



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

**Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin**

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 7 June 2017 at 9.30 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Students, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor D Faas, Professor S Garrigan, Professor A Holohan, Professor C Gardiner, Professor S Murphy, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor C Comiskey, Professor J P Spiers, Professor M Clarke, Professor P Cronin, Professor A O'Gara, Mr N Cooke, Ms E Crespo, Ms L Peters.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Research, Professor J Walsh, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor J Jones, Professor E O Nuallain, Dr S Chandra, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Mr D Whelehan, Ms A MacPherson, Mr R Doherty, Mr M Kenyon.
<i>In attendance</i>	Academic Secretary, Secretary to the College, Librarian and College Archivist, Dr A Oldam (Director of Student Services), Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Mr P Lavelle).

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda. The Secretary to the College informed the meeting of the statements of interest received. In respect of item A5 he recommended, and Council agreed, that the Senior Tutor should withdraw for the full item concerning the Tutorial Service Working Group Report but that other members of that group present at Council, Professors A Holohan, C Gardiner and JP Spiers and Dr A Oldam, should remain and participate in the discussion. In relation to item A7(i), the proposal for a new M.Sc. course in Clinical Dentistry, he recommended, and Council agreed, that Professor M Clarke should not participate in the discussion of that item. In respect of item A9(ii), concerning the quality review of programmes in the School of Law, he recommended, and Council agreed, that the Dean of Graduate Studies, as a member of that School, be allowed to make summary remarks and then withdraw for the remainder of the item.

CL/16-17/206 Declaration
A new observer made the required statutory declaration.

CL/16-17/207 Minutes
The minutes of the meeting of 10 May 2017 were approved and signed.

CL/16-17/208 Matters Arising

- (i) **CL/16-17/179(i):** the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, in respect of the Confederal School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology quality review, recommended that the existing working group, which is chaired by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and comprises the Registrar, the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, members of the Trust Bodies and the Religions and Theology Board, be tasked with developing an implementation plan. He further recommended that the Head of School should join this group and that representatives from the external review panel be invited to act in an advisory capacity.

Decision/Action

208.1: Council approved the recommendations.

- (ii) **CL/16-17/199:** Council noted and approved the corrected version of the Staffing Summary for the Faculty of Health Sciences, dated April 2017

CL/16-17/209 Provost's Report

This item was moved up the agenda by one place. The Provost recapped on the work plan he outlined at the start of the 2016-17 academic year and provided an update in relation to each item.

- (i) The Provost spoke to the restructuring of management structures, which was completed in Michaelmas Term 2016. A Chief Officers' Group was established in December 2016 and is running on a trial basis for one year, after which it will be reviewed to ensure that it is operating well. If found to be so it will be more firmly established and information about it will be incorporated into a handbook on management structures in Trinity. He referred to a sub-group of the Chief Officers' Group, the Identity Management Committee, and noted that it had updated Trinity's visual identity guidelines and produced relevant information in a handbook, as tabled at the meeting. The Provost noted that Board approved a document concerning Trinity's branding and noted that these guidelines would be made publicly available on the University's website.
- (ii) Referring to the fundraising campaign, the Provost noted that it was progressing, albeit at a slightly slower pace than originally anticipated. Clear priorities have been set, which include the sourcing of funding for scholarships. He noted that the Campaign Forum is fully established and comprises 40 Trinity academic and administrative staff members who are attached to projects for which funding is being sought. He commented that some weaknesses had been identified in the Alumni and Development Office and that these are being addressed.
- (iii) The Provost spoke to the progress made on a number of largescale projects including the Trinity Education Project (TEP), Online Education Strategy, Estates Masterplan, Global Relations Strategy and E3 (The Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute). In relation to the latter project, he confirmed that this is expected to result in the enrolment of 1,800 additional students.

The Dean of Graduate Studies joined the meeting.

- (iv) The Provost outlined the progress made in relation to a number of capital projects noting areas of overlap with the aforementioned projects under (iii) above. He provided updates in relation to the Trinity Business School, the demolition of Oisín House, E3 and the Trinity Technology Campus, and the Cancer Institute at St James's.

- (v) The Provost commented on the strengthening of the Public Affairs and Communications function in Trinity and noted that it is collaborating well with the fundraising programme and the marketing section of the Global Relations Office.
- (vi) The Provost invited the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to provide an update in relation to the Higher Education Authority's National Review of Gender Equality in Higher Education Institutions. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that following the publication of the HEA's report, a sub-group of the Equality Committee was established to develop an implementation plan to assign responsibility to appropriate officers/areas for discrete actions. He noted that the implementation plan was submitted to, and approved by, Board in February 2017.
- (vii) The Provost spoke about his responsibilities in relation to the running of the University and provided updates in relation to general College business. Concerning funding, he highlighted the review being undertaken by the HEA in respect of the Recurrent Grant Allocation Model (RGAM) and advised that Trinity has made a submission in relation to increasing the weighting for research activity. Also on the topic of funding, he noted current national discussions in relation to increasing the National Training Levy, which is included in employers' PRSI contributions, and the opposition to this measure expressed by employers.

He noted his recent travels to Cambridge, to attend LERU's Rectors' Assembly, to Northern Ireland, to visit different alumni groups, and to Brussels to attend the Science and Business Network. He highlighted the beatification of Fr John Sullivan, a Classics graduate of the University, and confirmed that he attended the ceremony which was held in Dublin. He noted the public unveiling of several important early Irish manuscripts following their conservation and digitisation; a project funded by Bank of America Merrill Lynch through its Global Art Conservation Project. Finally, he congratulated the winners of the Provost's Teaching Awards 2017: Ms Marie Morris, School of Medicine; Professor Michael King, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy; Professor Mairead Brady, School of Business; Professor Susan O'Callaghan, School of Medicine; and Professor Anita O'Donovan, School of Medicine.

CL/16-17/210 Trinity Education Project - Governance

The Provost welcomed Ms Fedelma McNamara, the TEP Project Manager, to the meeting. A document outlining the new governance structure for TEP, dated June 2017, was circulated with a presentation on the same topic, also dated June 2017. Speaking to the new structure, the Provost noted that much had been achieved to-date by the strands and their sub-groups, however, structural reconfiguration was required to ensure successful implementation of approved proposals. He outlined the new composition and terms of reference of the TEP Steering Committee, noting that it will ensure coordination with other Trinity initiatives such as the Research Excellence Strategy, the Global Relations Strategy and the Estates Masterplan. Six new sub-groups, each with a chair and a lead, will be established and will report into the Steering Committee:

- (i) TEP Public Affairs, Marketing and Internal Communications
Chair: Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Lead: Ms Sally-Anne Fisher;
- (ii) Technology and Business Processes Re-engineering, Mainstreaming and Planning/Management of Transition and Systems
Chair: Director of IT Services, Lead: Director of Student Services;
- (iii) Trinity Electives and Approved Modules
Chair: Provost, Lead: Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies;
- (iv) Pedagogy
Chair: Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Lead: Senior Academic Developer;

- (v) Internships and Careers, Student Exchanges/Mobility and Co-curriculum Activities (Employability)
Chair: Dean of Students, Lead: Academic Secretary;
- (vi) Progression and Awards, Fixed Timetable, Learning Spaces
Chair: Associate Dean of Undergraduate Science Education, Lead: Academic Services Division Manager.

The TEP Project Manager advised that she will work with the chairs and leads on their sub-groups' work plans to ensure integration throughout the entire programme of activities.

Responding to a query from the Librarian and College Archivist, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that adjunct membership of these sub-groups might be appropriate for Library representation for particular topics; he invited her to make contact with the chairs and leads of relevant sub-groups to discuss this further.

Council noted the revised TEP governance structure, details of which will be publicised on the Trinity website, and also noted that the first meeting of the newly configured Steering Committee would take place before the end of the current academic year.

The TEP Project Manager withdrew from the meeting and the Senior Tutor withdrew for the next item.

CL/16-17/211 Tutorial Service Working Group Report

The Provost welcomed Professor Mark Bell, Chair of the Tutorial Service Working Group, to the meeting. A memorandum, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated with the Report of the Tutorial Service Working Group. Speaking to the report, Professor Bell advised that the Working Group particularly looked at the recommendations arising from the quality review of the Service and the fundamental issues highlighted through that process. The Working Group operated on the basis that its recommendations should be delivered within existing resource allocations. The report does not cover postgraduate students, though, the Working Group was cognisant of the recommendations within the 2007 quality review report and supported the integration of postgraduate students under the Tutorial Service so that they are provided with equivalent levels of support to undergraduate students. He brought Council through the recommendations:

- (i) All newly-appointed staff would normally be required to commence a three-year term as a College Tutor during their first seven years in College.
- (ii) Reduce the size of chambers to 40 tutees.
- (iii) Recognise being a tutor within local workload allocation systems.
- (iv) Reward being a tutor within the assessment for promotion.
- (v) The reduction of chamber sizes to 40 would allow tutors to actively encourage each of their tutees to meet with them once a year.
- (vi) Students should be able to request extensions for coursework without applying via their tutor.
- (vii) Students should complete applications to Student Cases and submit these via their tutor, but only if the tutor believes that the application has clear evidence of merit.
- (viii) Tutors should retain their role as advocate for the tutee within the appeals process.
- (ix) A new role of Lead Tutor(s) should be created in each School.
- (x) Improved database services should be provided to aid the role of the tutor and the Senior Tutor's Office.
- (xi) The Tutorial Service should be promoted further online and via social media.

In addition to (i) above, Professor Bell advised that the Working Group also considered a recommendation in relation to requiring existing academic staff members to undertake a three-year term as College Tutor during each ten-year period of employment with Trinity, however, he

noted that this option required further exploration with Human Resources as it could entail a change to existing terms of employment.

The following comments were made during the discussion:

- tutors would require further supports, particularly in relation to their advocacy role, if the recommendations are implemented;
- whilst student responsibility in completing their own paperwork was welcomed, care was advised to ensure that submissions to Student Cases continue to come via tutors;
- the role of Tutor is held disproportionately by junior members of academic staff and measures to redress this to enlist more senior staff members were welcomed;
- mention of pastoral responsibilities should be included in job advertisements and specifications as an initial measure to effect cultural change;
- not all staff members are suited to the pastoral aspect of the role;
- incentivisation might be more successful in relation to senior staff members, such as, considering tutorship as a criterion for senior promotion;
- the pro-active contacting of tutees by tutors was welcomed;
- tutors can currently choose between different chamber sizes, a one-sized chamber of 40 tutees might be a disincentive to some;
- there is little support offered to postgraduate students.

Responding to a number of the comments made, Professor Bell noted that greater support to tutors is envisaged through the creation of one or two Lead Tutor roles in each school to provide guidance and advice. He confirmed that chambers would have a maximum of 40 students but in some cases, a half chamber might be considered. He acknowledged that not all staff members are suited to the pastoral element, however, tutors are only required to offer a basic level of pastoral support; in more serious cases, students are referred on to appropriate services.

The possibility of requiring existing members of academic staff to undertake tutorship roles was discussed in detail. Professor Bell advised that the Working Group considered that any recommendation in relation to this category of staff would have to be worked through fully with Human Resources. The Provost suggested that a recommendation could be made using language to indicate that it is a reasonable expectation for existing academic members of staff to undertake this role, whilst not mandatory.

The Provost thanked Professor Bell and the members of the Tutorial Service Working Group.

Decision/Action

211.1: Council approved the recommendations from the Tutorial Service Working Group, as circulated.

211.2: In addition, Council agreed that it is reasonable to expect, whilst not mandatory, that existing academic staff members undertake a three-year term as a tutor within every ten-year period of employment with Trinity College.

211.3: The Secretary to the College confirmed that he would discuss the additional recommendation, in relation to existing staff members, with Human Resources and report back to Council.

Professor M Bell withdrew and the Senior Tutor returned to the meeting.

CL/16-17/212 Undergraduate Course Proposal

(i) Academic Oversight for Trinity Innovation Academy Delivered Programmes

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 4 May 2017, was circulated with a document, of the same date, concerning the Academic Oversight for Trinity Innovation Academy Delivered Programmes. Speaking to the document, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of

Undergraduate Studies advised that the Innovation Academy is part of the Innovation and Entrepreneurship Hub, which is currently located within the Academic Services Division, and is not attached to any faculty or school in Trinity. Consequently, the academic oversight framework was developed to ensure that the Innovation Academy remains independent of any school, whilst ensuring that it adheres to Trinity's policies and procedures. She advised that the Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer has set up an Entrepreneurship and Education Co-Ordination Group, with representatives from the Academy and the School of Business. The Group will meet once per term and also in the early stages of new programme development. Any conflict of interest concerns between the School of Business and the Academy should be resolved at an early stage of new developments.

The framework includes, among other things, the establishment of an Academic Oversight Committee, chaired by an Academic Director, who will sit on the Undergraduate Studies and Graduate Studies Committees, and who will also ensure that any relevant course offerings meet the requirements of specific business accrediting bodies. To this end, once a term or when a new course is in development, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer will convene an Entrepreneurship and Education Coordination Group to ensure sufficient communication with the Trinity Business School and to avoid internal competition. The framework document also provides information about course committees, programme managers, module coordinators and the Student Liaison Officer.

Following a query, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies confirmed that the faculty representatives would be nominated by the relevant faculty deans.

The Provost extended his thanks to those who had worked on the oversight document.

Decision/Action

212(i).1: Council approved the document, Academic Oversight for Trinity Innovation Academy Delivered Programmes, as circulated, subject to clarifying in the document that the faculty representatives on the Academic Oversight Committee are nominated by the relevant faculty dean.

(ii) Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 4 May 2017, was circulated with a proposal for a new course leading to a special purpose Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship at Level 7 on the National Framework of Qualifications (NFQ). The Senior Lecturer advised Council that this is a 10 ECTS course consisting of two 5 ECTS modules which can be taken by undergraduate degree students in their Senior Fresh and/or Junior Sophister year(s).

Leading to a standalone award, it will be a differentiating marker for Trinity graduates and will provide them with a valuable set of transferable skills. The programme offers a co-curricular learning experience which facilitates the development of critical thinking and the acquisition of the Trinity Graduate Attributes. It is delivered through blended learning with 70% of the course delivered online and 30% face-to-face through lectures and workshops. Students wishing to undertake the course will be required to pay a small fee of €100.

The proposal was reviewed by Professor Sofia Ritzén, of KTH Royal Institute of Technology in Stockholm, who praised the content and structure of the course and noted that it should facilitate the achievement of crucial skills needed in society.

Following queries, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies confirmed that the two modules may be taken in the same academic year or over two academic years,

the modules are additional to the student's main undergraduate studies and that consultation had taken place with Academic Registry staff. She noted that consideration should be given to subsuming these modules into the standard degree workload in the future. The Academic Secretary noted that the HEA, following a query on charging fees to registered students for another course, had confirmed that there was no restriction in this context.

Decision/Action

212(ii).1: Council approved the proposal for a new 10 ECTS course leading to a separate special purpose Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship and noted that it is due to commence in January 2018.

CL/16-17/213 Postgraduate Course Proposals

Professor M Clarke withdrew for the following sub-item.

(i) M.Sc. in Clinical Dentistry

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 22 May 2017, was circulated with a proposal from the School of Dental Science for a 30 ECTS top-up course, leading to the award of M.Sc. in Clinical Dentistry (NFQ Level 9), which is open to holders of the P.Grad.Dip. in Clinical Dentistry or holders of similar postgraduate diplomas attained in Trinity, elsewhere in Ireland or in the United Kingdom. He advised that over the next year or two, new legislation is likely to require practising dentists to undertake continuing professional development courses, whereas currently, this is done on a voluntary basis. This course has been developed to meet the expected demand.

The top-up course comprises three 10 ECTS modules covering a Research Dissertation, Fixed and Removable Prosthodontics and Paediatric Dentistry. It differs from other top-up Master's courses in Trinity in that the dissertation module does not carry 30 ECTS. This is due to the continuing professional development nature of the course, however, the 10 ECTS dissertation is expected to be of a publishable standard. Following the successful completion of the top-up course, P.Grad.Dip. holders from Trinity will have their lower award rescinded before being conferred with the Master's award.

He noted that the proposal received a very positive review from the external reviewer, Dr Ailbhe MacDonald, UCL Eastman Dental Institute in London. She praised the blended learning and assessment approaches and suggested that it would prove popular with general dental practitioners given the flexibility it affords.

Responding to a query from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer regarding the recent quality review of the School of Dental Science in which the external reviewers advised care in relation to launching new courses, the Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that this offering builds on existing provision rather than delivering something that is completely new.

Decision/Action

213(i).1: Council approved the proposal for a new 30 ECTS top-up course leading to the award of M.Sc. in Clinical Dentistry and noted that it is due to commence in September 2017

Professor M Clarke returned to the meeting.

- (ii) Postgraduate Certificate in Quantitative Methods and Data Analysis for Healthcare**
A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 25 May 2017, was circulated with a proposal from the School of Nursing and Midwifery for a new course leading to a Postgraduate Certificate in Quantitative Methods and Data Analysis for Healthcare (NFQ Level 9). It was noted that Professor C Comiskey was named in the proposal and Council agreed that she could remain in the meeting for the discussion but that she should not participate.

The Dean of Graduate Studies outlined the structure of the 30 ECTS course consisting of three 10 ECTS modules and highlighted the blended learning approach adopted. Two modules will be delivered completely online, with the third module, Healthcare Data Acquisition, Management and Analysis, delivered over an intensive one-week period through face-to-face lessons, and supported by worked examples and in-class practical tasks.

The proposal was externally reviewed by Dr Kate Flemming of the Public Health Institute, Liverpool John Moores University, who was very positive in her review and noted that it would be a useful addition to the existing continuing professional development courses on offer, providing, as it does, insights into both statistics and epidemiological concepts.

Responding to a query from the Provost, the Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that this course was bespoke to the area of healthcare and did not clash with offerings in the School of Computer Science and Statistics.

Decision/Action

213(ii).1: Council approved the proposal for a course leading to a Postgraduate Certificate in Quantitative Methods and Data Analysis for Healthcare and noted that it is due to commence in September 2017.

- (iii) M.Sc. in Ageing Health and Wellbeing in Intellectual Disability**
A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated with a proposal from the School of Nursing and Midwifery to deliver a new M.Sc. course in Ageing Health and Wellbeing in Intellectual Disability. The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced the proposal and confirmed that the proposing School had consulted with the School of Social Work and Social Policy in relation to the development of this programme.

He noted that people with intellectual disabilities are tending to live longer than before and, as they age, their needs become more complex. The course aims to provide nurses and healthcare professionals with specific skills in this area. He noted that this course will be delivered on online and via blended learning, in full-time and part-time formats. Students may exit with a Postgraduate Certificate on the completion of 30 ECTS, a Postgraduate Diploma on the successful completion of 60 ECTS or carry on to complete 90 ECTS for the award of M.Sc. Top-up course options are available for those who leave with either the Postgraduate Certificate or Postgraduate Diploma award to gain the Postgraduate Diploma or the M.Sc. award, respectively, upon successfully completing those courses and rescinding the lower qualification.

He confirmed that the course had been externally reviewed by Professor Julie Beadle-Brown, of the University of Kent, who commended the development of the course and noted that it draws richly on the expertise in the School. She commented that the course will facilitate healthcare professionals to respond skilfully to the needs of people with intellectual disabilities.

Decision/Action

213(iii).1: Council approved the proposal for a course in Ageing Health and Wellbeing in Intellectual Disability leading to the awards of M.Sc., P.Grad.Dip. and Postgraduate Certificate, with top-course available to holders of the Postgraduate Certificate or the P.Grad.Dip. to enable the attainment of the next higher award, as appropriate. Council noted that the course is due to commence in September 2017.

The Dean of Health Sciences retired from the meeting.

CL/16-17/214 Northern Ireland Report and Recommendations 2016-17

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated with a report on Northern Ireland for 2016-17. A presentation, dated 7 June 2017, was also circulated. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies brought the meeting through key recruitment figures in relation to students from Northern Ireland (NI). She noted that whilst the number of applicants from NI for entry in 2016-17 increased by almost 20% compared with 2015-16, the number of offers made as a proportion of the number of applications declined, from 32% in 2015-16 to 27% in 2016-17, as did the proportion of NI registered students at 2.52% (3.02% in 2015-16).

Referring to the NI Feasibility Study, through which up to 3 places are reserved for NI students in all undergraduate courses, bar Medicine, she confirmed that 24% of applicants through this route received an offer, compared to 27% of applicants coming through the standard route. In 2015-16 the proportion for both was 32%. The main challenges presented by this data are to increase the number of applications being made from pupils in NI and to address the low conversion of offers to acceptances. She noted that the NI market was complex with students displaying attributes similar to both domestic and non-EU student cohorts.

She referred to a survey of applicants who had not accepted offers and noted that their responses indicated that it was easier to stay in NI, the cost of living and accommodation in Dublin is off-putting and that there is little support from guidance counsellors. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies stated that 47 responses were received from the survey cohort of 166 and she confirmed that the survey would be run again. She outlined several recommendations:

- development of a targeted conversion campaign for NI students;
- continuation of the engagement programme visits to schools;
- consideration given to measures to address accommodation concerns;
- enhanced engagement with recent NI alumni;
- continuation of the NI Feasibility Study for 2018-19 entrants;
- clarification of fee status for NI students.

In the ensuing discussion, there were different views expressed in relation to setting aside accommodation for NI students with some members supporting such an action and others not. Securing accommodation in Dublin is difficult for all students and it was suggested that other universities provide better supports to students who look for off-campus rooms. It was suggested by a member that a general distance criterion could be developed for Trinity rooms rather than specifically reserving places for NI students. It was noted that the Students' Union maintains off-campus accommodation lists in Trinity and it was suggested that this could be reviewed.

In relation to fee status, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies noted that free fees are guaranteed for NI entrants in 2017-18 but beyond this it is not known.

Decision/Action

214.1: Council approved the Northern Ireland Report and Recommendations 2016-17.

214.2: The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies to provide data on NI entrants for 2017-18 to Council at the September 2017 meeting.

CL/16-17/215 Quality Assurance

(i) Review of the School of Histories and Humanities

A memorandum from the Quality Office, on behalf of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated with the report on the Quality Review of the School of Histories and Humanities. A presentation dated 29 May 2017 was also circulated.

Speaking to the item, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the School comprises a large Department of History, with smaller departments in Classics and History of Art and Architecture as well as the Trinity Centre for Gender and Women's Studies. He outlined the reviewers' main findings and recommendations. They support the School's five-year strategic plan, however, they thought that delivery of this may be difficult due to a lack of coherent processes in relation to budgetary matters and staffing. They noted a number of impending retirements and the staffing profile in the Department of History of Art and Architecture, where no staff members hold a position above Associate Professor.

They commented on the lack of adequate space and supported the School's desire for co-location. They noted that plans to extend their M.Phil. offerings could exacerbate existing issues in relation to staffing, space and Library resources. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that specific issues with access to Library resources had been addressed.

A number of concerns were raised in relation to staffing, chief among which related to the viability of the Centre for Gender and Women's Studies with its current low complement of staff. They recommended filling a number of posts across the School in addition to redressing the gender balance, particularly among senior staff members. In relation to finances, they noted the School's success in generating income and supported the initiative to introduce multi-annual budgeting. They recommended charging more for the School's summer schools and commended the Semester Start-up Programme.

They highlighted issues with long-term planning and commented that processes and systems could operate more efficiently, for example module selection and student feedback could be centralised within the School and conducted online.

The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences echoed the reviewers' concerns in relation to the Centre for Gender and Women's Studies and briefly commented on the expansion plans for the Department of History of Art and Architecture over the coming years. He noted a slight misconception in relation to the loss of senior staff due to retirements; many of these held personal chairs, therefore, it would not be normal to replace these at the same level. He felt that the focus on space and resources did not do the School any justice as the academic achievements and strengths of the School were not showcased.

In the discussion that followed, it was noted that there were some improvements that the School could make that would not require additional resources, such as streamlining processes and making use of College online resources. It was commented that the report was not the most incisive, it did not include particular recommendations in relation to research activities and did not include any data. The Provost questioned the overall usefulness of the report and commented that the recommendations were not particularly clear.

Decision/Action

215(i).1: Council approved the report on the Quality Review of the School of Histories and Humanities and the external reviewers' recommendations, as circulated.

(ii) Review of the Law Programmes

A memorandum from the Quality Office, on behalf of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated along with the report on the Quality Review of the Law Programmes. A presentation, dated 29 May 2017, was also circulated.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented on the different focus adopted in this review, which looked at the Law programmes rather than the School of Law itself. He commended the format of the report, noting that the reviewers made precise and insightful recommendations.

He summarised their findings. They noted the strong ranking performance of the School and commented that the School is facing similar issues to other law schools around the world. They suggested care in relation to introducing new programmes to avoid diluting the quality of the current educational offerings. They supported the development of a new Law School building or at least expanding and modernising existing spaces to assist the School in the delivery of its programmes and to better facilitate its work.

Commenting on the programmes, they applauded the delivery of undergraduate teaching by senior staff members. They suggested that a formal review of the year abroad should be initiated and that opportunities for experiential learning, through placements and internships, should be expanded. They noted that options should be explored in relation to approved modules within the new TEP structures. Speaking to the law programmes run in conjunction with other schools, they noted that greater negotiation is required in relation to these and recommended that these courses appoint coordinators with overall programme responsibility and to act as a single point of contact for students. They queried the sustainability of the Law and French programme and voiced concerns in relation to the Law and German programme, the delivery of which relies heavily on particular staff members, thus making it vulnerable. Turning to postgraduate courses, they recommended tailoring offerings for international students, introducing a system for the double marking of dissertations and providing open book examinations. They generally supported the use of formative assessments and encouraged more opportunities for active learning.

The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Science commented on the practical nature and usefulness of the report. He noted that its recommendations were largely pedagogical in nature, therefore, not strictly within his remit. He did note the comments made in relation to the Law and French and Law and German courses and advised that he has spoken to the relevant Heads of School.

The Dean of Graduate Studies commented that the L.L.M. could be further streamlined and packaged to increase its attractiveness to non-EU students and noted that a series of marketing workshops have been scheduled to take place in September/October for this purpose. He also advised that the Graduate Studies Committee (GSC) is due to discuss dissertations at the start of the coming academic year, in terms of what is perceived by the dissertation and whether it could be more innovative in nature.

The Dean of Graduate Studies withdrew for the remainder of the item.

The Provost commented on the contrasting styles of the two quality review reports considered by Council. The Academic Secretary noted that the review report concerning the School of Histories and Humanities was very similar to reports emanating from their previous reviews. This issue has been discussed at the Quality Committee where thematic reviews of Schools have been endorsed, for example by looking at specific topics such as programme delivery. She commented that the School of Law was very open to this new type of review and she suggested that the review of the School of Histories and Humanities did not do it justice; there was no sense of the School's dynamism in the report. She confirmed that review reports become available online after they are considered by Council and that consultation occurs with all schools well in advance of their scheduled review to ascertain the most useful review format.

The Provost commended the work of the Quality Office and the Quality Committee in relation to promoting different review types thereby ensuring continued relevance.

Decision/Action

215(ii).1: Council approved the report on the Quality Review of the Law programmes and the external reviewers' recommendations, as circulated.

The Dean of Graduate Studies returned to the meeting.

CL/16-17/216 Virtual Learning Environment Policy

The Provost welcomed Professor Tim Savage, Associate Dean for Online Education, to the meeting. A policy document on Trinity's Virtual Learning Environment (VLE), dated 30 May 2017, was circulated, as was a related presentation, dated 7 June 2017. The Associate Dean for Online Education spoke to the purpose and benefits of the policy which are to support the development of technology-enhanced learning, enhance the student experience, support innovative teaching strategies and to build digital capacity. He advised that the policy has three main elements. Firstly, it supports the use of a single institutional VLE as a single point of access to teaching and learning resources and information. This does not preclude the use of additional environments or tools but these should be supplementary to the institutional VLE. Secondly, the policy outlines minimum content specifications in relation to course and module information and lecturer content, as determined by each lecturer. Thirdly, it is to promote compliance with information and data policies.

He thanked the members of the VLE Policy Working Group and each of the areas consulted in the finalisation of the document.

Responding to a question about student entitlements under the policy and potential grounds for appeal, the Associate Dean for Online Education commented that there is no rigid timeline for adoption; this has been left to each academic staff member though it should be done in a timely manner. In relation to the Trinity Accessible Information Policy and Guidelines, he noted that the VLE Policy further supports their use, though enforcement of these is not within the scope of this document. In relation to technical difficulties with Blackboard, he responded that these are also outside the scope of the policy and are the responsibility of IT Services or the Academic Registry, depending on the specific issue. He confirmed that IT Services are implementing enhancements and tighter timelines to address specific issues.

The Provost noted that Professor Savage would soon finish his term as the first Associate Dean for Online Education and thanked him warmly.

Decision/Action

216.1: Council approved the Policy on the Trinity Virtual Learning Environment, as circulated.

The Associate Dean for Online Education withdrew from the meeting.

CL/16-17/217 Entrance Exhibitioners

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 1 June 2017, was circulated. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies advised that the purpose of the memorandum was to invite Council to consider if it would be appropriate to investigate alternative methods of allocating Entrance Exhibitions to entrants. Currently, students who have achieved 560 points in their Leaving Certificate examination, not including bonus points for higher level mathematics, are awarded this prize. It consists of a book token worth €150 and an invitation to the students concerned, their parents/guardians and school principals, to a reception in Michaelmas Term in their honour.

She noted that it is timely to consider if there are more appropriate ways to award these prizes, for example, by awarding it to students accepted to the Junior Fresh year who achieve the highest points among Trinity entrants from his/her secondary school. If Council endorses the consideration of an alternative system, there must be clarity in relation to what Trinity wishes to reward and transparency in relation to the criteria.

The positive impact of such an alternative method on smaller secondary schools was noted. It was suggested by a member that if Trinity wishes to continue to reward excellence that a minimum points threshold should be considered. Responding to a query, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies noted that if this or a similar scheme were adopted, it could only apply to Irish schools and the Leaving Certificate examination, therefore, consideration would have to be given to a different mechanism, if any, for Junior Fresh entrants coming from schools outside Ireland.

Decision/Action

217.1: Council endorsed the development of an alternative method of awarding Entrance Exhibitions, including for entrants to Trinity from schools outside Ireland.

217.2: The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies is to bring a full proposal to Council as early as possible in Michaelmas Term 2017, for consideration and approval.

217.3: The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies is to investigate how quickly such a mechanism could be implemented following Council approval.

Professor JP Spiers retired from the meeting.

CL/16-17/218 Proposed New Postgraduate Studentship Model

The Provost welcomed Professor Gerard McHugh, Associate Vice-President for Global Relations/Dean of Development, to the meeting. A paper from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 1 May 2017, was circulated. The Dean of Graduate Studies spoke to the item noting that there is a scheme of research studentships administered by Graduate Studies, informally called the '1252 Awards'. There are 65 of these awards made which cover PhD fees and a small stipend of €6,500 annually. These are currently allocated proportionately to faculty deans based on the number of PhDs awarded in each faculty in the previous year. The faculty deans normally use the same proportional mechanism to award these to schools who, in turn, award them to the best students.

There are a number of issues identified with the current 1252 scheme, in that the stipend is small and insufficient to cover living costs, awarding it to the best student applicant does not always align with external funding mechanisms which are based on project-based applications from Principal Investigators (PIs) and include the cost of a PhD studentship, and there is no learning benefit for the supervisor to gain experience of writing funding proposals or managing grants, post-award.

Under the proposed new model the studentships would be renamed the 'Alumni Studentships' given the significant level of funding from that source. These studentships would be of a four-year duration and would cover student fees (EU or Non-EU) and a stipend of €16,000. Significantly, they would not be made to students directly but to Assistant or Associate Professors on a competitive basis following the submission of a project application. Successful staff members would be able to advertise for PhD students to work on their project, whilst completing their PhD research under the supervision of that staff member.

He acknowledged that the proposal adopts a funding model from the area of science but, with careful thought, it could be adapted to work well in the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Science. It could lead to an imbalance of awards to the Faculties of Engineering, Mathematics and Science and Health Sciences, where academic staff members have experience of similar funding mechanisms, therefore, the committee making decisions with respect to these awards will allocate them in the same proportions as apply to the 1252 Awards, that is, based on the number of approved PhD awards in the previous years. He noted that the scheme is intended to help strengthen the career profile of more junior professors and, further, that there is no barrier to co-supervision in conjunction with more senior academic staff members. He commented that 25, of the current 1252 awards will continue to be awarded as they are now.

Commenting on fundraising, the Associate Vice-President for Global Relations/Dean of Development advised that the new scheme would require additional funds of €400,000 to make awards per year, which means that funding of €1.6 million would be required when it is fully implemented. It is likely that funding would have to be sought from industry and charitable foundations in addition to alumni donors. He confirmed that sufficient funding is in place for the first two years of the initiative.

Concerns were expressed in relation to trying to apply a science-based funding model to the arts and humanities and in relation to industry potentially trying to influence the type of research conducted. It was suggested that an alternative name be used for the award scheme since 'alumni' is a masculine noun and that the word scholarship should perhaps be used instead of studentship. The Dean of Graduate Studies suggested some ways in which the scheme could work in the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences.

The Provost suggested that, if adopted, the scheme could be reviewed after a year to ensure fairness and to consider any unintended consequences.

Decision/Action

218.1: Council approved the proposed new studentship model, subject to amending the title of the award scheme.

218.2: Council requested a full review of the scheme after its first year of operation.

The Associate Vice-President for Global Relations/Dean of Development withdrew and Professors C Comiskey and S Garrigan retired from the meeting.

CL/16-17/219 U-Lead Update Report

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 30 May 2017, was circulated. Speaking to the item, he reminded members that the purpose of U-Lead was to provide an overarching structure intended to maximise impact and to achieve greater coherency and integration of academic development and support activities. Due to a change in personnel progress has been slow to-date. He noted that Dr Daniel Rogers is the new Director of this initiative. Immediate priorities have been identified, which are to:

- (i) oversee the development of a web portal in which all programmes will be visible and presented coherently;

- (ii) develop a communications strategy which provides some coherence and visibility across the whole programme and reduces the over-reliance on mailing lists;
- (iii) carry out a resource analysis to identify all continuing professional development offerings relevant to academic members of staff at Trinity and investigate how these are currently delivered and how they are themed to identify any gaps;
- (iv) begin to develop a short video series around inspiring academic leaders at Trinity.

He requested Council to grant an extension of the U-Lead programme for a further year before a determination is made whether or not to continue with the initiative. The Provost commented that the implementation of TEP is likely to require a different approach to academic development and that this will supersede U-Lead.

Decision/Action

219.1: Council approved the continuation of the U-Lead project for a further year.

CL/16-17/220 Library Annual Report 2015-16

The Library Annual Report for 2015-16 was circulated to Council. Speaking briefly, due to time constraints, the Librarian and College Archivist noted that this was the first annual report following the publication of the Strategy for the Library 2015-2020. The annual report follows the format of that strategy by reporting on activities under its five main pillars:

- Integrated Space
- Integrated Digital
- Integration into Teaching, Learning and Research
- Prioritised Funding
- Inter-related Policies and Programmes

Decision/Action

220.1: Council approved Library Annual Report 2015-16.

Professor P Cronin retired from the meeting

CL/16-17/221 Any Other Urgent Business

Responding to a query, the Provost confirmed that there was no alternative to the academic year structure, approved by Council in February 2017 (CL/16-17/100), being developed or proposed.

SECTION B

CL/16-17/222 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies drew Council's attention to several items across both sets of minutes. These included the course proposals for four dual degree programmes to be delivered in conjunction with Columbia University, the change in title from Business Studies to Global Business (CAO entry code TR080), an update on widening participation activities and proposals, the CAVE Report on the Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study and the extension of that study by a further year, the consideration of Calendar Changes for 2017-18 and the changed admission requirements for Pharmacy.

The draft minutes of the meetings of 23 May and 30 May 2017 were noted and approved.

CL/16-17/223 Graduate Studies Committee

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The draft minutes of the meeting of 18 May 2017 were noted and approved along with the Dean of Graduate Studies Annual Report 2015-16.

CL/16-17/224 Human Resources Committee

The minutes of the meeting of 13 April 2017 were noted and approved.

CL/16-17/225 International Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 13 April 2017 were noted and approved.

Dr A Oldam retired from the meeting.

CL/16-17/226 Quality Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 18 May 2017 were noted and approved along with the progress report for the School of Chemistry.

CL/16-17/227 Research Committee

The minutes of the meeting of 18 April 2017 were noted and approved.

CL/16-17/228 Student Life Committee

The minutes of the meeting of 25 April 2017 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

CL/16-17/229 Administrative Arrangements in the Summer Session

The Council noted that items of routine College business relating to Council would be dealt with by the Provost or Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer during the Summer Session, 3 July 2017 to 27 August 2017, and a report would be made to Council at its first meeting of Michaelmas Term 2017 on 27 September 2017.

CL/16-17/230 Membership of the University Council 2017-2018

The Council noted and approved the membership of the University Council, as follows:

- (i) Faculty of Health Sciences (2017-2020)
 - (a) Senior Constituency – Head of School: Professor Anne-Marie Brady (Nursing and Midwifery)
 - (b) Senior Constituency: Professor Rose-Anne Kenny (Medicine)
 - (c) Junior Constituency: Professor Mary Clarke (Dental Science) (second term)
 - (d) Junior Constituency: Professor Margarita Corry (Nursing & Midwifery)
- (ii) Senate (2017-2019): Ms Simone Cameron-Coen (second term)
- (iii) Students' Union
 - Education Officer: Ms Alice MacPherson
 - AHSS Representative: Mr Colm O'Halloran
 - EMS Representative: Mr Paul Shanahan
- (iv) Graduate Students' Union – Vice President: Mr Madhav Bhargav
- (vi) Co-opted (2017-2018): The Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor Juliette Hussey) and the Dean of Students (Professor Kevin O'Kelly)
- (vii) Observer - Secretary to the Scholars: Mr Patrick Lavelle

CL/16-17/231 Committee Membership**(i) Junior Academic Progressions Committee**

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 29 May 2017.

(ii) Faculty Review Committees Membership 2016/17

The Council noted the Memorandum from the Acting Secretary, Senior Academic Promotions Committee, circulated, dated 2 June 2017.

CL/16-17/232 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 May 2017 and noted by Board on 24 May 2017.

(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone

MD Shanti Mahabir

(ii) Higher Degrees by Publication

ScD Patrick Wyse Jackson

(iii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone

PhD Margot Blankier; Anne Burke; Tom Burke; Peter Gerard Connell; Anne-Marie Connolly; Astero Constantinou; Val Corbett; Jonathan Creasy; Michele Crepaz; Amy Ann Devlin; Emily Dillon; Saman Feghhi; Anna Festa; Sarah Geiger; Michael Gibbons; Mairéad Grogan; Bora Im; Jonathan Michael Johnston; Colin Patrick Kenny; Grainne Kirwan; Sandrine Valerie Laurant; Rui David Leite Portele Martiniano; Stella Long; Neal Edward Mc Bride; Stephen McQuillan; Sara Beth Mitchell; Chandre Monerawela; Marie Morris; Frank Slyne; Anne Michelle Spirtos; Mary Stefanazzi; Sorcha Stegall; Vanessa Theresa Stout; Deirdre Marie Twomey; Mai Yatani; Mengyang Zhang.

DChDent Mohammad Alotaibi

MSc Timothy Costigan; Nicola Keohane; Brian William Mc Guinness; Siti Noor Ilaina Mohamed Khairulzaman; Cormac Molloy; Eve Roseingrave; Alice Ruth Waugh.

MLitt Hamish Forsyth; Kevin Francis Kennedy; Deirdre Fíne Molumby.

CL/16-17/233 Heads of School

The Council noted that the Board had approved the following nominations as Heads of School at its meeting of 24 May 2017:

(i) Nursing and Midwifery: Professor Anne-Marie Brady for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.

(ii) Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences: Professor Anne-Marie Healy for a second term of two years from 3 July 2017.

(iii) Medicine: Extension of term as Interim Head of School of Professor Paul Browne to 31 May 2017.

(iv) Biochemistry and Immunology: Professor Ed Lavelle for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.

- (v) **Computer Science and Statistics:** Professor Carol O'Sullivan for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.
- (vi) **Chemistry:** Professor Mike Lyons for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.
- (vii) **Education:** Professor Andrew Loxley for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.
- (viii) **Histories and Humanities:** Professor Christine Morris for a three-year term from 3rd July 2017.
- (ix) **Genetics and Microbiology:** Professor Charles Dorman for a second consecutive term of three years from 3rd July 2017.

CL/16-17/234 School Directors

The Council noted and approved the following appointments, to commence 3 July 2017:

- (i) **School of Creative Arts**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Nicholas Johnson for a two-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor Paula Quigley, for a two-year term.
- (ii) **School of Dental Science**
 Director of Research: Professor Jeffrey O'Sullivan for a two-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Derek Sullivan for a second term of two years;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor Michael O'Sullivan for a second term of two years.
- (iii) **Confederal School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor David Shepherd for a one-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Cathriona Russell for a one-year term;
 Director of Research: Professor Jacob Erickson for a one-year term.
- (iv) **Trinity Business School**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Kristian Myrseth for a two-year term;
 Director of Research: Professor Brian Lucey for a second term of one-year.
- (v) **School of Computer Science and Statistics**
 Director of Research: Professor Declan O'Sullivan for a two-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor Owen Conlan for a two-year term.
- (vi) **School of Education**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor John Walsh, retrospectively from 22 Feb 2017 (to replace Professor Andrew Loxley who was appointed as Acting Head of School) to end of Trinity Term 2018.
- (vii) **School of Social Sciences and Philosophy**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Michael Wycherley for a two-year term.
- (viii) **School of Nursing and Midwifery**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor Fiona Timmins for a two-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Naomi Elliott for a two-year term;
 Director of International Initiatives: Professor Frances O'Brien for a two-year term.
- (ix) **Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Rachel Hoare for a two-year term;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor Justin Doherty for a two-year term;
 Director of Research: Professor Brian Brewer for a two-year term.
- (x) **Social Work and Social Policy**

Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor Philip Curry for a three-year term.

CL/16-17/235 Heads of Discipline

The Council noted and approved the following appointments, to commence 3 July 2017:

- (i) **Engineering**
Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering: Professor Daniel Kelly for a first term of three years.
- (ii) **Biochemistry and Immunology**
Biochemistry: Professor Daniela Zisterer for a first term of three years.
Immunology: Professor Luke O’Neill for a first term of three years.
- (iii) **Genetics and Microbiology**
Microbiology: Professor Alastair Fleming for a first term of three years.
- (iv) **Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies**
Hispanic Studies: Professor Susana Bayó Belenguer for a second term of three years;
Germanic Studies: Professor Mary Cosgrove for a first term of three years.
- (v) **Nursing and Midwifery**
Mental Health in Nursing: Professor Brian Keogh for a first term of three years;
General Nursing: Professor Louise Daly for a first term of three years.

CL/16-17/236 Centre Director – European Studies

The Council noted and approved the appointment of Professor Balazs Apor as Director of the Centre for European Studies for a three-year term commencing 3 July 2017.

CL/16-17/237 Examinations outside the formal annual and supplemental examination sessions – 2017/18

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Activity Lead - Assess, Progress and Graduation, circulated, dated 30 May 2017.

CL/16-17/238 Course Title Change from Business Studies to Global Business

The Council noted and approved the Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 29 May 2017.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

The Provost thanked all outgoing members for their service on the University Council.

Signed

Date