



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

**Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin**

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 29 November 2017 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Students, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor J Walsh, Professor S Garrigan, Professor A Holohan, Professor C Gardiner, Professor E O Nuallain, Professor S Murphy, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor A M Brady, Professor M Clarke, Professor M Corry, Dr S Chandra, Professor A O’Gara, Ms A MacPherson, Mr C O’Halloran, Mr R Doherty, Mr M Bhargav, Ms A Walsh.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Research, Professor D Faas, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor R A Kenny, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Mr P Shanahan, Professor M Hennessy (Associate Dean of Research).
<i>In attendance</i>	Academic Secretary, Secretary to the College, Librarian and College Archivist, Dr A Oldam (Director of Student Services), Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Mr P Lavelle), Mr V J Paidimukkala.

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda. None was declared

- CL/17-18/052 Declaration**
A new member and a new observer each made the required declaration.
- CL/17-18/053 Minutes**
The minutes of the meeting of 25 October 2017 were approved and signed.
- CL/17-18/054 Matters Arising**
- (i) **CL/17-18/026(iv):** The Academic Secretary, referring to discussion regarding the under-reporting of the number of external examiner reports for postgraduate taught courses in the Faculty of Health Sciences for 2015/16, having looked into the issue, confirmed that this was due to the late logging of a specific batch of reports. She advised that the Quality Officer, in collaboration with the Dean of Graduate Studies, is putting in place procedures for postgraduate taught Courses in line with those at the undergraduate level. She also noted that the data presented in the Annual Quality Report 2015/16 is submitted by schools directly to their respective Faculty Office,

indicating a need for validation of these data centrally. The Provost commented on the importance of having reliable procedures in place as the external examiner role is central to the quality assurance and improvement of our undergraduate and postgraduate provision.

CL/17-18/037: The Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that he and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer have had initial strategic discussions with regard to the development and introduction of new postgraduate programmes. One topic within these discussions was the appropriateness of advertising new courses following their consideration by the Graduate Studies Committee but prior to receiving Council approval. Council members discussed related issues including approval timelines, marketing, potential reputation risks and preliminary set-up of new courses in Trinity's systems. It was noted that the Academic Registry requires Council approval before it initiates set-up work. A member commented on the need for some schools to be able to respond quickly to competitive calls from, in particular, government agencies for responses to bids for continuing professional development programmes, adding that the Trinity system is not always agile enough to allow schools to compete. The Provost highlighted the autonomy enjoyed by Irish universities to offer new programmes and make awards, compared with institutions in many other countries, noting that this level of autonomy comes with certain duties including adherence to internal quality procedures. He reaffirmed College's policy that the University Council approves programmes of study and marketing of such programmes can only take place following Council approval. He added, however, that in very exceptional cases the Dean of Graduate Studies or the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies may make a judgement call to allow marketing prior to Council approval. However, in such cases the rationale for this decision must be presented to Council for noting. Following some discussion on this matter, it was agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer should review existing processes and bring recommendations to a future meeting of Council on the development of new courses and on further streamlining related approval processes.

- (ii) **CL/17-18/031:** In relation to the partnership with Columbia University, Council noted the memorandum from the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 28 November 2017, concerning staffing in the Department of Near and Middle Eastern Studies. It was also noted that the contract with Columbia had been finalised and would be signed imminently. The Provost extended his thanks to all those who had worked on this project.

Decision/Action

054(i).1: The Quality Officer, working with the Dean of Graduate Studies, to put in place a procedure for tracking and maintaining external examiner records and recommendations.

054(ii).2: It was re-affirmed that Council approval is required prior to advertising new courses, save in exceptional circumstances where the Dean of Graduate Studies or the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies may make a judgement call to allow marketing prior to Council approval. However, in such cases the rationale for this decision must be presented to Council for noting.

054(ii).3: The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to review existing processes and bring recommendations to a future meeting of Council on the development of new courses and streamlining related approval processes.

