



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings.

Board Meeting 21 June 2023

This meeting was held in the Trinity Board Room

Present: Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Professor K Ahmad, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan, Professor S Browne, Mr K Byrne, Professor N Campbell, Ms Z Cummins, Mr P Farrell, Ms G Fullam, Mr D Grouse, Professor D Jones, Professor C Leahy, Ms R Mathews McKay, Professor R McManus, Professor A Nolan, Professor F Sheerin, Professor J Walsh.

Apologies: Professor I Arnedillo Sánchez, Professor R Kenny, Mr M Murtagh-White, Professor L Roe, Ms C Staunton.

In attendance: Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham), Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

SECTION A

BD/22-23/275 Statements of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from Mr Farrell in relation to agenda item A.4(iii) External Board Member. Having discussed the matter with Mr Farrell, the Secretary to the College proposed and it was agreed, that he would not be present in the meeting for that item.

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, the Registrar, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and the Vice-President for Global Engagement in relation to agenda item A.9 Annual Officers. The Secretary to the College, having discussed the matter with the Officers, proposed and it was agreed, that the Officers would not be present in the meeting for that item.

The Secretary to the College also advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from Professor Jones, Professor Leahy, Professor Ahmad, Professor Arnedillo-Sanchez, Professor Walsh, Professor Roe, Ms Mathews-McKay and Mr Byrne in relation to Agenda item C.25 Board Elections. The Secretary to the College advised that as the item was for noting only, it was not proposed that they leave the meeting for discussion on the item and that proposal was agreed.

The Provost advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Secretary to the College in relation to agenda item C.30 Faculty Deans' Review of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship. Having discussed the item with Mr Coman, the

Provost proposed, and it was agreed, that Mr Coman would leave the meeting for the discussion on the item.

The Provost advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Secretary to the College and the Assistant Secretary in relation to Agenda item D.37 Nominations for Appointment. Having discussed the matter with the Secretary to the College and the Assistant Secretary, the Provost proposed, and it was agreed, that they both would leave the meeting for that item.

BD/22-23/276 Minutes

(i) Draft Minutes of the Meeting 24 May 2023

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting 24 May 2023.

BD/22-23/277 Matters Arising

The following items were raised under matters arising:

(i) BD/22-23/253 Seanad Éireann University of Dublin Constituency

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that letter to the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Heritage would be issued later in the week.

BD/22-23/278 Strategic Capital Projects Dashboard

The Board noted the Dashboard as presented and received the verbal update from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation.

BD/22-23/279 Annual Officers

This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, the Registrar, the Vice-President for Global Engagement and the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies left the meeting for this item.

The Provost invited the Board's attention to her memorandum dated 21 June 2023 and the nominations in respect of Annual Officers as contained within.

Action/Decision

279.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 21 June 2023.

BD/22-23/280 Honorary Degrees

This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

The Registrar provided the Board with a summary of this item with reference to his memorandum dated 20 June 2023 which had been tabled.

Action/Decision

280.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 20 June 2023.

BD/22-23/281 Old Library Redevelopment Project

Ms Helen Shenton, Librarian and College Archivist, Mr Marc Sharifi, Programme Manager Strategic Projects, and Mr Greg Power, Head of Capital Projects and Planning, joined the meeting for this item.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation introduced the item with reference to her presentation dated 21 June 2023 which had been tabled. She advised the Board that due to significant inflationary pressure on the project the Board, at its meeting on 26 April 2023, had decided to pause to review the scope and the costs of the project before tendering for a contractor.

In addition, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation noted that there remains a strong commitment to the conservation of the building and preservation of the collections. She advised the Board that

reviewing the scope of the project had been very challenging with difficult decisions required and a significant amount of deliberations.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation outlined the proposed revision to the scope of the project noting the estimated impact on timelines and costs. She then summarised the next steps for the Board noting that in the interim period the Old Library with the current Book of Kells exhibition and Long Room will remain open to visitors in parallel with the interim exhibition with the envisaged estimate for the closure of the Old Library now being 2026. Also, it was noted that works would continue to progress on the interim exhibition in New Square.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, noting that while the reduction in scope of the project was helpful, further savings would need to be identified. She concluded by advising the Board that revised proposals would be brought to future meetings of the Executive Officers' Group, Finance Committee and Board and summarised the request of the Board to reduce the scope of the project.

