



## Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

### Board Meeting 26 April 2023

*This meeting was held in the Trinity Board Room*

**Present:** Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Professor K Ahmad, S Alyn Stacey, Professor I Arnedillo Sánchez, Professor L Brennan, Professor S Browne, Mr K Byrne, Professor N Campbell, Ms Z Cummins, Mr P Farrell, Ms G Fullam, Mr D Grouse, Professor D Jones, Professor C Leahy, Professor A Nolan, Ms Mathews McKay, Mr M Murtagh-White, Ms C Staunton, Professor J Walsh.

**Apologies:** Professor R Kenny, Professor R McManus, Professor L Roe, Professor F Sheerin.

**In attendance:** Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

**(ex officio)** Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

**(by invitation)** Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham), Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

*It was noted that the Vice-President for Global Engagement would be delayed in joining the meeting due to another urgent commitment.*

### SECTION A

#### **BD/22-23/213 Statements of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Registrar, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Professor Arnedillo-Sánchez and Professor Leahy in relation to agenda item A.11 Council Acta. It was proposed, with the agreement of those Board members, that they would not be present in the meeting for that item.

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from Professor Alyn Stacey in relation to agenda item A.7 Visitors. The Secretary to the College, having discussed the matter with Professor Alyn Stacey, proposed and it was agreed that she would not be present in the meeting for that item.

#### **BD/22-23/214 Minutes**

- (i) The Board noted the notes of the Board Away-Day on 9 February 2023
- (ii) The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting 29 March 2023.

#### **BD/22-23/215 Matters Arising**

There was one item raised under matters arising:

- (i) **BD/22-23/202 Science Gallery Dublin Update**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

In response to the comments from a Board member the Provost agreed to follow up with the Board member on the matter after the meeting.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Secretary to the College clarified that where a Board member's contribution is referenced as having been noted in the minutes, this is to reflect that the contribution was taken into consideration during the discussion on the particular Board agenda item.

**BD/22-23/216 Strategic Capital Projects Update**

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation provided the Board with a verbal update in relation to the on-going strategic capital projects. She advised the Board that the Rubrics and Chief Steward's House projects are due to be delivered on time and within budget and noted the excellent sustainability achievements of the Rubrics project in particular. She informed the Board that it is proposed to organise an opportunity for Board members to tour the refurbished Rubrics building and advised that she would follow up with the Secretary's Office to arrange.

It was also noted that works were progressing on the Portal project in Trinity East.

**Action/Decision**

**216.01** The Board noted the Dashboard as presented and received the verbal update from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation.

**BD/22-23/217 Old Library Redevelopment Project**

*Ms Helen Shenton, Librarian and College Archivist, joined the meeting for this item.*

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation introduced the item with reference to her presentation dated 26 April 2023 and provided the Board with an update on the status of the project.

She advised the Board that due to significant inflation and supply chain issues exacerbated by implementation considerations; it was timely to review the project and that it was proposed to reassess the scope of the project in advance of tendering for the main contractor. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that the project team at all times remain committed to the conservation of the Old Library building and preservation of the valuable collections. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation concluded by advising the Board of the enabling projects which are continuing and gave an overview of the revised timeline for the project noting that a further update will be provided to the Board at the June meeting.

In response to comments from a Board member voicing their concerns in respect of the project, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation noted that it was timely now to carefully consider how best to ensure successful delivery of the project. The Provost also noted that great care will continue to be taken to ensure the highest quality standards in the project.

A Board member welcomed the update noting that it would be timely to pause at this stage and the Provost clarified that the project team are working through a reassessment of the project and that further information will be provided to the Board in June.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, in response to comments from a Board member about the Public Works Contracts, advised the Board that the University is engaging with Government in respect of the general requirements of Public Works contracts.

A Board member acknowledging the significant body of work being undertaken by the staff in the Library noted the potential impact on the current exhibition and the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that the timeline was under review and that all implications will be taken into account.

A Board member voiced their support for pausing the project at this stage noting that inflationary

matters must be reflected upon, but that given how central the Old Library is to the heritage and history of Trinity financial matters should not undermine the ambition of the project. The Provost, acknowledging the contributions of the Board member, noted the unique role of the University in being the custodians of the Old Library and the collections not just for the University but also for the State.

In addition, the Librarian and College Archivist underlined the criticality of this being a legacy project and the importance of taking a long-term perspective. She further clarified that there was no doubt that the conservation of the building and the collections is of the utmost priority.

**Action/Decision**

**217.01** The Board received the verbal update from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation.

*Ms Shenton left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/22-23/218 Quarterly Financial Review and Forecasts**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to his presentation dated 19 April 2023 which had been circulated in advance.

He provided the Board with a summary of the key observations of the financial performance of the University in the first quarter of the financial year 2022/23. He advised the Board that due to an anticipated reduction in energy costs the performance of the University may be better than originally forecasted. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer noted that budgets remain challenging across all Faculties and Divisions and the performance to date had been as expected.

The Provost thanked the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and opened the item for questions and comments.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer in response to a query from a Board member, advised the Board that it is envisaged that a reduction in energy costs may be observed in the coming months which should improve the University's overall financial position.

*The Vice-President for Global Engagement joined the meeting at this point.*

In response to a query from a Board member in relation to an observed increase in the spend on casual pay, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that some of the increase reflects the return to normal activities post Covid and it was noted that the Board were due to receive a presentation on staffing later in the meeting.

**Action/Decision**

**218.01** The Board noted and discussed the presentation from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 19 April 2023.

**BD/22-23/219 Trinity Strategic Plan 2020-2025: Community and Connection Review and Update**

The Provost introduced the item noting that this was an update to advise the Board of the current status on the implementation of the Strategic Plan.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited the Board's attention to her presentation dated 26 April 2023, which had been circulated in advance. She provided the Board with an overview of the progress made to date noting the proposed change in status of some of the goals. In addition, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board of some of the main achievements to date and noted those goals that face significant barriers to completion due to factors such as State funding, the Pandemic, Brexit and the consequences of the war in Ukraine.

A Board member commended the work completed to date in delivering and reporting on the Strategic Plan and noted the importance of having clear metrics and funding for every goal.

In response to comments and a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer provided the rationale for the proposed change in status for some of the goals noting that the Board was also being asked to recognise the actions that will not now complete given changes in circumstances.

In response to comments in respect of the goal in the Plan in respect of a growth in student and staff numbers, the Vice-President for Global Engagement advised the Board that a process of consultation is on-going across the schools to inform decisions on this matter for future planning. In addition, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that discussions in respect of strategic staffing would continue with the Faculty Deans.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of career opportunities for support staff, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the Human Resources department was currently considering the matter.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of an off-site Collections Resource Centre, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that while the item remained a priority there was currently no available funding to support this activity. The Board member commended the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and her office for efficiently monitoring the implementation of the Strategic Plan.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, acknowledging comments from Board members in respect of ensuring there are funding streams available when setting future goals, emphasised to the Board the need to further invest in IT as a matter of urgency.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the E3 Learning Foundry, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the proposed change in status was based on an update received from the Faculty Dean on actions in regards of that goal as distinct from the current status of the associated capital project.

A Board member commended the University in achieving a significant amount of the goals thus far noting that there are some goals which in the current environment would no longer be expected to be delivered and noted the importance of utilising measurable indicators and quantifiable measures for future plans.

In response to comments from Board members, it was agreed that the status would remain unchanged for the goal in respect of recognition and reward for staff and the goal in respect of the Tutorial system for undergraduate students.

The Provost, reflecting on the approach to be followed when preparing the next Strategic Plan noted that the following may be helpful:

- The introduction of a dashboard so that the potential contradictory nature of some actions can be considered.
- The need for clarity in respect of funding to support some actions versus those that may be aspirational in nature.
- The importance of clarity in respect of decision making to ensure all parties can contribute to the achievement of the goals and that autonomies are respected.

Following a comment from a Board member, the importance of the Board being actively consulted in the development of any future plan was acknowledged.

#### **Action/Decision**

**219.01** The Board received the update from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

**219.02** The Board approved the suggested changes to status and ownerships as outlined with the exception of goals 2.6 and 8.5 as noted.

*The dissent of Professor Alyn-Stacey and of Mr Byrne was noted.*

### **BD/22-23/220 Annual HR Metrics Report**

*The Director of Human Resources, Ms Antoinette Quinn and Ms Gwen Turner, Head of Strategic Planning and Process Improvement, Human Resources, joined the meeting for this item.*

Ms Quinn introduced the Report noting the significant increase in recruitment related activity and advised the Board of the current composition of staff across the University.

Ms Turner, with reference to the presentation from herself and Ms Quinn dated 26 April 2023, which had been circulated in advance, provided the Board with a summary of the report under the following metrics:

1. Recruitment
2. Attrition & Movement
3. Fixed Term Work & Contract types
4. Promotion & Career progression
5. Occasional Staff
6. Research Staff.

In conclusion, Ms Quinn advised the Board that in general across the staff in the University there is an ambition for development and progression but that a greater level of feedback and performance management is required. She noted some areas for further consideration including the use of the Irish Universities Association pay guidelines across the University in addition to any items identified through the Board approved Working Group, chaired by the Registrar, and which is reviewing patterns of employment and is scheduled to report to Board at the start of the next academic year.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of the lack of a promotions process for Professional staff, it was agreed that a review of some terminology used in the report would be undertaken to more accurately reflect the current opportunities for Professional staff. The distinction between promotion and progression was also acknowledged.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of staff turnover rates, the potential disruptions for the Schools and areas involved was noted.

In response to comments from Board members in respect of the use of fixed-term contracts of employments and engagement of occasional staff, the Registrar clarified that a lot of these issues are being discussed by the Board approved Working Group which is carefully considering the data available and he reassured the Board that any issues identified will be considered in detail.

In response to comments from Board members, it was noted that consideration could be given to including some contextual information, possibly including input from exit interviews, on the reasons for staff leaving the University in future reports.

In response to queries in respect of some of the data contained in the report, the Director of Human Resources advised the Board that further review and analysis of the available information is currently being undertaken and that a clearer understanding of current staffing practices will be identified. It was also noted that there are planned system improvements which will enhance future reporting.

#### **Action Decision**

**220.01** The Board considered and approved the Annual HR Metrics Report from the Head of Strategic Planning and Process Improvement, Human Resources, dated 2 February 2023.

### **BD/22-23/221 Visitors**

*Professor Alyn Stacey was absent from the meeting for this item.*

The Board received the verbal update from the Secretary to the College.

**BD/22-23/222 Seanad Éireann University of Dublin Constituency**

This item was deferred to a future meeting of the Board.

*Professor Alyn Stacey re-joined the meeting at this point.*

**BD/22-23/223 Trinity Legacies Review Working Group**

*Professor Eoin O’Sullivan, Senior Dean, and Ms Helen Shenton, Librarian and College Archivist, joined the meeting for this item.*

The Provost introduced the item with reference to her memorandum dated 25 April 2023 and asked the Senior Dean to summarise the work of the Trinity Legacies Review Working Group to date.

Professor O’Sullivan advised the Board that the Working Group has met on a number of occasions to deliberate on the detailed evidence review produced by members of the Discipline of History and the submissions received, to explore options for the Provost in respect of memorialising Bishop George Berkeley, D.D., in Trinity and summarised the resulting deliberations.

Ms Shenton advised the Board of some practical steps that would be needed to operationalise the change within the Library’s systems including amendments to IT systems and websites noting that efforts would be made to minimise any confusion in the short-term.

The Provost commended the Working Group for embracing the ethos of evidence-based research and consultation and noted the significant amount of work which went in to developing the proposal. She advised the Board that in light of the deliberations of the TLRWG, the Board was asked to consider and approve her recommendation that (i) The Berkeley Library is de-named, (ii) the Bishop George Berkeley, D.D., Memorial Window is ‘retained and explained’, (iii) the decision on the renaming of the Gold Medals is referred to the Discipline of Classics, (iv) the Bishop George Berkeley, D.D., portraits in the College Art Collection be subject to a new College Policy on artwork and the reconvening of the College Art Collections Advisory Group.

The Registrar paid tribute to the Senior Dean for his contribution to the item, which was echoed by several Board members.

A Board member commended the significant contribution of the student body to this item noting the symbolic and historic elements of the proposals.

Several Board members voiced their strong support for the proposals. In addition, a Board member noted the Board’s agreement to empower committees and working groups and commended the significant piece of work that had been conducted in respect of this item. They also noted the modernity of the naming of the Library which sets it aside from historic fabric of the University.

A Board member voiced their concern in the application of the particular ethos noting the potential difficulties in determining appropriate parameters in the future.

Following comments from Board members it was acknowledged that it would be beneficial to have an evidenced-based explanation behind the proposal available to provide the context and to inform any queries which may arise.

The Provost concluded the item noting the importance of having fora where all views and opinions can be debated to inform decisions.

**Action/Decision**

**223.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 25 April 2023 and the recommendations as contained within.

*The dissent of Professor Alyn Stacey on the grounds of the application of the ethos of the proposal was noted.*

## **BD/22-23/224 Board Composition and Governance**

### **(i) Timeline for Board Composition**

The Secretary to the College provided the Board with an overview of the proposed timeline in respect of the composition of the incoming Board.

#### **Action/Decision**

**224.01** The Board noted the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 19 April 2023 and the timeline in respect of Board composition as contained in it.

### **(ii) Board Elections**

The Secretary to the College provided the Board with an overview of the proposed timeline for the Board election process 2023.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Secretary to the College clarified the duration of terms of membership of the Board for any existing Board members who may be re-elected as provided for by the HEA Act, 2022.

#### **Action/Decision**

**224.02** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 19 April 2023 and approved the timeline for the Board Elections 2023 as contained in it.

### **(iii) Nominations Committee and External Board Membership**

The Registrar introduced the item with reference to the memorandum from himself and the Secretary to the College dated 18 April 2023 which had been circulated in advance. He drew the attention of the Board to an error in the wording in the revised Statutes, as quoted in the memorandum, whereby it had been agreed that the wording 'and competence in' as contained in Section 15(3) Nomination of External Members would be removed and advised the Board that the corrected wording of the Statutes would be circulated to the Board.

The Registrar noted that under the Statutes there is a provision for a Nominations Committee to be established noting that the proposed composition and draft Terms of Reference for this Committee were before the Board for approval. In addition, a suggested list of possible organisations to contact when seeking nominations was also before the Board for approval.

*The Vice-President for Global Engagement re-joined the meeting at this time.*

The Secretary to the College read out the specific requests being asked of the Board under this item being as follows:

1. To note the update and approve the draft Terms of Reference for the Nominations Committee.
2. To consider whether the Nominations Committee, on this occasion, should seek nominations from the following options:
  - External bodies including those listed in the memorandum with additional suggestions included in Appendix 2 of the memorandum.
  - Alumni
  - All staff and students
  - Public advertisement.
3. To decide if, apart from those nominated by external bodies, candidates making an expression of interest should be seconded by a member of Trinity staff, students or alumni.

In response to comments from Board members, it was agreed that the membership of the Committee should be expanded to include an academic (non-Fellow) member of staff and an additional external member.

In respect of the list of potential organisations from which to seek nominations, the Secretary to the



College advised Board members that should they have any additional suggestions that they could email such suggestions to him and he would bring them to the attention of the Nominations Committee.

In response to comments from a Board member, the importance of conducting due diligence in respect of any nomination was noted and it was suggested that Board members, if contacting the Secretary to the College include a paragraph outlining why a nomination or organisation should be considered.

Responding to queries from Board members in respect of the list of bodies contacted on previous occasions, the Secretary to the College clarified that that list reflects the wording as set out in the Trinity College, Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000, as follows:

*'3.(2)(g) One member not being an employee or student of the College chosen by a committee of the Board which shall comprise the Provost and two members of the Board from among nominations made by such organisations as are representative of such business or professional interest as the Board considers appropriate;'*

A Board member noted the importance of ensuring that a wide range of organisations are considered and not just the traditional commercially focused bodies and lobby groups as were contacted on previous occasions. It was noted that all of the bodies suggested in the Appendix would be contacted and consideration would be given to all other suggestions received.

It was agreed that nominations should be sought from alumni and all staff and students but that a public advertisement should not be used on this occasion.

In respect of the third request it was decided that there was no requirement for candidates making an expression of interest to be seconded by a member of Trinity staff, students or alumni.

#### **Action/Decision**

**224.03** The Board considered the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 18 April 2023.

**224.04** It was agreed that the Secretary to College would amend the memorandum to reflect the discussion at the meeting and the draft Terms of Reference which would then be circulated to the Board for approval by electronic means.

#### **(iv) Skills and Experience Matrix**

The Secretary to the College invited the Board's attention to the draft Skills and Experience matrix which had been circulated in advance.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Provost clarified that the overall skills and experience across the totality of the Board membership would be considered.

#### **Acton/Decision**

**224.05** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 18 April 2023 and the accompanying Skills and Experience Matrix.

#### **BD/22-23/225 University Council**

*The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Registrar, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Professor Arnedillo-Sánchez and Professor Leahy left the meeting for this item.*

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 12 April 2023.

#### **BD/22-23/226 Provost's Report**

Due to the full meeting agenda and to ensure time sensitive matters were discussed there was no report from the Provost on this occasion.

#### **BD/22-23/227 Any Other Urgent Business**



There were no items raised under other urgent business.

## SECTION A.2

### **BD/22-23/228 College Habitats Maintenance Policy**

The Board considered and approved the documentation from the Campus Services Manager, on behalf of the Grounds and Garden Committee, dated 6 April 2023.

In response to comments from a Board member, the importance of being ambitious and of seeking advice and expertise on biodiversity matters was acknowledged. In addition, the Provost advised the Board that she is working closely with the Vice-President for Biodiversity and Climate Action on all such matters.

*The Vice-President for Global Engagement left the meeting at this point.*

### **BD?22-23/229 Bereavement Leave Policy**

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Director of Human Resources dated 18 April 2023 and the updated Bereavement Leave Policy.

## SECTION B

### **BD/22-23/230 Board Business**

#### **(i) Callover**

The Board noted the callover updated to 29 March 2023.

#### **(ii) Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board outcomes from the meeting of 29 March 2023.

### **BD/22-23/231 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 17 November 2022.

### **BD/22-23/232 Human Resources Committee**

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 9 March 2023.

### **BD/22-23/233 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the following meetings:

- 9 June 2022
- 11 November 2022
- 15 February 2023.

### **BD/22-23/234 Quality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of minutes of the meeting of 29 March 2023.

## SECTION C

### **BD/22-23/235 Heads of Schools**

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú as Head of School of Histories and Humanities for a three-year term from 5 June 2023 to the end of Trinity term 2026
- (ii) Professor Gillian Wylie as Head of School of Religion, Theology, and Peace Studies for a three-year term from 5 June 2023 to the end of Trinity term 2026.

### **BD/22-23/236 Membership of Board Compliance Committee – Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 18 April 2023.

**BD/22-23/237 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted the Higher Degrees, approved by Council on 12 April 2023.

**BD/22-23/238 William Lyons Prize**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of the School of Social Sciences and Philosophy dated 24 March 2023.

**BD/22-23/239 Nomination of Trinity Representatives for Dublin Dental University Hospital (DDUH) Board**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 18 April 2023.

**BD/22-23/240 The John Mallet Purser Memorial Lecture 2023**

The Board noted and approved the recommendation from the Head of Discipline of Physiology that Professor Dame Pamela Shaw DBE, of the University of Sheffield, should present the 2023 John Mallet Purser Memorial Lecture.

**BD/22-23/241 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board on 30 March 2023.

**BD/22-23/242 Sealings**

The Board noted the Sealings. (See appendix 1 to this minute)

**This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.**

**BD/22-23/243 Dates of Board and Council Meetings 2023/24**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 19 April 2022.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....