidlaw Library.

The CIC noted the progress of the project which is on target and which will continue to be monitored including in an update for the following day's Board meeting and a further business case update in October 2024.

Ms. Crosbie and Mr. Gordon left the meeting at this point.

CIC /23-24/ 60

Maintenance Investment Programme (MIP)

The Director of Campus Infrastructure introduced the item with reference to his presentation dated 18th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance. Background was provided on the size of the Trinity estate, methods used to categorise estate condition noting that 67% of the university's estate is in Condition C, and the significant budget constraints which result in a lack of early maintenance and subsequent increased repair or replacement costs.

With only 1% of turnover allocated towards the MIP and an Annual HEA Devolved Grant available for some maintenance works, priority is placed on work required for the purposes of health & safety, compliance and to prevent imminent failures. This includes work in areas such as lighting, lift replacements, and asbestos removal, with the replacement of roofs being a particularly urgent need. Fundraising efforts with Trinity Development & Alumni have not been successful to assist with this need. There are a number of calculation tools available to establish benchmark maintenance investment costs and 2.5% of the Insurance Replacement Value of the estate (IRV) turnover is one commonly used as the requirement for adequate university estate investment and in response to a query from a member, the Chair indicated increased funding could be requested from Board while recognising the many other priorities requiring urgent funding in the university.

In response to queries from members, the Director of Campus Infrastructure undertook to provide exact figures on Trinity's comparison of Condition C & D space with other Irish universities, to provide an indication of comparative additional costs the university may incur due to its older buildings, and to consider the Santry book repository building for the list of buildings no longer fit for purpose.

In response to a query from a member, the Director of Campus Infrastructure explained the methodology behind the condition ratings is quite prescriptive and therefore likely to be relatively objective.

In response to a point raised by a member, the Director of Campus Infrastructure and COO agreed there are other areas to consider beyond condition such as Universal Access (UA) and explained while funding can be easier to obtain through the Disability Service, planning permission can then impact planned UA works.

The CIC noted the update from the Director of Campus Infrastructure.

Action 60.1 – The Director of Campus Infrastructure to provide exact figures on Trinity's comparison of Condition C & D space with other Irish universities.

Action 60.2 – The Director of Campus Infrastructure to provide an indication of comparative additional costs the university may incur due to its older buildings.

Action 60.3 – The Director of Campus Infrastructure to consider the Santry book repository building for the list of buildings no longer fit for purpose.

CIC /23-24/ 61 **Gap to Target Update**

The Director of Campus Infrastructure introduced the item with reference to his presentation dated 18th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance and informed the CIC this will be submitted also to the Environment & Sustainability Committee's meeting later in the week. Background was provided on the university's target of a 51% thermal gap reduction of 4,356 tCO_2 by 2030 to contribute to government targets in the face of a potential €5bn national fine, and university projects identified to close the gap including four energy centre buildings and specific efforts in buildings such as the TBSI which is the estate's largest energy user. These projects will lead to a 4,354 tCO_2 reduction (shortfall of 2 tCO_2) but will require significant funding. The IUA has recently stated universities do not have the funding they require for these works and the Government will need to provide significant funding if the public sector estate is to achieve these targets.

In response to a query from a member, the Director of Campus Infrastructure agreed Smart Buildings Technology would contribute to environmental targets but simple behaviour changes by building occupants were also needed.

In response to a query from a member, the Director of Campus Infrastructure undertook to contact the Dean of Research and other relevant stakeholders to establish pathways to students who could be involved in checking building efficiencies such as students from the School of Engineering.

Action 61.1 – The Director of Campus Infrastructure to contact the Dean of Research and other relevant stakeholders to establish pathways to students who could be involved in checking building efficiencies such as students from the School of Engineering.

Prof. Orla Sheils, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Office, and Ms. Eimear Byrne, Strategic Projects Officer, joined the meeting at this point.

CIC /23-24/ 62 **Strategic Plan 2025-30 Consultation**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (VP/CAO) introduced the item with reference to her presentation which had been circulated in advance and informed the CIC her office is current engaging in consultation across the university requesting input for strategic objectives of the next university Strategic Plan to be launched in July 2025. She provided background to changes from the new HEA Act 2022 legislation which include a more prescriptive structure, the requirement to submit each draft to the Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science, and the possibility the Minister may request submission of drafts to other agencies.

Themes which have emerged in consultation so far include finances and funding security, staff retention and development, student matters (online offerings, access, global footprint, development of courses in areas of demand, accommodation, student centre/sports facilities), protecting research excellence, digital matters (simplification, AI), sustainability, and civic engagement. The CIC is requested to submit what one thing could be done to transform the shape of the university over the next 5 years, both as individual members but also as a committee, with a dedicated email address available at: strategy2025-30@tcd.ie.

In response to a point raised by a member on the need to move to a strategic approach regarding campus maintenance and infrastructure investment, the VP/CAO confirmed new ring-fenced income streams are required for such requirements which are unlikely to be appealing to donors.

The Chair suggested the CIC could submit input in a structured approach which the VP/CAO confirmed could be incorporated at any stage.

Action 62.1 – The CIC (through the Secretary) to submit input to the VP/CAO on the next Strategic Plan.

Prof. Sheils and Ms. Byrne left the meeting at this point.

Policy	

CIC /23-24/ 63　　**Library Collections Security Policy**

The Librarian introduced the item with reference to the draft Library Content and Collections Security Policy circulated in advance and requested CIC approval to recommend the policy to Board for approval. She noted this is the first time physical and digital content will be covered in the same policy, and that it expands the remit beyond the Old Library's contents per the previous iteration of the policy.

In response to a query from a member, the Librarian noted that while the Library holds the largest proportion of collections in the university there are others which may not be adequately covered by collection management policies and processes such as the university's art, anatomy, and geology collections, its herbarium, and collections held by Schools, and that risk registers may also be a mechanism for dealing with collections security such as recording any lack of cataloguing. The College Secretary commented a consultation piece would be required and she can begin this work starting with the university's art collection which falls under her remit. The Chair further commented other collections could be looked at to see how much the Library policy could be transferred to them.

The CIC approved the request for onward submission to Board for approval.

Action 63.1 – The College Secretary to begin consultation work starting with the university's art collection and to look at how much the Library Content and Collections Security Policy can be transferred to this and other university collections.

CIC /23-24/ 64　　**Donations Policy**

The Librarian introduced the item with reference to the draft Policy on Donations of Collections and Content to the Library circulated in advance, requesting approval from the CIC following Executive Officers Group and Council approval. She noted this draft policy now covers digital collections including 'born digital' or hybrid collections, and that the policy makes explicit to donors that lifecycle costs (such as for acquisition, cataloguing and security) would need to be covered for the university to accept donations.

The CIC approved the Policy on Donations of Collections and Content to the Library.

CIC /23-24/ 65　　**IT and Cyber-Security Policy**

The Director of IT Services introduced the item with reference to the draft IT and Cyber-Security Policy circulated in advance, requesting CIC approval to recommend the policy to Board for approval. He confirmed the draft policy had been approved by Executive Officers Group and the Federated IT & Cyber-Security Group. He noted this is a refresh of existing policy and principles, and included twelve supporting policies covering areas such as passwords, emails etc.

In response to queries from a member, the Director of IT Services confirmed the draft policy had been subject to comprehensive consultation including in the case of the specific query, and noted the request for inclusion of OT as well as IOT in future iterations of the policy.

In response to queries from a member noting concerns discussed at Research Committee, the Director of IT Services confirmed that IT Services approval and vetting of AI software and tools is only required where access to and use of confidential university data is involved and not in the course of normal research, that sensitive data falls under the remit of the policy where the university could be held liable for any breaches, that where software is developed in the course of and for the purpose of research it will only be covered by the policy where this results in a university product being created, and that these points should be covered when the policy is communicated.

The CIC approved the request for onward submission to Board for approval.

Action 65.1 – The Director of IT Services to communicate the points discussed by the Research Committee when the IT and Cyber-Security Policy is communicated to the university.

Risk & Oversight

CIC /23-24/ 66	**Terms of Reference review and Committee Self-Evaluation**

The Bursar introduced the item with reference to her memorandum dated 10th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance and which proposed a Terms of Reference review and Committee Self-Evaluation to be completed by December 2024. The timeline suggested will provide the CIC with a full year of meeting and activities to enable meaningful assessment. The Bursar requested CIC members to revert to her with feedback on the Terms of Reference and to review the draft self-evaluation questions over the Summer period.

Action 66.1 – CIC members to revert to the Bursar with feedback on the Terms of Reference and to review the draft self-evaluation questions over the Summer period.

CIC /23-24/ 67   **Review of University Risk Register items within the remit of the Critical Infrastructure Committee**
The Bursar introduced the item with reference to her memorandum dated 10th June 2024 which had been circulated in advance requesting that CIC members note the draft extract from the University Risk Register of infrastructure-related risks. She noted this will be a standing item at CIC meetings and requested that named risk owners who are members of the CIC update the Committee where any risks or their ratings have changed.

In response to a query from a member, the Bursar confirmed the omission of the Cyber-Security risk in the draft extract document was an oversight and will be included in the next CIC meeting's extract.

Action 67.1 – CIC members named as risk owners in extracts from the University Risk Register to update the CIC where any risks or their ratings have changed.

CIC /23-24/ 68   **Minutes for Noting**
The following meeting minutes were noted by CIC:
- Extracts from Environment & Sustainability Committee minutes - meeting 02.05.2024
- Extracts from Finance Committee minutes - meeting 30.04.2024
- Extracts from Risk & Compliance Committee minutes – meeting 06.03.2024
- Grounds & Gardens Advisory Committee minutes – meeting 20.03.2024

Next Meeting Dates	

CIC /23-24/ 69   The following **Critical Infrastructure Committee (CIC) meeting dates** were noted for 2024/25:
- 10.00 – 13.00 Thursday 26th September 2024
- 10.00 – 13.00 Tuesday 19th November 2024
- 10.00 – 13.00 Thursday 13th February 2025
- 10.00 – 13.00 Tuesday 15th April 2025
- 10.00 – 13.00 Wednesday 18th June 2025

Any Other Business	

CIC /23-24/ 70   **Any Other Business**
None

Tara Doyle
Chair – Critical Infrastructure Committee
Approved at Meeting on 26th September 2024