The Provost thanked the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and opened the item for questions and comments.

In response to comments and queries from a Board member, the Provost confirmed that the project remains a strategic priority for the coming year and that every effort will be made to minimise disruption to access to the collections for those that require it.

In response to a query in respect of the revised timeline, Mr Power clarified that the full extent of the impact on the timeline is unknown at this stage and that there will be a need to revisit planning applications which may result in further impacts on the timeline for the project.

A number of Board members commended the project team for exercising caution and supported the proposal, while the difficulty in having to revisit a key strategic project in this way was acknowledged.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, responding to comments from Board members, noted that there is a possibility that inflation will reduce in coming years but noted that for now it is best to proceed assuming a continued increase in costs. She also advised the Board that key stakeholders will continue engagement with Dublin City Council after the meeting.

Responding to comments from Board members in respect of philanthropic support for the project, the Provost noted that while significant efforts had been made to secure philanthropic funding for the project there was still some further work required.

The Librarian/College Archivist commended the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and the project team and welcomed the continued commitment to the core elements of the project.

Action/Decision

281.01 The Board received the verbal update from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation.

Ms Shenton and Mr Sharifi left the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/282 Dartry Accommodation Project

Professor Kevin O'Kelly, Project Sponsor, Dartry Accommodation Project, Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, and Mr Greg Power, Head of Capital Projects and Planning, joined the meeting for this item.

Professor O'Kelly introduced item with reference to his presentation dated 21 June 2023, which had been circulated in advance. He provided Board members with a summary of the background to the project to date which had been initiated with a view to providing additional affordable student accommodation.

Professor O'Kelly advised Board members that while Board had approved the project in 2018, due to inflationary pressures the project had since been deemed unviable from a financial perspective.

However, the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science had since indicated support for the project and it is proposed to explore funding options for the project. He also noted that full planning permission for the project had been received which is viable for a number of years.

Professor O’Kelly presented an overview of the proposed revised financial model for the project and outlined the next steps to be taken to progress the project. He concluded by advising the Board that should the project be deemed viable a full business case will be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

In response to a query from a Board member, Mr Coote clarified the conditions on which Government funding might be awarded noting that every effort would be made to secure the most financially viable level of funding for the project.

Responding to comments from a Board member in respect of the increasing need for student accommodation and the difficulties also facing staff members in finding accommodation, Professor O’Kelly noted that the provision of student accommodation at an affordable rate underpinned the project proposal.

A Board member suggested that further consideration be given to the possibility of including family units in the development of the new student accommodation should it proceed.

Professor O’Kelly advised the Board that representations would be continued to be made to Government in respect of a greater view of the hardship and difficulty of access to accommodation currently being faced by students.

Action Decision

282.01 The Board noted and discussed the update from the Project Sponsor, Dartry Accommodation Project, dated 12 June 2023.

282.02 The Board endorsed the proposal to continue to engage with Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science in this process with a view to entering into a non-binding Memorandum of Understanding with the Government in July 2023.

Mr Coote, Professor O’Kelly, and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/283 Board Composition and Governance

This Secretary to the College introduced the item with reference to a memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 June 2023 which had been circulated in advance and advised the Board that he and the Assistant Secretary had met with Department Officials on the previous Friday to discuss the final steps required to obtain Ministerial approval of the regulations relating to the selection, election, nomination or appointment of members of the Board as contained in the Statutes.

(i) Proposed Changes to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes

The Registrar advised that on foot of the ongoing discussions with the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science, Board was asked to approve a number of further changes to the Statutes. The Provost noted that this has been a long and complex process and commended the Secretary to the College, the Assistant Secretary and the Registrar for their continued work on this.

The Registrar then provided the Board with a summary of the proposed amendments to the Statutes.

Some Board members voiced their concerns in respect of further providing for voting at Board meetings, a practice not generally utilised, and also in respect of the timeline and approach to the approval of the regulations to date.

In response to queries from Board members, the Secretary to the College clarified that the membership and terms of reference of the Nominations Committee had been approved by the Board at a previous meeting. In addition, he clarified that the list of external organisations to be contacted when seeking

nominations had also been approved by the Board.

A Board member noted that the use of the proposed self-scoring portal and the Board approved Skills and Experience Matrix would be helpful when considering potential external Board members. In addition, it was noted that it is proposed that the Nominations Committee would meet with a selection of interested individuals to ensure that they are committed to the best interests and sustainability of the University.

The Secretary to the College closed the item by noting that the final decision on the appointment of the external Board members would be a decision for the Board to make.

Action/Decision

283.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 June 2023.

(ii) Nominations Committee Revised Terms of Reference

The Secretary to the College introduced this item with reference to the memorandum from himself and the Registrar dated 16 June 2023. He outlined the proposed amendments to the Terms of Reference for the Nominations Committee for the Board.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Secretary to the College clarified that only the process by which external members are chosen by the Board was required to be approved by the Minister rather than the names of potential external members of the Board.

The dissent of Professor Alyn-Stacey, Mr Byrne, Ms Cummins, Professor Campbell, Ms Fullam, Mr Grouse Ms Mathews-McKay and Professor Walsh was noted.

Action Decision

283.02 The Board noted and discussed the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 16 June 2023.

(iii) External Board Member

Mr Farrell left the meeting for this item.

The Secretary to the College introduced this item noting that the Supplemental Charter of 2022 and the Universities Act, 1997, as amended by the Higher Education Authority Act, 2022 (in Section 16. (4)) specifies in respect of Board composition that there are to be seven external members appointed by the Board in accordance with a process for such appointments that is determined by the Board and approved by the Minister. He also noted that the Board at its meeting of 14 September 2022 had approved the nomination of Mr Paul Farrell as an external member of the Board from the date of that meeting to the end of the academic year 2026/27.

The Provost, with reference to her memorandum dated 16 June 2023 which had been circulated, in her capacity as Chair of the Board, proposed to the Board that Mr Farrell, having served almost 1 year of his first term on the Board, be given the opportunity to serve the remainder of that term and be appointed as one of the required 7 external members of the Board in keeping with section 16. (4)(b) of the legislation.

Action/Decision

283.03 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 16 June 2023 and the nomination of Mr Farrell as an external Board member of the incoming Board.

Mr Farrell re-joined the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/284 Quarterly Financial Forecasts

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to his presentation dated 12 June 2023 which had been circulated in advance. He provided the Board with a summary of the financial highlights of the second quarter ended 31 March 2023 and the full year forecast to 30 September 2023. He also provided a summary of performance compared to budget and the financial performance of the

previous year.

The Provost thanked the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer for the update and as there were no comments or queries brought the item to a close.

Action/Decision

284.01 The Board approved the presentation from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 12 June 2023.

BD/22-23/285 Annual Review of the University Risk Register 2022/23

The Chief Risk Officer, Ms Julia Carmichael, joined the meeting for this item.

Ms Carmichael introduced this item with reference to her memorandum dated 19 June 2023 and her presentation dated 21 June 2023 which had been circulated in advance. She summarised the top risks facing the University at present noting that the main risk trends in the University Risk Register include those related to external threats which include cybercrime and cyberattacks on the infrastructure of the University, the impact of disruptive technology such as Artificial Intelligence on academic integrity, and climate change adaptability and mitigation. Ms Carmichael concluded by presenting an overview of a PESTLE (Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal, Environmental) analysis for the University for the year 2022/23.

The Provost thanked Ms Carmichael and opened the item for discussion and questions.

A Board member noted the importance of providing the Board with further information in respect of risk mitigation and in presenting a prioritised plan of how the risks are to be addressed. The Provost, in response, acknowledged the need for this noting that further consideration is to be given to how the Board can best utilise the known risks to inform decision making.

Responding to comments in respect of the need for increased recurrent funding the Provost advised that discussions are on-going with the Government in respect of this in addition to other potential funding sources for the sector.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Provost advised the Board that the Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science is due to publish the first report of an Independent National Review of State Supports for PhD Researchers in the coming weeks.

A Board member noted the importance of not only capturing risks but identifying the opportunities that may come from such risks and of setting out a clear vision for the sector in order for the sector to be in a position to benefit from any potential future Government funding surpluses.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of funding for IT infrastructure, the Chief Operating Officer advised that a submission through the Irish Universities' Association had been issued to the Government on this matter. Following comments from a Board member the importance of continuously monitoring the probability of an adverse impact of IT risks was noted.

The Chief Risk Officer responding to comments about the need for a risk reduction budget noted that there are some provisions in respect of health and safety matters and acknowledged that further work is required in respect of further mitigation planning.

Action/Decision

285.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Chief Risk Officer dated 19 June 2023 and the accompanying University Risk register 2022/33.

Ms Carmichael left the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/286 Disciplinary Panel

The Secretary to the College introduced the item with reference to his memoranda dated 19 June 2023 which had been circulated in advance and his memorandum dated 20 June 2023 which had been

tabled. He advised that a meeting of the Disciplinary Panel had been held on 16 May 2023 and that the decision of the Panel was before the Board for consideration.

In response to comments and queries from Board members, the Registrar clarified that the composition of the Disciplinary Panel, including the Chair, had been approved by Board and that should the Board approve the recommendations of the report of the Chair the staff member had the option of appealing that decision to the Visitors.

The importance of taking action to address inappropriate or poor behaviour by staff members was acknowledged particularly in respect of the potential negative impact on the student experience.

Following comments from Board members in respect of the disciplinary process for academic staff compared to the disciplinary process for professional staff, the Registrar advised that it would be timely to conduct a review and to develop some proposals for the Board in this regard.

Action/Decision

286.01 The Board noted the memoranda from the Secretary to the College dated 19 June 2023 and 20 June 2023.

286.02 The Board considered and approved the recommendations of the report of the Chairperson of the Disciplinary Panel dated 16 May 2023.

The dissent of Mr Grouse and Professor Walsh was noted.

BD/22-23/287 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 7 June 2023 and the accompanying appendix, Formalisation of Disciplinary Structure in the School of Mathematics.

BD/22-23/288 Provost's Report

Due to the full meeting agenda and to ensure time sensitive matters were discussed, there was no report from the Provost on this occasion.

BD/22-23/289 Any Other Urgent Business

The following items were raised under any other urgent items of business:

(i) Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer

The Provost informed the Board that the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer had advised that he would be leaving Trinity to pursue an employment opportunity elsewhere. She commended Mr Reynolds for his integrity and contribution to the University and to the Board and on behalf of the Board wished him well in his new role.

(ii) Event for out-going Board Members

It was noted that an event to thank out-going Board members for their work on the Board would be organised in due course.

SECTION A.2

BD/22-23/290 Dignity and Respect, and Sexual Misconduct Policies

This item was deferred to a future meeting of the Board.

BD/22-23/291 Changes to the Procedures for Progression within Assistant Professor Grade

The Vice-Provost advised the Board that further amendments had been incorporated into the revised procedures.

Following comments from two Board members in respect of minor wording amendments it was agreed that the Procedures would be circulated to Board members for final consideration and electronic approval in the coming weeks.

Action/Decision

291.01 It was agreed that this item would be circulated to Board members for final consideration and approval through electronic means.

BD/22-23/292 Progression from AO3 Grade to AO2 Grade

Following a clarification from the Provost, the Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Director of Human Resources dated 15 June 2023.

BD/22-23/293 Updated Vetting/Foreign Police Certification Policy for Staff

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Garda Vetting Staff Liaison Person, dated 29 May 2023.

BD/22-23/294 Annual Review of the Risk Management Policy

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Chief Risk Officer, dated 14 June 2023.

BD/22-23/295 Misuse of Drugs Policy

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Dean of Students, dated 9 June 2023.

SECTION B

BD/22-23/296 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the callover updated to 24 May 2023.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board outcomes from the meeting of 24 May 2023.

BD/22-23/297 Audit Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 14 March 2023.

BD/22-23/298 Estates Policy Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 8 March 2023.

BD/22-23/299 Human Resources Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the following meetings:

- (i) Meeting of 10 May 2023;
- (ii) Meeting of 6 June 2023.

BD/22-23/300 Library and Information Policy Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 22 March 2023.

BD/22-23/301 Remuneration Committee

The Dean of the Faculty of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics, Professor Sylvia Draper, joined the meeting for the discussion on this item.

Professor Draper provided the Board with a summary of the relevant experience and achievements to date noting the opportunities for the Faculty and potential of multi-disciplinary research to support the development of the E3 Research Institute.

A number of Board members voiced their support for the proposal and proposed appointment. Other Board members noted their concern with the use of the Departures Framework noting the potential impact on the morale of staff across the University. Some concern regarding the funding and sponsorship of this post was acknowledged.

The Provost, reflecting on comments from Board members advised the Board of the wide-reaching implications that a decision to withdraw the option of engaging the Universities

Act 1997 – Agreed Framework between the Universities and the Higher Education Authority for Departures from Approved Levels of Remuneration, Fees, Allowances and Expenses for University Employees would have for the University and noted that no such decision could be taken without College-wide consultation particularly with Heads of School. She agreed that she would raise this matter with the Heads of Schools and Faculty Deans so that a widely informed decision could be taken in respect of engaging the Framework.

Action/Decision

301.01 The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 19 June 2023 and the memorandum from the Dean of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics dated 30 May 2023.

The dissent of Professor Ahmad, Professor Alyn-Stacey, Professor Campbell, Ms Cummins, Ms Fullam, Professor Jones, Professor Leahy and Professor Walsh was noted.

SECTION C

BD/22-23/302 Board Elections 2023

The Board noted that the following have been elected to Board:

(i) Fellows Constituency

Professor Darryl Jones (2023/24 – 2025/26, remainder of term)
Professor Cliona O’Farrelly (2023/24 – 2026/27, new term)
Professor Caitriona Leahy (2023/24 – 2025/26, remainder of term)
Professor Mark Cunningham (2023/24 – 2026/27, new term)
Professor Khurshid Ahmad (2023/24, remainder of term).

(ii) Academic Staff (Non-Fellow) Constituency

Professor Inmaculada Arnedillo-Sanchez (2023/24 – 2025/26, remainder of term)
Professor John Mark Walsh (2023/24, remainder of term)
Professor Lorna Roe (2023/24, remainder of term).

(iii) Professional, Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency

Ms Rachel Mathews-McKay (2023/24, remainder of term)
Mr Kevin John Byrne (2023/24, remainder of term).

BD/22-23/303 Board Membership

(i) Students’ Union

The Board noted that the following have been elected, and will serve as members of the Board of the College for the academic year 2023/24:

President	Mr László Molnárfi
Welfare Officer	Ms Aoife Bennett

(ii) The Board noted and approved that the incoming members listed above may attend to observe the Board meeting of 21 June 2023.

BD/22-23/304 Planning Group Report #28 to Board

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 14 June 2023.

BD/22-23/305 Revised Timeline for Assent of the Fellows

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 June 2023.

BD/22-23/306 Administrative Procedures in the Summer Session

The Board noted and approved that items of routine College business relating to Board will be dealt with by the Provost or Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer between the Board meeting of 21 June 2023 and the first Board meeting of 2023/24 (20 September 2023), and a report will be made to Board at its meeting of 20 September 2023.

BD/22-23/307 Faculty Deans' Review of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship

The Secretary to the College left the meeting for this item.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 8 June 2023.

BD/22-23/308 Trinity College Dublin Annual Report 2021/22

The Board noted and approved the Annual Report 2021/22.

BD/22-23/309 Higher Degrees

The Board noted the Higher Degrees, approved by Council on the 7 June 2023.

BD/22-23/310 Prizes and Other Awards

(i) A.J. Leventhal Scholarship

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Dean of Arts Humanities and Social Sciences dated 7 June 2023

(ii) E.C. Smith Scholarship in Pathology

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of Discipline of Anatomy, Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate) and the Financial Advisor, School of Medicine, dated 1 June 2023

(iii) Sarah Purser Medical Research Fund

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of Discipline of Anatomy, Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate) and the Financial Advisor, School of Medicine, dated 1 June 2023

(iv) Technicon Research Fellowship

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of Discipline of Anatomy, Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate) and the Financial Advisor, School of Medicine, dated 1 June 2023

BD/22-23/311 Sealings

The Board noted the Sealings (attached as appendix 1 to this minute).

This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

BD/22-23/312 Associated Companies – Reports of Directors to Board

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 14 June 2023.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: