

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

**The University of Dublin**

**Trinity College**

**A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 14 January 2004 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.**

*Present* Provost, Vice-Provost, Senior Lecturer, Registrar, Senior Tutor, Dean of Arts (Humanities), Dr M H Adams, Dean of Arts (Letters), Dr E V Patten, Dr N Persram, Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences, Dr D W O'Dwyer, Professor P J Prendergast, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr A W Kelly, Dean of Science, Dr B Espey, Ms G E Fallon, Ms H Fychan, Ms M McMahon, Ms S Scott.

*Apologies* Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies, Dr P C Conroy, Professor D M Singleton, Dr M L Brennan, Professor P Coxon, Dr C Benson, Mr J O Q Inderhaug, Dean of Dental Affairs.

*In attendance* Librarian, Secretary, Academic Secretary.

*Student observers* Mr F de Bulbh, Mr C O'Coilean, Ms R Ni Eidhin.

The Provost opened the meeting by wishing everyone a Happy New Year.

**14/A Declaration** A member of Council attending for the first time made the Statutory Declaration.

**14/B Minutes** The minutes of the meeting of 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2003 were approved.

**14/C Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been minuted under appropriate headings hereafter.

**14/D Provost's Report - Financial Situation (see Actum 9/B (i) of 3 December 2003)** The Education Officer of the Students' Union and the Vice-President of the Graduate Students' Union extended their thanks to members of the College who participated in the demonstration held on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2003.

**14/E Provost's Report - OECD Review of Higher Education in Ireland (see Actum 9/B (ii) of 3 December 2003)** With regard to disciplinary balance and duplication within the third-level system, the Senior Lecturer advised that she had raised this issue with the Deans' Committee and that discussion had been initiated in some Faculties.

**15/A Senior Lecturer's Annual Report, 2002-03 – Broad Curriculum (see Actum 9/C of 3 December 2003)** The Senior Lecturer advised Council that the overall retention rate on Broad Curriculum cross-faculty courses was currently 89%, compared with 53% at the same time last year.

**15/B Provost's Report**

(i) **OECD Review of Higher Education in Ireland** Terms of reference for this review had already been circulated to Council for information. OECD review teams will visit three universities in February (University College Dublin, University College Cork, and the University of Limerick). It was noted that an advertisement had been placed in the national newspapers inviting submissions to the OECD review team from any interested individuals or organisations on any issues relevant to the review. The Senior Lecturer was participating in the preparation of a submission from CHIU. The Provost noted the importance of this review which, among other things, would consider disciplinary balance and the duplication of courses within the system. Council also noted recent reports in the media concerning the public perception of universities.

(ii) **European Universities Association – Quality Review of Universities in Ireland** In accordance with the provisions of the Universities Act 1997, the HEA had initiated a review of quality assurance in Irish Universities. The review would be undertaken by the European Universities Association (EUA) and had been commissioned jointly by the HEA and the Irish Universities Quality Board (IUQB). A preparatory seminar would be held on 20 January 2004 hosted jointly by the HEA, the EUA and the IUQB. Each institution was required to prepare a self-assessment and supporting documentation in accordance with detailed EUA guidelines, to be submitted to the EUA in March 2004. The EUA guidelines also required that a steering committee be established to prepare the self-evaluation documentation. The Senior Lecturer will chair the steering committee and its membership was currently being finalised.

Review teams from the EUA will visit each university in the Trinity Term and again in Michaelmas Term 2004. The EUA will prepare a written report on each of the seven universities and individual universities are obliged to publish their report on their website. The EUA will also submit to the HEA and the IUQB a sectoral report on quality assurance issues across all the universities.

**15/C Agenda For Change 2003/04 and Subsequent Years** A memorandum from the Provost dated 10<sup>th</sup> December 2003 had been circulated. The memorandum had been considered by the Board and a number of amendments had been incorporated into the version circulated for consideration by Council.

It was noted that CHIU had mounted a strong campaign to reverse the financial cutbacks and raise awareness of the very serious situation facing the universities. The Provost stated that it would be necessary for the College to continue to review its activities and adapt to changing circumstances, particularly in the context of the financial cutbacks. Consideration would also be given to the identification of sources of revenue other than public funding.

*Implementation Plan* It was proposed that the Unit Cost Management Working Party (UCMWP) be reconstituted to form a Resource Management Working Group with an extended remit. The membership would be broadened to include three elected Board members (one of whom would be a student representative), and two Council nominees (one of whom would be a Faculty Dean). The terms of reference of the new Group were set out in the circulated memorandum. Among its first tasks would be the administration of the Emergency Fund of €800,000 and the quantification of the impact of the cutbacks across all

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings***

areas. The development of a planning framework in relation to staffing was also considered to be a priority. The Group will be chaired by the Senior Lecturer and its first meeting was scheduled for Monday 19th January 2004. In the discussion, Council noted that the views of Faculty Deans will be represented by the Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences, who was a member of the committee. It was agreed that while the Group reported directly to the Board, the Senior Lecturer would also provide regular updates to the University Council.

*Specific Issues for 2004/05* It was noted that Executive Officers were in the process of identifying what savings can be made in 2004/05 and a report would be made to Board later in the Hilary Term.

*Change Agenda* The Board had agreed that a significant change in the way in which the College carries out its operations was necessary to meet the new public funding environment. One of the first issues to be addressed was the development of a new resource allocation model to ensure that both pay and non-pay resources followed performance and activity. The Executive Officers would identify the quantitative and qualitative criteria for use within the model and work had begun on the collation of data. It would then be necessary to develop the resource allocation model and this may have implications for the management structures of the College. A group chaired by Professor John Murray will consider the systems and structures for distributing resources. Consideration would also be given to the issue of space as a resource and a first step in reviewing its allocation would be to undertake a space utilisation exercise across College.

It was acknowledged that in relation to budgets that were distributed by the Deans' Committee (e.g. non-pay, quarterly salaries, and recurrent and capital equipment budgets), agreed formulas for their distribution, had been in place for at least the last six or seven years. The Provost stated that irrespective of changes in core funding, it was important that we develop a resource allocation model for the university and that transparent mechanisms were in place for the management of our resources.

*Short-term Rationalisation* The Senior Lecturer and the Deans' Committee will be reviewing options relating to short-term rationalisation within College and in addition, will consider possibilities for rationalisation and greater collaboration across the sector. It was noted that disciplinary balance and duplication of courses was likely to be an issue raised in the OECD review.

*Outsourcing some of our Services* The College Secretary will chair a group that will consider the advantages and disadvantages associated with outsourcing some of our services.

*Targeted Reduction of Staff Numbers* Given the financial situation and as pay costs represent approximately 75% of our budget, it may be necessary to reduce staff numbers significantly. The Vice-Provost will chair a group that will address the technical and legal issues that may arise in seeking a reduction in staff numbers.

*New Sources of Revenue* A number of areas were identified for further investigation in terms of developing new sources of revenue and thus reducing dependency on state funding. These included (a) expanding the number of non-EU fee-paying students, (b) generating a stream of revenue from assets, and (c) increasing research income. The Registrar and the Director of ISA are developing a business plan in relation to (a); the Bursar will chair a group to investigate the possibilities associated with (b); and the Provost and the Dean of Research will work with a group to bring forward proposals in relation to increasing research income.

In the discussion, the Provost clarified a number of points and answered questions raised. It was noted that the proposals involved establishing a number of groups and the question was raised as to why the work that they would be undertaking could not be done within the existing committee structure. The Provost and the College Secretary indicated that these were expert working groups, usually chaired by an Executive Officer, that would focus on

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings***

specific and often technical issues, and would report to principal committees, Council and Board as appropriate.

Council noted and approved the proposals as presented.

- 16/A Personnel and Appointments Committee** Council noted and approved the recommendations arising from the meetings held on 12<sup>th</sup> December and 16<sup>th</sup> December 2003 as set out in the circulated memorandum dated 16<sup>th</sup> December 2003 from the Acting Secretary to the Committee and in memoranda dated 16<sup>th</sup> December 2003 and 7<sup>th</sup> January 2004 from the Staff Secretary.

The Vice-Provost indicated that approvals related mainly to self-financing activities, to appointments that had a health and safety aspect, or that were a charge on the PAC Emergency Fund. In response to a question, she indicated that up to now, the PAC had taken the view that self-financing activities determine their own priorities however in the current financial circumstances, it may become necessary to consider such matters in more detail.

- 16/B Working Party on Teaching and Learning – Progress Report on Implementation of Recommendations** The final report of the Working Party on Teaching and Learning had been approved by the University Council in February 2003 and it had been agreed by Council that the Senior Lecturer would provide an annual report on progress made in implementing its recommendations. A progress report from the Senior Lecturer dated 7<sup>th</sup> January 2004 had been circulated. The Senior Lecturer stated that she had consulted with various Officers in compiling this report and their responses had been considered by the Academic Affairs Committee. The Senior Lecturer invited Council's attention to the report under the following headings:

- A. *Establishment of a Centre for Academic Practice and Student Learning* The Centre had been established and a Director had been appointed with effect from September 2003. Information was provided on the prioritisation and implementation of objectives assigned to the Centre.
- B. *Review of Personnel Policies* The Report of the Academic Promotions Review Group addressed several of the recommendations and this Report was currently under discussion in College.
- C. *Promoting Inclusiveness* Reports from the Vice-Provost and from the Registrar were included on the identification and removal of barriers to ensure full participation by staff and students.
- D. *Curriculum Reform and Review* Information was provided on the implementation of Council policy in relation to the Broad Curriculum. A data collection exercise had been undertaken to determine student workload associated with each undergraduate programme and also on whether individual programmes included a dissertation.
- E. *Incentives to Promote and Reward Teaching* Increased funding had been made available for teaching development grants and the number of Provost's Teaching Awards had increased from three to four. It was noted that a bid to the HEA for funding to support teaching sabbaticals had been unsuccessful.
- F. *Bologna Declaration* A document summarising the College's position in relation to the nine objectives of the Bologna Declaration had been discussed by the Deans' Committee and will be updated and circulated to the Academic Affairs Committee and the University Council later in the year.
- G. *Infrastructure* Progress reports from the Bursar, the Librarian and the Director of IS Services on the implementation of recommendations under this heading had been included in the circulated document.

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings***

- H. *Improve Staff:Student Ratios* Given the current financial circumstances, it had not been possible to make progress in this area and College had been obliged to implement staff cuts.
- J. *Miscellaneous* Progress under this heading referred to the development of a policy on Lifelong Learning, the proposed increase in the number of students participating in SOCRATES programmes, and liaison with the National Qualifications Authority of Ireland.

The Provost noted that significant progress had been made in most of the areas identified in the very comprehensive report from the Working Party on Teaching and Learning and he thanked the Senior Lecturer for preparing the progress report for consideration by Council. Council noted and approved the report as presented.

- 17/A Science Foundation Ireland** The College Secretary advised Council of ongoing discussions with Science Foundation Ireland (SFI) in relation to the Chair positions in Department of Chemistry. Staff funded through SFI were normally appointed on five-year contracts, following which permanent Chair appointments are available to them. Financial arrangements for this are dealt with by the Faculty/Department concerned.

The College Secretary briefed Council on the case of an individual who has an application for SFI funding and following discussion and clarification on a number of points, Council agreed that negotiations should continue with the individual and with SFI. It was noted that if the outcome of the discussions was successful, the individual concerned would be offered a permanent Chair appointment on completion of the SFI contract. It was noted that this applicant had been offered a Chair in 2001, but for personal reasons at that time could not accept it.

A second case involved a candidate who had also submitted a proposal for SFI funding and in this case, in order that a permanent appointment could be offered at the end of the five-year period, it would be necessary to create a Personal Chair. The processes associated with such an appointment had been confirmed by Council during the previous academic year and in the case of external candidates, involved the candidate making application, being considered by the Senior Promotions Committee and interviewed by the University Council.

The Dean of Science advised that the Department of Chemistry was fully aware of the implications of the above proposals and of the need to make appropriate provision within its staffing plan. It was noted that in recent years, the Department had been unsuccessful in recruiting to two Chair appointments.

It was noted that in both cases, normal terms and conditions would apply on appointment to a permanent post in the College. In addition, it was noted that SFI conducted a rigorous peer review of proposals - applications from the individuals concerned may not be successful.

Council agreed that negotiations with SFI and with the two individuals concerned should proceed.

In response to a question, the College Secretary advised that a review of Chairs had been initiated and a report would be brought to Council in due course.

- 17/B Academic Affairs Committee** Council noted and approved the minutes of the Academic Affairs Committee of 25<sup>th</sup> November 2003.

- 17/C Nominations for Appointment** Council noted and approved the circulated and tabled information which is attached as Appendix 1. The circulated information contained a

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

number of typographical errors and unapproved titles and the Secretary advised that these would be corrected for the record.

**18/A Other Business – Chairs**

- (i) **Nursing and Midwifery Studies** On the advice of the College Secretary, Council noted and approved nominations for the external members of the Search Committee. Interviews would be held on the afternoon of 26<sup>th</sup> February 2004 and he encouraged a full attendance of Council members.
- (ii) **Clinical Microbiology** On the advice of the College Secretary, Council noted and approved nominations for the external members of the Search Committee for this Chair. As this was a joint appointment with St James's Hospital, Council would not be involved in the interview process but would receive a nomination for appointment in due course.

**18/B Graduate Studies Committee—Minutes of 16 October 2003** The Council noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of the Graduate Studies Committee of 16 October 2003.

**18/C Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

- (i) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone** The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 25 November 2003 and noted by Board on 17 December 2003:

**PhD** Daria Brennan; Elizabeth Brint; Anna Bryson; Irene Connolly; Niamh Margaret Connolly; Patrick Fournet; Charlotte Anne Fryatt; Mark Glynn; James Richard Hodkinson; Martin Holland; Karl Levis; Anne Nugent; Aoife O'Brien; Derek O'Regan; Livingstone Anthony Thompson; Evelyn Noelle Timothy; Gabriele Zenobi.

**MSc** Derek Cassidy; Michael John Fagan; Conor McCarthy; Justin Raymond Woods.

- (ii) to note that the names of the following two candidates for the degree of PhD, approved by the sub-committee on 3 December 2002 and Board on 18 December 2002 had not been presented to Council: Cecilia Ka Yuk Chan; Fergus Hugh Antony Mulligan.

**18/D Leave of Absence** The Council noted and approved the following applications recommended by Deans and Heads of Department concerned on the usual basis, satisfactory proposals having been made for provision for teaching and other needs:

- (i) **Nursing and Midwifery Studies** Ms E Curtis – Hilary term 2004;
- (ii) **Statistics** Dr M O'Regan – Trinity term 2004.

**18/E Nominating Committee** The Council approved the membership of the following committees:

- (i) **Russian – Thomas Brown Lectureship (3-year contract)**  
Dean of Arts (Letters)  
Dr J Doherty  
Dr S Smyth  
Dr S M S Devitt

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Under Other Business:

(ii) **Lecturer in Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering (permanent)**

Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences

Dr R P West

Dr E R Farrell

Dr M M O'Mahony

Dr J E Killen

Mr O Keegan (Dublin City Council)

(iii) **Consultant Paediatrician/Senior Lecturer (permanent)**

*TCD*

Dean of Health Sciences

Professor H M C V Hoey

Professor K P C Conlon

Professor D J McConnell

*Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Dublin Incorporating the National Children's Hospital*

Dr P Greally

Mr D Reardon

Mr G Brady

Professor T Stephenson (University of Nottingham)

Professor B Taylor (University of London)

Signed .....

Date .....

Appendix 1 to Actum 17/C

**Nominations for Appointment – 14 January 2004**

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Biochemistry	Research Fellow	CARTY Michael, B.Sc. (Belf.), Ph.D. (Belf.)	15.12.2003	15.12.2006
Biochemistry	Research Fellow Senior Demonstrator	ROBINSON Glynis, B.A. (Open), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Biochemistry	Research Lecturer	JEFFERIES Caroline, B.A. Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2006
Biochemistry	Research Associate	KELLY Julie Anne, Ph.D., M.Sc. (Manc.) B.Sc. (Hudd.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Chemistry	Research Fellow	NOLAN Michael, B.Sc. (DCU), Ph.D. (NMRC)	01.12.2003	31.05.2005
Clinical Medicine	Honorary Lecturer	O'SULLIVAN Maria, Ph.D. (Dubl.), B.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.09.2003	31.08.2006
Clinical Medicine	Lecturer in Medicine	McLOUGHLIN Ramona, MB, B.Ch. BAO (NUI), MRCP (UK)	01.07.2003	30.06.2004
Clinical Medicine	Lecturer Registrar	GOULDING Carol, MB (RCPI)	01.09.03	31.08.2004
Clinical Medicine	Senior Lecturer	THIRION Pierre, MD (Paris V)	05.01.2004	04.01.2006
Computer Science	Part-Time Lecturer	SIMPSON Jurgen	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Computer Science	Part-time Lecturer	FITZPATRICK Feargal, B.Des (NUI)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Electronic & Electrical Engineering	Research Fellow	PANARINA Olga, Ph.D. (Dubl.), Dip. Im Chem.(St. Petersburg State University)	01.12.2003	31.12.2004
English	Research Fellow	DILLANE Fionnuala, BA (NUI), MA (NUI)	30.10.2003	30.09.2005
Film/School of Drama	Part-Time Film Librarian/Research Assistant	FISHER Dorothy B.F.A. (Calif)	Subject to Work Permit	9 months
Geology	Visiting Professor	JONES Alan, B.Sc.(Nott.), M.Sc. (Birm.) Ph.D. (EDIN)	01.01.2004	31.12.2006
Germanic Studies	Harting Scholar	HARTSUIKER Marjan	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Germanic Studies	Teaching Assistant	MURPHY Brian, Beng. (Belf) MPhil (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Germanic Studies	Teaching Assistant	KULENOVIC Melita, BA (Berkeley)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
History of Art	Research Fellow	MOORE-McCANN Brenda, MB (NUI), BA Mod (Dubl) PhD (Dubl)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
History of Art	Temporary Lecturer	GALLAGHER William, BA (Dubl.)	01.12.2003	30.06.2004
IIS	Visiting Professor	SUTHERLAND Alan, Ph.D., MA (Warw.)	19.11.2003	13.03.2004

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



Microbiology	Research Fellow	MEEHAN Mary, B.A. (Mod) Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2006
Microbiology	Research Fellow	KELLY Barbara, B.Sc (NUI)	01.01.2004	31.10.2004
Modern History	Research Associate	DOYLE E.D, ( I.E.E.)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Associate	O'NEILL John, Ph.D (Dubl), M.Phil (Dubl)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Associate	KENNEDY Michael, BA, PhD (NUI)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Modern History	Research Fellow	O'CORRAIN Daithi, BA (Dubl.), H.Dip (NUI)	01.11.2003	31.10.2006
Modern History	Research Associate	McMAHON Deirdre, BA, MA (NUI) Ph.D (Cantab)	01.12.2003	30.09.2005
Pharmaceutical Chemistry	Research Fellow	BARRETT Irene, B.Sc. (NUI), Ph.D. (NUI)	08.12.2003	07.12.2004
Pharmacognosy	Research Associate	O'TOOLE Gerard, B.Sc. (NUI), B.Sc.(NUI), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	30.09.2003	30.09.2006
Physics	Research Fellow	O'BRIEN Canice B.Sc. (NUI)	01.01.2004	31.03.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	QUESADA-PATO Roberto, BS, MS, Ph.D.(Oviedo)	01.11.2003	31.10.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	PERON Nicolas, Ph.D. (Pierre et Marie Curie Paris VI)	08.09.2003	31.08.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	FOURNET Patrick, Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Physics	Research Fellow	MORITZ Jerome, Ph.D. (U. Fourier de Grenoble, France)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
Physiotherapy	Clinical Teacher	O'SULLIVAN Cliona, B.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.12.2003	30.06.2004
Policy Institute	Research Fellow	BOYLE Nigel, Ph.D. (Duke U.) BA (Liv.)	01.11.2003	30.06.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	MCNAMARA Cronan, B.Sc. (NUI), M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	FROST Dermot, B.A. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Pure & Applied Mathematics	Part-Time Lecturer	BRADLEY Kevin, Ph.D. (Dubl.), M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Trinity Centre for Bioengineering	Research Fellow	BYRNE Elaine, B.A. (Dubl.), Ph.D. (Dund.)	27.10.2003	25.10.2005