

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 7 November 2007  
at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost, Senior Lecturer, Registrar, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Pro-Dean of Arts and Humanities, Dr M H Adams, Dr P Coleman, Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences, Dr H Gibbons, Dr V A Campbell, Dr M E G Lyons, Dr M J F Brown, Pro-Dean of Social and Human Sciences, Dr M L Brennan, Ms F M Haffey, Mr B Rock, Mr C Hallworth, Mr H Sullivan, Professor N M Claffey.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Health Sciences, Dr J P Gormley, Dean of Science, Dr B M Lucey, Dr A O'Gara, Mr G O Maonaigh.
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary, Academic Secretary.
<i>Observers</i>	Dr G Biehler, Mr D L Parris.
<i>Student observers</i>	Mr C Reilly, Mr D Walsh, Ms C Ní Dhubhda.

#### SECTION A

CL/07-08/030 **Statutory Declaration** Professor N Grene (Acting Dean of Arts and Humanities) and Mr H Sullivan (Students' Union) made the statutory declaration.

CL/07-08/031 **Minutes of meetings**

- (i) Minutes of the meeting of the 10<sup>th</sup> October 2007 were approved subject to a correction in CL/07-08/009 to read Mr Misstear and not Professor Misstear.
- (ii) Minutes of the meeting of the 18<sup>th</sup> October 2007 were approved.

CL/07-08/032 **Matter Arising from the Minutes**

**Academic Titles in Trinity College Dublin (Actum CL/06-07/216 of 27 June 2007)**  
Dr Gibbons, referring to the statement that current arrangements between College and the Unions stand, noted that College had turned down two urgent requests from the General Secretary, Mr M Jennings, for a meeting of the ASA/IFUT Branch to discuss matters in the School of Natural Sciences. Dr Gibbons noted that this is a direct breach of the 1981 IFUT/TCD Agreement on Consultation. The Secretary advised that the matter should be raised with the appropriate office, and undertook to relay the matter to the Staff Secretary.

**CL/07-08/033 Provost's Report**

- (i) **Strategic Innovation Fund (SIF)** The Provost informed Council that the outcome of College's submission to the SIF Cycle II is expected sometime in late December 2007.
- (ii) **Science Foundation Ireland (SFI)** The Provost noted that fourteen of the 28 applications to the SFI Stokes Professorship and lectureship Programme 2007 were successful. Formal notification of this outcome is expected this week.
- (iii) **THES (Times Higher Education Supplement) University World Rankings** The Provost noted the imminent publication of the THES 2007 university world rankings.

**CL/07-08/034 Restructuring Update** The Senior Lecturer informed Council that the sub-groups of the Restructuring Implementation Oversight Group have now been established and work on the various topics is progressing well.

**CL/07-08/035 Academic Appeals Committee** Council noted the recommendations of the Academic Appeals Committee of the meetings of the 8<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> October 2007, and noted the correction that Dr M Lyons and a Pro-Dean of Science, not Health Sciences, were present at the meeting of the 8<sup>th</sup> October 2007.

**CL/07-08/036 Milltown Institute of Theology and Philosophy** A memorandum from the Registrar dated 2<sup>nd</sup> November 2007 was circulated together with a draft framework agreement dated 4<sup>th</sup> October 2007. Council approved in principle a strategic alliance between College and the Milltown Institute subject to a number of identified conditions.

**CL/07-08/037 Statutes - Response to letter from Statutes Review Working Party** A memorandum from the Registrar dated 6<sup>th</sup> November 2007 was circulated together with a memorandum from the Statutes Review Working Party of 19<sup>th</sup> September 2007. Introducing this item the Registrar invited Council's attention to the main issues for consideration and provided a brief overview of these, namely (i) resolution of conflicts, (ii) membership of Council, (iii) external relations, (iv) fitness to practise, (v) faculty residence requirements, and (vi) staff discipline. Council had already approved the transitional arrangements for Council (CL/07-08/005) at its meeting of the 10<sup>th</sup> October 2007.

Council considered the proposed suggestions and in respect of the resolution of conflict between Board and Council, the meeting discussed the suggestion that one refusal by Board should be sufficient before an application is made to the Visitors. It was noted that the Board is the governing authority with the ultimate power of decision provided for in the Universities Act 1997, and in revising the Statutes, it would be important that Council recognise the ultimate authority of the Board. It was further noted that in the past fifteen years there had not been any requirement to resolve a conflict between the Board and Council.

In considering issues around fitness to practise, the Registrar confirmed that these related specifically to students on professional courses who are unfit to practice for reasons other than those relating to examinations or disciplinary matters. At present the Statutes do not provide the power to decline a student in such a case to progress academically or to take a degree. In discussing this it was noted that on successful

completion of some professional courses such as dental science, for example, the graduand is also licensed to practise.

The Faculty residence requirement to reside at a distance of not more than 50 kilometres from College was considered inappropriate in Ireland today, and it was suggested that where such a requirement is necessary the employment contract could stipulate the requirement that the individual reside sufficiently close to Dublin.

There was considerable discussion about the staff discipline regulations which do not provide for mediation and progress too quickly to a formal process involving a disciplinary panel. Council was informed of the report of the Review Committee on Disciplinary Procedures Relating to Staff, May 1995, more commonly referred to as the 'Duncan Report.' With respect to staff discipline, the Duncan Report states, among other things, the importance of mediation and informal discussion. It was suggested that the Duncan procedures should remain in place and be supported by informal procedures. In response to a query, it was confirmed that student disciplinary procedures were covered separately in the Statutes.

Council, following much discussion, agreed with respect to:

- (i) *resolution of conflicts* that in the event of a conflict between Board and Council one refusal by Board would be sufficient before an application is made to the Visitors;
- (ii) *external relations* that the Statutes Review Working Party draft sub-sections of the Council and Board chapters that reassert and clarify the principles and processes of decision-making and the respective roles of Council and Board in this regard;
- (iii) *fitness to practise* that the Statutes Review Working Party liaise with the working party on fitness to practise, chaired by the Dean of Students, on this matter;
- (iv) *faculty residence requirements* that the requirement that full-time members of staff reside at a distance of not more than 50 kilometres from the College be altered to reflect the changed conditions in respect of accommodation and travel in the greater Dublin area;
- (v) *staff discipline* that the proposed Working Party be established, and in devising a new staff disciplinary code, it should take cognisance of the relevant sections in the Duncan Report, 1995.

#### CL/07-08/038 Any Other Urgent Business

- (i) **Membership of the Working Party on Council Composition** The Proposed membership of the Working Party on Council Composition was tabled. Council approved the following membership:
 

Registrar	Chair
Senior Lecturer	Secretary to Council
Board representatives	Dr A Piesse
	Dr J Parnell
Council representatives	Dr V Campbell
	Ms F Haffey
Fellows' representative	Professor H Delany
Statutes Review Working Party Representative	Dr S Boyce
Student representative	Mr B Rock
- (ii) **Council representative on the Equality Committee** Dr H Gibbons was nominated and approved to represent Council on the Equality Committee.

## SECTION B

**CL/07-08/039 Heads' of School Committee** The minutes of the Heads' of School Committee of the 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007 were circulated. The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to the discussion on ECTS credits (HC/07-08/04) and noted that all undergraduate and postgraduate programmes must be presented in multiples of five ECTS credits - a Council approved policy - by the end of this academic year in order to draw down HEA core grant funding in 2008.

The Students' Union Education Officer, referring to HC/07-08/02 (iii), expressed concern about the quality of teaching space available to students on the nursing programmes and stressed the importance of solving this crisis as a matter of priority. It was noted that quality teaching and research space was a general concern for College and that a space development plan was currently being developed.

**CL/07-08/040 Research Committee** The Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Research Committee from its meeting of 4 October 2007, which had been circulated.

**CL/07-08/041 Student Services Committee** The Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 18 September 2007, which had been circulated.

## SECTION C

**CL/07-08/042 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners** The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 25 September 2007 and noted by Board on 24 October 2007.

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**MD** Karen Roisin Mullan.

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Kaukab Azim; Alexander Baturu; Gopaldaswamy Bharath; Aileen Caitriona Blaney; Eimear Theresa Brown; Amelia Caffarra; Ruth Alice Canavan; Michael Anthony Carney; Nicola Carroll; Elizabeth Mary Daly; Haslin Dato Paduka Ali; Joanna Christine Day; David Ian Delany; Hugh Denman; Mairead de Róiste; Ranke De Vries; Gerald Patrick Dillon; Lisa Jane Gillespie; Orla Hanrahan; David Henry; Aloysius Kahindi; Deborah Mary Keogh; Niamh Kelly; Aine Padraicin Larkin; Laragh Larsen; Louise McMahon; Paul David McNicholas; Stephen James Minton; Eimhín Maire Caitriona Ní Mhuircheartaigh; Muireann Ni Raghallaigh; Raymond O'Brien; Anthony O'Donnell; Katherine Phillips Connolly; Karl Andrew Quinn; Sumesh Sofin Ramakrishna Pillai Gopala; Catherine Ryan; John Paul Ryan; Stephen Smyth; Deirdre Mary Stritch; Conor Teljeur; Amanda Tivnan; Edel Tully; Andrew Martin Whelan.

**MSc** Ruth Barry-Gould; Myra Catherine Duane Reilly; Yvonne Marie French; Elizabeth Gubbins; Andrew Arthur Hall; Andrea Kearns; Declan Christopher Kelly; Edward Kelly; Fiona Keogan; Siobhan Launder;

Patricia Louisor; Michelle McGillion; Brian Gerard Mulvihill; Miriam O'Donoghue; Joanna O'Driscoll; Karen Sheeran; Ian James Stemson; Catherine Shirley Twohig; Andrew Waldron.

**MLitt** Lara Byrne; Jane Louise Eckett; Paul William James Hutchinson; Nina Susanna Shiel.

**MCh** Olivia Flannery; Michael Leonard; Ruairi MacNiocaill.

**CL/07-08/043 Higher Degrees - Grading of Higher Diploma in Psychology** The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, circulated dated 24 October 2007.

**CL/07-08/044 Headship of Discipline**

- (i) **Geography** The Council noted that Professor A Davies had been nominated as Head of Discipline of Geography;
- (ii) **Nursing - General Discipline** The Council noted that Professor G Fealy had been elected to this post.
- (iii) **Organic, Medicinal and Biological Chemistry** The Council noted that Dr I Rozas had been elected, to hold office until 12 July 2010.

**CL/07-08/045 Abridged entry and the Award of the B.A. degree (Calendar M12, paragraph 21:)** The Council approved the conferring of the ordinary degree of B.A. on the following B.A.I. candidates who gained abridged entry in 2005/2006 to the Junior Sophister year (Mechanical Engineering) of the B.A.I. programme - the award of the ordinary degree of B.A. being applicable as each student had successfully passed the Senior Sophister Engineering final examinations:

Alliot, Remi (05101999)  
Hemon, Aurelien (05101972)  
Michelet, Didier (05101981)  
Reymond, Olivier (05101964)  
Thomas, Laurent (05102006)

**CL/07-08/046 Student Case** The Council noted and approved the request of the Senior Lecturer that a named student may repeat the JS year in full in 2007-2008, taking the JS year for a third time.

#### SECTION D

*In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.*

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*