

## The University of Dublin

### Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 1 December 2004 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost, Senior Lecturer, Registrar, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Arts (Humanities), Dean of Arts (Letters), Professor D M Singleton, Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies, Dr M L Brennan, Dr M L Rhodes, Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences, Dr S P Wilson, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr A W Kelly, Dean of Science, Professor P Coxon, Dr N Marples, Dr C Benson, Mr C Larkin, Mr D McCormack, Mr D Mac Síthigh, Ms C Waters, Mr C Larkin.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dr P C Conroy, Professor E O'Halpin, Dr E V Patten, Dr A Kokaram, Professor C M Begley, Ms G E Fallon, Dean of Dental Affairs, Ms K Gibson, Mr A Payne.
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary, Academic Secretary.
<i>Student observers</i>	Ms M McMahon, Ms F Van Der Puil, Mr J Bertram.
<i>By Invitation:</i>	Admissions Officer, for CL/04-05/057.
<i>Statutory Declaration</i>	Members of Council attending for the first time made the statutory declaration.

### SECTION A

- CL/04-05/051 Minutes** The Minutes of the meeting of 10 November 2004 were approved and signed.
- CL/04-05/052 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been minuted under appropriate headings hereafter.
- CL/04-05/053 Key Principles/Issues associated with an Academically-based Resource Allocation Model (see Actum CL/04-05/033 of 10<sup>th</sup> November 2004)** In response to a question, the Senior Lecturer indicated that the Board will receive a new paper from the Task Force at its meeting on 14<sup>th</sup> December 2004 and that the paper would be circulated for consideration by Council at its meeting in January 2005.
- CL/04-05/054 Provost's Report**  
*Science Foundation Ireland: Annual Overhead Investment Plan* The Provost advised Council that following the review of Trinity's Annual Overhead Investment Plan, Science Foundation Ireland had agreed an initial overhead contribution of 30%.

**CL/04-05/055 Structures – Academic Re-organisation** A memorandum from the Provost dated 19<sup>th</sup> November 2004 had been circulated together with a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer. The Provost advised Council that the memoranda had been discussed by the Board at its meeting on 24<sup>th</sup> November 2004 and it had been agreed that a schedule for the next two to three months should be presented for consideration by Board at its meeting on 14<sup>th</sup> December.

The Senior Lecturer introduced his memorandum, noting that it had been written as a descriptive update. He reminded Council that in July 2004, the Board had agreed that at its November meeting it should receive a report on the likely number and composition of Schools/Departments and by December 2004 at the latest, make firm decisions on these matters. A period of extensive discussion had taken place since the Board decision in July, particularly in September/ October/ November, and the circulated paper attempted to summarise the position that had been arrived at by mid-November.

The paper provided an update on proposals for Schools that were under discussion in each of the six Faculties and the Senior Lecturer elaborated on the position outlined in his memorandum. Some very imaginative proposals for Schools had been made, involving more than two-thirds of departments and a greater proportion of academic staff. In other areas, dilemmas were being faced and consideration was being given to how these departments might be supported in furthering their discussions. In addition, a number of departments were having difficulty in becoming part of proposals for integrated Schools and the paper suggested that where this was the case, consideration should be given to these departments being embodied in a School of a federal nature, one in which academic and resource integration was not expected. The Senior Lecturer stated that based on current information, approximately 13-15 Schools are likely to be formed and in such circumstances, it is possible to consider a schools-only structure or a structure incorporating faculties and schools.

A number of recurring themes had emerged from the discussions to date including issues of disciplinary identity, equity and governance. In acknowledging issues of concern regarding disciplinary identity, the paper proposed that where a strong argument is made that the issue of departmental title is of substantive importance, consideration should be given to retaining departmental title, with review by Council and Board in three years time.

The paper noted that following discussion by Council, Academic Affairs Committee and the Deans' Committee, it had been agreed by Board that it would receive a final paper in December 2004. Draft proposals on governance would be developed in consultation with Deans. In the period before Board makes its final decision, emerging schools would be encouraged and supported.

The Senior Lecturer stated that the introduction of the Academically-based Resource Allocation Model (ARAM) will require a transition period of at least three years. During this time, it was proposed that departments that are part of a federated school arrangement could seek new School status on the basis of having achieved an agreed plan for growth.

In the discussion, it was suggested that binding decisions should not be made at this point as more consensus was necessary and further information should be provided. It was considered that more time was necessary for additional exposition and elaboration around the formation of schools, the question of Faculties, the election versus selection of Heads of School, and the implications for teaching of changes in academic organisation. It was suggested that a poll might

be conducted in order to indicate the level of support for the changes in academic organisation.

Two Deans noted that any significant delay could have a negative impact on progress to date and that those departments that had developed proposals for schools should be facilitated in moving forward. Others indicated that there were areas that needed a minimum amount of additional time to allow a consensus to emerge. Council acknowledged the importance of allowing an appropriate differentiation in pace in progressing discussion on new academic structures and agreed that those with firm proposals should be encouraged and supported. The Senior Lecturer commented that the issue of timing was important as any extension of the original deadline could create pressures later in the academic year.

In response to comments raised regarding the lack of information on governance and on the ARAM, the Senior Lecturer stated that the Deans' Committee will shortly consider governance issues. A new paper on the ARAM had been drafted and while it would illustrate how proposals had developed, it would not change matters of principle.

Some members of Council expressed the view that there was a need to see further detail of the ARAM before any binding decisions were made and as it was difficult to separate discussion of academic structures from ARAM, it was suggested that decisions on new structures should be informed by further information on the ARAM. The Senior Lecturer indicated that the task force was working towards providing as much detail as soon as possible. In terms of the broad structure of the ARAM, he noted that there had been considerable agreement with the proposals that 5% of funding should be reserved for strategic purposes, and that of the remainder, 70% should be allocated for teaching and 30% for research, the latter reflecting the minimum that should be allocated to research in the context of the College's commitment to being a research-led institution.

The Provost stated that while the ARAM would distribute resources according to agreed criteria, it would also seek to embody the mission and values of the College as set out in the College's Strategic Plan. The ARAM would also provide transparency in terms of resource allocation. In response to comments about how a school with a significant deficit might be supported, the Provost indicated that decisions on whether resources were distributed on a formulaic basis, or whether discretion was exercised, would have to be considered in the context of academic planning and how academic structures interact with funding issues.

It was noted that the new ARAM paper would be considered by the Board on December 14<sup>th</sup> and it was agreed that a special meeting of Council should be held in early January to discuss the ARAM paper and provide feedback to Board.

It was suggested that Council should formally recommend to Board that no firm decisions be made at the December meeting to allow time for further discussion. The Senior Lecturer indicated that it was appropriate that Board should receive the advice of Council in relation to the ARAM and academic re-organisation. However he was of the view that such advice should be measured and that it would be unhelpful if it were not possible to allow progress to be made with certain school proposals.

It was noted that at the December meeting, the Board would receive an outline schedule in relation to discussions and decisions on both the ARAM and on academic re-organisation taking into account Council's schedule of meetings. It was further noted that the views of Council would be conveyed to Board formally through its minutes and joint membership.

**CL/04-05/056 Departmental Review - Centre for Language and Communication Studies** A report from the Provost dated 1<sup>st</sup> December 2004 on the review of the Centre for Language and Communication Studies (CLCS) had been circulated. The overall impression of the reviewers was of an academic unit that delivered high-powered research and teaching, while simultaneously providing language teaching and learning resources for the College as a whole. The reviewers stated that the CLCS can be viewed as a centre for excellence, with staff who are exceptionally committed to the task of delivering a high quality service. The Centre offers three taught MPhil programmes and makes a major contribution to two undergraduate programmes. The reviewers commented on the lack of language support in EFL (English as a foreign language) in Trinity and recommended that an EFL programme be established. In terms of the foreign language modules offered by the CLCS, they recommended that greater efforts be made to integrate the modules into the broad curriculum initiative. The reviewers noted that the quality and quantity of research carried out by staff of the CLCS is impressive and that the many indicators of excellence of research include high level consultancy work carried out for government and international agencies and the publishing of work in the best publishing houses and most competitive journals. They indicated that the Centre is particularly well-known for the close integration of teaching and research in applied linguistics and that research in several areas of second language acquisition is particularly recognised as cutting-edge. The reviewers commended the work of staff in the Phonetics and Speech Science Laboratory which they considered to be excellent and comparable to that in leading laboratories in Japan, the United States and Europe. They noted that facilities in the CLCS are in urgent need of updating and recommended a review of funding for equipment for the Centre.

The Dean of Arts (Letters) welcomed the very positive report on the Centre for Language and Communication Studies and commented that if an EFL programme were established, both academic and resource issues would need to be considered. She noted that while the reviewers had recommended that the language modules should be integrated into the broad curriculum, it had not been alluded to in the recommendations to Council. It was agreed that an additional recommendation should be included to reflect this issue and it is noted as recommendation 10 below. Council also noted the valuable role played by the Centre for Deaf Studies which receives short-term funding from the HEA.

Council noted and approved the following recommendations:

- (a) that the Centre should:
  1. Consider the reviewers' suggestions concerning establishing an English as a Foreign Language programme.
  2. Prepare a costed proposal concerning the upgrading of facilities.
  3. Consider the matter of continuity in research funding and how, in the first instance, the Centre might address the concerns noted.
  4. Address the issues raised with regard to the Introduction to Language Studies and the outline proposals made by the Reviewers.
- (b) that the Faculty should:
  5. Facilitate the Centre during the current process of reorganisation in exploring possibilities for new configurations with other departments that could work to the Centre's and the College's best interests in teaching and research.
- (c) that College should:

6. Consider the recommendation with regard to the weighting attributed to students of the Centre in a new academic resource allocation process.
7. Consider proposals brought forward by the Centre concerning facilities, administrative staffing and the matter of a chair in the Centre, to be evaluated in the context of College funding and any new academic resource allocation process.
8. Consider the recommendations made with regard to the positioning of the Centre in the new academic structures.
9. Consider the role of the Centre in the provision of any English as a Foreign Language schemes that might be brought forward by College in the future.
10. Increase awareness of the language modules as part of the broad curriculum.

**CL/04-05/057 Senior Lecturer's Annual Report 2003/04** A copy of the Senior Lecturer's Annual Report for 2003/04 which included admissions data for 2004 had been circulated and the Admissions Officer attended the meeting for discussion of this item.

The Senior Lecturer stated that the introduction and summary reflected on the content of the report in the context of some of the College's stated objectives. In terms of diversity in the student body, he noted that in 2003/4, 13% of students were non-Irish, with 6% non-EU, and he questioned whether this was adequate in terms of the College's objective of being an international university. Significant efforts had been made to increase the number of non-traditional students and Council and Board had agreed a target of 15% of all first year undergraduate places. In 2004 the percentage of non-traditional new entrants had increased from 7% in 2003 to 11%. The report of the Working Party on Lifelong Learning indicated that 23% of the student population may be regarded as participating in lifelong learning and this proportion was likely to increase. The enhancement of the student learning experience is another strategic objective and a number of initiatives were undertaken in the development of the Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning (CAPSL). The Student Counselling Service had also initiated a number of projects to support student retention. Pass rates in the Junior Freshman year were monitored annually by the Deans' Committee and a report presented to the University Council. In the area of educational practice, the first cycle of academic departmental reviews was completed and Trinity also participated in a review of quality assurance that was undertaken by the European University Association. Major policy initiatives in 2003/04 included decisions in relation to access for non-traditional students; the continuing expansion of the Broad Curriculum programme; the development of College's position with regard to the Bologna Process; the re-alignment of CAPSL; and the assessment of lifelong learning activities in College. At the end of 2003/04, discussions were initiated on new academic structures, the introduction of an academically-based resource allocation model, and a review of administrative, technical and support structures.

The Admissions Officer invited Council's attention to the following issues relating to Admissions in 2004:

- Trinity attracted 12% of first preference applications in the CAO system
- There was a decrease of 1.5% in the overall number of CAO applications
- Of the 57,056 CAO applicants to degree courses, 2151 students (3.8%) achieved 545 points or more and 536 (25%) of these students accepted places at Trinity and were awarded Entrance Exhibitions
- A total of 236 non-traditional students registered on undergraduate degree programmes, representing 10.8% of the CAO intake (7% in 2003). Non-traditional students are categorised as follows: (a) mature students

- admitted under the mature student dispensation scheme, (b) students with a disability, and (c) socio-economically disadvantaged students
- Non-EU students were included for the first time in the new entrant survey. A greater proportion of non-EU rather than EU students ranked international reputation and reputation for quality in teaching and research as very important reasons for choosing to study at Trinity
  - Information was provided in the tables on the number of eligible applications (those who matriculated and met course requirements)
  - Tables A5 and A6 provided information on the ratio of eligible first preference applications to quota
  - The number of mature student applicants had decreased although the number of registered mature students had increased
  - The percentage rate of acceptances to offers varied from 44% to 100%
  - A number of high demand courses did not fill their quotas. This was largely due to Leaving Certificate upgrades where students were offered places on other courses late in October
  - The Two-subject Moderatorship programme filled 85% of its quota overall – the filling of quotas within TSM is determined by the level of demand for individual combinations, and in particular, the spread of that demand across the more popular subjects
  - 53% of all students admitted to Trinity through the CAO achieved 500 points or above.

In the discussion, it was noted that 38% of the undergraduate population was male and this was reflected in numbers taking the Leaving Certificate and also in those awarded Entrance Exhibitions. The number of first preference applications to courses offered by the Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences had decreased significantly and this was largely due to the fall-off in demand for courses in computer science. In relation to pass rates, the Senior Lecturer indicated that measures taken to improve Junior Freshman pass rates included curriculum revision and the provision of additional support in areas including language teaching and mathematics.

The Senior Lecturer responded to a number of questions and clarified points raised. On behalf of Council, the Provost thanked the Senior Lecturer and his staff for preparing the Annual Report.

**CL/04-05/058 Nominations for Appointment** Council noted and approved the circulated information (see Appendix 1).

**CL/04-05/059 Senior Promotions – Associate Professorship (Non-Quota)** Council noted and approved the following recommendation as set out in a tabled memorandum dated 14<sup>th</sup> September 2004 from the Acting Secretary to the Academic and Senior Administrative Promotions Review Committee

Dr Fiona Mulcahy, Department of Clinical Medicine – promotion to Associate Professorship with effect from 1<sup>st</sup> October 2004

**CL/04-05/060 Chair of Pharmacology (1979)** Council noted and approved the nominations for external assessors for the Chair of Pharmacology (1979), as advised by the Secretary to the College.

## SECTION B

**CL/04-05/061 Personnel and Appointments Committee** Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meeting of 12 November 2004, as circulated.

## SECTION C

**CL/04-05/062 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners** The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 October 2004 and noted by Board on 24 November 2004.

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**MD** Zahid Mahmood.

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Juan Armando Casas-Mollano; Kevin Connaire; Martina Ann Geraghty; Philip Edward Mackenzie; Neil Sutherland Meadows; Jude Mulligan; Margaret Joy Susannah Norton; Aileen Margaret Patterson; Isabelle Christiane Torrance.

**MSc** Patrick Christopher Clerkin; Ross Frederick Andrew Charles Collery; Fearghal Ó Nia.

**MDentCh** Catherine Ruth Crocker; Jarlath Edward Durkan; Paul Vincent Keogh; David James Killian; Dermot Joseph Murnan; Aidan Bernard Redahan; Morna Ann Smyth; Joyce Elizabeth Woods.

**CL/04-05/063 Representation on Council**

(i) **University Senate** The Council noted that the University Senate has elected Ms F M Haffey to replace Ms G E Fallon, who has resigned from Council, for the remainder of the academic year 2004-2005.

(ii) **Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences** The Council noted that Dr S P Wilson (Statistics) has been elected as Junior Representative of the Faculty for the remainder of the academic year 2004-2005.

**CL/04-05/064 Dublin Dental School and Hospital – Senior Lecturer in Dental Materials Science (see CL/04-05/049)** The Council approved the appointment of Garry J P Fleming, BSc (Limerick), PhD (Birm), with effect from 1 March 2005.

**CL/04-05/065 Chairs – Irish School of Ecumenics (Trinity College Dublin)** The Council noted and approved the establishment of a Chair at the Irish School of Ecumenics, subject to confirmation that start-up costs and permanent funding are available and to further note that the ISE Trust would have the right to appoint two members of the Search Committee.

**CL/04-05/066 Nominating Committee** The Council approved the membership of the following committee:

**Psychology – MSc Counselling Psychology Course Co-ordinator  
(contract of indefinite duration)**

Professor E Ní Chuilleanáin - Pro-Dean of Arts (Humanities)

Professor R M J Byrne

Dr K Tierney

Dr E Mahon

Dr A Bellamy (Brynmair Clinic, Wales)

Signed .....

Date .....



## Appendix 1 to CL/04-05/058

**Nominations for Appointment -**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Post</b>	<b>Name and Qualifications</b>	<b>Start date</b>	<b>Termination date (if contract)</b>
Biochemistry	Research Fellow	KEENAN, Catriona, BSc (NUI), MSc (Kingston), PhD (Dubl.)	01-02-2004	31-01-2005
Centre for Bioengineering	Research Fellow	VARD, John, BA, BAI (Dubl.)	01-11-2004	30-04-2005
Centre for Bioengineering/ Mechanical Engineering	Lecturer Part-Time	O'BRIEN, Fergal, BA, BAI, PhD (Dubl.), MIEI	01-10-2004	30-09-2007
Centre for Research in IT Education	Visiting Research Fellow	MARSHALL, Kevin, BA, MSc (Hull), PhD (Boston Coll.)	01-12-2004	31-09-2005
Chemistry	Research Fellow	MORGAN, Ben, MChem (Oxon.)	01-01-2005	30-09-2007
Chemistry	Research Fellow	PERERA, K.S.D., BSc (Sri Jay), PhD (Belf.)	10-01-2005	10-01-2006
Chemistry	Research Fellow	WHELAN, Áine, BA (Dubl.)	01-11-2004	30-09-2005
Dental Science	Visiting Professor	HOBDELL, Martin H., BDS, MA, PhD, IDSRCS (Lond.)	01-10-2004	30-09-2006
Economics	Lecturer Part-Time	COLLINS, Michael L., BA, MA (NUI)	01-10-2004	30-09-2005
Gender & Women's Studies	Research Associate	CONLON, Deirdre, MA, MPhil (C.U.N.Y.)	01-12-2004	31-10-2005
Gender & Women's Studies	Lecturer Part-Time	McDERMOTT, Mary, BA (UWI), MPhil (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-09-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	DOHERTY, Jim, PG Dip, MPhil (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	GLEASON, Angela, MPhil, PhD (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	LYONS, Patrick Joseph, BA, MLitt (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	MAC UID, Audrey, BA (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	McKENNA, Malachy, BA, PhD (Belf.),	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	NIC LOCHLAINN, Róisín, MLitt (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005
Irish	Lecturer Part-Time	Ó HÁINLE, Cathal Gearóid, BA, BD, MA (NUI), DLitt. (Dubl.)	01-10-2004	30-06-2005

Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering	Research Fellow	COX, Damien Peter, BE (NUI)	01-11-2004	31-05-2005
Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering	Research Fellow	DE PELLEGRIN, Denis Vivian, BSc, PhD (W.Aust.)	01-11-2004	31-10-2006
Modern History	Research Associate	CROWE, Catriona, BA (NUI)	01-05-2004	31-12-2006
Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Lecturer	COOLEY, Sharon, MB, BCh, BAO (NUI), MRCOG, MRCPI	01-09-2004	31-12-2005
Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Research Fellow	ONDREJCAK, Tomas, MSc, Dr. rer.nat, PhD (PJ Safarik U., Slovak Republic)	11-11-2004	10-11-2006
Pharmacy	Research Fellow	DOOHAN, Róisín, BSc, PhD (NUI)	01-11-2004	30-06-2005
Physics	Research Fellow	PHELAN, Richard, BSc (Hull)	01-11-2004	31-10-2005
Physics	Research Fellow	USOV, Victor, MSc (Omsk State U., Russia)	01-11-2004	30-10-2005
Physiology	Research Fellow	LINDEN, James Francis, BSc (Belf.)	22-11-2004	21-11-2007
Physiology	Research Fellow	LOANE, David James, MSc (Dubl.)	01-11-2004	31-10-2005
Psychology	Research Associate	HONAN, Rita, BA (Miami), PhD (Mass.)	01-02-2005	31-12-2005
Psychology	Research Associate	McKENZIE, Ken, BA (Dubl.), PhD (DCU)	12-11-2004	30-11-2006
Sociology	Research Fellow	AIGNER, Petra Irene, BSocSc (Birm.), MPhil (Dubl.)	01-11-2004	31-08-2006
Sociology	Research Fellow	SCHWEIGER, Christian, MA (Regensburg), PhD (Derby)	01-11-2004	30-10-2006