



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

Board Meeting 25 January 2023

This meeting was held in the Trinity Board Room

Present: Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Professor K Ahmad, Professor I Arnedillo Sánchez, Professor L Brennan, Professor S Browne, Mr K Byrne, Professor N Campbell, Ms Z Cummins, Mr P Farrell, Ms G Fullam, Mr D Grouse, Professor R Kenny, Professor D Jones, Professor C Leahy, Ms R Mathews-McKay, Prof R McManus, Professor A Nolan, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor F Sheerin, Ms C Staunton, Professor J Walsh.

Apologies: Professor L Roe.

In attendance: Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham), Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

SECTION A

BD/22-23/108 Statements of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Provost in relation to agenda item C.23 Science Gallery International: Changes to Constitution. Having discussed the matter with the Provost, the Secretary to the College proposed, and it was agreed, that the Provost would leave the meeting for the discussion on this item because the Provost is also a director of the Science Gallery International company.

BD/22-23/109 Minutes of the Meeting of 14 December 2022

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 14 December 2022.

BD/22-23/110 Matters Arising

The following item was raised under matters arising:

(i) BD/22-23/089 Trinity Legacies Review Working Group

The Secretary to the College confirmed to the Board that contact had been made with the National Museum of Ireland.

BD/22-23/111 Strategic Capital Projects Dashboard

The Chief Operating Officer summarised the Dashboard for Board members. She noted in particular the progress being made in respect of sustainable energy systems being included in capital projects.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the implications for the University of the Metro North project, the Chief Operating Officer advised that every effort will be made through

submissions to Dublin City Council to minimise the impact on the University and the Provost advised that the progression of the project is being actively monitored.

Action/Decision

130.01 The Board noted the Dashboard as presented and received the verbal update from the Chief Operating Officer.

BD/22-23/112 Board Composition and Governance Update

This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

The Secretary to the College introduced the item with reference to a memorandum from himself and the Registrar dated 19 January 2023, which had been circulated in advance.

The Secretary to the College advised Board members that the date for the Board Away Day was now confirmed for the afternoon of Thursday 9 February 2023.

In addition, the Secretary to the College advised the Board that through the Irish Universities Association work is underway on high-level principles for the appointment of Board members.

Professor Walsh and Ms Fullam joined the meeting at this point.

The Registrar advised the Board that there had been a wide-ranging and helpful consultation process to date. With reference to the proposed draft amendments to the Statutes and noting the significant number of amendments that will be required, the Registrar encouraged Board members to review the draft amendments and to send any comments or observations to him no later than 48 hours before the Away Day. The Secretary to the College clarified that he would circulate the document electronically to all Board members in the coming days.

The Registrar noted that it is important for the Statutes to be clear as they act as guides to the college community and as such the focus should not be on the exact wording used but more so on whether the amendments facilitated the necessary changes and were easily understood. He concluded by thanking everyone who has been engaged in the consultation process and for the valuable feedback received to date.

The Provost noted the importance of receiving written inputs in advance of the Away Day so that appropriate consideration can be given to items raised and that there can be a focused discussion at the Away Day.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the high-level principles for appointment, the Secretary to the College clarified that the HEA Act 2022 requires for the Minister to approve the regulations and process of appointment of Board members and so work was underway through the Irish Universities Association Secretaries' Group to draft a common set of principles for all of the universities and to seek the views of Department officials now so as to minimise any delay at a later date. The Provost noted that it had been advised that the Universities work as a sector in this regard and also noted that the high-level principles would be overarching and would allow each university to operate transparently and in accordance with its own ethos.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Provost clarified that the process for appointment would not be provided for in the Statutes but would form separate guidelines. Following further queries from the Board member, the Provost noted that the Board is currently operating in a transitional stage and that the process of appointment would take time to be embedded and could be reviewed in the future.

Responding to comments from a Board member in respect of changes to the committee structures, the Provost advised the Board that it is beneficial for the Board to have sight of the proposed committee changes to help inform decisions in respect of the proposed amendments to the Statutes in respect of Board composition. She noted that revisions to the committee structures would also

facilitate a mechanism to have greater inclusion and participation at the committee level. It was noted that at this point the focus of the amendments is to be on the new committee structures and that careful and more detailed consideration will be given to the development of the relevant terms of reference, the details of which are in the Schedules in the Statutes and at the discretion of the Board for approval, at a later date.

Professor Nolan joined the meeting at this point.

The Registrar noted that consultation in respect of the changes to committee structures formed part of the initial consultation process and that a meeting with Chairs and Secretaries of the Principal Committees to discuss the matter was in the process of being scheduled.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of approving the process for the appointment for external Board members, the Registrar clarified that the proposed Statute provision will be for discussion at the Away Day and that the full details of the process can be developed after that.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Registrar suggested that he will provide some explanatory notes in respect of the Act, the Statutes, Chapters and Schedules to aid discussion at the Away Day.

