



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 21 October 2015 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor D Faas, Professor A Holohan, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor R Dahyot, Professor J P Spiers, Professor C Comiskey, Professor P Cronin, Professor M Clarke, Dr S Bloomfield, Professor D Kelleher, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Dr G Hegarty, Ms M Kenny, Mr J Bryant, Mr M McInerney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Students, Professor C Morash, Professor J Walsh, Professor I Donohue, Dean of Health Sciences, Ms P O'Beirne, Mr D Whelehan, Chief Operating Officer, Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall).
<i>In attendance</i>	Academic Secretary, Librarian and College Archivist, Secretary to the College, Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	None
<i>By invitation</i>	Professor P Geoghegan

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. The Vice-President of Global Relations and Professor R Dahyot both declared an interest in item D.20/CL/15-16/045 and it was noted that they would step out of the meeting during its discussion.

CL/15-16/025 Statutory Declaration

A new member made the statutory declaration.

CL/15-16/026 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of 23 September were approved and signed.

CL/15-16/027 Matters Arising

- (i) **CL/15-16/008:** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that financial plan for the expansion of the School of Business provides for the costs associated with the expected increase in student numbers. In the case of non-EU students this would be as per the figure provided under the second Global Relations Strategy. She noted that the financial template accompanying course proposals does not adequately reflect the way in which allocations are made and that work will be undertaken at the faculty level to revise the template in this regard.

- (ii) **CL/15-16/005 (ii):** The Dean of Research confirmed that elements of the revised International Policy related to research funding are being addressed by the Ethics Committee, and recommendations will be made to the Research Committee and Council in due course.

CL/15-16/028 Provost's Report

Noting the length of the agenda and the comprehensive report provided at the previous meeting, the Provost advised that he would defer his report to the next meeting of Council.

CL/15-16/029 Trinity Education Project – overview and timeline

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer spoke to this item by way of a presentation. She noted that draft graduate attributes had been discussed by Council previously in June 2015 (CL/14-15/195) and were in the process of being refined. She provided an update to Council on the Education Project noting that the membership and terms of reference for the Steering Committee, and for the project strands, were in place; overarching timelines have been agreed; a project manager has been appointed; and a phase of communication and engagement has commenced.

She outlined the stages of an indicative timeline for the delivery of a new suite of undergraduate courses for the 2018/19 academic year, in addition to detailing the following project strands:

- (i) Stakeholder Management, Communication and Resources
- (ii) Curriculum Principles and Architecture
- (iii) Assessment
- (iv) Internships and Study Abroad
- (v) Technology Enhanced Learning
- (vi) Learning Spaces
- (vii) Differentiation and Positioning (branding)

She explained that each strand reports into the project Steering Committee with each strand leader sitting as a member thereof. Focusing on Curriculum Principles and Architecture, she noted that this strand will look at the shape of undergraduate education in Trinity and will develop principles that will guide the implementation of the graduate attributes into the undergraduate curriculum. It incorporates the review of Science (TR071) and will look at the structure of the Two Subject Moderatorship. These guiding principles are due to be circulated to Council in November 2015, with follow-on examples to be presented subsequently in January 2016. Following this, there will be two to three months for Trinity to decide on preferred curricular elements and then approximately a year for schools to plan and design course curricula to meet the agreed structure. She noted that the Trinity Education Project will look to further modularise the undergraduate education and to simplify progression requirements.

Some concerns were raised by members in relation to the additional difficulties faced by schools delivering professionally accredited courses and with the outlined timeline, which does not seem to allow sufficient lead-in time to alter minimum course entry requirements ahead of the 2018/19 deadline.

Council was informed that a meeting with employers who hire the largest number of Trinity graduates would take place on 9 November 2015, in the Science Gallery, to gather their input and to help refine the graduate attributes. Council was further informed that the revised graduate attributes and guiding principles would be circulated to its next meeting.

Council noted the updates on the Trinity Education Project.

CL/15-16/030 Dual and Joint Degrees

A memorandum from the Registrar and Academic Secretary, dated October 2015, was circulated, along with tabulated information on current collaborative Trinity courses and the policy document on Dual and Joint Awards. Introducing the item, the Registrar noted that the policy document had been considered by Council previously (CL/14-15/196) but, given the complexity of issues and terminology, it was decided that it should come back for consideration supported by a clarifying diagram.

Speaking to the policy, she advised that its purpose is to support the attainment of goals in the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 with respect to national and international partnerships by providing a framework to develop such partnerships. The policy is underpinned by a number of principles, primarily to protect Trinity's reputation and academic standing. These are, the:

- protection of the reputation of Trinity, nationally and internationally;
- protection and maintenance of the academic integrity and reputation of academic programmes offered in Trinity and the awards conferred;
- avoidance, where possible, of double counting of credits towards awards;
- consolidation of Trinity's position as Ireland's premier university;
- facilitation of collaboration with HEIs and other awarding bodies that will enhance Trinity's global presence and reputation.

She cautioned that such partnerships should not be entered solely for financial benefit as these collaborations are generally very resource intensive with no financial benefits to the University.

The Academic Secretary brought Council through the table containing information on Trinity's current provision under the headings of dual programmes and joint programmes to explain the different types of course configurations and the awards to which they may lead. It was noted that Trinity does not currently engage in joint programmes leading to multiple awards, though such engagement may be necessary in the future if Trinity collaborates with institutions in jurisdictions where the issuing of joint degrees is prohibited.

The policy document was welcomed though a word of caution was expressed in relation to ensuring that sufficient infrastructure is put in place to facilitate the registration and progression of students with dual registration status.

Council noted and approved the policy document on Dual and Joint Awards.

CL/15-16/031 Ussher Assistant Professors Recruitment Campaign

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 13 October 2015, concerning the process for awarding Ussher Assistant Professorships positions to Schools was circulated along with a list of the successful applications. Information on the conditions and expectations attached to each post to which each Head of School, on behalf of the School Executive, agrees, was also provided. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the onus to meet the conditions and expectations overall lies on the schools rather than the eventual appointees, though the appointee will contribute to capacity in those schools. She outlined the timeline for different stages of the recruitment process and noted that the 40 posts would be advertised collectively, nationally and internationally, towards the end of 2015 and into early 2016. She highlighted that the posts are funded by non-exchequer income.

Responding to comments and queries, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that the schools receiving these posts must undertake to mentor and nurture those appointed and that the appointees would be expected to engage in the full range of academic activities which includes service to College. She also confirmed that the final proposal for the tenure track recruitment of early career academics would come back to Council for approval before the end of the Calendar year. The opportunity for the Library to be involved with the new Ussher posts

was welcomed and it was noted there had been enormous value in the discussions about potential collaborations across the Schools and that several of the successful posts involved the Library.

Council approved all the positions and their conditions, as listed, apart from the Assistant Professorship in Medieval and Early Modern Literature in the School of English. It was noted that this post would return to the next meeting of Council following clarification and refinement of the associated expectations and conditions.

CL/15-16/032 Report of 2015 Senior Academic Promotions Statistics

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 13 October 2015, was circulated along with statistics on Senior Academic Promotions 2015 in terms of the number of applications (total and breakdown by Faculty), the number of those who were shortlisted, and, of those, the number who were successful broken down by gender for each of the categories of Personal Chair, Professor, Associate Professor. Information was also provided in relation to previous promotion rounds in 2014 and 2014, for comparison purposes.

Council noted the statistics on Senior Academic Promotions 2015, as circulated.

Professor D Faas retired from the meeting.

CL/15-16/033 Postgraduate Course Proposals – School of Business

This item was taken before the item on the Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study.

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 15 October 2015, was circulated along with three postgraduate course proposals from the School of Business:

M.Sc. in Management with Accounting
M.Sc. in Management with Finance
M.Sc. in Management with Marketing

Introducing the proposals, the Dean of Graduate Studies noted that these courses comprise and build on a core set of management modules taken with modules in other subjects, namely, accounting, finance and marketing; these combinations are not available in other universities in Ireland. The structure is the same for each course and comprises a taught element of 60 ECTS, made up of modules carrying 5 ECTS each, and a dissertation and research methods element comprising 30 ECTS. Each course is one-year, full-time and provides for an exit postgraduate diploma.

Entry to each of the courses would require a minimum 2.1 honours Bachelor degree result in any academic area. She noted that the courses are aimed towards students who have not studied business previously and are designed to 'upskill' graduates.

She stated that the proposals were reviewed by Professor Raj Aggarwal, University of Akron, in Ohio who provided comments on specific module topics and themes; these were consequently addressed and will continue to be addressed as additional module options are developed. Overall, he provided a very positive review of the courses noting their excellence and recommended their approval.

Responding to a query, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that there was one further course proposal, an M.Sc. in International Finance, due to come to Council for approval. She noted that the School of Business are currently making some revisions to that proposal following comments by the external reviewer. It was also confirmed that growth plan for the School of Business included the costs for a number of additional academic posts.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Council approved the establishment of three new courses leading to M.Sc. awards in Management with Accounting, Management with Finance and Management with Marketing, each of which allows for an exit P. Grad. Dip., and noted that the courses were due to commence in September 2016.

Professor P Geoghegan joined the meeting.

CL/15-16/034 Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study - Update

The Provost welcomed Professor Patrick Geoghegan, former Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer and Project Sponsor, to the meeting to talk to proposed adjustments to the Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study.

Professor Geoghegan, introducing the item commented that Council, at its meeting of 13 May 2015, approved a one-year extension to the Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study (CL/14-15/169) and requested to be notified of any future adjustments.

He updated Council on to the operation of the study in its second year and noted that there was a reduction in administrative workload primarily due to the Central Applications Office (CAO) supplying the relative performance rank data as a matter of course and through streamlining the way in which the personal statements were read and scored.

He referred to the circulated document which provided three options in relation to the study in its third year:

- (i) **No change** - calculate the three modalities as before, with each one weighted equally. It would require no additional work, and would provide a similar set of data for analysis, however, it is unlikely to reveal anything different from the first two years.
- (ii) **Weight the three modalities differently** - change the weightings of the different modalities (or scales). - There has been most support internally and externally for the relative performance ranking (RPR) element and it is also the element that can be scaled-up most easily and cost-effectively, therefore, increasing its weighting could be justified.
- (iii) **Using the personal statement as a qualifier only** - every applicant would be required to complete the personal statement, but it is not scored 1-6 as before. Instead it scored as Pass (effectively 1-4 in the current scale) or Fail (5-6 in the current scale, meaning incomplete, plagiarised, or showing no suitability at all for the courses). Applicants who proceed following this stage are scored using Leaving Certificate results and their RPR equally.

He stated that the third option, the most radical, was his preferred option. He commented that a substantial number of students had ticked the box to take part in the process over the last two years but did not submit any personal statement, therefore, the completion of a personal statement, in itself, was a good way of identifying those with the determination and willingness to do something extra to get into their chosen course in Trinity. Option three would reduce costs considerably, while still maintaining the personal statement as an element. He noted that scores for students' personal statements tend to bunch in the middle category (3-4). Further, option three is supported by the Department of Education and Skills and the Undergraduate Studies Committee (USC).

The possible effects of implementing the third option were discussed. It was suggested by a member that it might lead to an increase in the number of personal statements submitted but the opposing view was also expressed. It was also suggested that the quality of personal statements might decline overall. Whatever option is chosen, Professor Geoghegan stressed that the details will be explicitly communicated to applicants.

Responding to queries, Professor Geoghegan commented that very few applicants (6/7) fail the personal statement outright and for those that did it was mainly because the statement was either incomplete or because plagiarism was detected. Students admitted under the study are tracked throughout their undergraduate studies and there has been an anonymous questionnaire. Research on the study will be carried out CAVE (Cultures, Academic Values and Education Research Centre) in the School of Education. Commenting on the final outcomes of the study and what would determine its success, Professor Geoghegan highlighted that the entry mechanism works as designed and that he hoped that elements of the study, even if not used in the future for admissions purposes, could be found to have other beneficial uses, for example, the RPR element could be incorporated into the award of Entrance Exhibitioners.

The Provost commented that it would be interesting to see how students, admitted through the study, perform relative to students submitted via the traditional CAO route. In response, Professor Geoghegan noted that the study has generated useful data, not only concerning those admitted via this mechanism, but also on the wider pool of applicants under this scheme who were admitted subsequently having attained sufficient CAO points.

Council approved the adjustment of the Trinity Admissions Feasibility Study in its third year through the implementation of the third option. The Provost thanked and commended Professor Geoghegan for his work on this project.

Professor Geoghegan left the meeting.

CL/15-16/035 Any Other Urgent Business

There were no other items of business.

SECTION B

CL/15-16/036 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer drew attention to the discussion concerning the pressurised appeals period following the supplemental examination session and the very tight timeframe in which results are published and appeals may be lodged and heard. This year, whilst the number of cases coming before the various courts of first appeal reduced slightly (201), the number of cases made directly to the Academic Appeals Committee, having bypassed the appropriate court of first appeal, had increased 29 (out of the 47 cases taken to Academic Appeal). She reported that she had convened a working group to consider the issues comprising the Senior Lecturer (chair), Registrar, Senior Tutor, a school administrator, a director of teaching and learning (undergraduate) and administrative support and advice from Trinity Teaching and Learning.

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 13 October 2015.

CL/15-16/037 Graduate Studies Committee

The draft minutes of 24 September 2015 were noted and approved.

CL/15-16/038 Research Committee

The Dean of Research highlighted the changed composition of Research Committee meetings which is being introduced to improve the efficiency and quality of meetings. He confirmed that whilst the overall number of attendees would be reduced, that the faculty balance would be maintained and that meetings for all Directors of Research would be held, one at the start and the one at the end of the academic year.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The draft minutes of 6 October 2015 were noted and approved.

CL/15-16/039 Academic Appeals Committee

XX

The draft minutes of meetings of 28, 29 and 30 September along with those from 1, 2, 5 and 6 October 2015 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

CL/15-16/040 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 September 2015 and noted by Board on 7 October 2015.

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

DChDent Dalya Al Moghrabi; Joe Hennessy.

D.Ed. Paul Francis Condell.

MD Jeyanthi Kulasegarah; Roisin Morgan; Brendan Joseph Patrick O Shea; Aamir Saleem; Helen Tuite.

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

PhD Roisin Louise Adams; Md Saniul Alam; Barry Aldwell; Ciara Máirín Barrett; Eva Barrett; Richard Carroll; Jamie Blake Knox; Laura Brady; William Richard Brazil; Lorcan John Brennan; Elizabeth Carroll; Marco Paulo Barbosa Conceicao; Michelle Cotter; Edmond Coughlan; Lucy Crockford; Thomas Joseph Cronin; Michael Patrick Curran; Brian Dempsey; Emanuele Di Pascale; Thinh Doan; Peter Kevin Timothy Doherty; Katie Dunne; Claire-Louise Fagan; Louise Flynn; Laura Foley; Ronald Andrew Geobey; Atje Gercama; Michele Giblin; Shane Gormley; Patricia Elizabeth Hanna; Conor Maurice Henry; Thomas Higgins; Jo-Hanna Ivers; Mohammed Kasasbeh; Aengus Kelly; Axel Kelly; Isabelle Killane; Chantal Kobel; Annariina Marjaana Koivu; Britta Lang; Eoin Patrick Lynch; Anna Malgorzata Malara; Claire-Louise Noelle Mann; Michaela Markova; Peter May; Conor Mc Ginn; Anne Marie McInerney; Aoife Louise McMahon; Aoife Mc Namara; Mithileash Mohan; Brian Moran; Donal Mullins; Penelope Muteteli; Fergal O' Connor; Jamie Marie O Sullivan; Samantha Pare; Luke Rogers; Padhraig Gearod Ryan; Timothy Savage; David Seip; Waleed Serhan; Derek Sinnott; Ann Margaret Stokes; Anthony Paul Stynes; Peter Vegh; Simeon John Walsh; Zbigniew Edmund Zdziarski.

MSc Vanesha Bhagwan; Pedro Jose Díaz Payno; Kim Olaya-Bosch; Kenneth Ryall; Esther Simón Carbajo.

MLitt Yuh Jhung Hwang; Paul Johnstone; Michael Nash; Rodolph Pallier.

CL/15-16/041 University Council Membership – Graduate Students' Union Representative 2015-2016

The Council noted that the following would represent the Graduate Students' Union in 2015-2016: Mr Michael McInerney, Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science.

CL/15-16/042 School Directors –

The Council noted the nominations of the following:

- (i) School of Histories and Humanities**
 - a. Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate) (Hilary Term 2016 during Professor Rachel Moss’s leave of absence): Professor Peter Cherry;
 - b. Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate) (2015-2017): Professor Ann Dolan.
- (ii) School of Physics**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate):
 Professor Louise Bradley (extending for one year 2015-2016)

CL/15-16/043 Committees – Membership

The Council noted and approved the memorandum, circulated, from the Secretary to the Junior Academic Progressions Committee in respect of the Junior Academic Progressions Committee membership dated 12 October 2015.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed

Date