

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 20 November 2013 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost(in the chair), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor D Faas, Professor J Walsh, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor R Dahyot, Professor G Watson, Professor G Davey, Professor I Donohue, Professor D Brennan, Professor J Nunn, Professor A-M Healy, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Mr J Leahy, Ms S G Smith, Mr N Slater.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor M Junker-Kenny, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor S Smith, Dr S Bloomfield, Dr A O'Gara, Ms D Alexander, Ms H Hughes, Mr I Mooney, Mr D McGlacken-Byrne, Acting Librarian, Ms J Chaisson (GSU).
<i>In attendance</i>	Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer, Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall).
<i>By invitation</i>	Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager for CL/13-14/048.

**SECTION A**

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. None were declared.

**CL/13-14/045 Minutes**

The minutes of the meetings held on 8 May, 23 May and 11 June 2013 were approved and signed.

It was noted that item 4.C on the current agenda corrected the document circulated to Council under CL/13-14/044 (iii), for the meeting of 23 October, by clarifying that the search committee approved was for the Professorship of Pharmaceutical Chemistry. The Provost noted the unacceptable level of errors in staffing proposals to Council from Human Resources, particularly in relation to post titles and the membership of search committees, and invited the College Secretary to write to the Director of Human Resources on this matter. The minutes of the meeting of 23 October 2013 were approved and signed.

**CL/13-14/046 Matters Arising:**

- (i) CL/13-14/030 (ii): In response to a query related to the review of student case processes, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that a paper had been produced which is being considered and discussed by the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, the Dean of Graduate Studies and by the Academic Secretary. She noted that it would be forwarded to the Senior Tutor and Dean of Students in due course.
- (ii) CL/13-14/029 (i) The Provost asked the Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science to speak to the issue concerning space in the Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute (TBSI). The Dean confirmed that he had just recently taken on line-management responsibility for the TBSI and, therefore, could not offer Council a detailed report on the matter at this point in time. It was confirmed during the discussion that each research institute in College is responsible to one of the Faculty Deans.

**CL/13-14/047 Provost's Report**

- (i) The Provost reported on the success of the Trinity Global Graduate Forum held on 8 and 9 November 2013. He noted that more than 100 Trinity graduates, from all over the world, had gathered for the two-day forum to provide ideas and to discuss the challenges Trinity is facing under the themes of reputation, growth, education, technology and finances. Speaking in relation to some of the discussions he commented that College will have to consider if it should grow and, if it does, whether this should occur overseas or in Dublin. It was noted that if student numbers were to grow in line with Ireland's projected population growth, Trinity would have approximately 25,000 students by 2030. In relation to the type of educational experience offered by Trinity he noted that most undergraduate students complete independent projects/research which can be expensive to deliver and commented that it has to be questioned if this can be sustained. He noted that some attendees suggested that the Trinity education is not particularly distinctive. The model of education currently pursued by College must also be analysed and decisions must be made as to whether or not technology could make it more efficient and effective, whilst still maintaining Trinity's ethos. On the matter of finances he noted that State funding for higher education is reducing and that it might be timely to look at a different type of funding model for higher education. He explained that that the outcomes of these discussions would feed into the upcoming strategic planning process.
- (ii) Commenting on his recent visits to Asia and North America, the Provost announced that philanthropic funding had been secured to fund a Centre for Asian Studies and to develop an undergraduate course, possibly joint honors, which would include the study of Chinese and Asian cultures as one of its subjects. He noted that the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences was supportive of the development and that there would be some faculty strategic funding made available to contribute to these developments. The Vice-President for Global Relations provided background information on the donor and confirmed that he is a Trinity graduate. It was observed by a member that new courses can take a number of years before interest is raised at secondary school level and that it would be important that there is sufficient funding to sustain the course in the early years. Responding to a question about non-EU student numbers the Provost confirmed that it is still the plan

to adhere to the targets published under the Global Relations Strategy, and that the Finance Committee has approved an increase of the non-EU fee level in line with inflation.

- (iii) The Provost noted that the Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy would be launched in the following week by the Minister for Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation. It was confirmed that the event would take place on Wednesday 27 November 2013.
- (iv) The Provost advised members that an e-mail would be sent to the College Community to invite people to attend a town hall style meeting to discuss the forthcoming strategic planning process.

#### CL/13-14/048 Trinity Identity Initiative

The Provost welcomed the Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager to the meeting to deliver a presentation on the Trinity Identity Initiative.

Introducing the item, the Director of Communications and Marketing stated that the main objective of the initiative is to review how College wishes to be perceived externally and, in doing so, create a shared visual identity and narrative for the entire university. This will allow Trinity to tell a more cohesive and powerful story about what it wishes to achieve in the future. He advised that the initiative is not a cosmetic exercise, rather, it goes to the heart of Trinity's ethos and mission to clearly articulate and promote the values and identity of College in a coherent, concise, distinct and recognisable manner to internal, national and international audiences, as provided for in the Strategic Plan 2009-2014. Speaking to specific challenges, the Marketing Manager presented a large variety of logos and identities used at the institutional level and across different units in College. She noted that a framework was needed to ensure that these identities could co-exist with the identity articulated at the institutional level.

The Director of Communications and Marketing informed the meeting that the initiative had been activated; the Provost is the sponsor, a steering committee has been set up and key staff members are in place. He noted that preliminary research would be carried out internally through an online questionnaire in addition to consultation with the public, and holding focus group sessions and workshops. The planned deadline for delivery on the project is September 2014 and will tie in with the launch of the new strategic plan. He outlined the expected outputs of the project, which would be aligned with the communications strategy, as: consistency in the name and visual identity of the College; an 'identity toolkit', which will provide logos and templates for College use; and the identification of Trinity's key values and unique identifiers. In response to a query about conducting specific research in emerging international markets, he advised that this would not be possible given the current budget and timeline, however, it could be considered for the future. Nonetheless, he noted that linkages were in place with the Global Relations Strategy and the Trinity Global Graduate Forum. It was confirmed that the e-mail regarding the internal survey would be sent to both staff and students.

The Provost thanked the Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager for attending the meeting and encouraged members to complete the online survey.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

**CL/13-14/049 Research Matters**

A number of memoranda, dated 12<sup>th</sup> November 2013, from the Dean of Research were circulated along with the following documents: (i) Dean of Research Annual Report 2011-12, dated 2 October 2013; (ii) Criteria for Research Ethics Committees, dated 2 October 2013; (iii) Terms of Reference for the Research Ethics Policy Committee, dated 8 October 2013; (iv) IUA Policy Statement on Ensuring Research Integrity in Ireland, dated 17 July 2013; and (v) Principles for Open Innovation, Engagement and Knowledge Transfer, dated 15 October 2013.

**(i) Dean of Research, Annual Report 2011-12**

The Dean of Research spoke to the report noting that the version circulated to Council had been abridged and emphasised the point that a significant proportion of data presented in the report had come from external sources, therefore, in some cases it was representative rather than exact. He noted that more explicit treatment had been given to research funding and centres and, for the first time, the report had included sections on patents related activities and innovation. He brought the committee through the document. He noted that despite the fact that the numbers of Trinity's research publications seemed to be in slight decline in 2012, the impact of these publications for the same period continued to increase in terms of the overall number of citations and the number of citations per paper. In relation to intellectual property there have been increases in the key performance indicators of: new patent applications; licences, options and assignments; intellectual property collaboration agreements; and materials transfer agreements. He voiced concern over the decrease in the number of completed invention disclosure forms (49 in 2011/12 compared with 60 in 2010/11). However, the increasing number of schools becoming involved in these activities is to be welcomed, as is Trinity's performance nationally under core performance indicators. The chapter on Trinity Research Centres is new to the report and provides details on 35 research centres; of these, four were new in 2011/12. It was noted that one centre closed in this period. Speaking to the data on research income and accounts he noted that College was awarded €67 million during the period which represents a 40% decrease on 2010/11. However, research funding can be volatile and he commented that this year, whilst not covered by the report, College had been awarded funds in the region of €128 million. Turning his attention to actual funding allocations in 2011/12 he reported that €77 million was received, which represented a decrease of 16.6% on research income received in the previous year. He was happy to report that level of income in the current year had increased. He drew Council's attention to the key performance indicators for researchers, highlighting that 419 principal investigators (PIs) held research accounts in 2012 and, of these, the top 10 PIs brought in almost 25% of the funding received. To provide additional context he added that the top 20 PIs brought in 35% of the funding in 2012. He commented that projections show that research expenditure is expected to fall over the coming five years. Turning to the chapter on research applications and contracts he noted that Trinity performs very well nationally in winning research funding awards, receiving a 44% share of Science Foundation Ireland's (SFI) funding for the investigators programme in 2012, and is the top institution nationally in obtaining EU funding. He noted that the number of applications to funding bodies had increased but the total number of research contracts awarded to Trinity had decreased.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Responding to questions, the Dean of Research explained that data related to the impact of TCD papers, compared with the national average in selected fields, comes from Thomson Reuters Essential Science Indicators. Trinity constantly interrogates and challenges data gathering methodologies, especially when findings appear to be counter-intuitive. With regard to industry research funding the Dean of Research acknowledged that Trinity needs to expand in this area. In relation to statistics showing a breakdown of researchers by categories of staff and contract types, he confirmed that this data would be interesting to consider but was not currently available. He noted that the list of research centres presented in the report were active in 2011/12, though some might have closed since then. Commenting on the variety of research impacts, he advised that the Research Support System is being enhanced to capture a greater range of research impacts which should better represent the outputs from research fields in the arts, humanities and social sciences.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responded to a query concerning the potential loss of Marie Curie ITN (Initial Training Networks) funding due to the lack of fee waivers for PhD students. She advised that this was considered by the Planning Group and since College financial projections are heavily reliant on fee income it was not considered prudent to waive fees at this time. However, she noted work is being carried out to find a possible source of funding to which high performing researchers could apply.

The Provost commended the Dean of Research and the Trinity Research and Innovation staff on the production of an extremely comprehensive annual report.

**(ii) Criteria for Research Ethics Committees**

The Dean of Research explained that the document presented was for Council's consideration and noting. He stated that he would like to consult more widely on the criteria and, in this regard, he confirmed that any comments could be sent to him directly or to the Associate Dean of Research.

He advised that the document presents the criteria for the types of research which would require approval by a Level 1 (low risk) Research Ethics Committee (REC) and research that would require approval by a Level 2 (high risk) REC. Extant committees will be designated as either Level 1 or Level 2 before any new committees are considered. He confirmed that research carried out by Student Services would be covered by these criteria, however, quality assurance studies such as module/course evaluations are not covered as they do not fall into category of research.

The level of consent required of survey respondents was discussed and it was confirmed that consent must be explicitly, rather than tacitly, given in line with EU data protection regulations.

**(iii) Terms of reference for Research Ethics Committee**

The Dean of Research advised that the Research Ethics Committee has been reconstituted as a sub-committee of the Research Committee and is responsible for research ethics policies and practice, as well as research

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

integrity. He noted that the membership now includes the Senior Dean and a representative of the Graduate Students' Union.

Council approved the revised membership and terms of reference of the Research Ethics Committee.

(iv) **Irish Universities Association Policy Statement on Ensuring Research Integrity in Ireland**

Due to time constraints, discussion of this document was deferred to the next meeting of Council.

(v) **Principles for Open Innovation, Engagement and Knowledge Transfer**

The Dean of Research introduced the item and advised that the main premise behind these principles was to ensure, in so far as possible, that the outputs from research in Trinity, such as knowledge and technology, are used appropriately to generate a societal and/or economic return to the community.

In the course of the ensuing discussion the principle, 'TCD claims ownership of all intellectual property developed by TCD employees in the course of their employment.' was questioned since it does not take account of the exemption provided for in the current version of Trinity's overarching intellectual property policy, namely, that College does not claim ownership of intellectual property encompassed in scholarly publications of College Staff. It was commented that the principles, as drafted, were more relevant to intellectual property which could be commercialised whereas they should represent a broader range of research outputs. Responding to a query about the review of the existing Policy, Practice and Regulations on Intellectual Property, the Dean of Research confirmed that the Technology Transfer Manager is currently revising the document in consultation with the College Solicitor.

It was noted that, following clarification of certain matters, this item should be re-visited at the next meeting of Council.

**CL/13-14/050 Postgraduate Course Proposal - Master in Pharmacy (M. Pharm.)**

A proposal for a new course leading to a Master in Pharmacy (M. Pharm.), dated 12 November 2013, was circulated. Speaking to the proposal the Dean of Graduate Studies provided background information to its development noting that previously pharmacy graduates completed their pre-registration training, which took the form of a work placement, under the direct management of the Pharmaceutical Society of Ireland (PSI). Since 2009, this placement year has taken the form of a one-year M.Pharm. delivered by the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland, on behalf of the PSI, following their successful bid to deliver the course. The contract to deliver the M.Pharm. is open to tender again and the proposal document, as circulated, represents the School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences' response to the call. It was noted that the delivery of this one-year course on behalf of the PSI, by whichever institution wins the bid, is an interim measure pending the development of a more integrated programme of pharmacy training.

Speaking to the particulars of the proposal she noted that the duration of the course is a full 12 months and carries 90 ECTS; 60 credits for the taught elements and 30

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

credits for the research project. Modules would be delivered mainly online and through experiential learning during their clinical placement, with a small number of visits to the Trinity campus. Student placements would be overseen by preceptor pharmacists each of whom must be, or have been, trained to standards required by the PSI. There would be a variety of assessment modalities used and she noted that the large pre-registration examination contributes 30% to each module mark. Since only one institution can be awarded the contract it is envisaged that 150-170 students would have to be accommodated each year, however, it was noted that this was tentative as Trinity might not win the tender. The Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that there are sufficient preceptors in place to facilitate student placements.

The Senior Tutor advised that the language used in the appeals section should be reviewed since it resembled the undergraduate appeals mechanisms rather than those at the postgraduate level. Commenting on the sentence 'Only graduates who have been declared satisfactory by the PSI will be eligible to enter the programme' the Provost stated that College would have to proceed cautiously, if it won the tender, to ensure its autonomy over admissions.

Council approved the proposal for a one-year course leading to an award of M.Pharm. and noted that the course would commence in September 2014, if Trinity's bid is deemed successful.

**CL/13-14/051 Any Other Urgent Business**

There was no other urgent business in Section A. See Minutes CL/13-14/064 (v) and CL/13-14/065 in Section D below.

**SECTION B**

**CL/13-14/052 Human Resources Committee**

The Provost drew Council's attention to the discussion at the Human Resources Committee concerning the creation of the title of Professor Emeritus (HRC 2012-2013/05). It was noted that the Committee discussed the issue of a proportion of academics failing to progress beyond the merit bar (HRC 2012-2013/23) and the hardship caused across College due to the non-replacement of staff on maternity leave (HRC 2012-2013/60), and the likely connection between the two in relation to a proportion of female academics was highlighted. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer acknowledged the difficulties caused by the policy to not replace staff on maternity leave and stated that the possibility of a central fund is under discussion. It was also queried how the additional 78 hours per annum would be added to an academic staff member's workload and it was suggested that not enough is being done to counter the common perception that the only work done by academic staff is the delivery of lectures. Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 31 October 2013.

**CL/13-14/053 International Committee**

The Vice-President for Global Relations drew the meeting's attention to the intense period of visits conducted by the Global Relations team (IC/12-13/026). The draft minutes of 10 October 2013 were noted and approved.

**CL/13-14/054 Research Committee**

The Dean of Research highlighted the review of the Policy on Research Centres (RS/13-14/18), the reconstitution of the Knowledge Transfer and Innovation Committee (RS/13-14/19) and the imminent launch of the new College Research website (RS/13-14/22). Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 5 November 2013.

**CL/13-14/055 Student Life Committee**

The Dean of Students advised that the Orientation Review is nearing completion (SLC/13-14/12) and that the pilot of the Irish Survey of Student Engagement would be launched in December 2013. The draft minutes of 16 October 2013 were noted and approved.

## SECTION C

**CL/13-14/056 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners - Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, as circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 October 2013 and noted by Board on 6 November 2013.

**MD** Miriam Byrne; Sam Lynch.

**PhD** Andrea Bobersky; Riccardo Bresciani; Valentin Daniel Burcea; Marika Doucet; Frank Dunlop; Stephen Liam Dunne; Toufic El Arnaout; Mary Carmel Fitzgerald; Susan Galavan; Emer Guinan; Sara Pauline Hayes; Louise Mary Heeran Flynn; Damian Jackson; Jennifer Johnson; Patrick Kelly; Brendan Connell James Kirwan; Niall Aidan McCrory; Cormack McKenna; Neasa Mc Nabola; Sarah Mullen Giulia Ni Dhulchaointigh; Hugh Nolan; Margaret Claire O'Regan; Nor Effendy Othman; Kangyu Pan; Il - Haam Petersen; Deirdre Reilly; Ciaran Smyth; Janis Umblis.

**MAI** Gerard Patrick Brady.

**MSc** Muireann Mc Donnell; Carolyn Walsh; Lin Zhang.

**DEd** William Walsh.

**DChDent** Fatimah Alsaege; Angus Burns.

**CL/13-14/057 Change of Title of Department of History of Art to History of Art and Architecture**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 7 November 2013.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



**CL/13-14/058 Headship of Discipline**

- (i) **Anatomy**  
The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor N J Mahony as Head of Discipline of Anatomy from 14 October 2013 for one year on an interim basis;
- (ii) **Electronic and Electrical Engineering**  
The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor W Dowling as Head of Discipline of Electronic and Electrical Engineering with immediate effect until 30 June 2016.

**CL/13-14/059 Minutes of Meeting of 23 October 2013 - Selection Committees - CL/13-14/044 (iii)**

The Council noted that the Search Committee for the post of Professorship in Pharmaceutical Chemistry, considered at the meeting of 23 October 2013, should have been submitted as 'Professorship of Pharmaceutical Chemistry'.

**CL/13-14/060 Headship of School of Medicine - Nominating Committee**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Health Sciences, circulated, dated 13 November 2013.

**SECTION D**

*In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted*

Signed .....

Date .....