Action/Decision

112.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar and the Secretary to the College dated 19 January 2023.

BD/22-23/113 Portal Project Update

Mr Leonard Hobbs, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation, Ms Jennifer Crossman, Project Finance Director, Mr Mark Bennett, Portal Director, Mr Colin Brogan, Project Manager, and Mr Gerard Heffernan, Category Manager (Capital and Facilities), joined the meeting for this item.

The Provost welcomed the visitors to the meeting. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation introduced this item with reference to her presentation, dated 18 January 2023, which had been circulated in advance noting that while capital costs have increased no additional funding for the project was being requested at this time.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation provided the Board with a summary of the background of the Trinity East and Portal projects to date and of the approvals received. She noted that given a significantly changed economic environment it is now proposed to deliver on the vision of Trinity East in a more sustainable way by activating the campus by refurbishment.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that the project plans for Portal had evolved making it a long-term strategic project with an opportunity to address critical space needs while maintaining the benefits of an innovation hub. She advised the Board that a tender had been issued in respect of appointing a contractor and that the business case had been updated to reflect an increase in costs and an increase in philanthropy available for the project.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation concluded by summarising the request of the Board to appoint a contractor and to commence works. The Provost thanked the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and opened the item for discussion and comments.

Following queries from a Board member, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified the level of staff resources contributing to the project and advised that there is no decanting necessary for the Portal works to proceed.

Responding to a query regarding the proposed occupancy levels, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that there was some flexibility with the potential for growth in the future and the intention to appropriately landscape the site was acknowledged.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, in response to a query from a Board member, clarified the initial level of occupancy envisaged which could include Trinity researchers from areas such as SFI centres and multi-disciplinary units and the Portal Director noted the potential for the space to facilitate campus companies and co-working and research spaces for industry partners and corporate sponsors.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Project Finance Director clarified the operational budget and staffing projections.

Responding to queries from Board members, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that careful consideration had been given to the project budget and clarified the implications on funding should there be amendments to the project.

Responding to comments from a Board member in respect of occupying the space, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that several requests from researchers for a space on the site had already been received and it is envisaged that space on the main campus could be freed up with occupation in Trinity East.

In response to comments and queries from Board members in respect of the role of industry in academia the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that further consideration will be given to this matter in future collaborations, and she also advised that consideration was being given to broadening access to library materials across the entire campus.

Mr Hobbs, Ms Crossman, Mr Bennett, Mr Brogan and Mr Heffernan left the meeting at this point.

Action/Decision

113.01 The Board considered and approved the presentation from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation dated 18 January 2023.

113.02 The Board considered and approved the request to appoint the preferred contractor and to commence works.

113.03 The Board noted the report from the Independent Monitor dated 20 January 2023.

BD/22-23/114 Annual Officer

The Board approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 24 January 2023, as was tabled, and approved the nomination of Professor Dónall Mac Dónaill as Junior Dean as was contained within.

BD/22-23/115 Nominations for Honorary Degrees

The Registrar provided the Board with a summary of his memorandum dated 24 January 2023, as was tabled, and the nominations for Honorary Degrees.

Following discussion, many Board members supported the nominations proposed and the importance of supporting recommendations made by committees to the Board was acknowledged. Some Board members noted their concern in respect of a nomination and also suggested some greater clarity and guidelines in respect of the nomination process.

In response to the comments, the Provost asked that the Registrar conduct a review of the Honorary Degrees process in general and bring forward a proposal for discussion at a future meeting of the Board.

The Registrar concluded by noting the confidential nature of this item.

Action/Decision

115.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 24 January 2023, as was tabled, and approved the nominations for Honorary Degrees as contained within. In relation to a nomination there were 3 dissents and 2 abstentions.

115.02 The Registrar is to conduct a review of the Honorary Degrees process in general and bring forward a proposal for discussion at a future meeting of the Board.

BD/22-23/116 2010 Consolidated Statutes – Assent of the Fellows

The Registrar advised the Board that the Assent of the Fellows and the approval of the Visitors had been received in respect of the proposed amendments to the Chapter on Students and that the process was now complete.

Action/Decision

116.01 The Board received the report from the Registrar.

BD/22-23/117 University Council

Responding to comments and queries from a Board member in respect of draft minute CL/22-23/087 Degree Classification and Trends, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the minutes as circulated were in draft format and that it is proposed to incorporate amendments to them before they are finalised. She noted the importance of Trinity gathering relevant data in respect of potential grade inflation to inform national discussions. The Provost noted that it would be prudent to follow the approach as outlined by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer so that accurate data can facilitate informed discussions.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Vice-President for Global Engagement clarified that there are regional teams recruiting students for Trinity from several countries and regions across the world.

In response to comments from a Board member, the potential issues arising from the inappropriate use of artificial intelligence was acknowledged and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that work is in progress to identify ways to further support students during their studies and staff in setting assessments.

The effects of the Pandemic on student well-being and performance were acknowledged.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of draft minute CL/22-23/085 National Student Survey Report (UG &PGT) 2021/22, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that a copy of the Report was available from the Dean of Students.

Action/Decision

117.01 The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 18 January 2023.

BD/22-23/118 Provost Report

The Provost provided the Board with a report on the following matters:

(i) Staff Changes

The Provost advised the Board that the Director of Public Affairs and Communications, Mr Tom Molloy would be leaving the University to take up employment elsewhere at the end of the month. On behalf of the Board, the Provost recorded her thanks to Mr Molloy for all of his contributions to the University.

The Provost also extended her thanks to Professor Philip Coleman for his service as Junior Dean and to Professor Edward Arnold for his service as Steward.

(ii) Delayed Leaving Certificate Results

The Provost advised the Board that the Government has indicated that further delays to the publishing of the Leaving Certificate results are envisaged for this and future years.

BD/22-23/119 Any Other Urgent Business

The following items were raised under other urgent business:

(i) Female Sculptures in the Long Room

A Board member extended their thanks to the Provost for an invitation to the launch of the four female sculptures in the Long Room due to be held on 1 February 2023.

(ii) The Old Library Redevelopment Project

In response to comments and queries from a Board member in relation to the schedule for the Old Library Redevelopment Project, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that the programme was on schedule and that appropriate financial planning was in place. The Chief Operating Officer noted that a significant level of oversight of the project was in place and that separately efforts are being made to input into a review of the public procurement process.

SECTION A.2**BD/22-23/120 Revised Treasury Policy**

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Project Appraisal Manager and the Treasury Accountant dated 18 January 2023 and the accompanying Revised Treasury Policy.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the University's Risk Appetite Statement it was noted that an update on this item would be provided at a future meeting of the Board.

In response to queries from a Board member in relation to the potential impact of foreign currency exchange rate movements on University income, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified that all University billing is denominated in Euros.

BD/22-23/121 Hospitality and Entertainment Policy

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Financial Operations Manager dated 18 January 2023 and the accompanying Hospitality and Entertainment Policy.

SECTION B**BD/22-23/122 Board Business****(i) Callover**

The Board noted the callover updated to 14 December 2022.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board outcomes from the meeting of 14 December 2022.

BD/22-23/123 Equality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 7 December 2022.

BD/22-23/124 Safety Committee

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 27 October 2022.

SECTION C**BD/22-23/125 Associated Companies: Directors' Reports**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 18 January 2023.

BD/22-23/126 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by Council on 18 January 2023.

BD/22-23/127 Membership of Audit Committee

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 18 January 2023.

BD/22-23/128 Strategic Capital Projects – Reports from Independent Monitors**(i) Old Library Redevelopment Project**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from Ms Denise Kennedy dated 5 December 2022.

(ii) Historic Accommodation Building Project

The Board noted the report from Mr Niall Meagher dated 5 December 2022.

BD/22-23/129 Calendar Changes to reflect amended title of ‘Dublin University Central Athletic Club’

The Board noted the memorandum from Dean of Students dated 11 January 2023.

BD/22-23/130 Calendar Changes related to College Office Holder

The Board noted the memorandum from the Provost dated 23 January 2023.

BD/22-23/131 Health and Safety Oversight 2021/22

The Board noted the memorandum from the Chief Operating Officer and Chair of the College Safety Committee dated 2 November 2022.

BD/22-23/132 Science Gallery International: Changes to Constitution

The Provost introduced this item with reference to a memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 18 January 2023 which had been circulated in advance. She advised the Board that at its company board meeting on the 6 December 2022, the Directors of Science Gallery International (SGI) had endorsed changes to SGI’s Constitution. The Provost advised the Board that it was timely to review the level of influence and control that Trinity operates over the SGI network. As such, included in the amendments, which were set out in an accompanying memorandum and draft constitution, were changes that take into account the maturity of the international network and that allow all members to participate equally in the SGI company.

The Provost left the meeting and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer chaired the meeting for the remainder of the discussion on this item.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that it was deemed reasonable at this stage of the international consortium for all members to contribute equitably.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of any potential financial implications, the Secretary to the College advised the Board that as with all companies the liability is limited and with the proposed amendments to the constitution all company members will share responsibility and accountability.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the difference in governance structures between the Science Gallery Dublin and the Science Gallery International company and also clarified Trinity’s role in Science Gallery International in the future.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of Directors’ Reports from Associated Companies, the Secretary to the College clarified that this item was on the agenda in Section C and the reports had been circulated.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to College dated 18 January 2023.

BD/22-23/133 School of Medicine Studentships 2022/23

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Sophister Coordinator, School of

Medicine dated 13 December 2023.

BD/22-23/134 Sealings

The Board noted the Sealings (See Appendix 1 to this minute).

This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: