Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 13 June 2012 at 10.30 am in the Board Room.

Present Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer,

Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor A McNabola, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor T Connor, Professor D Brennan, Professor S Smith, Professor J Nunn, Dr H Mannan, Dr A O'Gara, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Professor A Piesse, Ms R

Barry, Dr D Fitzgerald.

Apologies Dean of Research, Professor E O'Dell, Professor J Wickham, Professor Z

Rodgers, Professor D O'Donovan, Professor J P Labrador, Ms D Jones, Ms S Leydon, Mr D Ferrick, Ms L Aljohmani, Mr M McAndrew, Mr R J Smith (GSU),

Chief Operating Officer.

In attendance Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Ms O Sheehan.

Observers Secretary to the Scholars (Mr T O'Connor).

By invitation Professor H Rice (for CL/11-12/194)

SECTION A

CL/11-12/189 Minutes

Minutes of the meeting of 16 May 2012 were approved and signed following one amendment to the wording of CL/11-12/170, second paragraph: 'The Statutes outline the reasons as to why the Divinity School ceased to exist and ...'

CL/11-12/190 Matters Arising:

There were no matters arising.

CL/11-12/191 Provost's Report

(i) The Provost reminded Council that the HEA has asked higher education institutions to consider how they may collaborate on a regional basis as part of the National Strategy for Higher Education, in particular with respect to the document 'Towards a future higher education landscape'. The Trinity response will focus on two dimensions - (i) to reaffirm our mission, and (ii) to respond to the HEA call for closer collaboration among higher education institutions. In our response, to be submitted by the end of July, we will be emphasising our position as Ireland's university on the world stage and

outlining our evolving global relations strategy. We will make some suggestions for collaboration based on conversations with other institutions in the neighbourhood. A Council member viewed this review of educational provision by the HEA as a significant threat to the sector. He saw the desired outcome as a realignment of third-level institutions purely to meet short-term economic demands. He suggested that, given the time-frame, there should be urgent discussions with the College community about College's response. The Provost noted that the College's response will make suggestions for areas of potential collaboration, rather than binding commitments. It may be prudent to delay wider consultation with the College community until we are in a position to pursue any discussions to a conclusion. Any necessary decisions arising from these discussions will be brought to Board and Council in the normal way.

(ii) The Provost brought Council's attention to a report in the national press that the Minister for Education and Skills was disappointed that higher education institutions had not yet proposed changes on admission procedures. As Council is aware, the Senior Lecturer is actively considering possible options for undergraduate admission that would not rely exclusively on the existing points system and he recently hosted a conference 'Undergraduate Admissions for the 21st Century' in Trinity College. The Senior Lecturer confirmed that representatives from the Department of Education and Skills had attended the conference. The Senior Lecturer will continue his work on developing a discussion paper on Admissions to higher education.

CL/11-12/192 Global Relations

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations spoke to the document 'Global Relations Strategy', 6 June 2012, circulated. She noted that Board had approved the high-level strategy for Global Relations (BD/11-12/102) and the subsequent business plan (BD/11-12/263 of 30 May 2012). She welcomed this opportunity to discuss the academic aspects of the Global Relations Strategy (GRS) with Council. She drew Council's attention to Appendix 6 which shows Trinity's results in a survey of international students compared to other Irish and international institutions. Satisfied international students can be our most enthusiastic ambassador abroad. However, on the basis of this survey Trinity rates poorly on the quality of the student experience. The Vice-Provost for Global Relations highlighted a number of specific areas to be addressed:

- Student accommodation at present about 10% of international students are housed in College accommodation. She suggested that at a minimum international students should be guaranteed College accommodation in their Junior Freshman year which would require the provision of additional College accommodation.
- The inclusion of work based learning as part of course curriculum and how internships, both for incoming and outgoing students, would facilitate a work based learning curriculum.
- The slowness of decision-making on international student applications on average 86 days in Trinity compared to 48 hours for some of our competitors.
- Increasing international mobility a first step will be to audit existing activity and then to consider how it can be best supported. In some instances academic structures are restricting opportunities. The Senior Tutor reported that financial considerations are affecting students' ability to take part in international exchanges.

The length of time it takes for assessed work to be returned. The Senior Lecturer reported that he intends to address the issue of student feedback in all its aspects in the next academic year, drawing on the expertise of CAPSL.

The business plan of the GRS incorporates the principle that the resource arising from the additional international student recruitment flows back into the delivery area and the Vice-Provost for Global Relations noted the importance of Schools, support areas and the Library in delivering the GRS. She noted that the business plan allows for the appointment of global relations officers in Schools to help build capacity where staff are already over-stretched. In response to a query from a Council member, the Vice-Provost for Global Relations said that while some Schools may decide to develop new courses or amend existing courses for international students our existing suite of programmes are attractive to international students; in particular those from North America who value a four year liberal arts education.

A Council member said that Trinity is ideally placed to make our mark on the world stage. He noted the importance of our distinct identity in meeting the GRS targets of international student recruitment and the contradiction with what appears to be government policy to impose uniformity. He suggested that the result of the HEA 'Landscape' strategy would be to encourage mediocrity in the sector rather than encourage individual institutional excellence.

A Council member sought the Vice-Provost for Global Relations' assessment of the current projections for student numbers from Study Group International (SGI). Although the number of students expected to register on Trinity courses in 2012/13 (14) is lower than first projected this may be explained by the late start of the SGI programme. For 2013/14 an intake of 75 was projected by SGI; only 36 students have enrolled with SGI for the September 2012 programme. There is a second admission in January 2013 which should increase that number. The Vice-Provost for Global Relations assured Council that she is keeping student recruitment by SGI under constant scrutiny. The Senior Lecturer confirmed that he is satisfied with the academic standard of the SGI programme.

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations concluded by acknowledging the tremendous work already being done in Schools to increase our international profile. She looks forward to working with College Officers and the wider College community to implement the GRS so as to reap the benefits that increased internationalisation can bring. The Provost thanked her for the excellent document and looked forward to the successful implementation of the GRS.

CL/11-12/193 College Calendar and Academic Titles

(i) Internationalisation of Academic Titles

A memo from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, 7 June 2012, was circulated. The new academic titles were introduced by Schedule adopted by Board in 2011 (BD/10-11/273). The Schedule uses the expression 'may be described as' and thus permits academic staff to use either title (for example, Lecturer or Assistant Professor) in their day-to-day business. This discretion is not altered by this proposal. It is desirable, however, that there is consistency in the use of titles in the College Calendar and for official College business. Council agreed to exercise its power, permitted by the Statues and Schedules, to use the new titles in the Calendar. An express clause will be

included in the Calendar that such a decision has been taken and the cover pages of both parts of the Calendar will record that they are made pursuant to section 10 of the Introduction Chapter of the Consolidated Statutes of Trinity College Dublin and of the University of Dublin, 2010.

A Council member suggested that because there had been no change to the Statutes there was room for ambiguity in the use of the new titles. He noted the differing practices across College whereby some refer to all as 'Professor', some use the title Assistant Professor and some use the old titles. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that this proposal should clarify the use of titles for the purpose of College business. She noted that 'Assistant Professor' is a title rather than a salutation. Academic staff should ensure that their communications, such as email signatures, business cards, etc., convey their expertise and position. Council further agreed that the new titles should be used for all official College and University business.

(ii) Visiting Professors and Visiting Academics

A memo from the Secretary to the College, College Calendar: Visiting Professors and Visiting Academics, 11 June 2012 was tabled. At present Visiting Professor and Visiting Academics are listed in the Calendar in two places: under their host department and as a separate list. The recent changes in Academic Titles has resulted in the redefinition of many research associates as visiting academics and will thus increase the number of Visiting Academics to be listed. In order to bring consistency in presentation and to reduce duplication in what is already a very large document Council agreed to list all Visiting Academics, Visiting Professors and Visiting Research Fellows in their host department only in future editions of the Calendar.

CL/11-12/194 Report of the Working Group on the Merit Bar

The Report of the Working Group on the Merit Bart, 5 June 2012, was circulated and Professor Henry Rice, Chair of the Working Group attended. The Working Group was established by the HR Committee to consider issues referred to it by Board following discussion of the Equality Officer's report on the gender of lecturers at the merit bar. This report has been approved by the Equality Committee. The Working Group was firmly of the view that the maintenance of a proper balance between teaching and research was the sine qua non of a research-led University and that there should be no question of the introduction of a two-way career path - one for staff wishing to focus solely on teaching, the other for staff wishing to focus on research. The group considered the weightings for teaching, research, contribution to the College and contribution to the discipline/the community currently used for candidates presenting for review at the Merit Bar and considered that they were appropriate to lecturers at this stage of their career. The working group had some concerns that candidates are not always fully informed of what is required and was aware of a perception that the Merit Bar review is so rigorous as to be a deterrent to some candidates. It suggested that the high success rate be widely communicated so as to counteract this erroneous perception. In the few cases where an individual does not proceed beyond the merit bar the working group saw merit in the Faculty Dean having a role.

There was some discussion about the role of the Faculty Dean in the process. Professor Rice explained that as the Faculty Dean is not involved in the candidate's

review he/she would be impartial and could provide support to the candidate: the Dean's input was not intended to be punitive but supportive. The Faculty Dean has oversight of any issues at a School level that may be impacting on candidates' ability to progress, and has the capacity to address these. The working group recommends that the merit bar be repositioned between the 11th and 12th points of the lecturer scale and that candidates who are not recommended as suitable to proceed should, in future, be held at the 11th point of the scale. Following discussion on the rationale for this recommendation. Council endorsed this recommendation. Council agreed that the role of a mentor is important to guide candidates through the progression process and that mentors should be provided with the appropriate information to enable them fulfil their role. It requested that all lecturers who have not yet gone through the merit bar be offered the opportunity to take part in a mentorship partnership. The view was expressed that there are some staff who would be eligible for promotion do not apply, and these staff would benefit from having a mentor. Professor Rice confirmed that 'Accelerated Advancement' was not part of the Group's remit.

Council noted the report of the working group and approved all of the recommendations therein including the repositioning of the merit bar, subject to extending the offer of mentorship to all candidates.

CL/11-12/195 Implementation Plan: School of Business

The review of the School of Business was conducted in March 2011. The School's implementation plan, May 2012, was circulated. The Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences noted that at the time of the review the School may have had different expectations about the amount of funding that would flow to it from its activities. Since that time College's income has reduced and the funding model for School has changed. He is working with the Head of School, in consultation with the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, to develop a business plan to support strategic objectives. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer said that College had been unable to support a growth vision in any School in the annual budgeting cycle for 2012/13. She noted that not all the reviewers' recommendations require financial input and encouraged the School to look at those that can be achieved without additional resources. The implementation plan raises the possibility that the School will be unable to support its existing portfolio of activity. The Dean agreed that many Schools may be unable to offer the level of optional modules as they have in the past. The cost of adjunct lecturers is one of the few areas where Schools have the flexibility to make financial savings. He regretted the impact that this may have on the student experience. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reported that annual budgetary meetings with Heads of School had looked at vulnerable areas and had attempted, where possible, to safeguard these. She reminded Council that College faces a particularly difficult time until the steps we are taking to improve our financial position, such as the Global Relations Strategy, can generate more income.

Council noted the implementation plan for the School of Business.

CL/11-12/196 Harmonisation of Assessment and Progression Regulations: One-Year Taught Masters Degrees and Postgraduate Diplomas

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, 5 June 2012, Harmonisation of Assessment and Progression Regulations: One-Year Taught Masters Degrees and Postgraduate Diplomas, was circulated. The Dean thanked Professor Scattergood and the Working Group for considering the issues through open and constructive engagement with the Schools and course directors. The document has been approved by the Graduate Studies Committee. The recommendations for successful completion of a Masters course reaffirm existing practice. Most discussion was generated by the assessment models and two are suggested: the credit weighted version: 66.67% for the taught element and 33.33% for the dissertation or the decoupled version: 40% for the taught element and 60% for the dissertation. A Council member suggested that, perhaps, more than two models should be permitted. The Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that these two models had been proposed after considerable consultation and had been embraced by course coordinators and the academic staff consulted. They provide clarity and consistency for assessment weightings. Council noted the document and approved the recommendations to harmonise the assessment and progression regulations for one-year taught masters degrees and postgraduate diplomas. The Provost conveyed his thanks to Professor Scattergood and the working group for the high quality of work and for having achieved consensus on such a difficult topic.

CL/11-12/197 Graduate Studies Proposal - Postgraduate Diploma in Sustainable Energy

A proposal for a new Postgraduate Diploma in Sustainable Energy, dated 5 June 2012, was circulated. The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced the proposal for a one-year part-time diploma to be offered by the School of Engineering which will provide continuous professional development for engineers. Sustainable Energy is an area of research strength in the School. The School has withdrawn one of its existing diploma courses and those resources will be directed to this new course. In time the course may be developed to provide a new strand within the MSc in Civil Engineering. The course has three core modules and teaching will be provided both by Trinity staff and experts from industry. The proposal has been favourably reviewed by an external assessor and his suggestions have been incorporated into the final proposal. The Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that the proposed course assessment is consistent with the Harmonisation of Assessment for Postgraduate Taught Courses.

Council approved the course proposal for a one-year part-time postgraduate diploma in sustainable energy with its first intake in September 2012.

CL/11-12/198 Fixed Teaching Timetable

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 6 June 2012, was circulated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that as part of the implementation of the new student administration system online registration for courses will be available in August/September 2012. Online registration for modules will be piloted in January 2013 for five postgraduate taught courses with online module registration available for all students in 2013/14. In order for online module registration to be fully implemented a somewhat fixed timetable is required. Council is asked to approve the appointment of a small working group reporting to the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to make recommendations on the implications of adopting a 'fixed' timetable for undergraduate and postgraduate

courses. Council agreed to this proposal and further recommended that the working group should seek to ensure that a 'fixed' timetable permits students to avail of a full-range of extra-curricular activities as part of their student experience.

CL11-12/199 Any Other Urgent Business

(i) Fitness to Practice

A memorandum from the College Secretary, College Fitness to Practice Committee, 12 June 2012, was tabled. At a meeting on 11 June 2012 the College Fitness to Practice Committee upheld the decision of the School of Social Work and Social Policy that a Junior Sophister Bachelor in Social Studies student is currently unfit to participate in the course. The Committee recommends that, with the aim of integrating the student back into the course, he/she undergo examination and assessment by the appropriate medical expert and that the student should make available all relevant records or reports. If the student fails to comply or if he/she is assessed to be unfit to continue with the course or is unable or unsuitable to participate to the standards required the student may be required to withdraw from the course or go off books until he/she is fit to proceed. Pursuant to section 5 of Schedule 3 of the Chapters Council approved the recommendations of the College Fitness to Practice Committee in this case.

(ii) Review of Library Subscriptions

A Council member expressed his concern about the manner in which the renewal of journal subscriptions was being addressed. Heads of School have been asked to choose from a list of journals those for which the subscriptions can be cancelled in order to meet a monetary target. While conscious of the financial environment in which the College is operating, he believed that a more strategic approach should be taken to coping with the reduction in the Library budget. He pointed to the risk for the Library's reputation of the continuing decline in its resources. The Librarian responded that the matter of cuts to the Library budget was raised with the Academic Management Group and the Planning Group and that due process was followed. However, given the scale of the Library's budget reduction there is very little room for manoeuvre, especially when so much of the budget is committed to fixed costs. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reported that the issue had been fully discussed at the Library Users Committee. The Library, in common with other areas, is obliged to make cuts in its expenditure for 2012/13. When proposing those journals that may be discontinued consideration had been given to usage and whether the information may be available in another format. The Library, as in other areas, is attempting to mitigate the effects by calling on any unallocated amounts. It is recognised that this can only be a short-term remedy. A Council member expressed his view that there should be greater consultation at School level and a better process developed about how the reduction in the Library's budget impacts on teaching and research. The Provost commented that the process in place allowed for discussion and consultation; the constraints were financial and not necessarily the process consultation.

SECTION B

CL/11-12/200 Graduate Studies Committee

Council noted the draft Minutes of the meeting of 31 May 2012.

CL/11-12/201 Undergraduate Studies Committee

- (i) Council noted the draft Minutes of the meeting of 22 May 2012. The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to the recommendation that the Provost should sign the Talloires Declaration which refers to higher education institutions using '...the processes of education and research to respond to, serve and strengthen its communities for local and global citizenship', and enhance College's visible commitment to civic engagement. The Undergraduate Studies Committee has endorsed the inclusion of the Senior Tutor as a member of the Committee, as suggested by Council at its last meeting. In line with good practice it agreed to review its terms of reference and membership during the next academic year.
- (ii) The proposals for Bachelor in Education curriculum changes, 6 June 2012, were circulated. Undergraduate teacher education programmes commencing in 2012 are required to be of four year's duration and must include a significant element of school experience and placement. Accordingly the curricula for the B Ed programmes offered by the Church of Ireland College of Education and the Marino Institute of Education, both accreditated by Trinity College, have been revised. These revisions have been externally reviewed, have been approved by the Associated Colleges Degrees Committee and the Undergraduate Studies Committee. Council approved the proposals for curriculum changes to the Bachelor in Education programmes proposed by the Church of Ireland College of Education and Marino Institute of Education.

CL/11-12/202 Human Resources Committee

The draft Minutes of the Human Resources Committee, 15 May 2012, together with amended Fee Remission Regulations, were noted. At the request of a Council member the HR Committee is asked to ensure that the wording of the Regulation on Fee Remission does not discriminate against a staff whose service may not be deemed continuous merely because of administrative delays, for example in issuing contracts.

CL/11-12/203 International Committee

- (i) The draft Minutes of the meeting of 5 June 2012 were noted.
- (ii) Revised Terms of Reference for the International Committee to allow it have oversight and monitor implementation of the Global Relations Strategy were approved. Revised membership of the International Committee as circulated was approved, with the inclusion of the Senior Lecturer who has responsibility for undergraduate studies.

CL/11-12/204 Research Committee

Draft minutes of the meeting of 29 May 2012 were noted. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responded to a query on behalf of the Dean of Research who was unable to attend. She clarified that the main thrust of the policy on the provision for redundancy payments was that the cost of such payments should be built into grant applications. Where the funding body does not permit this the principle that the cost is charged to the same unit that benefits from the activity applies.

SECTION C

CL/11-12/205 Membership of Council

- (i) Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences
 The Council noted a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated
 5 June 2012.
- (ii) Research Constituency
 The Council noted a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated
 30 May 2012.
- (iii) Co-opted Members Statute on Council, Section 4 sub-section (1)(g)
 Schedule 1, sub-section 3 (5).

 The Council noted the nomination of the Provost that Professor J Ohlmeyer
 (Vice-Provost for Global Relations) and Professor A Piesse (Dean of Students)
 should be co-opted to membership of Council for the academic year 2012 2013.

CL/11-12/206 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 May 2012 and noted by Board on 30 May 2012.

- (i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone
 - M.D. Timothy John Noel Horgan.
- (ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone
 - PhD Roisin Catherine Adams; Inna Afonina; Diego Albano; Damon Berry; Ashling Bourke; Jennifer Maire Brett; Pauline Byakika; Michael Byrne; Aurab Chakrabarty; Lisa Bernadette Coen; Michelle Coleman; Colm Conroy; Owen James Corrigan; Elif Dagdan; Karen Erica Donnelly-Swift; Jessica Evans; Julia Silveira Fahel; Lydia Forde; Lindsey Bernadette Garratt; Stephen Graham; Catherine Griffin; Alastair William Haddow; Jennifer Hughes; Tomas Irish; Elizabeth Kehoe; Catherine Kiely; Murat Kirca; Stergiani Kostopoulou; Mohammed Lamorde; Bo Liu; Mustafa Lotya; Brendan Mac Mahon; Lauren Elizabeth Mulcahy; Corman Luke O Coileain; Eamonn Gerard O'Connor; Deirdre O'Donnell; Sein O Muineachain; Annelies Pletsers;

David Prichard; Stephen Quinn; Sarah Reilly; Ruth Ryan; Gavin Shorten Barbara Siller; Alana Smith; Boon Wan Wang.

MLitt Rory Broderick; Jarlath Jennings.

MSc Peter Dunne; Audrey Martin; Dan Zhou.

CL/11-12/207 School Directors 2012-2014

The Council noted and approved the following nominations, for 2012-2014 except where otherwise stated below:

- (i) Computer Science and Statistics
 - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor A Butterfield;
 - (b) Director of Research: Professor C Vogel.
- (ii) Nursing and Midwifery
 - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate) 2012-2014: Professor S O'Donnell;
 - (b) Director of Teaching & Learning, Postgraduate: 2012-2013: Professor A-M Brady;
 - (c) Director of Research 2012-2015; Professor G McKee.
- (iii) Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences
 - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor A Sasse;
 - (b) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor L Tajber;
 - (c) Director of Research: Professor L O'Driscoll.
- (iv) Psychology
 - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor M Gormley;
 - (b) Director of Research: Professor M MacLachlan.

CL/11-12/208 Heads of Discipline

The Council noted and approved the following nomination for 2012-2015 (except where otherwise stated):

- (i) Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering
 - Professor B Basu
- (ii) Classics 2012-2013

Professor C Morris.

- (iii) Computer Science and Statistics
 - (a) Intelligent Systems: Professor D O'Sullivan;
 - (b) Software Systems: Professor M Hennessy;
 - (c) Statistics: Professor S Wilson.
- (iv) Electronic and Electrical Engineering 2012-2014 Professor J B Foley.
- (v) History of Art 2012-2013
 - (a) Michaelmas Term: Professor Y Scott;
 - (b) Hilary and Trinity Term: Professor P Cherry.
- (vi) Nursing and Midwifery
 - (a) Paediatric Nursing

Professor E Hollywood;

- (b) Intellectual Disabilities
 Professor C Griffiths:
- (c) Midwifery

Professor K Muldoon.

(vii) Occupational Therapy Professor D Connolly.

CL/11-12/209 Course Director - B.A. (Moderatorship) in Environmental Sciences - 2012-15 The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor M L Williams.

CL/11-12/210 Annual Reports 2010-2011

The Council noted the following annual report:

Human Resources, 2010-2011

https://www.tcd.ie/hr/news/local_articles/2012/HRC_HR_Annual_Report_March_2011.pdf

CL/11-12/211 The Lir Term Dates

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from Professor B Singleton, circulated, dated 5 June 2012.

CL/11-12/212 Examinations outside the formal annual and supplemental examination sessions - 2012/13

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Examinations and Timetables Officer, circulated, dated 7 June 2012

CL/11-12/213 Administrative Arrangements in the Summer Session

The Council noted that items of routine College business will be dealt with by the Provost or Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer during the Summer Session, 2 July 2012 to 24 August 2012.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed	
Date	