

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 16 January 2013 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

|                      |   |
|----------------------|---|
| <i>Present</i>       | Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor D Faas, Professor J Walsh, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor J P Labrador, Professor G Davey, Professor D Brennan, Professor S Smith, Professor J Nunn, Dr S Bloomfield, Ms D Jones, Dr A O'Gara, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Professor A Piesse, Mr D Ferrick, Ms S Leydon, Mr A McEwan. |
| <i>Apologies</i>     | Professor A McNabola, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor T Connor, Mr E Tebay, Mr S Maguire, Ms J Spillane, Secretary to the Scholars (Mr T O'Connor)   |
| <i>In attendance</i> | Acting Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer, Ms O Sheehan.  |
| <i>Observers</i>     | Ms M Dee (GSU).   |

Council conveyed its condolences to the family of Professor John Scott, Fellow Emeritus, on his recent death.

The Provost invited Professor Gavin Davey, a new member of Council, to make the Statutory Declaration as provided for in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

SECTION A

**CL/12-13/075 Minutes**

Minutes of the meeting of 21 November 2012 were approved and signed following the requested amendments:

- (i) to record the presence of the Dean of Graduate Studies
- (ii) CL12-13/024 (i), line 5, amend to Dean of *Students*.
- (iii) CL12-13/025, third line from end, Professor Walsh, *of the* School of Education.
- (iv) CL12-13/063, delete the sentence 'Professor D C Williams ... two items.'

**CL/12-13/076 Matters Arising:**

CL12-13/024 (i) The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reported that the Finance Committee had agreed to continue to extend the registration period to facilitate those students who have been affected by the delay in the processing of local authority grants by Student Universal Support Ireland (SUSI).

**CL12-13/025** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that College has notified the HEA that, together with its three partner institutions, it will move ahead to establish a dispersed new institute as recommended by the Report on the Structure of Initial Teacher Education. At a meeting in December 2012 of the task force it was agreed to hold a workshop to develop the vision for the new institute, to scope the project in a way that ensures opportunities for enhancing the provision of initial teacher education ensuring the strengths of all partners are fully utilised. At a recent meeting with the Provost and Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Chairman of the Board of Governors of the Church of Ireland College of Education, confirmed that the CICE will be incorporated into DCU and thus form part of the institute of education made up of DCU, St Patrick's College and Mater Dei. While Trinity College understands the decision of the CICE it regrets the end of this long-standing, fruitful relationship. The CICE will continue as an Associated College until its negotiations with DCU are successfully concluded and should CICE's position change for any reason Trinity would be prepared to reopen discussions.

**CL/12-13/050** The Dean of Research updated Council on progress on the E3 Strategy which is proceeding along two lines. A case for support from research funding sources in Ireland and Europe is being developed in tandem with preparation of a high-level plan for capital development. The capital project will be dependent on the availability of public funding and is being scoped now so as to be well-prepared should a call be issued by government.

**CL/12-13/051** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reported that the Mid-Term Review of the Strategic Plan is at the printers and copies will be circulated to members of Council shortly. In response to a query she confirmed that the print run is small. It was agreed that where electronic circulation reduces costs it should be used for the dissemination of documents, as for example, happened in the case of the 'Landscape' document.

**CL/12-13/052** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that Board had approved the proposal to establish the title Professor Emeritus/Emerita with the recommendation that consideration should be given to extending a similar title to other grades of academic staff.

#### **CL/12-13/077 Provost's Report**

- (i) The Provost informed Council that, having submitted its Landscape document in July 2012, College has been invited to meet the HEA in February 2013 to discuss it. In the meantime, the IUA has submitted to the HEA a position paper on Higher Education System Configuration which is a composite document on behalf of the sector. It emphasises that individual institutions' Landscape documents demonstrate the considerable efforts already made in building collaborations and alliances and the Provost reminded Council of our existing linkages in the area of initial teacher education, with the DIT and the RIAM. The universities have already committed to the development of regional clusters and propose five configurations. It is as yet unclear as to how the HEA intends to proceed and the Provost believes that it is impeded by a basic flaw in that its starting point concentrated on the development of technological universities and consolidation rather than identifying pathways for students to move between institutions.

A Council member expressed his concern about the relationship between the IUA position paper and Trinity's response to 'Landscape'. As the IUA document is not publically available and has not been discussed by Council it

is impossible to assess how they relate to one another. He considers it inappropriate that the IUA should make commitments before discussion by Board and Council. The Provost replied that it is essential that he put the College's position forward. He emphasised that, in contributing to the IUA document, neither he nor the Executive Officers team had gone beyond their authority. The IUA document does not make any binding commitments on the College's behalf. He agreed that Council members should be provided, electronically, with the IUA document 'Higher Education System Configuration Position Paper'.

- (ii) A meeting is scheduled between the Minister for Education and Skills, the Provost and the President of UCD, to continue discussions on the Minister's proposed amendment to the Universities Bill. The Provost assured Council that he is taking all steps to counter the dangers inherent in the amendment.

#### **CL/12-13/078 IUA Task Force on Reform of University Selection and Entry**

- (i) **Briefing Note**

Council noted the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 8 January 2013. A Task Group was established by the seven universities to develop detailed proposals for the reform of university selection and entry and a timeline for implementation as a response to a request from the Minister for Education and Skills. A briefing note on the Task Group's objectives (22 November 2012) was circulated. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies noted that the Task Group is examining a very wide range of proposals covering the Leaving Certificate grade bands, Leaving Certificate assessment, incentivising positive subject choice, broadening undergraduate entry routes and other forms of assessment. The Group, chaired by Professor Philip Nolan of NUI Maynooth, has met on a number of occasions but progress has been slow. In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies replied that he did not expect the Task Group to extend its consideration of issues further than those outlined in its document.

- (ii) **Trinity's Position on Reform of University Selection and Entry**

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 8 January 2013, inviting Council to consider and confirm College's position and aspirations on university selection and entry was circulated. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies introduced the item by explaining that there is a widespread view externally that the multiplicity of course codes within Trinity serves to 'heat' the Leaving Certificate points race and that Trinity has a vested interest in retaining high-points small-quota courses. The structure of admissions to the Two Subject Moderatorship Programme, whereby each of the possible subject combinations, has its own code exacerbates this perception. Within the context of the work being undertaken by the IUA Task Group on the Reform of University Selection and Entry it is an opportune time to consider how Trinity could counter this perception while continuing to offer the existing range of courses. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies' memorandum suggests that we reconsider the structure of existing joint honors programmes and explore the potential for providing new educational opportunities for students which would allow for greater flexibility in subject choice and transfer within

subjects. It recognises that the title of the TSM course does not provide the necessary clarity externally and proposes that the title should be changed. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer will chair a working group to consider the ideal structure of TSM, and other joint honors programmes, taking account of academic coherence, admission issues, timetabling and course administration. Membership of the working group will include the Director of TSM, the Head of School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies (a School heavily involved in TSM) and Directors of Teaching and Learning (UG) from the School of Social Sciences and Philosophy and the School of Psychology and a student representative.

The principles outlined in the memorandum had been discussed, through a series of resolutions, by the Undergraduate Studies Committee in December 2012. All resolutions had been approved, some with unanimous support. Where there had been dissent much of it had centred on the speed of the proposed changes. In a discussion of the resolutions considered by the Undergraduate Studies Committee Council members expressed reservations about the third resolution and noted that there may well be good academic reasons for small quota high-points courses. The memorandum notes College's commitment to exploring measures to increase the number of students from Northern Ireland, recognising the value of having students from all parts of the island as well as international students in the student body.

During the discussion of the IUA Briefing Note and the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies memorandum the following points were made:

- the title of a joint honors programme needs to be given careful attention
- describing small quota courses as having 'no virtue' is a very strong statement
- there may well be insurmountable difficulties arising from European law about treating applicants from NI differently to UK applicants
- that all students taking A-levels should be treated the same regardless of their geographical location
- that our graduates from NI have played significant roles in the Peace Process and that there is a wider benefit to society in ensuring the recruitment of NI students is supported
- that it is important that Trinity continues to welcome students from all traditions
- that the working group has been presented with implicit solutions before it starts its work
- that there are dangers in changing the title of a programme such as TSM without a well thought-out and implemented communications programme
- that attempts to change the structure of the TSM programme in the past had not been successful
- that some joint honors programmes are in reality two single subjects studied separately
- that the working group should consider ways in which course administration, including timetabling, could be simplified
- that the use of phrases such as 'incentivising positive subject' in the IUA document raise value judgements

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

- that there needs to be more critical appraisal of the concept of awarding bonus points to some subjects in the Leaving Certificate.

Council supported the Position on Reform of University Selection and Entry as representing College's position on issues to be discussed by the IUA Task Group, noting that there are some occasions when there is academic merit for high-points low-quota courses, that the Chair of the TSM Management Committee will be a member of the working group, the TSM Management Committee will be consulted on a change of name for the programme and there is more work to be done on lifting the barriers to the recruitment of students from NI.

#### **CL/12-13/079 New Admission Procedure to Joint Honors Programmes**

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, 8 January 2013, was circulated. During his presentation of the previous agenda item the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies had provided the context for the proposal. The proposal refers predominantly to TSM combinations but also to the History and Political Science and Geography and Political Science courses. The existing codes will be replaced by 26 course codes, reducing the number of course codes by 154, while still allowing the current 180 combination to be chosen. As at present students must attain the required level for the subject with the highest points in their chosen combination. During the discussion about university selection and entry there was widespread support for the proposal to reduce the number of course codes which was viewed as a pragmatic approach to protecting our current provision. It was noted that there is no academic case for a proliferation of course codes and the use of single codes will not automatically lead to reduction in course entry points. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies conveyed to Council the Director of TSM's broad acceptance for the need to reduce the number of course codes in response to external pressure. The Director noted the need for care to ensure that recruitment to one of College's most popular programmes is not adversely affected by confusion or dilution of the programme's strengths.

Council approved the proposal to reduce the number of course codes by which applicants choose their course of study for students entering in 2014/2015 onwards.

#### **CL/12-13/080 Admission to Medicine - Changes to HPAT**

A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 8 January 2013, was circulated. In 2009 the Health Professional Admission Test (HPAT) was introduced to remove the Leaving Certificate as the sole determinant of entry to Medicine. A National Research Group Evaluating Revised Entry and Selection Mechanisms to Medicine was convened in 2009 at the request of the HEA and under the auspices of the Council of Deans of Faculties of Medical Schools in Ireland. Professor Martina Hennessy represented Trinity on the group which produced an interim report. One of the main findings of the report is that candidates who repeat the HPAT-Ireland test are likely to improve their score. Furthermore, repetition of HPAT-Ireland questions in tests, necessitated by the fact that scores are valid for a 2 year period, may also contribute to the benefit of repeating. To ameliorate the effect of repeating the test it is recommended that:

- HPAT-Ireland scores are valid for a period of one year only

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

- A redistribution is applied to the weighting of HPAT-Ireland sections
- Further practice material is made available to all HPAT-Ireland applicants which also includes some examples of correct responses and the rationales to these to ensure adequate opportunities for all to become familiar with the test format and sample items.

These recommendations have the support of the School of Medicine.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that there will be a wider review of HPAT in two years when all Schools of Medicine will have the opportunity to judge its success or otherwise in meeting its objectives.

Council approved the recommendations for changes to the HPAT to come into effect for those entering Medicine in 2014/15 onwards.

#### **CL/12-13/081 Quality - School of Physics Implementation Plan**

The Provost invited the Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science to present the Implementation Plan from the School of Physics, 11 December 2012, circulated.

The Dean noted that the Reviewers had presented an extensive report with 33 recommendations; 22 of which have already been implemented by the School. The Dean drew Council's attention in particular to those recommendations that have yet to be implemented. The Reviewers recommended the appointment of a new Erasmus Smith Professor to maintain scientific leadership and pointed to the threat that young professors will leave the School - issues that affect many Schools. Although the Reviewers recommend that the School should consider establishing a help room student representatives did not feel this was necessary throughout the year. The School is exploring providing non-monetary rewards for postgraduate demonstrators. The Dean informed Council that the Theoretical Physics Course Committee has been established and is addressing the issue of the project for SS Theoretical Physics students. There are a number of recommendations which the School feels cannot be implemented. For example, the School does not have access to large facilities such as synchrotron light sources. While student representatives from Physics meet regularly with the School and the Theoretical Physics Course Committee has student representatives, Engineering students who take modules in Physics may not be represented. The School has done some outreach work but Physics is not a popular secondary school subject, especially in girls schools. The Dean drew Council's attention to recommendation 20 from the Reviewers that world-class researchers should have some reduction in teaching loads and noted that this is contrary to College policy. The Provost thanked the Dean for his report and welcomed the focus in the Reviewers' Report on teaching. The Dean reported that he has provided the School with a small grant to explore more innovative teaching practice on the understanding that its experience should be disseminated around College.

Council noted the Implementation Plan for the School of Physics.

#### **CL/12-13/082 Master in Arts (*jure officii*)**

The Registrar spoke to a memorandum from the Schedules Working Party, 4 January 2013, circulated.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The Master in Arts *jure officii* is the means by which members of College become members of the University and members of the Senate. It entitles Fellows to serve as Senior Master non-Regent and the Registrar to be a Master or Doctor of the University. In considering the current rules relating to the award of the degree as they affect part-time staff and the current Calendar entry the Schedules Working Party became aware of other issues to be resolved. Professor O'Dell brought Council through the recommendations:

- the inclusion of the Chief Operating Officer in those eligible
- that those eligible may be proposed at a Stated Meeting after their admission to office (rather than at the *next* Stated Meeting)
- the use of new academic titles
- the inclusion of Chief Technical Officers, Chief Medical Scientists and Senior Experimental Officers in the Calendar entry as being among those eligible; in line with a Board decision of 1994
- reducing the length of service required for other eligible categories of staff from forty years to thirty-five years
- extending eligibility to permanent part-time staff who had previously been permanent full-time; in line with a decision of the Visitor on those eligible to be included in the register for the election of a Provost.

A Council member noted that this was one of a number of changes to the Statutes required to accommodate part-time staff and queried whether more should be expected. The Registrar explained that this change, combined with the decision of the Visitor, would provide a precedent for other clauses in the Statutes. Council briefly discussed whether the period of eligibility should be further reduced to thirty years but confirmed the Working Party's recommendation of thirty-five years. The Acting Librarian reported that Library staff welcomed the opportunity for more staff to avail of the honour. Council approved the recommendations of the Schedules Working Party on the award and Calendar entry for the Master in Arts *jure officii*.

## SECTION B

### CL/12-13/083 Undergraduate Studies Committee

At its meeting on 11 December 2012 the Undergraduate Studies Committee agreed that in the implementation of SiTS

- end-of-year overall results (modules and assessment component marks and grades) will be released to the individual student's portal page
- the same information will be released to staff (including tutors) at the same time via the staff portal page
- for the 2012/13 academic year the publication of results will continue via the web and on noticeboards using the anonymous examination number
- students' results should be ordered by merit in published results lists for all years.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies brought Council's attention to the use of student ambassadors in Open Day and the development of a Trinity Explore website. He will circulate the weblink for the new page to Council members in due course. Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the Undergraduate Studies Committee, 11 December 2012.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



**CL/12-13/084 Graduate Studies Committee**

At its meeting on 6 December 2012 the Graduate Studies Committee had approved the proposals for the publication of results in SiTS. The Committee confirmed that PhD students are required to take a minimum of 10 ECTS of modules to satisfy the criteria for a structured PhD and the Dean will be working with Schools to define specific requirements.

In response to a query the Dean reported that the proposal for a validated Master of Music in Performance from the RIAM has been sent for external review. As is common the reviewer had made a number of recommendations and the course proposal is being amended in this context. It will come to Council later this term.

Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the Graduate Studies Committee, 6 December 2012.

**CL/12-13/085 Human Resources Committee - Review of Academic Staff on Probation/Review of Academic Staff for Conversion to Established Posts**

The Provost proposed and Council agreed that implementation of the policy on Confirmation in Post of Academic Staff requires discussion. It will revert to the next Council meeting as a Section A agenda item.

**CL12/13/086 International Committee**

The Vice-President for Global Relations drew Council's attention to Minute IC/12-13/007 giving details on international student recruitment and expressed her satisfaction with the interest in TCD courses that is being generated.

Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the International Committee, 15 November 2012.

**CL/12-13/087 Quality Committee**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the business of the Quality Committee is concentrating on implementing the recommendations of the IRIU. Proposals on the implementation of an overhauled student evaluation system and on the role of the Quality Committee itself will be brought to Council in due course. Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the Quality Committee, 13 December 2012.

**CL/12-13/088 Research Committee**

The Dean of Research brought Council's attention to four important issues the Research Committee is working on:

- development of a policy document covering the formation, oversight, operation and financial arrangements for Trinity Research Institutes
- review of the existing policies on IP, to be informed by the new national IP policy
- providing a better structure for the approval of research ethics across all units in College. A policy document will be brought forward to Council by the Associate Dean of Research
- development of the College strategy on industry liaison and entrepreneurship.

Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the Research Committee, 4 December 2012

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



## SECTION C

**CL/12-13/089 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 21 November 2012 and noted by Board on 5 December 2012, as circulated.

**PhD** Myles Dungan; Elizabeth Fahey-McCarthy; Theresa Frawley; Pawel Gancarski; Sheila Greene; Raimondas Ibenskas; Caroline Jagoe; Lars Henry Manzke; Judith McGrath; Alex McKee; Dolores Martina McLoughlin; Mary Patricia O'Malley; Amy Prendergast; Eric Risser; Johanna Jessica Salomon; Elena Schwagerus; Mafalda Viana.

**DChDent** Patrick Delaney; Joanne Susan Mawhinney.

**CL/12-13/090 Graduate Studies Business requiring Council Approval**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, circulated, dated 8 January 2013, in respect of:

- (i) change of name and award of the Postgraduate Diploma in Statistics (PDCS-STAT-1P) to the Postgraduate Certificate in Statistics;
- (ii) A change of name of the M.Sc. in Political Science (PTSP-POLS-1F / PTSP-POLS-1P) to the M.Sc. in Politics and Public Policy;
- (iii) restructuring of the part-time M.Sc. in Health Informatics, School of Computer Science and Statistics, which will ensure 60 ECTS are delivered in Year 1 (of the 2 Year programme) sufficient for a Postgraduate Diploma to be awarded if a student exits after Year 1;
- (iv) restructuring of the part-time M.Sc. in Management of Information Systems, School of Computer Science and Statistics, which will ensure 60 ECTS are delivered in Year 1 (of the 2 Year programme) sufficient for a Postgraduate Diploma to be awarded if a student exits after Year 1;
- (v) restructuring of the part-time M.Sc. in Technology and Learning, School of Computer Science and Statistics, which will ensure 60 ECTS are delivered in Year 1 (of the 2 Year programme) sufficient for a Postgraduate Diploma to be awarded if a student exits after Year 1.

**CL/12-13/091 Headship of School of Chemistry**

The Council noted that the Board, at its meeting of 5 December 2012, approved the nomination of Dr S M Draper, Professor in Chemistry, to the headship of the School of Chemistry, from 1 January 2013 to 2 July 2016.

**CL/12-13/092 School of Social Work and Social Policy**

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor R H Gilligan as Director of Research from Hilary term 2013 to the end of Trinity Term 2015.

**CL/12-13/093 Academic Appeals Committee for Graduate Students (Taught) (Calendar part I, B147)**

The Council noted and approved the following membership:

The Registrar, Chair

The Senior Tutor, Secretary (in attendance)

Two nominees of the Registrar:

Professor D J Ryan

Professor B D R Misstear

Professor M O'Regan (former Senior Tutor)

Two representatives of the Tutors:

Professor J Lalor

Professor J P Spiers

Professor J I Saeed (former Dean of Graduate Studies)

The Vice-President, Graduate Students' Union

**CL/12-13/094 Senior Promotions Committee - *ad hoc* Appeals Committee on Senior Promotions 2012**

**(i) Interim Report to Board**

The Council noted a memorandum from the Senior Dean, Chair of the *ad hoc* Appeals Committee for Senior Promotions 2012 to Board, circulated, dated 3 December 2012 (received by Board on 5 December 2012);

**(ii) Council Representation**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Dean, circulated, dated 7 January 2013.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed .....

Date .....