

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 16 April 2014 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor J Walsh, Professor R Dahyot, Professor A-M Healy, Professor J Nunn, Professor D Brennan, Dr S Bloomfield, Ms D Alexander, Mr J Leahy, Mr I Mooney, Ms S G Smith, Mr N Slater.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor D Faas, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor G Davey, Professor I Donohue, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor S Smith, Dr A O'Gara, Ms H Hughes, Mr D McGlacken-Byrne, Ms J Chaisson (GSU).
<i>In attendance</i>	Acting Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Interim Chief Operating Officer, Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observer</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall).
<i>By Invitation</i>	Professor E Drew (for CL/13-14/139)

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. None was declared.

**CL/13-14/136 Minutes**

The minutes of 12 March 2014 were approved and signed.

**CL/13-14/137 Matters Arising:**

- (i) CL/13-14/119: The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that she would attend the Graduate Studies Committee on 24 April 2014 to discuss enrolments to postgraduate courses. She also noted that the majority of school budgetary meetings had taken place at which constructive discussions had been held on this matter.

- (ii) CL/13-14/121: The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that a working group to look at the operational details of altering the coding mechanism for entry to the Two Subject Moderatorship (TSM) is being set up to consider implementation issues. She noted that the curriculum would be a significant area of focus in the Education pillar of the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 and that any planned changes to TSM would need to be mindful of this context. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies advised that he had met with the incoming Director of TSM, who had alternative suggestions on how to reduce the number of course codes, which he believed may be more workable.
  
- (iii) CL/13-14/118(ii): The Dean of Research updated the meeting on the Review of Research Themes noting that it would be a two-stage process. The first stage encompasses the review of research themes by panels, eight in total, comprising experts in relevant fields. The findings of these expert panels will feed into a higher level review panel comprising current and former senior academic leaders from other institutions. It is expected that this panel will conclude its work in Michaelmas term 2014.

#### CL/13-14/138 Provost's Report

- (i) The Provost advised that the outcomes of the Mission, Vision and Values Working Group will be presented to Council.
  
- (ii) The Provost noted that the working group tasked with developing the second Global Relations Strategy had met twice and has started earmarking possible activities to carry forward into the new Strategy.

#### CL/13-14/139 INTEGER Baseline Data Report

The Provost welcomed Professor Eileen Drew, Director of WiSER (Centre for Women in Science and Engineering Research), to the meeting to speak to the Institutional Transformation for Effecting Gender Equality in Research (INTEGER) Baseline Data Report, 2013, and to discuss its recommendations.

Delivering a Powerpoint presentation, Professor Drew explained that INTEGER is an FP7-funded project which aims to develop and implement gender action plans in research and higher education to create sustainable transformational change that will improve the career progression of women in scientific research. It is an international collaborative project involving, Trinity College, the *Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique*, France; Šiauliai University, Lithuania; and with GESIS Leibniz Institute for Social Sciences, Germany, acting as evaluator. WiSER, which was established previously with the support of the Science Foundation Ireland to promote the recruitment and retention of women in academic science, engineering and technology fields, is the vehicle for College's participation in this project.

She commented that current thinking on ways to increase female representation at all levels in the academe has moved away from measures to 'fix' the woman to considerations of 'fixing' the institution. Speaking to the baseline data gathered in Trinity in 2012 from academics she highlighted the following: more women than men have partners who work full-time; women are more likely to be employed as contract, rather than permanent, academic staff; fewer women than men felt that they had

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

achieved their career ambitions in terms of grade attainment, and related to this finding, just as many female academics want to fill senior management roles as male academics; more women than men avail of flexible working, which makes them ineligible for certain roles such as fellowship; and men felt more valued while women perceived the culture as more sexist and less respectful.

In terms of academic staff employed by College in 2012, 39% were female and 61% male. The balance between male and female employees in each of the first three academic grades of Assistant Professor, Associate Professor and Professor stays close to the breakdown of 40% female and 60% male. At the Professorial Chair level, there was greater divergence and more cause for concern, with women accounting for 13% of chair holders. In 1984, women represented 4% of Fellows of the College and by 2012, this had increased to 22%, however, this rate of increase did not follow in the category of Chaired Professors; in 1984 women accounted for 5% and only 13% in 2012. The low level of female representation in this category of staff is not confined to Trinity or Ireland, it is replicated across Europe.

The main focus of the INTEGER project in Trinity is on disciplines in the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science since female representation in the Faculty is far below the College average. In this regard the Schools of Natural Science, Chemistry and Physics have signed up to pilot Transformational Gender Action Plans (T-GAP). The T-GAP framework was developed by drawing on the baseline evidence presented in the report, this includes findings from the WISER database, TCD reports and studies, the INTEGER survey of all academic and research staff in 2012 and site visits to focus groups in the Schools of Natural Science and Chemistry. The framework is divided into four main themes: career progression; work-life balance; engagement of decision makers; organisational structure. The themes are sub-divided into eight categories under which specific actions could be recommended. She brought the meeting through some of the recommended actions proposed under each of the four main themes.

Responding to a question about making a submission for a bronze award to Athena SWAN, a UK body which recognises and celebrates good practice in recruiting, retaining and promoting women in STEMM (science, technology, engineering, medicine and mathematics) in higher education, when this scheme is opened up to non-UK applicants, Professor Drew confirmed that this would be done on a sectoral basis. Representatives from the seven universities, the Irish Universities Association and the Higher Education Authority (HEA) have met to discuss this and the HEA has agreed to fund a co-ordinator role for this submission.

During the ensuing discussion the report was widely commended by members. Comments were made in relation to management styles in College; the issue of research funding having no provision for maternity leave; the perception that if a staff member is conscientious they are 'punished' with additional workloads; the provision of careers advice and support for early career researchers; and the ratio of researchers to academic staff was noted which demonstrates the extent to which College relies on this category of staff.

Council supported the recommendations in the INTEGER Report and it was noted that the report would be considered by the Finance Committee, and the financial implications of implementing the recommendations will be assessed. Board and

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Council will monitor progress made in the implementation of the recommendations on a recurrent basis.

**CL/13-14/140 Strategic Plan 2014-2019: Preliminary Analysis of Aspects of External Environment**

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer on the Strategic Plan 2014-2019: Preliminary Analysis of External Aspects of External Environment, dated 7<sup>th</sup> April 2014, was circulated along with a confidential background working paper, dated March 2014.

Speaking to the document, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the document was a 'work in progress' and would be presented to a number of other College committees. The information provides an analysis of the national environment, the public funding context and details of some international opportunities for Trinity. In terms of the national environment it is recognised that there has been some improvement in the economy, which is at an early stage of recovery, and that students will look to possible areas of employment when making course choices. In the context of an increasing level of job opportunities, it is likely that enrolments to postgraduate courses will fall. At the undergraduate level, growth in student numbers will be modest over the coming five years, however, this will be followed by significant growth in 10-12 years' time. The projections in relation to public funding are disquieting, even under a best case scenario - one that assumes the maintenance of current spending proportions, that is, in terms of the overall budget allocation to Education and in terms of the share received by third-level education within that envelope - a 9% reduction is likely. In the worst case scenario, College could face reductions in the order of 25%.

The Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer commented that this analysis has raised serious questions about how College is to fund its future activities and maintain a good environment for students and staff. There are a number of options, some within and some outside the control of the institution. College has already embarked on a number of strategies including commercialisation, global relations and online education. Looking at internationalisation and concerns about quality, she noted that a number of well-regarded UK universities had built up significant non-EU student numbers and had maintained strong international ranking positions.

Responding to a question about the proportion of Irish school leavers, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies has been working to broaden the national base of student intake. The question must be asked as to whether or not College wants to increase its EU numbers and it must consider if there would there be capacity to do so. Even if course quotas (EU) were increased, with slow growth predicted in Irish student numbers over the next five years, it is uncertain that these places would be filled. In answer to a query about online education, she commented that this is currently in a pilot stage, therefore, activities on this front are constrained by the parameters of the pilot and capacity issues. The Provost noted that online education is likely to feature prominently in the forthcoming Strategic Plan and within the new Global Relations Strategy. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that discussions of the proposals under the Strategic Plan pillars had already started.

A member commented that a strong case, to maintain the proportion of funding provided to the higher education sector, should be made in the context of the expected bulge in the number of higher education entrants; these can be tracked

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

progressing from primary to post-primary education over the coming years. The Provost commented that it would be wise to plan for significant public funding reductions since this is the dominant trend globally and since it also appears to be the direction supported by a number of Irish politicians.

It was noted that proposals under the Strategic Plan's four main pillars of Education, Research, Public Engagement and Student Life would be circulated for consideration at the next meeting of Council.

#### **CL/13-14/141 Update on 2002 College Alcohol Policy**

A memorandum from the Dean of Students, dated 3 April 2014, was circulated along with an update to the College Alcohol Policy 2002, prepared by the College Alcohol Policy Group. The Dean of Students introduced the item and he explained that it was timely to update College's Alcohol Policy for a number of reasons: a number of years had passed since its initial ratification by Board in 2002; the Report of the Steering Group on a National Substance Misuse Strategy was published recently which includes a number of proposals such as the promotion of alcohol free venues and early interventions to prevent alcohol and other substance misuse; and, with the population of international students growing in College, greater consideration and sensitivity must be shown to those holding different cultural attitudes to alcohol.

Since 2002, achievements have been made in the following areas:

- (i) greater control over the marketing of alcohol promotions and sponsorship of events;
- (ii) encouraging alcohol-free events;
- (iii) raising awareness of alcohol and associated problems;
- (iv) provision of supports, for example, by the College Health Service and the Student Counselling Service, with referrals where necessary.

He brought the meeting through the initial action points and highlighted plans for greater information giving and raising awareness, the development of a policy for emerging areas of substance abuse, and the provision of a choice to students to opt for alcohol free accommodation. In relation to the provision of alcohol-free accommodation, he stated that students confirming this preference would be grouped together in the general accommodation rather than being placed in blocks or specific floors designated as alcohol free, which could have an isolating effect.

The issue surrounding the promotion of so called College events by external parties through the unauthorised use of the College name and other branding was discussed and it was commented that College must act promptly to disassociate itself from such events. The employment of students as drinks and venue promoters and the practice of offering free alcohol were also highlighted. In relation to raising awareness it was suggested that using students' peers would be more effective than staff.

Council approved the updates to the College Alcohol Policy which are to be incorporated into a more comprehensive College-wide policy for both staff and students. In this respect, the Provost invited the College Secretary and the Dean of Students to discuss the integrated policy.

**CL/13-14/142 International Student Barometer**

An updated memorandum from the Vice-President for Global Relations, dated 8 April 2014, was circulated along with detailed data from the International Student Barometer (ISB) related to Trinity College.

The Vice-President for Global Relations advised that this was the third time Trinity had participated in the ISB survey which targeted all international students, EU and non-EU alike, in College and which took place between November and December 2013. The results for Trinity have been ranked against UK, European and other international institutions. In addition, comparative data has been provided for Trinity College within a group of specific competitors which also comprises University College Dublin, University College London, University of Edinburgh, University of Warwick and the University of St. Andrews. For the first time, a breakdown of respondents by school within Trinity was provided.

She summarised the main findings from the survey. There had been a slight improvement in the average time taken to process applications for admission to undergraduate courses from 97 days to 90 days, however, this is not competitive when compared to the international average which was 52 days. There had also been some improvements in processing times for postgraduate taught and research courses in 2013/14 and she noted, as an aside, that further improvements have been achieved for applications for the next academic year.

In terms of academic experience Trinity has not performed well in its group of specific competitors, coming last or second from last when students were asked questions under the following headings: assessment, course organisation, learning spaces, marking criteria, multicultural, performance feedback, technology and virtual learning. Whilst the overall level of satisfaction was still very high, College slipped in the following categories when compared to specific competitors: academics' English, class size, expert lecturers, language support and quality lectures.

In the ranking of support areas, clubs and societies, along with the Careers Advisory and the Counselling services did well, however, satisfaction in the College Health Centre has slipped and the catering, information technology, Academic Registry, finance office and accommodation areas did not perform well.

She noted that the findings from the ISB had been discussed at the Executive Officers Group which agreed that the following would take responsibility for addressing concerns in specific areas:

- (i) academic policy (Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Dean of Graduate Studies);
- (ii) academic related issues and policy implementation (Faculty Deans and Heads of Schools)
- (iii) student admissions and administration (Academic Secretary, the Director of Internationalisation and Vice-President for Global Relations);
- (iv) student services and accommodation (Interim Chief Operating Officer);
- (v) student experience (Dean of Students).

She commented that failure to address these issues would prevent the delivery of the aims of the current Global Relations Strategy and would hamper any further plans under the new Strategy.

Responding to comments and queries the Vice-President for Global Relations acknowledged the difficulty faced by the College Health Centre given that it was designed for a student population of 5,000 and agreed that care must be taken not to damage the work being achieved by clubs and societies in College. In relation to financial support for international student she confirmed that a scholarship fund is being considered under the new Global Relations Strategy, though, she did note that the recent increase in non-EU fees does not seem to have adversely affected student recruitment. She advised that the whole student body could be targeted by this survey in future, if Council so directed.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies commented that performance feedback had been highlighted as an area for concern last year too and he noted measures taken in other universities to improve the quality of, and the response time for, the provision of feedback. He provided examples of other institutions putting in place a 15 or 20 day rule for the return of feedback and he highlighted an initiative in one university where students were asked to highlight good practices they had experienced in receiving performance feedback. It was noted that a clear policy in this area would be helpful but concerns were raised about the difficulty of implementation. In relation to the Library, the Acting Librarian noted that there are plans to open three floors of the Ussher Library overnight, in response to student demand, and that upgrades are planned for their information systems.

#### **CL/13-14/143 Quality**

Memoranda were circulated along with quality review reports for the School of Social Work and Social Policy and the BioResources Unit. The implementation plan for the School of Engineering was also circulated. It was noted that these documents had been considered in detail by the Quality Committee, in line with the new procedure.

##### **(i) Quality Review of the School of Social Work and Social Policy**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced the item. She noted that the findings had been positive on many fronts with the reviewers noting the progress which had been made since the previous review. In particular, she highlighted the reviewers' comments in relation to research activity in the School; the huge investment by staff in the support of teaching and learning; the significant levels of social engagement; issues related to resourcing, structures and space; and the impending problem of a significant number of staff retirements. She advised that all actions within the control of the School are being addressed and those which are outside its control are being considered by the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences.

The Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, highlighted the difficulty faced by the School with six members of staff due to retire over the next few years. He noted that the recruitment of an assistant professor in social policy is being prioritised at the Faculty level, however, decisions must be made in relation to College's commitment to high quality training in the social work area and the further development of research in the social policy and social welfare spheres.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

(ii) **Quality Review of the BioResources Unit (BRU)**

The Dean of Research spoke to the item, noting that the BRU is a specialised unit spread over a number of sites. He summarised the key issues highlighted by the reviewers and noted some early progress had been made. In relation to matters of leadership and the organisational structure of the BRU, he advised that the Directorship has been filled, and that the reporting line has moved from the Chief Operating Officer to the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science. The new Director will contribute to the new strategic plan for the BRU and there will be a review of the budgetary, financial and staffing structures.

(iii) **Implementation plan for the School of Engineering**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that all recommendations had been significantly advanced by the School of Engineering over the last six months, with a number of actions now complete. Two areas which are ongoing are the up-scaling of research activity in the School and the allocation of finances within the School to ensure that the 'general good' is maintained. In relation to the former action, she noted that this is tied into E3 project and that initial proposals had already been developed on the latter action point; progress is being made on both action points.

**CL/13-14/144 Any Other Urgent Business**

- (i) The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies notified Council of the third Oscar Nunan Memorial Match organised jointly by the 'Hist' and the 'Phil' and added that it is important for College to remember the students it has lost.
- (ii) Council noted and approved a tabled nomination for appointment form for a visiting professor to the School of Engineering - see Actum CL/13-14/161 in Section D.

## SECTION B

**CL/13-14/145 Undergraduate Studies Committee**

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 25 March 2014.

**CL/13-14/146 Graduate Studies Committee**

Council noted and approved the minutes of 20 February 2014 (revised) and the draft minutes of 27 March 2014.

**CL/13-14/147 Quality Committee**

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 20 March 2014.

**CL/13-14/148 Research Committee**

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 4 March 2014.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



## SECTION C

**CL/13-14/149 Council Membership 2014-2015****(i) Students' Union**

The Council noted that the following Faculty representatives had been elected and would serve as members of the University Council in 2014-2015:

- (a) Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences: Ms S Baker;
- (b) Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science: Ms M Kenny;
- (c) Faculty of Health Sciences: Mr A Miller.

**(ii) Observers - Secretary to the Scholars**

The Council noted that Ms A P Worrall had been re-elected as Secretary to the Scholars and would attend Council as an observer in 2014-2015.

**CL/13-14/150 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

The Council noted the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 12 March 2014 and noted by Board on 26 March 2014, as circulated:

**PhD** Kathleen Niamh Buckley; Jake Rowan Byrne; Claire Corcoran; Michael Courtney; Kevin Joseph Cunningham; Sinead Noelle Duggan; Christopher Egan; Louise Elliott; Alanna Gannon; Eoin Gubbins; Katarzyna Hanczaryk; Finnian Edward John Hanrahan; Matina Hughes; Gerard Hynes; Patrick Keating; Kevin Koidl; Patricia Julie Ling; Eoin Kieran McCarthy; Niamh McCormick; Niamh Bridget McGoldrick; Lyn Markey; Patrick Morrissey; Barry Edward Murphy; Ciska Neyts; Kara O Connell; Edward O'Gorman; Yoshio Oro; Louise Quinn; David Racine; Simona Salomone; Michael Brendan Sexton; Eamon Sheehy; Olaf Smits; Sophie Marie-Aude Sorel; Susan Spillane; Rory Stoney; Angharad Sweeney.

**MLitt** Esheza Paul-Itua.

**MSc** Oana Maria Deac; Seamus Galligan; Jess Mc Gonagle Garvey.

The Council noted an amendment to the title of a thesis recorded on 12 February 2014.

**CL/13-14/151 Admissions Requirements - Entry Requirements for Dental Science Programme**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from Dean of Dental Affairs, circulated, dated 1 April 2014.

**CL/13-14/152 Head of School of Nursing and Midwifery**

The Council noted that the Board had approved the nomination of Professor C Comiskey, Professor in Health Care Research, to the headship of the School of Nursing and Midwifery, 2014-2017.

**CL/13-14/153 Head of Discipline - Clinical Speech and Language Studies**

Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor I Walsh as Head of Discipline, 2014-2017.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

**CL/13-14/154 Directors in Schools**

The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences
  - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Dr C E Gobl, 2014-2016;
  - (b) Director of Research: Professor L Leeson, 2014-2016.
- (ii) Histories and Humanities
  - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor R Moss, 2014-2015;
  - (b) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor M Cuypers, 2014-2015;
  - (c) Director of Research: Professor M Ó Siochrú, 2014-2016.

**CL/13-14/155 Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences - Academic Director of the Philosophy, Political Science, Economics and Sociology (PPES) Programme**

The Council noted that Professor W Phelan has been nominated to the above post for three years from 1 July 2014.

**CL/13-14/156 School of Dental Science - Appointments**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Dental Affairs, circulated, dated 1 April 2014 in respect of Directors and Heads of Divisions.

**CL/13-14/157 Concurrent Awards - Ordinary BA**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 7 April 2014.

**CL/13-14/158 Senior Academic Promotions Committee 2013/2014 and Personal Chairs Sub-Committee - Membership**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Acting Secretary of the Senior Academic Promotions Committee, circulated, dated 31 March 2014.

**CL/13-14/159 Senior Academic Promotions Committee 2013/2014 and Faculty Shortlisting Committees**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Acting Secretary of the Senior Academic Promotions Committee, circulated, dated 31 March 2014.

**SECTION D**

*In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted*

Signed .....

Date .....

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*