

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting 16 September 2020

This meeting was conducted remotely using the Zoom application and was hosted in the Yeats Room.

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor J Barkhoff), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Registrar (Professor B Tangney), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor K Ahmad, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Mr K Byrne, Ms J Donoghue, Professor D Faas, Mr D Grouse, Mr E Hand, Professor R A Kenny, Ms L Keogh, Professor R McManus, Ms M O'Connor, Professor D R Phelan, Professor L Roe, Ms G Scanlon, Professor A Seery, Professor F Sheerin, Professor John Walsh.
- Apologies* Ms S Farrell, Professor K McTiernan, Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane).
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
- (by invitation)* Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

SECTION A

BD/20-21/001 Statements of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised that he had received a statement of potential conflict of interest from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer in relation to items C.20 Resignation of Directorships and C.21 Financial Signatories. Having discussed the matter with the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, the Secretary to the College proposed, and it was agreed, that the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer would leave the meeting for discussion on these items.

BD/20-21/002 Declaration by New Members

The Provost welcomed the new Board members to their first meeting of the Board.

At the invitation of the Provost the new members of the Board made the Statutory Declarations as required by the 2010 Consolidated Statutes. The new members of the Board also introduced themselves to the Board.

BD/20-21/003 Matters Arising

There were no matters arising.

BD/20-21/004 Provost's Report

The Provost provided Board members with an update on the following items:

(i) Covid-19 Pandemic

The Provost advised Board members of the governance structures which had been established in response to the Covid-19 Pandemic.

He then invited the Chairs of the relevant sub-groups to give updates to the Board.

- **Emergency Financial Management Group**

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised Board members that this Group is meeting weekly to discuss the financial impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic on the University. He informed Board members that allowing for increased Government funding as announced, the financial impact may not be as severe as originally forecasted in the worst case scenario and that the Group was optimistic that the level of projected initial financial costs in that scenario may not be realised.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that the Group was closely monitoring student registration numbers and making plans in respect of budgets for the current academic year, with budget guidelines to be finalised in the coming weeks.

In respect of meeting the costs incurred as a result of the Pandemic, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that Trinity will receive some financial support from Government funds and that financing options were being explored. He concluded by noting that while there is a lot of work ongoing, the coming weeks will be critical in respect of financial planning.

- **Recruitment Sub-Group**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer summarised the membership of this Group and provided Board members with an overview of the work of this Group to date. He advised the Board that very strong and convincing business cases had been submitted to the Group for consideration with the majority of posts approved being renewal or replacement posts. Overall, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the number of staffing requests had significantly decreased in the previous weeks.

- **Trinity Futures Group**

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation summarised the membership of this Group for Board members. She advised that the Group is preparing a discussion paper focusing on such matters as remote working and associated supports, online education and digital adaptation and a possible remote working hub.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation also advised that it is likely that several new working groups would need to be established to assist with the implementation of any agreed recommendations arising from the work of the Group and the discussion paper.

- **Phased Resumption of Activities on Campus Group**

The Provost, as Chair of this Group, provided Board members with an update on some of the decisions recently taken by the Group. This included the introduction of a pilot Covid-19 screening programme for residents in Trinity accommodation. He noted his particular thanks to Professor Orla Sheils and Dr David McGrath for leading out on this initiative.

In addition, the Provost informed the Board of the plan to introduce designated student breakout spaces on the campus which students could book for use should they have time in between teaching while on the campus. The support of the Presidents of the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union for this initiative was acknowledged.

He also noted that the Phased Resumption of Teaching Sub-Group was nearing the end of its work, with timetables being published and as much face to face teaching planned where possible to do so.

(ii) Strategic Projects

The Provost advised that he is continuing to work on key strategic projects including the E3 Research Institute (E3RI) and the TTEC Development Project. He advised Board members that the Strategic Assessment Report for the Trinity St James's Cancer Institute had been submitted.

The Provost also advised Board members that a new display case for the Book of Kells exhibition was now in place and that the project was progressing in respect of securing planning permission.

The importance of securing additional and continued philanthropic and public funding for these projects was noted.

(iii) Strategic Plan 2020 - 2025

The Provost shared a table summarising the nine goals of the Strategic Plan with the Board members. He spoke to each Goal noting the impact of the Pandemic on each and advising Board members how each goal is being reviewed in light of the current environment. He noted that while the Pandemic raised challenges for some of the goals it also provided new impetus for others.

(iv) Travel

The Provost, noting that travel was not possible at this time due to the Covid-19 Pandemic, informed Board members that he was using online platforms to continue to engage with alumni and supporters of the University. He advised that a meeting of the Provost's Council had taken place online on 4 September 2020. The Provost also advised that a new initiative; the Provost's Salon, had also been established which saw a series of remote meetings being held in the last two months.

It was noted that the Provost is to bring his work programme for the academic year 2020/21 to a future meeting of the Board.

In response to comments from Board members, the Provost noted the importance of ensuring reassuring and supportive communications to the College community. The significant contributions of all members of the community in maintaining the key activities of the University was acknowledged. The importance of all staff being supported to work effectively together was also noted.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of the potential tightening of restrictions in Dublin, the Provost advised that the Phased Resumption of Activities on Campus Group is monitoring the situation closely. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the Irish Universities Association was seeking urgent clarification as to what the implications of tighter restrictions for the Higher Education Sector would be.

In response to comments from a Board member, it was noted that any changes in socio-economic diversity in the student population as a result of the Pandemic should be kept under review.

The Provost, in response to queries from a Board member in respect of the screening programme, provided a summary of the associated costs, and the value of having medical professional colleagues to help inform the decision-making process was acknowledged.

BD/20-21/005 Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus (TTEC) Business Case Review

The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer and Project Sponsor, Dr Diarmuid O'Brien; Interim Project Director, Mr Jon Milward; Mr Ben Warner, Assistant Director, EY-DKM Economic Advisory Services (EY) and Ms Orla McKiernan, Analyst, EY, joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.

The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer provided an update on the project with reference to his presentation dated September 2020 which had been circulated in advance. He advised Board members that the submission of a Strategic Assessment Report (SAR) was a key document for any large capital project in respect of ascertaining a level of Government support. The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer also advised that this SAR is seeking approval to proceed to development of a Preliminary Business Case for the E3RI and Innovation Campus development project that will catalyse the establishment of the Grand Canal Innovation District on the basis of a significant Government investment in the E3RI. He also provided the Board with an overview of the vision for the new campus and governance of the project.

Mr Warner, then invited the Board's attention to his presentation dated 16 September 2020 which had been circulated in advance. He advised Board members that the business case for the project had been reviewed in light of the Covid-19 Pandemic. Mr Warner advised that three scenarios had been developed and outlined each to the Board members. He also summarised the risks to the project in the current challenging environment where there are many uncertainties.

The Provost thanked Dr O'Brien and Mr Warner and opened the item for discussion.

In response to a comment from a Board member, Dr O'Brien clarified that the opportunities arising from the European Regional Development Funding are to be explored in respect of this project. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer also clarified the three main funding streams underpinning the project as follows:

- (i) Government funding
- (ii) Philanthropy
- (iii) The value inherent in the site.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to comments from a Board member, it was agreed that the Office of the Secretary to the College would co-ordinate a visit to the site for Board members. The importance of good governance for the project was also acknowledged and the Provost clarified that as the project progresses the Board will be asked to approve the appropriate governance structures.

In response to comments from Board members in respect of the timing of this project and the constantly changing environment that the Pandemic presents, it was noted that the review had considered the impact of the Pandemic on the demand for office accommodation. The Provost noted that the submission of the SAR does not commit the University to proceeding with the full project and that it would enable applications for European and Government funding to be made.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of the various stages of the project and what the implications would be of a change after submission of the SAR, the Provost noted the options contained in the Report, noting that it is envisaged that the development of the E3 Research Institute (E3RI) would proceed at a minimum.

Some Board members, noting a concern in respect of the potential demand for office accommodation, supported the proposal to submit the SAR and the importance of maximising funding opportunities was acknowledged.

Arising from the previous Board meeting on 24 June 2020 (Action/Decision 294.05), the list of the parties currently working on or contracted for this project had been circulated and was noted. In response to comments from a Board member, it was agreed to bring further analysis of the spending to date on the project to the next Board meeting.

Commenting in respect of financial commitments, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that any future increase in spend on the project would be brought to the Board for approval.

The Provost concluded the discussion on the item and the Board approved the submission of the SAR.

The Provost thanked Dr O'Brien, Mr Milward, Mr Warner and Ms McKiernan who left the meeting at this point.

Action/Decision

005.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Chief Innovation and Enterprise officer, dated 10 September 2020.

005.02. The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 9 September 2020.

005.03 The Board approved the submission of the Strategic Assessment Report.

005.04 The Board noted the Business Case Review Report as prepared by Ernst and Young (EY).

005.05 It was agreed that the Office of the Secretary to the College would co-ordinate a visit to the site for Board members.

005.06 It was agreed to bring further analysis of the spending to date on the project to the next Board meeting.

BD/20-21/006 Printing House Square Project Update

Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly; Head of Capital Projects, Mr Greg Power; Independent Monitor, Ms Denise Kennedy and Chair of the Steering Committee, Mr Joe Linders joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Professor O'Kelly provided an update on the project to Board members with reference to his presentation dated 16 September 2020, which had been circulated in advance. He invited the Board's attention to some significant challenges for the project which included resource shortages and delays to the programme. It was noted that a revised schedule of works had also been prepared to reflect lower levels of productivity due to the impact of Covid-19.

Professor O'Kelly, noting that the Project remains within budget, advised Board members that a full project update is to be brought to the Finance Committee in the coming weeks.

Ms Kennedy, with reference to her memorandum dated 8 September 2020, which had been circulated in advance, provided an update to the Board on the following items:

- Budget;
- Programme;
- Quality;
- Health & Safety;
- Team Performance.

In conclusion, Ms Kennedy advised the Board that the uncertainty regarding the programme may be frustrating for those involved and noted the importance of continuing efforts to resolve any resourcing issues. She noted that despite the challenges around programme, the budget contingency was sufficient for this stage of a project and the quality being achieved is commendable to those involved in the design and those monitoring and executing the works.

Mr Linders, noting the significant delay to the programme, provided assurances to the Board in respect of the budget and the quality of the works being undertaken. The importance of ensuring that all compliance aspects were adhered to was noted.

The Provost thanked Professor O'Kelly, Mr Power, Ms Kennedy and Mr Linders for the update, and they left the meeting at this point.

The Provost, in summarising the discussion, noted that it is envisaged that the project will further progress with the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation scheduled to meet with senior personnel representing the contractor and it was noted that there is a Project Board in place tasked with completing this project.

Action/Decision

006.01 The Board noted and discussed a report on the Printing House Square Project and the memorandum from the Independent Monitor dated 8 September 2020.

BD/20-21/007 Quality Review of Financial Services Division

Pro-Provost for the Review, Professor Linda Hogan joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.

The Provost welcomed Professor Hogan to the meeting noting that she had acted as Pro-Provost for the purposes of the review. Professor Hogan introduced this item providing Board members with the context of the review which had been conducted in January 2020 noting that the review provided the Financial Services Division (FSD) with a timely opportunity for critical self-assessment.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer with reference to his presentation dated 16 September 2020, which had been circulated provided Board members with overview of the review noting the seven key themes across which recommendations were made.

He concluded by summarising the next steps in the process which included the development of an implementation plan based on report recommendations which would come to a future meeting of the Board.

In response to suggestions from Board members, it was noted that the establishment of a user-group to facilitate academic and other user input into financial processes and systems is to be explored by the FSD.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Responding to comments from Board members, Professor Hogan advised that the Financial Services Division is there as a support for academic planning, particularly in terms of coherence and ensuring that Schools get timely financial information. She also noted that FSD plays an integral part in the development and financial management of capital projects.

Responding to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, who welcomed the report and the recommendations within, noted that he is Chair of the Planning Group which works closely with the Treasurer/Chief Academic Officer and his team to achieve cohesion and a close integration of planning and finance.

A Board member suggested that it would be beneficial for the FSD to input into the Induction programme for all new Principal Investigators and it was agreed that this should be actioned by the FSD team.

The Provost closed the item, noting the importance of ensuring collaborative activity between the academic community and FSD. He also noted that an implementation plan will come to a future meeting of the Board.

The Provost thanked Professor Hogan for her contribution to the review and she left the meeting at this point.

Action/Decision

007.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum and presentation from the Quality Office on behalf of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 7 September 2020.

007.02 The Board noted the Report from the Quality Assurance Review of the Financial Services Division and the response from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, Mr Peter Reynolds and the Pro-Provost for the Review, Professor Linda Hogan.

- BD/20-21/008 Appointment of the Provost: Establishment of Steering, Interview and Appeals Committees**
The Registrar, with reference to his memorandum dated 11 September 2020, which had been circulated, introduced the item. He advised Board members that in accordance with the 2010 Consolidated Statutes (Chapter on the Provost, Sections 6, 7 and 8), the proposed membership of the Steering Committee, Interview Committee and Appeals Committee was now presented for approval.

Action/Decision

008.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 11 September 2020 and the membership of the three committees as contained within.

- BD/20-21/009 2010 Consolidated Statutes: Proposed changes to the Chapter on Provost and Schedule 1 to Chapter on the Provost**
The Registrar introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 8 September 2020, and his presentation which had been circulated in advance. He advised Board members that in light of the current Pandemic and public health advice, it was now timely to plan for a scenario in which a physical ballot and count would not be possible as part of the appointment of the Provost process. As such, the Statutes and Schedules Working Party had proposed amendments to the Statutes that would see provisions whereby an election may be conducted through electronic means.

The Registrar advised that he had made enquiries with the preferred supplier and had received a full demonstration which was summarised for Board members in his presentation. As such, he assured the Board that the process could be conducted in keeping with the provisions as set out in the Statutes including successive rounds of ballots.

The Registrar advised that planning for an in-person ballot and count would continue and it was noted that the timeline for seeking the Assent of the Fellows would be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

Action/Decision

009.01 The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 8 September 2020 and the amendments to the Chapter on Provost and Schedule 1 to Chapter on the Provost as

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

009.02 It was noted that the timeline for seeking the Assent of the Fellows would be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

BD/20-21/010 Board Elections 2020: Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency

The Secretary to the College introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 14 September 2020, which had been circulated in advance. He advised the Board that further to the decision to postpone the Elections for the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff constituency to Michaelmas Term 2020, due to the impact of the Pandemic on the holding of a paper-based election for that constituency, a detailed plan for the holding of the election for this constituency, including a timeline, was now before the Board for approval.

The Secretary to the College noted that the usual practice of posting nomination and voting papers to the College addresses of members of this constituency may not be suitable for some staff who are not currently physically attending their place of work on a regular basis. It is therefore proposed to contact the members of this constituency in advance of the call for nominations and in advance of voting, by email to the members offering the members their choice of the following three options:

- Nomination and voting papers to be sent to a work address;
- Nomination and voting papers to be sent to an alternative address, such as a home address;
- Nomination and voting papers to be collected from and submitted to a "Polling' Station" on campus.

In respect of those staff who do not have a Trinity email address or who do not regularly use email, the communication will also be sent to the Heads of the relevant areas to ask them to communicate onwards.

Action/Decision

010.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 14 September 2020 and the detailed plan and timeline for the conduct of the 2020 Elections to the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency as contained within.

Professor Alyn Stacey left the meeting at this point.

BD/20-21/011 Visitors

The Board received the verbal update from the Secretary to the College.

BD/20-21/012 Any Other Urgent Business

(i) Conference Travel Scheme – Amended due to Covid-19

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that due to the Covid-19 Pandemic, it is proposed that the Conference Travel Scheme be amended so that for the academic year 2020/21 the funding may be used by staff to purchase specific IT equipment to facilitate working remotely.

Action/Decision

012.01. The Board approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 15 September 2020 and the proposed amendment to the Travel Conference Scheme as contained within.

(ii) Staff Retirements

The Board noted the members of staff who were due to retire at the end of September and the Provost, on behalf of the College and the Board, having named each retiree individually, thanked them for their much-valued service and contribution to College.

SECTION B

BD/20-21/013 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Callover updated to 17 June 2020 and 24 June 2020.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meetings of 17 June 2020 and 24 June 2020.

BD/20-21/014 Estates Policy Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meetings of:

- (i) 6 March 2020
- (ii) 5 June 2020
- (iii) 1 September 2020.

BD/20-21/015 Finance Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 15 June 2020. In relation to the TTEC Pre-Development Project (FN/19-20/97) and the property swap, the Treasurer/Chief Financial officer advised that the sub-committee as provided for in Action 97.02 had convened to oversee the completion of the transaction.

SECTION C**BD/20-21/016 Administrative Procedures in the Summer Session**

The Board noted the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 8 September 2020 including:

- (i) Annual Officer: Associate Dean of Undergraduate Common Architecture
It was noted that Professor Graeme Murdock is taking up the Associate Dean of Undergraduate Common Architecture Officership.
- (ii) Board Elections 2020
- (iii) Membership of the Foundation Scholarship – Central Scholarship Committee
- (iv) Dr Eithne Walls Memorial Scholarship
- (v) Proposal to Change Name of Discipline of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
- (vi) Research Ethics Committee for Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science
- (vii) Trinity Ball 2021 Update
- (viii) KPMG Prize
- (ix) Administrative Arrangements in the Summer Session
- (x) Assistant Junior Deans 2020/21
- (xi) Appointment of Judicial Visitor
- (xii) Early Retirement
- (xiii) Nominations for Appointment.

BD/20-21/017 Gender Representation among Fellows

The Board noted the memorandum from the Equality Officer dated 2 September 2020.

BD/20-21/018 Membership of Committees of Board and Council

The Board noted and approved the Memoranda from the Registrar dated

- (i) 10 September 2020;
- (ii) 15 September 2020.

BD/20-21/019 Appointment of Trustee to Marino Institute of Education (MIE)

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 9 September 2020.

BD/20-21/020 TTEC Project – Further Information Request

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 9 September 2020.

Mr Reynolds left the meeting for the next 2 items.

BD/20-21/021 Resignation of Directorships

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 9 September 2020.

BD/20-21/022 Financial Signatories

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 7 September 2020.

Mr Reynolds re-joined the meeting at this point.

BD/20-21/023 Associated Companies – Directors’ Reports

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 9 September 2020.

BD/20-21/024 Intermission of Non-Foundation Scholarship

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies dated 27 August 2020.

BD/20-21/025 School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2019/20

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School of Medicine dated 9 September 2020.

SECTION D

BD/20-21/026 Nominations for Appointment

The Board noted and approved the Nominations for Appointment.

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed:

Date: