



**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

### **Board Meeting 26 January 2022**

*This meeting was conducted remotely using the Zoom application and was hosted in the Provost's Office.*

**Present:** Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Professor K Ahmad, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Mr K Byrne, Ms J Donoghue, Ms B Genockey, Mr D Grouse, Ms L Keogh, Ms R Mathews-McKay, Professor R McManus, Professor K McTiernan, Ms S Mueller-Owens, Professor A Nolan, Professor D R Phelan, Professor L Roe, Ms G Scanlon, Professor A Seery, Professor F Sheerin, Professor J Walsh.

**Apologies:** Professor D Faas, Professor R A Kenny.

It was noted that the Registrar would join the meeting at approximately 11.40am after a Commencement ceremony and that Professor Burke and Professor Ahmad will need to leave the meeting early.

**In attendance:** Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

**(ex officio)** Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

**(by invitation)** Interim Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham), Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

### **SECTION A**

#### **BD/21-22/134 Statements of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflicts of interest had been received.

#### **BD/21-22/135 Minutes of the Meeting of 1 December 2021**

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 1 December 2021.

#### **BD/21-22/136 Matters Arising**

The following items were raised under matters arising:

##### **(i) BD/21-22/105 Annual HR Metrics Report**

The Provost advised that, as suggested by a Board member at the last meeting, she intends to establish a Board Working Group to examine the issue of precarious working and that the proposed membership and terms of reference will be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

##### **(ii) BD/21-22/109 2010 Consolidated Statutes: Proposed Amendments to Schedule 1 to the Chapter on Chancellor**

The Registrar advised the Board that several Commencements ceremonies had recently been held and that the schedule of ceremonies was now back on track having cleared the backlog of ceremonies which had been delayed due to the Pandemic. He extended

his thanks to Ms Lorraine Norton and the Graduation Team in Academic Registry and the members of the Caput for their work in conducting the ceremonies.

**BD/21-22/137 Strategic Capital Projects Updates**

**(i) Dashboard**

The Interim Chief Operating Officer presented the Dashboard to the Board. The Provost noted that there was no change to the Dashboard further to its consideration at the last meeting.

**Action/Decision**

**137.01** The Board received the report from the Interim Chief Operating Officer and noted the Dashboard.

**(ii) Focus on the Historic Accommodation Buildings Project**

*Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O’Kelly; Independent Monitor, Mr Niall Meagher; and Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power joined the meeting for this item.*

Professor O’Kelly, with reference to his presentation dated 26 January 2022 which had been circulated in advance, provided the Board with an update on the Rubrics and Chief Steward’s House projects. He advised the Board that works on the Rubrics had uncovered a number of previously unknown conditions and gave examples as to such matters and how they have been dealt with.

Professor O’Kelly advised that the current phase of the project (stripping) was now complete in the buildings and most of the ‘unknowns’ have been uncovered. It was also noted that the Design Team are reviewing some claims by the contractor in respect of these matters. He advised the Board that approval is required from Dublin City Council in respect of the roof slates to be used but that the proposed slates had been endorsed by the Estates Policy Committee. Professor O’Kelly noted that if this approval is not forthcoming there could be a significant risk to the project costs and timeline.

Professor O’Kelly advised that works to the Chief Steward’s House were progressing well and that works in House 10 are scheduled to commence in February/March 2022 and to last for 10 to 12 weeks. Professor O’Kelly concluded by summarising the project budget and associated timelines for the Board.

The Independent Monitor, with reference to his report dated 21 January 2022 which had been circulated in advance, provided the Board with an overview of his observations in respect of the project since his appointment as Independent Monitor in late October 2021. He advised that in his view the Design Team were very capable, experienced and carefully considered all restoration requirements. He provided updates in respect of the project programme, risks, quality and budget and cost control.

Responding to comments from some Board members in respect of the contract duration, delays to the project and the availability of roof slates, Professor O’Kelly advised that contingency had been built in to the project timeline and that the current delay has not as yet impacted on the completion date.

In response to a query and comments from a Board member, Mr Power advised that careful consideration is being given to the type of windows to be used. The historical nature of this project was acknowledged and Mr Power advised that the project will be recorded in the usual way. A Board member extended his congratulations to the team working on this project, noting that it is a complex restoration project and voicing his full support for the project.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the final appearance of the roof, Professor O’Kelly advised that it will appear visually different initially as the current roof has undergone colour changes due to very many years of weathering.

The Provost thanked Mr Meagher and brought the item to a close.

#### **Action/Decision**

**137.02** The Board noted and discussed the update from the Project Sponsor.

**137.03** The Board noted and discussed the report from the Independent Monitor dated 21 January 2022.

*Mr Meagher left the meeting at this point.*

*Professor Stokes left the meeting at this point.*

#### **(iii) Focus on the Printing House Square Project**

*Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O’Kelly; and Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power remained in the meeting for this item. Independent Monitor, Ms Denise Kennedy joined the meeting for this item.*

Professor O’Kelly, provided the Board with an overview of his presentation dated 26 January 2022, which had been circulated in advance. He advised the Board that the project was almost at completion with a revised schedule issued by the contractor indicating a completion date at the end of March. However, estimates of actual work against the programme display a lack of confidence in this regard with a likely completion date of end of April/May 2022.

Senior representatives of the Contractor are regularly being brought to site to particular points in the project to answer questions on progress.

Professor O’Kelly advised the Board that the project budgeting is successful but it would not be able to meet *ex gratia* Covid payments and any arbitration costs should they occur. He also advised that despite the significant delay to programme all other critical success factors of the project had been met.

The Independent Monitor, with reference to her Report dated 18 January 2022, provided an update in respect of budget, programme, quality, health and safety and team performance. She advised the Board that it is positive that good lines of communication between the contractor and the Trinity team remain in place. Ms Kennedy noted that, based on her observations in terms of progress, it is likely that the project will conclude by April/May 2022. She also noted that the quality of the works remains very high and that there will be an impressive building for the university’s use at the end of the project.

Following comments from Board members in respect of the previous and possible future loss of revenues due to the unavailability of the student accommodation, the Independent Monitor advised that there is confidence that the building will be available for use in the summer months.

Responding to comments from a Board member in respect of the presence of the rifle range in the complex, Professor O’Kelly advised the Board that at an early stage in the project, the then Board members had been invited to a presentation by the Rifle Club and Trinity Sport. He confirmed that there is a separate entrance from outside the building in to the range and that there is no direct access between the accommodation and range below. He also noted that the facility is very secure with the rifles themselves stored in a separate location to the ammunition and that An Garda Síochána were satisfied with the security measures in place.

Following comments from another Board member, the Provost advised that this matter will be considered further at a future meeting of the Board.

Following a request from a Board member, it was noted that further consideration is to be given to arranging a visit for Board members to the building in advance of the official opening of the building.

**Action/Decision**

**137.04** The Board noted and discussed the update from the Project Sponsor.

**137.05** The Board noted and discussed the memorandum from the Independent Monitor dated 18 January 2022.

*Professor O’Kelly and Ms Kennedy left the meeting at this point.*

*Professor Stokes re-joined the meeting at this point.*

**BD/21-22/138 Interim Exhibition (Old Library Redevelopment Project)**

*Librarian & College Archivist, Ms Helen Shenton; Commercial Director, Mr Gerry Crawford joined the meeting for this item and Mr Power remained in the meeting for this item.*

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation with reference to her memorandum and presentation both dated 24 January 2022 which had been circulated, noted that the Board had approved an initial business case for the Old Library Redevelopment Project and the associated Interim Exhibition, but some elements of the interim Exhibition, namely location and feasibility, remained to be determined.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation noted that while consideration had originally been given to the use of Library Square and New Square as the location for an interim exhibition, subsequent engagement led to College Park being proposed. She noted that there had been continued engagement with Trinity Sport regarding the potential use of College Park and that a feasibility study of that proposal had now been conducted. In particular, she acknowledged the work of Trinity Sport and DUCAC to identify a reconfiguration of facilities that would allow all sporting activities to continue. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation also advised the Board that a daylight and shadow analysis had been conducted and no impact on work and conditions in the Ussher Library were envisaged.

In relation to financial feasibility, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that, following a financial feasibility study of the proposals in respect of the interim exhibition, it was noted that a pavilion in College Park without the Book of Kells was not the optimal visitor experience option as it does not achieve the return required by the University to support the Old Library Refurbishment Project business case. The importance of ensuring the appropriate conservation and protection of the Book of Kells was also acknowledged.

As the original immersive only experience proposal was found not to generate the required contribution to the OLRP business case, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that consideration is being given to an alternative location and summarised a new proposal (Option B) which included the renovation of the Printing House to house the Book of Kells and a smaller pavilion on New Square to house an immersive audio-visual exhibition, retail space and support space. She advised Board members that a built environment feasibility study had been completed and confirmed that all aspects of this proposal can be delivered ensuring security, fire safety, and optimised visitor flow.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation summarised the financial information of the new proposal for the Board noting that this option anticipates an overall net increase in projected contribution. It was noted that as there are likely to be timing issues and an optimal co-ordination strategy would need to be developed.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation concluded by advising the Board that approval was sought to proceed with Option B as outlined, including the renovation of the Printing House to accommodate the Book of Kells and a smaller Pavilion for an interim exhibition in New Square. She also noted that the Executive Officers’ Group had met on Friday, 21 January 2022 and had approved the recommendation of proceeding with Option B.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Several Board members welcomed the proposal and commended the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and her team for their work in this respect and the importance of preserving the Old Library and its collections was acknowledged.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of planning permission for the new proposed location, Mr Power advised that it is envisaged that an application for this proposal would be more likely to be favourably received by Dublin City Council as it is considerably smaller than the original proposal and now also includes the conservation of a protected building on the campus.

A Board member commended the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and welcomed the proposal particularly the planned use of the Printing House which complements its historical status. They also suggested that further consideration be given to managing potential congestion.

In response to a query from a Board member, it was noted that the renovation of the Porter's Lodge will be considered in the list of renovation projects for future consideration.

A Board member noted that there may be some funding opportunities to support these proposals in the new European Bauhaus initiative and the EU Renovation Fund.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the visitor experience and movement between the Printing House and the interim exhibition, the importance of good signage, way-finding and an immersive experience was acknowledged.

Responding to comments from Board members, Mr Power advised that further consideration will be given to the movement and volume of people on the campus and noted that the interim exhibition will be fully accessible including the new case for displaying the Book of Kells which is also accessible.

Mr Crawford, responding to a query and comments from Board members in respect of ticket price and advertising, advised that careful consideration will be given to the pricing so that it will be attractive to visitors and noted that further consideration will be given to the promotion of and timing of the proposals to minimise any potential loss of revenue.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation concluded her remarks by extending her thanks to the relevant sports clubs, DUCAC, the Commercial Revenue Unit, the Library staff and to the team in Estates and Facilities for their work on this proposal.

#### **Action/Decision**

**138.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation dated 24 January 2022.

**138.02** The Board approved the proposal to proceed with Option B as outlined, including the renovation of the Printing House to accommodate the Book of Kells and a smaller Pavilion for an interim exhibition in New Square.

*Ms Shenton, Mr Crawford and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.*

The Provost reiterated that, as referred to at the Board meeting on 1 December (minute BD/21-22/099), under the Consolidated Statutes 2010, the business of the Board is confidential. The Statutes provide that the Provost is the spokesperson for the Board and as such any media queries should be directed to Trinity Communications. The importance of all Board business being kept confidential was also noted.

It is damaging to Trinity's reputation and brings the integrity of the Board in to disrepute if public comments are made by Board members before a Board meeting about business to be discussed at the Board, all the more so when the comments are inaccurate.

With Board's agreement, the Provost will make direct contact to make these points.

### **BD/21-22/139 Quarterly Strategic Plan and Risk Update**

*Chief Risk Officer, Ms Julia Carmichael and Projects and Enablement Manager (Provost's Office), Ms Shumane Cleary joined the meeting for this item*

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to her presentation dated 26 January 2022, which had been circulated in advance. She provided the Board with a summary of the achievements in respect of the implementation of the Plan since the last report. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also gave an update on the RAG status of the various goals contained within the Plan noting in particular the impact of the Pandemic on the staff: student ratio and any new red RAG status actions/targets since the last report.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer concluded by advising Board members that the Board was requested to receive the Strategic Plan 2020 -2025 *Community and Connection* Progress Report and Update for the period up to December 2021.

A Board member noted that additional academic staff would also require additional support staff and the Provost agreed that this should be factored into future discussions. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the Dean of Research is mapping out all of the supports required in relation to the planned strategic growth.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, responding to comments from a Board member in respect of maintaining the quality of education provided and the need for further administrative support for academics, advised the Board that responsibility for strategic staff planning has been devolved to the Heads of School so they can have the ability to decide how best to meet the staffing needs of their Schools.

She also noted that the Baseline Budgeting Model (BBM) is currently under review with a questionnaire issued and ongoing engagement with School Administrative Managers, Heads of School and the Fellows.

The cost of living and accommodation costs in Dublin was noted as an impediment to attracting and retaining high calibre staff. It was also noted that a new working group is to be formed to look at the issue of precarious employment.

Responding to comments from some Board members in respect of international student recruitment, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Vice-President for Global Engagement are developing a new Undergraduate Admissions Strategy with consideration being given to even more creative teaching offerings to attract international students. The importance of ensuring appropriately resourced and quality programmes are offered was noted.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that she will liaise with the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation in relation to plans in respect of the Santry campus. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanked Ms Carmichael and Ms Cleary for their work in preparing the presentation.

### **Action/Decision**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**



**139.01** The Board received the report from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer on the *Strategic Plan 2020 -2025 Community and Connection*.

*Ms Carmichael and Ms Cleary left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/21-22/140 Quarterly Financial Review and Forecasts**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer introduced this item noting that it had previously been agreed by the Board for quarterly updates to be given on this item to the Board. With reference to his presentation dated 26 January 2022, which had been circulated in advance, he provided the Board with a summary of the financial performance observed in Quarter 4 of the Financial Year 2020/21 and for the full financial year to 30 September 2021. He gave an overview of the financial highlights and noted that the University will be reporting an underlying deficit (before unrealised gains and losses) for the Financial Year 2020/2021 due mainly to the impact of Covid-19 on University income.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer presented summary dashboards outlining income and expenditure, actual performance, the financial performance of the capital projects and cashflow.

He also noted that a more detailed review of the financial performance will be brought to the March meeting of the Board when the audited Consolidated Financial Statements are presented for approval.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer agreed to provide a calculation of 'net liquidity days' for the Board member after the meeting.

A Board member, enquiring as to the University's performance, queried the exposure of the University to interest rate increases. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that approximately 85% of the University's borrowings are on fixed interest rates and that Finance Committee has approved a proposal to put in place hedging/SWAP arrangements for the remainder of the loans on variable rates.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified that the updated figure for registered students is approximately 20,000 with final numbers to be confirmed in March 2022.

**Action/Decision**

**140.01** The Board received the presentation from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 26 January 2022.

*Professor Phelan joined the meeting at this point.*

**BD/21-22/141 Changes to Eligibility Criteria for the Master in Arts (*Jure Officii*)**

The Registrar with reference to the memorandum dated 19 January 2022, summarised for the Board the reasons for the proposal to amend the eligibility criteria for the MAJo degree. The Registrar acknowledged the input of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Dean of Graduate Studies and of Mr David Grouse to the proposals.

In particular, he noted the inequity in the existing regulations and advised the Board that it is proposed that all staff would be eligible to apply for the degree after 10 years of service.

The Registrar clarified that the changes will come into effect on June 1, 2022 and will not apply to any previous calls for applications for the degree. Members of staff who would have been eligible to apply for the MA (*JO*) degree under the rules previously in force but who would *not* be so eligible under the rules contained within this paragraph, *will* be permitted to apply for the degree following the call for applications in both 2022 and 2023 but not

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

thereafter. He also invited the Board's attention to the proposed changes to the wording for future Calendars.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Registrar noted that the Graduations team had recently accommodated additional commencement ceremonies and would be happy to do more if needed.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar advised that should it be appropriate to reconsider Senate membership then this will be dealt with as a separate matter.

A Board member welcomed the proposal noting that it was a great step forward in enhancing collegiality and the Provost noted the importance of the proposal.

#### **Action/Decision**

**141.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 January 2022.

#### **BD/21-22/142 Consolidated Statutes: Proposed Amendments**

- (i) **Schedule 2 to Chapter on Council (Standing Orders)**
- (ii) **Schedule 2 to Chapter on Committees (Detailed Provisions Relating to Committees)**
- (iii) **Schedule 1 to Chapter on Professors (Established Chairs)**
- (iv) **Table on Degrees (Chapter on University)**

The Registrar, with reference to his memorandum dated 20 January 2022 which had been circulated in advance, provided the Board with a summary of and the rationale for the proposed amendments to Schedules of the Statutes. He advised the Board that the proposed amendments were agreed by the Statutes & Schedules Working Party (SSWP) on 18 January 2022.

#### **Action/Decision**

**142.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 20 January 2022 and the accompanying amendments.

#### **BD/21-22/143 Provost's Report**

The Provost noting that this item is taken later in the agenda to allow appropriate time for the main items of business to be considered, provided the Board with an update on the following items:

##### **(i) Covid-19**

The Provost noting the recent relaxing of restrictions by the Government, advised the Board that it is envisaged that the month of February will be used by all areas of the University to plan how to facilitate a return to work on campus. With reference to the Blended Working Policy she noted the importance of ensuring that the right level of staff working on campus be organised so that appropriate cover is in place. The Provost also noted the importance of ensuring there is flexibility in the arrangements as Covid-19 is still present in society.

The Provost proposed that an in-person Board meeting be arranged for the March meeting of the Board and asked the Secretary to the College to liaise with Board members to ensure that all Board members would be comfortable to meet in person.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer commended the work of the Director of the College Health Service, Dr David McGrath in liaising with the Health Service Executive (HSE) to arrange having another vaccination centre on campus in February.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**



**(ii) HEA Bill, 2022**

The Provost advised that she, the Registrar and the Secretary to the College are to meet with the Fellows later in the week to discuss the HEA Bill 2022 and that it is planned to issue an all staff communication to help keep colleagues up to date on the matter. She acknowledged the significant work being carried out by the Secretary to the College and in particular his work on liaising with the Irish Universities Association (IUA) in regards to proposed amendments to the Bill.

The Secretary to the College advised that the Bill is scheduled to progress to the Second Stage in the Dáil later in the week.

**BD/21-22/144 Visitors**

The Board received the verbal update from the Secretary to the College.

The Secretary to the College, in response to a query from a Board member, advised that the Visitor system can be very helpful in resolving internal disputes and often avoids the need for external legal proceedings.

**BD/21-22/145 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 15 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/146 Any Other Urgent Business**

There were no other items of urgent business.

**SECTION B****BD/21-22/147 Board Business**

- (i) The Board noted the callover updated to 1 December 2021.
- (ii) The Board noted the outcomes from the meetings of 1 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/148 Audit Committee**

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 5 October 2021.

**BD/21-22/149 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 28 July 2021.

**BD/21-22/150 Engagement Advisory Group**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 14 October 2021.

**BD/21-22/151 Equality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of 30 September 2021, 10 November 2021 and 13 December 2021.

The Chair of the Equality Committee noted the importance of the work of the Scholars at Risk in respect of a Scholar supported by the University and also the need for EDI to be fully embedded in all aspects of College.

Following comments from a number of Board members, it was noted that further consideration is to be given to further ways of eliminating period poverty for students and staff.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Secretary to the College advised that corrections to committee meeting minutes should be made directly to the Secretary of the relevant committee at the time the minutes are circulated to the Committee.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**BD/21-22/152 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 27 September 2021.

**SECTION C**

**BD/21-22/153 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by Council on 15 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/154 Sealings**

The Board noted the Sealings (attached as Appendix 1 to this minute).

**This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.**

**BD/21-22/155 Board Business Approved by Written Procedure – Scholarship Examinations Contingency Plan**

The Board noted that the enclosed memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 10 December 2021 was approved by the Board via written procedure on 14 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/156 Head of School**

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor Blanaid Daly as Head of School of Dental Science from 1 January 2022 to end of Trinity term 2026.

**BD/21-22/157 Appointment of Director of the Science Gallery (Interim)**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 19 January 2022.

**BD/21-22/158 School of Medicine Studentships 2021/22**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School of Medicine dated 10 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/159 Membership of Committee of Board (Coiste na Gaeilge)**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar dated 20 January 2022.

**BD/21-22/160 Associated Companies – Directors' Reports**

The Board noted and approved Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 19 January 2022.

**BD/21-22/161 The H.O. White Memorial Lecture 2022 (Ref: Calendar Part 1)**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of English dated 16 December 2021.

**BD/21-22/162 Award of Degree *Ad Eundem Gradum***

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar dated 25 January 2022.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Signed: .....

Date: .....