The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 22 October 2014 at 11.15 a.m. in the Board Room.

Present	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor D Faas, Professor J Walsh, Professor R Dahyot, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor JP Spiers, Professor C Comiskey, Professor M Clarke, Professor P Cronin, Dr S Bloomfield, Ms D Alexander, Dean of Students, Ms K Byrne, Ms S Baker, Mr A Hanna.
Apologies	Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor I Donohue, Vice-President for Global Relations, Ms M Kenny, Mr A Miller, Ms S Kearney, Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall), Interim Chief Operating Officer.
In attendance	Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Librarian, Ms S De Brunner.
Observers	Mr S Hatton (GSU).
By invitation	Associate Dean for Online Learning for CL/14-15/032.

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. Professor Daniel Faas declared an interest in item CL/14-15/049 but noted that he had to leave the meeting early in any case.

CL/14-15/028   Statutory Declaration
    A new member made the statutory declaration.

CL/14-15/029   Minutes
    The minutes of 24 September 2014 were approved and signed.

CL/14-15/030   Matters Arising:
    (i)   **CL/14-15/003(i):** The Dean of Graduate Studies noted that the external review report for the Professional Special Purpose Certificate in Academic Practice had been received from Professor Ray Land of Durham University. In addition to complimenting specific aspects of the course he noted that it was equivalent to courses in the United Kingdom and that its content is appropriate for postgraduate study. Council, having previously approved the proposal in principle, subject to the endorsement of the external reviewer (CL/13-14/192), approved the course in full.

    (ii)   **CL/14-15/006:** The Dean of Graduate Studies advised Council that the TCD-UCD Framework for Collaborative Taught Programmes/Courses had been approved recently by UCD's Academic Council.

    (iii)   **CL/14-15/007:** The Librarian noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and she had met to clarify certain financial information presented in the Library Annual Report

2012-2013. Consequently, the Annual Report was amended and is available from the Library.

CL/14-15/031   Provost's Report

(i)   The Provost reminded Council members of the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 launch later that day by An Taoiseach, Mr Enda Kenny, T.D. He highlighted the key aspects of the Strategic Plan which would come before Council for discussion and approval.

(ii)   Commenting on recent newspaper articles, the Provost advised Council that the Identity Initiative was merely paused and not cancelled, as had been reported. Consultation will take place with various groups and the item will be discussed at a future Council meeting.

(iii)   The Provost, responding to a question about the lifting of the Employment Control Framework (ECF) and the implications for future academic promotion rounds, advised that College is waiting to receive concrete information on this matter before making firm decisions. He noted that that the most detrimental aspect of the ECF was the reduction in staff numbers. It was further commented by a member that the terms of the ECF made it harder to promote staff to professor grades, which has led to an imbalance in College, and it was queried if this imbalance would be addressed. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that analysis for benchmarking purposes is being carried out and the impact within College of the ECF and circumstances in other institutions will be considered; the resulting data will be considered ahead of any decisions in this regard. She echoed the Provost's comment that the biggest problem arising from the ECF was the limit placed on staff numbers and she noted that many appointments made over the last six months were delayed so that College could meet reporting requirements in December 2014. She further noted that whilst the ECF is due to be lifted College is still constrained financially.

CL/14-15/032   Online Education Strategy II

The Provost welcomed the Associate Dean for Online Education to the meeting. It was noted that a Working Group was established, and chaired, by the Provost towards the end of 2013/14. It was charged with developing proposals to progress online education beyond the pilot stage and to embed it within College activities; the Report from the Online Education Project Working Group, dated October 2014, derives from that group.

The Associate Dean for Online Education outlined the key aims of the next phase of the Online Education Project which are to:

(i)   use flexible and wholly online modes of course delivery to increase the numbers of student online learners to 1000, on up to 20 courses, focused primarily on postgraduate and continuing professional development (CPD) students, targeted at areas of national and international demand;

(ii)   ensure that the online student experience matches the research-led Trinity education based on academic rigour and built upon the existing culture of scholarship, innovation and creativity;

(iii)   develop technology enhanced learning across the face-to-face teaching environment to assist in the ongoing development of 21st Century learning paradigms such as a flexible curriculum, hybrid learning and the flipped classroom to enhance the student experience;

(iv)   create global-learning communities through the provision of high-quality, open access courses (MOOCs) in areas where Trinity has recognised excellence and global reach.

Responding to concerns expressed about the poor use, or lack of use, of Blackboard in particular areas of College, the Associate Dean for Online Education commented that staff teaching on courses developed for online delivery are required to undergo training. Blackboard

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

training, for general purposes, is already provided by the eLearning team. It was noted that the recently approved Professional Special Purpose Certificate in Academic Practice contains a credit bearing module on technology.

The discussion turned to student supports and it was commented that College must consider how to deliver student services to wholly online students. It must also consider how to support students to learn with technology; despite high levels of familiarity and confidence in the use of technology it cannot be assumed that incoming students have the skills to learn in this context. Further, the increase in flexible education is likely to draw in a broader profile of students with differing skills and knowledge.

Answering a question on the potential of redesigning large volume freshman modules to facilitate a technology enhanced hybrid teaching and learning model, or 'flipped' model, the Associate Dean for Online Learning said that this can be done provided the module learning outcomes remain the paramount objective of any such redesign. If it is to be done properly it requires the upfront investment of time on the part of the lecturer, to work with instructional designers and multimedia developers, as well as expenditure on the production of online materials and technology enhancements. He noted, however, that the existing virtual learning environment, Blackboard, is fit for this purpose. He cautioned against implementing this approach simply to maximise numbers and revenue.

Given the small number of online courses approved in Trinity, it was queried if the target of enrolling 1,000 students within a five-year timeframe was realistic. The Associate Dean for Online Education expressed the opinion that it was achievable and explained that the target is based on the expectation that there will be 20 courses open for registration by 2019. This requires the approval of a minimum of three courses per year over the next five years with an average of 50 students enrolled per course.

It was queried if distinct roles would evolve over the next five years to support the delivery of online education, for example, Directors of Online Education within schools or the creation of a College role of Dean for Online Education. The Provost commented that technology should permeate education in general. The Associate Dean for Online Education agreed with this comment and suggested that the term technology based learning would become obsolete in the future; it will be considered simply as learning. He noted that the role of Associate Dean is necessary for the interim period, during the pilot and embedding stages, and beyond that it would be imperative to use existing College structures to avoid the creation of online education silos.

The Provost thanked the Associate Dean for Online Education for attending the meeting to present information on the next stage of the online education strategy and Council noted the report.

CL/14-15/033   **Annual Report of the Dean of Research 2012-2013**
The Annual Report of the Dean of Research 2012-2013, dated September 2014, was circulated along with the Annual Report on Publications and Impact 2009-2013, also dated September 2014. The Dean of Research commented on the time lag necessary to collate information on publications and research impacts which tends to delay the publication of the annual report. For the first time this year, the publications and research impact information has been presented separately, and this should allow for the earlier publication of the annual report in future years.

Turning to the Annual Report on Publication and Impacts 2009-2013, the Dean of Research made the following comments:
(i)   the decline in the number of publications from TCD authors has been reversed;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

(ii)   a factor which contributed to the increase in the reported number of publications was the discovery that certain international databases missed papers which should have been attributed to TCD;

(iii)   TCD has started to outstrip UCD in the number of publications produced on an annual basis;

(iv)   whilst the increase in the number of publications is welcomed, it can tend to dilute the impact of such research outputs if citation numbers do not keep pace;

(v)   there was a slight decline in the number of citations in 2014 when compared to 2013 figures, however, TCD remains the leading university in Ireland for research impact in terms of citations per publication;

(vi)   83% of citations are related to publications coming from 10% of staff and 98% of citations are related to publications from 25% of staff;

(vii)   57% of all papers received at least one citation, which a slight reduction on the previous year, and means that 43% of all papers are not cited.

In relation to the data on publications and research impacts, he noted that there is much for College to be positive about, however, there are some areas of vulnerability which require careful monitoring.

Turning to the Annual Report for 2012-2013, he made the following observations:

(i)   the filing of patents has declined but this is attributed to the adoption of a more cautious approach due to the costs involved;

(ii)   the number of licences has also declined but it is too early to say if a trend is emerging;

(iii)   the number of directly funded engagements with industry have increased;

(iv)   research centres totalled 36 in 2012/13 which includes the establishment of five new centres and the closure or re-classification of four;

(v)   €126 million in research funding was awarded to TCD, which was a significant increase on the previous year's figure of €67 million;

(vi)   €27.6 million of the total awarded came from non-exchequer sources;

(v)   research income of near €94 million was received which represented an increase of 21% on the previous year;

(vi)   467 staff members held research accounts which represents a small decline on the previous year;

(vii)   the top 10 principal investigators received almost 25% of all research income in 2013 and the top 20 principals investigators received 35.5%;

(viii)   research expenditure projections show expected increases over the next five years;

(ix)   there was a decrease in the number of research applications made during this period, however, this reflects the funding schemes available and is not something to worry about in itself.

During the discussion, the Dean of Research confirmed that the measurement of research impact relies heavily on the number of citations per publication and this is better suited to research in STEM subjects. He acknowledged that the impact of research in the arts and humanities is not always straightforward and he confirmed that work is continuing to attempt to capture this type of information directly from schools. In response to a question about the availability of papers through open access journals, the Dean of Research advised that this seems to lead to an increase in the number of citations per paper released, however, he confirmed that articles included in more established journals tend to attract the greatest number of citations. Answering a question about the categories of staff applying for research funding, he confirmed that there is no concrete data on this topic but there is a sense that there is greater diversification.

On behalf of Council, the Provost thanked the Dean of Research and the staff involved in the preparation of the circulated reports.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/14-15/034   **Review of the Structural Configuration of Research in the Social Sciences**
A memorandum dated 14 October 2014 and a report dated September 2014, concerning the structural configuration of research in the social sciences, were circulated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, speaking to the item, emphasised that the review focused on the organisation of research in the social sciences along with its supporting infrastructure, and not on the quality of the research.

She noted that she had met with Heads of Schools and Disciplines and Directors of Research, in addition to holding a number of town hall meetings. The report and its recommendations have been accepted by stakeholders and these have also been approved by the Research Committee. The findings from the review show that there are a number of organisational challenges to support research activities in this area given the level of fragmentation and number of small research groupings. This has led to the duplication of administrative structures and leaves small research groups particularly vulnerable to staff losses, which in turn can lead to reduced research funding. The research theme of international development, which originated in the Institute for International Integration Studies (IIIS), has critical mass in College but it has become somewhat fragmented in recent times.

She outlined the recommendations which are to:
(i)   re-consolidate research on international development across the social and life sciences drawing substantially on existing strengths in the IIIS;
(ii)   create a shared infrastructure (hub) to support other research across the social sciences; and
(iii)   stand-down the IIIS as a Trinity Research Institute.

During the course of the discussion the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that: other research areas coming under IIIS currently would be supported by the proposed shared infrastructure hub; that the formation of this hub would be led by the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences but that input from principal investigators was imperative; and the re-configuration of research on international development has yet to be mapped out. It was noted that a champion for the re-configuration of this research theme had been identified and the Provost invited the Deans of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences and Health Sciences and the Dean of Research to initiate discussions in this regard, and requested that Council receive an update on developments.

Council approved the recommendations concerning the structural re-configuration of research in the social sciences.

CL/14-15/035   **Discussion Topics for the Trinity College Library Strategy 2014-2019**
A memorandum from the Librarian concerning the Library Strategy 2014-2019, dated 15 October 2014, was circulated. Speaking to the memorandum, the Librarian commented that the development of a new Library strategy would be integral to ensuring that College has the sort of Library it wants and needs.

She outlined some of the transformative issues affecting the Library: the digital shift, meaning that libraries must be both physical and virtual entities; the different ways in which space is used leading to its re-imaging and re-designation to suit changing habits, for example, 24-hour and collaborative study areas; and the democratisation of holdings though the digitisation of library collections.

During the discussion of the item, a number of suggestions were made:
(i)   students should be made aware of the Library's holdings and facilities as early as possible in their academic careers which could be achieved through incorporating such information into a study skills module for credit;
(ii)   more common and informal study space should be provided especially given the increase in group project work as a form of assessment;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

(iii)   study space in the Library should be examined and it should support the use of laptops or similar for study purposes;

(iv)   capital projects seeking approval in College should be required to consider the inclusion of more collaborative areas for student use.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that Library and its strategy will be fundamental to the achievement of many goals in the Strategic Plan 2014-2019, especially in relation to curriculum renewal.

The Provost thanked the Librarian for initiating such a lively discussion and noted that the Library Strategy 2014-2019 will be presented at a future meeting of Council.

CL/14-15/036   Any Other Urgent Business

The Provost highlighted the changes in the publication of the University Calendar and stated that the definitive version is on the College website. He extended his thanks to the Assistant Secretary and Ms Norah Quinton for their work on this project. The Senior Tutor highlighted an issue with referencing sections of the Calendar in handbooks and elsewhere since there are no page numbers available online. The Provost invited the Senior Tutor to outline these difficulties to the College Secretary and also encouraged other members to make any further suggestions for improvement to the College Secretary.

Council noted under any other business the tabled memorandum under CL/14-15/049 concerning recommendations for promotions to Associate Professor and to Clinical Professor.

SECTION B

CL/14-15/037   Undergraduate Studies Committee

The Dean of Undergraduate Studies highlighted the discussion related to the new policy on the provision of feedback to students on their coursework and noted that concerns were raised in relation to the joint issues of non-compliance and the enforcement of this policy. In response, the Provost noted, and Council endorsed, that this is Council mandated policy and, as such, Undergraduate and Postgraduate Directors of Teaching and Learning are empowered to enforce it. If there are difficulties implementing Council policy these should be addressed to the relevant Head of School and Faculty Dean.

The draft minutes of the meeting held on 30 September 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/038   Student Life Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 7 May 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/039   Quality Committee

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer highlighted the discussion on the Review Report for the Department of Sports and Recreation and noted that the Provost would be asked to nominate a Chair for a taskforce that will prepare a strategy for sport and recreation in Trinity.

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 9 October 2014.

CL/14-15/040   Research Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting of 7 October 2014 were noted and approved.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/14-15/041   Academic Appeals Committee

The Registrar drew the attention of Council to the large number of appeal cases coming to the Academic Appeals Committee and noted that a proportion of these were not heard at a court of first appeal due to the extreme time constraints following the supplemental examination session. She commented that this timeline was unworkable. Responding to a suggestion that academic regulations be examined and revised to help alleviate the pressure, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that this should not be done in isolation, rather, it is likely to be a component of the Trinity Education Project as defined in the new Strategic Plan.

Council approved the draft minutes of the meetings of 22, 24, 25, 26, and 29 September 2014.

SECTION C

CL/14-15/042   Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 24 September 2014 and noted by Board on 8 October 2014, as circulated:

(i)   **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

MD   Eva Bolton; Imad Addin Osman Brema; Kevin Mc Carroll; Andrew Moriarty; Aisling Laura Dobbyn Snow.

DChDent   Bridgid Power.

(ii)   **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

PhD   Muhammad Mustafa Alam; Karl Ackland; Yaser Alashqar; Omar Abdalkader Alsharef; Sam Barrett; Dawn Barry; Nicholas Bernard; Jean Bourke; Sean Brady; Gerard Brien; Aimee Jennifer Byrne; Heidi Campbell; Niamh Campbell; Myles Campbell; Sheila Maire Alana Cannon; Mario Alberto Burbano Carmona; Steven William Clarke; Eoin Coughlan; Nicholas Daly; Mia Davis; Gerard Deenihan; Sean Doherty; Michael John Doyle; Ronan Fahey; Thomas Finegan; Angela Fitzgerald Nuala Flood; Jillian Gahan; Sivaji Gundala; Peter Hyde; William Nicholas Jagoe; Darrell Ross Jones; Sinead Kelly; Kevin Kenna; Conor Kennedy; Eileen Leahy; Mathew Lyons; Edgar Arnold Lungu; Eloise Mac An Airchinnigh; John Joseph McAuley; Helen Mc Donagh; Barry Mc Guinness; Alex Mark McMahon; Bozeana Mangan; Hilary Moss; Yasuaki Nakano; Atul Nautiyal; Amarech Gude Obse; Sara Picardo; Jack Prenderville; Daniel Ryan; Maeve Catherine Sara Ryan; Andrea Staino; Patrick Andrew Shiel; Daniel Rouven Steinback; Hendrik Thomas; Viet Hun Tran; Polycarp Ugwu; Denisse Goffi Triglia Van Nierop; Gisela Margarida Frutuoso Vaz; Matteo Viganotti; Mark Ward; Feng Xue.

MSc   Katherine Doyle; Hans-Georg Eckhardt; Stephen Yates; Jiaqi Sun.

MLitt   Niamh Helena Dowdall.

MAI (Recurrent Education)
                Michael O Leary.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/14-15/043   **Title of Personal Chair – Professor of Engineering and the Arts**
The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 13 October 2014 and approved the title of the Personal Chair for Professor L E Doyle as 'Professor of Engineering and the Arts'.

CL/14-15/044   **School of Business – to Change the Nomenclature of the Head of the School of Business**
The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 14 October 2014 and approved that the nomenclature of the Head of the School of Business should be replaced by the title 'Dean'.

CL/14-15/045   **Senior Promotions *Ad hoc* Appeals Committee**
The Council noted a memorandum from the Senior Dean, circulated, dated 15 October 2014 and approved the replacement of Professor L E Doyle (CTVR) with Professor I Bacik (Law School).

SECTION D
In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed   ....

Date   ....

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings