



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

The University of Dublin
Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 23 September 2015 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor D Faas, Professor C Morash, Professor A Holohan, Professor J Walsh, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor R Dahyot, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor J P Spiers, Professor M Clarke, Ms S Cameron-Coen, Dr G Hegarty, Ms M Kenny, Ms P O'Beirne, Mr J Bryant, Mr D Whelehan.
<i>Apologies</i>	Senior Tutor, Professor I Donohue, Professor C Comiskey, Professor P Cronin, Dr S Bloomfield, Professor D Kelleher, Ms. S Kearney, Chief Operating Officer, Mr S. Hatton.
<i>In attendance</i>	Academic Secretary, Librarian and College Archivist, Secretary to the College, Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall).

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. None was declared.

CL/15-16/003 Statutory Declaration

A new member made the required statutory declaration.

CL/15-16/004 Minutes

- (i) The minutes of the meeting of 10 June 2015 were approved and signed.
- (ii) The minutes of the extraordinary meeting of 2 September 2015 were approved and signed.

CL/15-16/005 Matters Arising

- (i) **CL/14-15/193 (ii):** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reported that the proposal for a tenure-track recruitment procedure for early career academics had been considered by Board at the end of the last academic year. A final draft of the proposal is due to be circulated to Council during Michaelmas term 2015.
- (ii) **CL/14-15/193 (iii):** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the Dean of Research will bring a revised International Policy related to research funding to Council for consideration in due course.

- (iii) **CL/14-15/203:** The Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, responding to a query about the appeals process for the Postgraduate Certificate in Creative Thinking, Innovation and Entrepreneurship and the and the M. Phil. in Creative and Cultural Entrepreneurship, advised that such courses would be linked to a cognate School for the purposes of academic oversight and, consequently, access to standard appeals mechanisms. Work will be undertaken to identify an appropriate School for each course.
- (iv) **CL/14-15/195:** The Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science noted that the terms of reference for the new role of Associate Dean of Undergraduate Science Education were being finalised and would be circulated to Board in October for noting and approval. Subsequent to filling the position, attention will turn to the terms of reference of the Science (TR071) Taskforce and adjustments made if necessary. Work will continue during 2015/16 to consider the type of undergraduate science education Trinity wants to deliver and how best to ensure the attainment of Trinity graduate attributes in that context.
- (v) **CL/15-16/002:** It was noted that the revised common points scale was launched on 3 September 2015 by the Minister for Education and Skills. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that all involved had been commended for their work in developing the new scale, and, in particular, that Professor Wilkins, Trinity School of Mathematics, was singled out for his significant contribution.

CL/15-16/006 Provost's Report

The Provost reminded members of the vision and mission articulated within the Strategic Plan 2014 – 2019. He brought the meeting through the three components of the mission and outlined the three goals associated with each component. He highlighted, in particular, goal nine, which is to secure Trinity's future, and advised that it provides the foundation for his work plan for 2015/16. He outlined the strategic actions attached to the goal (global citizenship, ethical responsibilities, identity and delivering the mission-next steps) and a number of ongoing and planned activities involving the Provost, himself, and College Officers.

He noted that work is continuing to build valuable partnerships nationally and internationally. The Education Project is also critical to this goal as Trinity's curriculum is a significant part of the institution's identity and feeds into the promotion of global citizenship. It will be important to identify which features are common across all courses and to establish the ideal Trinity graduate attributes. Consideration will have to be given to the best means of embedding independence of thought and actions within Trinity's graduates.

He commented on the increased level of public affairs activities and noted that a substantial programme of events is envisaged which would include greater engagement with the Government, associated agencies and the media. Activities in this area had already increased both nationally and internationally and he confirmed that the Director of Public Affairs and Communications would present a plan for the next stage of the process to Board and Council in due course.

He advised that the Trinity Foundation has been renamed Trinity Development and Alumni and its focus has been renewed to align with the Strategic Plan 2014-2019. Staff members in that area are developing an integrated case for funding support for Trinity, as a whole, and a new funding campaign will be launched during the current academic year. As part of this, an advisory Provost's Council will be established comprising high level donors, as will a campaign cabinet which will meet regularly. He spoke of particular areas which require funding support such as the Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute (E3), the Library, Trinity Creative, the Cancer Institute and academic posts.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Other significant projects and activities include 21st Century Administration, Online Education, an estate and infrastructure strategy and plans under talent acquisition.

Finally, he noted his other responsibilities such as for the general management of the University chairing standing and *ad hoc* committees.

CL/15-16/007 Dean of Graduate Studies Annual Report 2013/14, including Admissions Data for 2014/15

The Dean of Graduate Studies Annual Report for 2013/14, including Admissions Data for 2014/15, dated 10 September 2015, was circulated. Introducing the report, the Dean of Graduate Studies noted that the first ten pages provided an overview of the activities in the Office of the Dean of Graduate Studies, the structure of which changed recently with the transfer of a number of operational functions to the Academic Registry. The remaining functions of her direct office currently include, among other things, the oversight of research students, student cases, support of the Graduate Studies Committee, working with other stakeholders on internal and external policy development and processing new postgraduate course proposals.

Speaking to the data contained in the report she highlighted the following:

- 2013/14 saw 4,309 postgraduate students registered, of which, 2,463 were new entrants on the postgraduate register;
- new entrant figures were down by 163 when compared to 2012/13;
- of the total number of registered students, 1,733 were undertaking degrees by research and 2,496 were registered to postgraduate taught courses;
- a further 55 were categorised as visiting students and 25 were registered to validated courses;
- whilst the number of postgraduate students has tended to fluctuate, the overall trend shows a decline in the period 2009/10 to 2013/14, with a pronounced decline in the number of part-time students;
- the overall breakdown between male and female students on the research register was almost even, however, on taught courses there were significantly more females;
- across both the taught and research registers female students outnumbered males students in the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences and the Faculty of Health Sciences with the opposite true of the Faculty in Engineering, Mathematics and Science;
- there were 195 live postgraduate taught courses which represents an overall increase when compared to 158 in 2006/07;
- of the total number of courses, approximately half ran in 2013/14 with fewer than 10 students;
- the names of all external examiners for research and taught courses are provided and, therefore, validated through this report;
- the majority of external examiner reports were complimentary in terms of the level of feedback provided to students;
- the return rate of external examiner reports could improve, especially in the Faculty of Health Sciences;
- there were 477 research degrees passed by Board and Council, however, eight students failed their PhD outright and a further eight PhD candidates were awarded a lower award. In addition, two students failed to receive their Master's degree by research (the majority of these results are under appeal and may change);
- admissions data for 14/15 shows that there were 4,568 applications for taught courses, 3,343 offers made with 2,435 acceptances leading the registration of 2,060 students;
- new to this report, data on sources of funding for research students show that approximately half of PhD students are in receipt of some level of funding;
- looking at the funding distribution on a faculty basis, 23% of students in Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, 76% of students in Engineering, Mathematics and

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Science and 56% of students in Health Sciences receive some sort of funding support for their doctoral studies.

There was a brief discussion about the number of courses with fewer than 10 students. The Dean of Graduate Studies acknowledged that while the number of students appear low there is a certain level of module sharing and shared teaching, however, she commented that it was a matter which requires ongoing attention.

The higher than normal failure rate among research students and the number of lower degrees awarded was discussed. The Dean of Graduate Studies noted that there were varied reasons for not awarding the PhD in these cases such as plagiarism, insufficient quality and the inability to meet criteria related to novelty or rigour. She highlighted that clear annual reporting and transfer procedures are in place to identify students that are not strong enough meet the demands of the PhD. It was suggested by a member that the publication of best practice guidelines for supervisors was a relatively recent development (2012) and that the figures should improve as the guidelines become more embedded. Following a query from a member as to whether or not the reporting and transfer procedures were followed in the highlighted cases, the Provost invited the Dean of Graduate Studies to investigate if procedures are being followed in relation to research students.

In response to a question research student number trends and available funding, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that the number of PhD students is decreasing across the sector. The Dean of Research noted that an increased level of funding support is being provided to postdoctoral researchers and is concomitantly decreasing for PhD students; the Science Foundation of Ireland have been apprised of this concern.

The level of teaching completed by PhD students was queried and the Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that there is variability across Trinity; some schools set a minimum number of hours and others do not. Responding to a suggestion from the Provost to survey research students about their teaching loads, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that a research student survey is in development and that she would ensure that appropriate questions are included. The Provost invited the Vice-President of the Graduate Students' Union to provide input on the development of the survey on behalf of the Graduate Students' Union.

The discussion then turned to the method of accepting research students into Trinity College. It was noted that some schools put in place panels to discuss and approve applications whilst in other areas, decisions are made by individual principal investigators (PI). In the latter scenario, information on applicants is often lost if the PI does not have the capacity to take on additional research students and not attempt is made to match them with other potential PIs. It was suggested that a client relationship management system might be useful in this regard to capture information on research student applicants. It was noted that consideration should be given to the processes surrounding the admission of research students.

The Provost commended the report and thanked those involved in its production. The Dean of Graduate Studies expressed her particular thanks to Ms Nicola Byrne and Ms Helen Thornbury for their work on the annual report. Council noted the Dean of Graduate Studies Annual Report for 2013/14, including Admissions Data for 2014/15.

CL/15-16/008 Postgraduate Course Proposals – School of Business

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 17 September 2015, was circulated along with five postgraduate course proposals from the School of Business:

Postgraduate Diploma in Accounting
M.Sc. in Advanced Accounting
M.Sc. in Investments

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

M.Sc. in Marketing
M.Sc. in Financial Risk Management

The Dean of Graduate Studies explained that the proposals were being presented to Council as a package and noted that four other proposals would be brought to a future meeting for approval; three were under external review and the School of Business is responding to a reviewer's comments on the fourth.

She noted that these proposals feed in to the growth plan for the School of Business and were developed following extensive research on course demand, fees and the offerings of other universities. As a result of this research, fees would be set a little higher than normal. Market research also showed that it would be better to market each course as a distinct entity rather than bundling them together as strands under an overall course title. Where relevant, the School of Business will seek professional accreditation for graduates of these courses and have already initiated discussions in this regard.

Speaking to the course structures, she noted that each of the M.Sc. courses comprises 12, 5-ECTS modules and 30 ECTS credits related to the dissertation and research methods. All courses are aligned to level 9 on the National Framework of Qualifications (NFQ) and include rigorous assessment methods. Each M.Sc. course has in place an exit P. Grad. Dip.

The P. Grad. Dip. standalone course in Accounting comprises 12, 5-ECTS modules, with no dissertation module, and is also aligned to level 9 on the . Its purpose is that of a conversion course to prepare students for an initial career in accounting, where they do not have past experience of the subject.

The Dean of Health Sciences retired from the meeting.

The proposals for the courses in Accounting and Advanced Accounting were reviewed by Professor George Iatridis, University of Thessaly, Greece. The proposal for the course in Investments was reviewed by Professor Michael Goldstein, Professor of Finance and Donald P. Babson Chair in Applied Investments, Babson College, Massachusetts. The course in Marketing was reviewed by Dr. Alan Bradshaw, Royal Holloway University of London and the final proposal, in Financial Risk Management, was reviewed by Professor Maurice Peat, The University of Sydney. The Dean of Graduate Studies noted that all reviews were positive.

Ms S. Cameron-Coen retired from the meeting.

There was a discussion about the projected increase in postgraduate student numbers arising from the proposed courses and the effect this would have on student services. Responding to a query about the funding of student services, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that this is provided for under the growth plan for the School of Business, and, in relation to non-EU students, this is provided for under the Global Relations Strategy II. It was noted that the contribution to student services in relation to these courses would be clarified under matters arising at the next meeting of Council.

Noting that all of the discussed courses were due to commence in September 2016, Council approved the proposals to establish courses leading to a P. Grad. Dip in Accounting and M.Sc. degree awards in Advanced Accounting, Investments, Marketing and Financial Risk Management, with exit P. Grad. Dip. available under each M.Sc. programme.

CL/15-16/009 Any Other Urgent Business

See CL/15-16/021 (ii) below in relation to additional nominations for appointment, including nominations for the positions of Professor of German (1776) and Professor in German.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

SECTION B

- CL/15-16/010 XX Academic Appeals Committee**
The draft minutes of meeting of 24 August 2015 were noted and approved.
- CL/15-16/011 International Committee**
The Vice-President for Global Relations highlighted the ongoing development of a template for schools which intend to enter into international partnerships. The draft minutes of 11th June 2015 were noted and approved.
- CL/15-16/012 Quality Committee**
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised of a revision to the policy on external examiners where by new external examiners will be approved at the undergraduate level by the Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer and subsequently noted at Council. This mirrors the process at the postgraduate level whereby the Dean of Graduate Studies approves external examiners rather than Council. The draft minutes of 4 June 2015 were noted and approved.
- CL/15-16/013 Undergraduate Studies Committee**
The Dean of Undergraduate Studies provided an update on the number of applications, offers and acceptances related to students from Northern Ireland. She also provided an update on the implementation of a number of recommendations arising from the Report of the Working Group on Plagiarism. The draft minutes of the meeting of 1 September 2015 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

- CL/15-16/014 Administrative Arrangements in the Summer Session**
The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 31 August 2015.
- The Secretary to the College noted that there was no new nomination put forward by the School of Business in relation the position of Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate).
- CL/15-16/015 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**
The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 June 2015 and noted by Board on 24 June 2015.
- (i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**
- DChDent** Ahmed Abdelsalam.
- DEd** Mary Ellen Goretti McGrath.
- MD** Maha Abdul Azeez; Barry Hall; Grainne Holleran.
- (ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

PhD Muhammad Arshad; Emer Barrett; Patricia Brazil; Donna Canada-Smith; Theresa Obiageli Chimamkpam; Ethel Claffey; Cathal Joseph Paul Cooney; Carmel Corrigan; Robert Crosbie; Alice Jurugo Drajea; Jacqueline Fallon; Caoimhe Gallagher; Charles Gerard Garavan; Paul Gorman; Ludovic Highman; Gregory Hulsman; Padraic Killeen; Conor Kearney; Vladimir Kmec; Stephen Lucek; Melinda Lyons; Orla Therese Mc Carthy; Danielle Mc Laughlin; Roisin Mc Manus; Patrick Moore; Catherine Mulwa; Genevieve Murray; Thomas Francis Noone; Michael Joseph O Byrne; Katharine O'Callaghan; Erna O'Connor; Connor Tiarnach O'Donoghue; Grainne O'Regan; Martha O Shaughnessy; Anne Marie O'Toole; Damien O'Tuama; Ema Ozaki; Adam Ross Patterson; Shane Plunkett; Finn Purcell-Milton; Deirdre Robertson; Anne Sappington; Leslie Sherlock; Amaury Souza; Gabrielle Tanham; Yesim Saliha Tunali; Mairin Philomena Wilson.

MSc Tara Helen McDonald; Shona O'Donnell; Andrea Waitz; Qian Zhang.

CL/15-16/016 University Council – Students' Union Representatives 2015-2016

The Council noted that the following would represent the Faculties in 2015-2016:

- (i) Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences: Ms Patricia O'Beirne;
- (ii) Engineering, Mathematics and Science: Mr James Bryant;
- (iii) Health Sciences: Mr Dale Whelehan.

CL/15-16/017 Committees – Membership

The Council noted and approved memoranda, circulated, in respect of the following committees:

- (i) Senior Promotions Committee - Personal Chairs sub-committee;
- (ii) Junior Academic Progressions Committee.

CL/15-16/018 School of Dental Science – Headship – Extension

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Health Sciences, circulated, dated 15 September 2015.

CL/15-16/019 School of Mathematics – School Directors 2015-2016

The Council noted and approved the following appointments:

- (i) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor David Wilkins;
- (ii) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor John Stalker;
- (iii) Director of Research: Professor Sergey Frolov.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed

Date

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings