

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 14 January 2015 at 11.15 a.m. in the Board Room.

| | |
|----------------------|---|
| <i>Present</i> | Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor J Walsh, Professor G Watson, Professor R Dahyot, Professor I Donohue, Professor JP Spiers, Professor C Comiskey, Professor M Clarke, Professor P Cronin, Professor D Kelleher, Ms D Alexander, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Ms K Byrne, Mr A Hanna. |
| <i>Apologies</i> | Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor D Faas, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr S Bloomfield, Ms S Baker, Ms M Kenny, Mr A Miller, Ms S Kearney, Interim Chief Operating Officer, Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall). |
| <i>In attendance</i> | Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Librarian, Ms S De Brunner. |
| <i>Observers</i> | Mr S Hatton (GSU). |

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. Ms D Alexander declared an interest in CL/14-15/076 but it was not deemed to be in conflict.

CL/14-15/072 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of 19 November 2014 were approved and signed subject to the rewording of a sentence within CL/14-15/053(ii) to read 'Providing information about the new Cancer Institute, the Dean of Research informed Council that this is a planned joint initiative between Trinity College and St James's Hospital which would benefit the country as a whole.'

CL/14-15/073 Matters Arising:

- (i) **CL/14-15/051:** The Secretary to the College noted that he would bring forward proposals to Council in relation to the declaration of members' interests.
- (ii) **CL/14-15/056:** The Secretary to the College advised that he had discussed the College Alcohol Policy with the Interim Director of Human Resources and that this will be progressed through the Human Resources Committee.

CL/14-15/074 Provost's Report

- (i) The Provost noted that he would inform Council, in due course, of the plans related to the Trinity Education Project, which will pull together a number of actions under the Strategic Plan 2014-2019.
- (ii) The Provost highlighted potential collaborations with institutions in India and Sri Lanka and he asked the Vice-President for Global Relations to inform the meeting about recent developments with Thapar University. The Vice-President for Global Relations noted

that Trinity is developing collaborative agreements with Thapar University, located in the Punjab region of India. She advised that discussions between the two institutions concerned the development of an online module in 'Humanities for Engineering' for delivery to Thapar's engineering students, twinning of existing undergraduate programmes in Engineering and Computer Science, the delivery of joint masters and PhD programmes. Following institutional visits in 2014, which included an academic review in November 2014, conducted by Trinity academics and the Academic Secretary, of Thapar's Engineering and Computer Science courses, research activity and governance structures, plans are now in train to harmonise the undergraduate curricula with a view to 40 Thapar students enrolling on Years 3 and 4 of Trinity's undergraduate programmes in Engineering and in Computer Science. It is further planned that Heads of Department from Thapar's Engineering and Computer Science departments will spend up to three months at Trinity to assist Thapar in its contemporisation programme and to gain first-hand experience of how Trinity operates, which will include gaining insights into the research fields of, and the pedagogical methods used in, the Schools of Engineering and Computer Science and Statistics. Responding to a query concerning international collaborations in the area of the arts and humanities, the Vice-President for Global Relations commented that a number of connections are being made, for example Trinity was represented at the Mumbai International Literary Festival in 2014 and would be again in 2015. She also flagged that early discussions have been taken place with Ashoka University; an institution based in New Delhi which focusses on the liberal arts.

CL/14-15/075 Ussher Scheme Review and Comparative Analysis

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 23 December 2014, was circulated along with a presentation, dated November 2014, which provided findings from the review of the Ussher recruitment scheme. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer spoke to the item and noted that College initiated a College-wide recruitment scheme in 2009, originally known as 'New Blood' Lectureships, which resulted in the creation of 40 Ussher Lectureships. Heads of Schools were required to submit proposals, which were judged against a number of criteria, to gain one or more of these positions for their School. Following the allocation of these vacant positions within College, two major recruitment rounds were advertised in 2010. This scheme differed from traditional recruitment in that candidates were recruited to tenure-track positions with permanent contracts being offered only to those who met the performance threshold, normally after five years, and these positions were advertised internationally through two major rounds rather than on a case-by-case basis as vacancies arose. Since this scheme represented a significant departure from the normal recruitment method and in contract-type, a review was conducted to compare the performance of those recruited through the Ussher scheme with those recruited through the traditional method.

In advance of bringing the meeting through the data, she cautioned that the numbers in both the Ussher and comparator groups were small which meant that care should be taken in drawing conclusions. She also cautioned, given the small numbers, that it may be possible to identify some post-holders, especially where the data had been presented on a school or faculty basis, therefore, the information must be treated as confidential. In addition to the quantitative evaluation, a process to gather feedback from those employed through the Ussher Scheme had been initiated.

Comparators were identified as those employed on contracts of three or more years and whose employment commenced in a period similar to those employed under the Ussher Scheme. The two groups were compared across a number of key indicators: publications, citations, funding submissions, grant funded income, research theme engagement and collaborations. When looking at the categories of publications, impact/citations and research contracts for funding, it was shown that those in the Ussher group performed significantly better than those in the comparator group. She added that each Ussher lecturer was assigned a mentor and experienced more structured engagement with senior colleagues and it should be noted that these positions were assigned to high performance and highly supported areas of research.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The achievements of the Ussher lecturers were welcomed and applauded by number of Council members, however, concerns were raised in relation to the perceived protection of their time which enabled them to focus on research. It was commented that they did not take up tutorial positions or other administrative roles and it was suggested that the two groups could not be compared fairly unless these factors were also considered. Responding, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that this perception is not quite correct. Ussher lecturers were advised not to take on tutorial duties in their first five years, though some have, however, they have not been protected from other administrative duties to any greater extent than other entry-level academic staff members, since all lecturers in their early years are supposed to be given lighter administrative duties. It was suggested by a member that the matter of allowing these lecturers to undertake research supervision should be addressed.

The Provost commented that the data presented supports the holding of a further Ussher recruitment round, which will be funded from non-exchequer sources, and may support the inclusion of tenure track aspects in future recruitment practices.

Professor J Walsh retired from the meeting.

CL/14-15/076 Quality Review of Trinity Research and Innovation

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 6 January 2015, was circulated along with the quality review report concerning Trinity Research and Innovation (TR&I) and the responses from the Director of TR&I and the Dean of Research. Speaking to the report, the Dean of Research noted the review process had helped to shape the emerging strategy for the unit. The reviewers broadly concluded that TR&I, as a unit, is in transition and that support requirements for research in College have increased in scope and complexity. In view of the foregoing, the reviewers highlighted the need for continued support of the unit by College as it continues through its transition and the need to clearly establish TR&I staff members as professionals, providing an outward facing service to the College community. He added that a process of change management is ongoing in the unit.

Responding to a query the Dean of Research confirmed that the Knowledge Transfer and Innovation Committee is being reinstated having been dormant for a number of years. It is now established as a sub-committee of the Research Committee with new terms of reference and its membership is being finalised.

The Registrar queried the absence of any mention of social entrepreneurship or of the Civic Engagement Officer. The Dean of Research noted that whilst not explicitly mentioned in the document, the involvement of TR&I in supporting all forms of entrepreneurship and innovation was understood by the reviewers. The Provost commenting on the recommendation concerning communications for the unit, noted that Mr Michael Moloney is heading up College's communications and marketing functions on an interim basis and would assist on this front. The Dean of Research highlighted the particular approach recommended by the reviewers and noted the active role of College's communications and marketing functions in the University's ranking strategy.

Council noted and approved the reviewers' recommendations and the responses from the Dean of Research and the Director of TR&I.

CL/14-15/077 Proposal for a Direct Entry Course Leading to a Bachelor in Business Studies

A memorandum from the Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 7 January 2015, was circulated along with a proposal for a direct entry course leading to a Bachelor in Business Studies degree, also dated 7 January 2015. The Dean of Undergraduate Studies spoke to the proposal and noted that the course represents a new entry route to study Business Studies as a single honors subject, similar to that within Economics and Social Studies, however, this course should appeal

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

to international and local students who wish to take a more focussed approach to studying business at the undergraduate level. The course, if approved, is due to commence in September 2016, would carry quotas of 25 EU/CAO and 50 non-EU students, and would lead to the award of Bachelor in Business Studies. The key international markets for this course are the United States, Canada, China and Brazil.

She noted the strategic importance of the direct entry course and the ways in which it aligns to the Strategic Plan 2014-19, particularly in relation to experiential learning, renewing the curriculum and with innovation and entrepreneurship. In the Junior Sophister year, students may opt to go abroad on Erasmus or other exchanges, however, all students, whether they stay in Trinity or go abroad, must complete the Personal and Professional Development module. In the Senior Sophister year students can choose at least one area of Business Studies to study in-depth and are also required to complete a significant research project or dissertation.

She reported that the proposal had been positively reviewed by Professor Ingrid Jeacle, of the University of Edinburgh, who noted that the content was well thought out and that being able 'to offer a defined Bachelor in Business Studies degree is an essential component of the arsenal of the contemporary Business School.'

The Vice-President of Global Relations commended the proposal and advised that a distinct undergraduate Business Studies degree course would be well sought after in international markets.

Concerns were raised about establishing a new course with a relatively small quota of 25 CAO places since Trinity is under external pressure to reduce and consolidate its courses for entry. The Dean of Undergraduate Studies reiterated the strategic importance of this course and the fact that Business Studies as a subject is available within a number of courses in Trinity which may mitigate the effect of the quota on points. A particular consideration in setting the CAO quota at 25 was to minimise the effect of this course on the existing programme in Economics and Social Studies, and it was arrived at through discussions between the Faculty Dean and partnering Schools in the delivery of that programme. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer acknowledged the external pressure being brought to bear on Trinity in relation to its undergraduate courses but noted that this should not stop strategically important developments. In terms of reducing entry routes, this will be managed through a review of TSM and the 92 entry routes into courses in the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences.

The unit cost of international students on College services was queried and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that this had been worked out previously as part of the business case for the expansion of the School of Business.

Council approved the proposal for a new course in Business Studies, leading to the award of the Bachelor in Business Studies, noting that it is due to commence in September 2016. The Provost commended the proposal and thanked all those who had been involved in the process.

CL/14-15/078 Promotions 2015

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Interim Director of Human Resources, dated 7 January 2015, was circulated. Speaking to the item the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that in December 2014 Board approved a number of recommendations to hold College promotions, where possible, under the parameters of the Employment Control Framework. Notably, advancement from either of the Assistant/Associate Professor grades to the Professor grade is restricted by the requirement to maintain the relative proportions which existed on 31 December 2008 of these two groups. Given current numbers in academic grades, Board approved the following quotas for promotions:

Associate Professor – 20
Professor (in) – 9

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Personal Chair – 3

She confirmed that the quotas would apply across both exchequer and non-exchequer funded academic posts; that decisions related to the awarding of clinical, honorary and adjunct academic titles would be considered by the Senior Promotions Committee; and that promotion beyond the merit bar for Assistant Professors will proceed as normal, though the payment of resulting increments may be delayed as a result of the Haddington Road Agreement.

Council noted the recommendations in relation to academic promotions approved by Board in December 2014.

CL/14-15/079 Any Other Urgent Business

- (i) The Academic Secretary updated Council on plans to implement the electronic circulation of committee papers to Council members through the use of Boardpad software. She noted that consideration is being given to the experiences of Board, which has already moved to the electronic circulation of papers, and that it is hoped to implement this for the last two Council meetings of the 2014/15 academic year. The Provost noted that, in addition to Board, the Executive Officers' Group and the Planning Group are also using this software.
- (ii) See Actum CL/14-15/094 below in relation to the proposed search committee for the exceptional recruitment of an external candidate for the position of Professor in Zoology.

SECTION B

CL/14-15/080 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 25 November 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/081 Graduate Studies Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 4 December 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/082 Human Resources Committee

The draft minutes for the meeting of 26 November 2014, were noted and approved along with appended policies related to Signed Contracts of Employment and Sick Leave.

CL/14-15/083 Quality Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 10 December 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/084 Research Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 14 November 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/085 Student Life Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 15 October were noted and approved.

SECTION C

CL/14-15/086 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 19 November 2014 and noted by Board on 17 December 2014.

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

MD Elizabeth Cummings.

DChDent Sittana Elfadil Hassan Ahmed.

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

PhD Steven Ellerhoff; Gabrield Fagan; Donal Holland; Mary Keegan; Kevin Finnbar Mc Carthy; Tariq Mesallati; Emer Ni Dhuill; Frances Anne O'Brien; Eoghan Conor O Shea; John Mario O'Sullivan; John Neil Charles Robinson; Julian Shaw; Janet Swinburne; Alexandra Tavvry; Adnan Velic; Siobhan Mary Young.

MSc Sinead Marley.

MLitt Maria Majella O Brien

CL/14-15/087 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 19 November 2014 and noted by Board on 17 December 2014.

CL/14-15/088 School of Business – Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate)

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor F Barry as Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate) for the remainder of the academic year 2014-2015, in place of Professor G McHugh.

CL/14-15/089 Nominations for Appointment of External Examiners in Marino Institute of Education and Church of Ireland College of Education

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies and the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 19 December 2014.

CL/14-15/090 Consolidated List of Teaching Assistants and Assistant Examiners including Demonstrators 2014-2015

The Council noted and approved memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 7 January 2015.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Signed

Date