CL/17-18/055 Provost's Report

- (i) The Provost updated Council on his recent travels to London, Toronto, San Francisco, Copenhagen and Budapest on matters of alumni relations, fundraising, partnerships and fact-finding. Whilst in Toronto he visited the Johnson and Johnson incubator laboratory based in the MaRS Discovery District and advised Council of plans to develop a similar life sciences incubator laboratory in Trinity. In Denmark, he and the Vice President Global Relations discussed areas of research overlap with the University of Copenhagen, followed by a meeting of LERU Rectors Group to discuss the implications arising from 'Brexit' on European research networks and funding. He also noted the launch, in Budapest, of a call for proposals under two new 'KICs' (Knowledge Innovation Communities): Urban Mobility: smart, green and integrated transport and Added Value Manufacturing.
- (ii) The Provost announced that Nobel laureate and Trinity graduate, Professor William C Campbell had, earlier that day, launched the new undergraduate Science curriculum.
- (iii) The Provost provided an update on the progress made in relate to the E3 (Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute) project. In relation to the first phase he advised that the specifications for the building to house the new institute were nearly finalised and that budget for this stage of the project will include monies for upgrading space and facilities in other specific buildings. Phase two has progressed with further work carried out on a master plan for the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus at Grand Canal Dock. He noted that decisions will need to be made concerning the best use of the land and whether or not a portion should be sold or leased-out.
- (iv) Speaking to the Trinity-wide fundraising campaign the Provost confirmed the formal inclusion of the School of Law within its ambit. A case for funding will soon go to the Planning Group and then onwards to the Executive Officers' Group for consideration. Another area for targeted funding under the campaign is to increase the number of endowed professorships in Trinity.
- (v) The Provost confirmed that the new Dean of Research, Professor Linda Doyle, would take up the role at the start of December.
- (vi) The Provost invited the Dean of Graduate Studies to provide an update on the inaugural Provost's Scholarship Awards. The Dean of Graduate Studies advised that 40 recipients had been selected and would be announced imminently. He commended the range and quality of research being conducted in Trinity and explained that the work of the judging panel was all the more difficult given the high number of excellent submissions. The Provost confirmed the Postgraduate Teaching Awards winners for 2017 as Mr James Hussey, Ms Maureen Williams, Mr Michael Cullinan and Mr Robert Conway-Kenny.

CL/17-18/056 Trinity Education Project

- (i) **Update from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer provided an update on the Trinity Education Project (TEP) via a presentation, dated November 2017. He outlined the progress made in each of the six sub-groups and planned work over the coming months and asked for questions and feedback. Responding to a question regarding the TEP Project Manager, he noted that Ms Fedelma McNamara would take up another position in Trinity and that interviews for her replacement would take place in early December. A member commented on the importance of students being apprised of the assessment workload and pattern in their courses under the new academic year structure as early as possible.

(ii) Derogations to Progression and Awards

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 24 November 2017, was circulated with a table showing specific derogations requested by Schools in relation to the TEP progression and awards regulations. Speaking to the item, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies noted that the new progression regulations were approved by Council in May 2017 and will take effect in September 2018. Schools delivering professionally accredited courses were contacted to discover if there were accreditation barriers to the implementation of the new regulations in their undergraduate courses. Consequently, a list of derogation requests from specific regulations was compiled, as circulated.

She brought the meeting through the requested derogations and explained that further information had been sought from the Schools of Nursing and Midwifery and Medicine; consequently, requests for further derogations would be presented to Council early in 2018.

Decision/Action

056(ii).1: Council approved the listed derogations from the new progression regulations, as circulated, on the basis of specific clinical or programme accreditation requirements.

CL/17-18/057 Report of the Irish Survey of Student Engagement (ISSE) 2017

A memorandum from the Dean of Students, dated 20 November 2017, was circulated. Speaking to the item, via a presentation, the Dean of Students noted that the circulated report presents data for the fifth year in which Trinity students had participated in the Irish Survey of Student Engagement (ISSE). He thanked Ms Amy Murray and the Quality Officer for their work in compiling the report and noted that school-based data could be made available on request. He advised that any school in receipt of a school-based report should provide information to the Quality Office as to how the information was used and what changes were put into place as a result.

Speaking to the format of the survey, he advised that, in the main, it was based around nine indices determined by 67 questions. In addition, it contained 22 non-indexed questions and provided space for open-comments from students. Moving to the results he confirmed that the response rate was 25% of the targeted cohorts (16.5% in 2013), which were first and final year undergraduate students and postgraduate taught students. The response rate on a faculty-basis was 52% for Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences; 30% for Engineering, Mathematics and Science; 18% for Health Sciences. Most respondents identified as being Irish (81.4%) and there were more female respondents (64%) than male (36%).

He presented data comparing Trinity to the average scores for all ISSE universities under each of the nine main indices. He advised, however, that the data in the report showing a comparison of scores on an internal faculty basis and from cohort to cohort were more instructive in terms of guiding further investigations of potential issues and to highlight areas of good practice. He also drew Council's attention to the mapping of ISSE questions to the four Trinity graduate attributes and to the work of specific TEP sub-groups and noted the usefulness of these data to help evaluate TEP outcomes in the future.

Speaking about the data generally, the Dean of Students emphasised that the scores represent respondents' perceptions, therefore, they do not directly indicate problems. Rather, poorer scores could be used to indicate areas that should be investigated and explored further. He noted that Trinity's response rate of 25% was above the national average but welcomed ideas in relation to increasing participation. Council members queried the fairly low level of student response and wondered about the efficacy of the findings and how the response rate could be

improved. It was felt that a 25% response rate, while low, should not be dismissed as it represents approximately 2,100 Trinity students, and at a national level just over 36,000 students. There is some very valuable information and many of the comments on the student experience are replicated in other College and external surveys. The Dean of Students confirmed that he has been invited to present the data to the Faculty Committee for Engineering, Mathematics and Science (EMS). As this Faculty is set to increase its student numbers, the Dean of EMS is anxious to ensure that the right interventions are made to provide a positive student experience. The Academic Secretary informed Council that the ISSE plans to include research students in its brief and there is currently a pilot exercise being conducted. She noted that Trinity has conducted its own survey of research students, and discussions on these can be found in the Quality Committee minutes in Section B of the agenda.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Students for the presentation and staff in the Quality Office for their work on the report.

Decision/Action

056.1: Council noted the ISSE Report for 2016/17.

CL/17-18/058 Creation of a new award of Doctor in Philosophia (Conjunctim)

A memorandum from the Registrar and the Academic Secretary, dated 22 November 2017, was circulated. The Registrar spoke to the matter and explained that there are opportunities for participation in European Joint Doctorates funded by the European Commission under Horizon 2020. Two projects, in which Trinity is a partner, will involve joint doctorate programmes; POLYTHEA, involving the School of Chemistry and for which funding has been secured, and INTREPID, for which the School of Biochemistry and Immunology is leading a submission for funding. It is planned that both would commence in 2018.

Speaking to the technicalities of issuing a joint award, she noted that universities in some jurisdictions are prohibited from issuing joint parchments bearing the crests of other institutions. In light of this, Trinity's policy on Joint and Dual Awards provides for the possibility of issuing multiple parchments to attest to the successful completion of a joint programme and the attainment of a joint qualification in such circumstances. The Registrar noted that precedents already exist as there are joint award titles in place for undergraduate and postgraduate taught courses.

The Academic Secretary, responding to queries, confirmed that framework agreements related to partnerships leading to joint doctorates would have to be considered by the Graduate Studies Committee (GSC) and approved by Council before they could be offered. The framework document would describe the responsibilities of each institution involved. She also noted that unlike undergraduate and postgraduate taught courses, there are no transcripts at a doctoral level. In the case of a joint doctoral programme, where the qualification cannot be attested through the production of single joint parchment, the main risk is that the graduate could claim that they have completed two or more doctorates. To minimise this risk, the parchment and the title of the award will indicate the 'jointness' of the qualification awarded. The Provost stressed his earlier point about ensuring the integrity of our awards, and queried the practices in other institutions. It was commented that by not making provision for such awards, Trinity College would not be in a position to benefit from the related Horizon 2020 funding and participating institutions are normally EU based and well regulated.

During the ensuing discussion, it was confirmed that the new award title itself would not be specifically linked to European funding programmes. The reputation of partners, especially outside the EU, was flagged as another potential risk, therefore, it was suggested that any proposals for joint doctorate partnerships would have to be considered on a case-by-case basis and such considerations would require early discussion with the relevant College Offices, including the Global Office and Trinity Teaching and Learning. It was noted that all partnerships

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

require due diligence investigations and information on how this is conducted and facilitated is available on the Global Office webpages.

Decision/Action

058.1: Council approved the creation of a new award of Doctor in Philosophia (Conjunctim), or in English, Doctor in Philosophy (Joint).

058.2: Proposals for joint PhD programmes are to be considered on a case-by-case basis involving consultation with the Dean of Graduate Studies, the Vice-President for Global Relations, Trinity Teaching & Learning, and the Research Development Office at an early stage.

058.3: Framework agreements specific to each partnership, detailing governance and operation arrangements, must be presented to GSC and to Council for consideration and approval before such joint programme are offered.

CL/17-18/059 Trinity College Dublin / L'Institut National des Sciences Appliquées de Lyon (INSA) Double Diploma Agreement

A document, prepared by the Head of the School of Engineering, Professor Henry Rice, on behalf of the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 21 November 2017, was circulated. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies brought Council through proposals by way of a presentation.

She confirmed that the School of Engineering has had a double award agreement with L'Institut National des Sciences Appliquées de Lyon (INSA) since 2003, commonly known as the double diploma. The agreement pre-existed the development of five-year integrated programmes in Engineering and Engineering with Management and the creation of the MAI (St) award. As a result, the highest awards that inbound INSA students can receive from their time in Trinity are the BAI or BSc (Ing) depending on the programme taken. She brought Council through an illustrative table describing the current programme structure for inbound INSA students and the proposed new structure. Under the new programme structure, incoming INSA students, having completed three years in Lyon, would enter the fourth year in Trinity and complete the fourth and fifth years before returning to INSA for a sixth year. Students successfully completing this programme would receive the MAI from the University of Dublin and the French Diplôme (Eng) from INSA. She also explained the structure for outbound Trinity students who would complete their first three years in Trinity, transfer to INSA for their fourth year, return to Trinity for their fifth year and then transfer back to INSA, if they choose, for a sixth year. Noting the change in the applicable awards for students entering the Engineering programme from 2016/17 onwards, she confirmed that outbound students successfully completing all six years would be eligible for the French Diplôme, in addition to the awards applicable to their Trinity programme.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies explained the second proposal from the School of Engineering. Currently, inbound INSA students are formally registered to the third year of their Trinity programme on arrival, however, they complete modules which are appropriate to the fourth year of the programme. It is requested that inbound INSA students registered for the first time in 2017/18 to the third year of Engineering or Engineering with Management have their registration status changed to being registered to the fourth year in 2017/18 and, thus, to allow for progression to the fifth year of the programme and to be eligible for the MAI (St) award on successful completion of their two years at Trinity. It was noted that students affected by this change had been consulted and had agreed to this change in status and the award of MAI (St), rather than BA and BAI for the Engineering programme or BSc (Ing) for the Engineering with Management programme. INSA students are aware that they will have to pay a postgraduate fee for Year 5 of the MAI.

Decision/Action

059.1: Council approved the proposal to revise the 'double diploma' programme for inbound INSA students to master's level leading to the MAI (St) award from 2018/19 onwards.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

059.2: Council approved the proposal to change the status of inbound INSA students registered for the first time in Trinity in 2017/18, from third year to fourth year, to allow candidates to receive the MAI (St) award on successful completion of two years at Trinity, rather than the BA and BAI awards for Engineering or the BSc (Ing.) award for the Engineering with Management programme.

CL/17-18/060 Postgraduate Course Proposal

(i) M.Sc. in Energy Science

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 27 November 2017, was circulated with a proposal for a new course in Energy Science, from the School of Physics, leading to the award of MSc with an exit award of P.Grad.Dip. Introducing the item, the Dean of Graduate Studies noted that the subject matter of this course covers the globally pressing matter of sustainable energy. If approved, the course will be taught by staff in the Schools of Physics, Chemistry, Natural Science and Engineering with the main partners in the course being the Schools of Physics, Chemistry and Natural Science.

He explained that the course may be taken over one-year full-time or two-years part time. It consists of six compulsory taught modules, one introductory module and five other specialising in various energy sources and technologies. Students will also undertake a 30 ECTS dissertation module. There will be clear linkages to the E3 Institute in the future.

He confirmed that the proposal was reviewed by Professor Graham Hughes, Chair in Environmental Fluid Mechanics, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Imperial College London. He was positive about the proposed course and suggested further enhancements to the course as it develops in the future, and the School has undertaken to make these enhancements.

It was commented by a member that the course committee comprised all male members bar one. The Dean of Graduate Studies undertook to provide that feedback to the lead proposing School.

(ii) Online Postgraduate Diploma in Clinical Exercise

Council noted that the proposal for Postgraduate Diploma in Clinical Exercise was undergoing external review and would come to a future meeting of Council for approval.

Decision/Action

060 (i) 1: Council approved the proposal for a new postgraduate course in Energy Science leading to the awards of MSc/PGradDip, and noted that it is due to commence in September 2018, noting that future enhancements in line with the external assessor recommendation will be made.

CL/17-18/061 Any Other Urgent Business

There was no other business.

SECTION B

- CL/17-18/062 Academic Appeals Committee**
XX The minutes of the meetings 7 July, 27 September and 2, 3 and 5 October 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/063 Undergraduate Studies Committee**
The draft minutes of the meeting of 21 November 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/064 Graduate Studies Committee**
The Dean of Graduate Studies highlighted the item on English language competence for postgraduate students noting that GSC had approved a proposal in relation to the 'pre-sessional' English language course delivered by the Centre for English Language Learning and Teaching. Students who achieve at least a 2.1 result on the completion of that course would meet the English language competency criterion for admissions and, therefore, would not need to present evidence of a separate IELTS/TOEFL/Cambridge score. In response to a question, he confirmed that applicants, whose first language is not English and who have already completed a degree course through English, do not need to present separate evidence of English language competency.
- The draft minutes of the meeting of 26 October 2017 were noted and approved.
- Decision/Action**
064.1: Students who achieve at least a 2.1 result on the completion of the 'pre-sessional' English language course delivered by the Centre for English Language Learning and Teaching will satisfy the English language competency criterion for admissions to postgraduate programmes and, therefore, will not need to present evidence of a separate IELTS/TOEFL/Cambridge score.
- CL/17-18/065 Human Resources Committee**
XX The minutes of the meeting of 19 October 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/066 International Committee**
The minutes of the meeting of 15 June 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/067 Quality Committee**
The minutes of the meeting of 9 November 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/068 Research Committee**
The minutes of the meetings of 16 May and 10 October 2017 were noted and approved.
- CL/17-18/069 Student Life Committee**
The minutes of the meeting of 12 October 2017 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/17-18/070 Membership of the University Council

The Council noted and approved the membership of the University Council as Representative of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science (Senior Constituency - Head of School) with immediate effect for the remainder of the term (to end 2018/19): Professor Patrick Wyse Jackson.

CL/17-18/071 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 25 October and noted by Board on 15 November 2017.

(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone

MD Donal Tighe

DChDent Fatmah Aljumah, Saleh Alkadi, Aïda Ben Cheikh

(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone

PhD Méadhbh Bríd Brosnan, Jason Andrew Cook, Sarah Elizabeth Corcoran, Catherine De Contreras, Ronan Martin Doorley, Clara Felisari, Richard Akinlabi Obafemi Komolafe, Caoimhín MacGiolla Phádraig, Ryan McGarrigle, Noor Alhusna Madzlan, Eleonora Neri, Christina Schuster, Jacopo Simoni, Mona Syrbe

MSc Alison Elizabeth McCann, James Stephen Swan.

CL/17-18/072 School Directors – School of Medicine

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Interim Head of School of Medicine, circulated, dated 8 November 2017.

CL/17-18/073 Heads of Discipline – School of Medicine

The Council noted and approved the following appointments:

(i) Professor Nick Mahony as acting Head of the Discipline of Anatomy with effect from 31 October 2017 until formal elections are arranged following the approval of the electoral register.

(ii) Professor Michelle Leech as acting Head of the Discipline of Radiation Therapy with effect from 20 November until formal elections are arranged following the approval of the electoral register.

CL/17-18/074 Request for Approval for Student to Repeat his JS year in 2018/19

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 9 November 2017.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Signed

Date