



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

**Minutes of Board Meeting 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2020**

*This meeting was conducted remotely using the Zoom application and was hosted in the Provost's Library.*

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor J Barkhoff), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Ms L Beston, Professor L Brennan, Mr K Byrne, Ms J Donoghue, Professor D Faas, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Ms A Leen, Ms N McCay, Professor K McTiernan, Professor R Moss, Professor B O'Connell, Professor E O'Halpin, Ms S Oye, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor F Sheerin.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor A Burke.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

**SECTION A**

**BD/19-20/208 Statements of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflict of interest had been received.

*The Provost, noting that Mr Byrne had attended the Board meeting on Trinity Monday, welcomed Mr Byrne to his first standard meeting of the Board.*

**BD/19-20/209 Minutes**

The Board approved the minutes of the meeting of 25 March 2020 subject to two minor amendments as follows:

- (i) the minutes are to note that Professor Alyn Stacey was available for the last meeting but could not join it due to technical reasons, and
- (ii) a title in the Nominations for Appointment is to be corrected to read 'School Administrative Manager'.

**BD/19-20/210 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

The following items were raised under Matters Arising:

**(i) BD/19-20/179 Trinity Endowment Fund for year ended 30 September 2019**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, in response to a query raised by a Board member at the Board meeting on 25 March 2020, provided the Board with a clarification in respect of the Endowment Fund and cash reserves. Mr Reynolds advised Board members that the Investment Committee takes a long-term approach to investments and that there were no emerging concerns in respect of the onset of the Covid-19 Pandemic. He also clarified that the Endowment fund has as its main objective the generation of funds.

**(ii) BD/19-20/184 Safe Zone Application**

The Secretary to the College provided an update to the Board and advised that a detailed Data Protection Impact Assessment (DPIA), which contained a review of data protection, IT security, contractual elements and a risk register associated with the processing of personal data for the purposes of SafeZone functionality had been conducted by the Data Protection Officer prior to Board approval.

Subsequent to SafeZone implementation Trinity was contacted by the Data Protection Commission regarding the application's implementation and queries were raised, including whether a DPIA had been conducted prior to rollout. A response, which included the DPIA, was provided to the Commission on 26 March 2020. There has been no further communication received from the Commission since this date on the subject of SafeZone.

A follow-up review of SafeZone functionality was conducted on 17 April 2020. Following this review, the Secretary to the College advised that the Data Protection Officer remains satisfied that the processing of personal data by Trinity for the purposes of SafeZone implementation is in accordance with the measures as set out in the DPIA and in compliance with data protection legislation.

Moreover, there have been no issues or complaints received during the first month of implementation. Furthermore, the Secretary to the College had been advised that no health data has been processed via the application and that a large number of individuals have registered with SafeZone, with a smaller number using the application each day. A second review of functionality and compliance will be conducted during June 2020.

In response to a query from a Board member, it was noted that the use of the application is voluntary. Staff ID cards and letters of authorisation are being checked at entrances to the campus.

Following comments from a Board member, the Provost noted the value of using the SafeZone application at this time.

**(iii) BD/19-20/185 Revised Senior Academic Promotions Procedure**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board members that the Emergency Financial Management Group had commenced work and is examining the case for proceeding with the next round of Senior Academic Promotions. A proposal on this will be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

He further advised that it is recommended that the Junior Academic Progressions should proceed but that the Accelerated Advancement process be paused at this time.

**BD/19-20/211 Provost's Report**

The Provost provided a report to the Board under the following headings:

**(i) Continuation of activities**

The Provost advised the Board that many activities had been progressed during the weeks of the closure of the campus due to the Pandemic. These included a meeting of the Council, a meeting of the Board Review Working Group, a continuation of work on the recruitment of

Chair Professor proposals and a meeting of the Campaign Cabinet. The Provost noted that specific and considered thought would need to be given to the impact of Covid-19 on the planned capital strategic projects such as the refurbishment of the Old Library, the E3 Research Institute and the Grand Canal Innovation District.

**(ii) Seanad Éireann election**

It was noted that the Seanad Éireann Elections had been conducted with the following Senators being re-elected to the Seanad:

**Ivana Bacik;**  
**David Norris;**  
**Lynn Ruane.**

The Provost extended his thanks to the Deputy Returning Officer, Ms Leona Coady and all those who assisted with the administration and oversight of the election process in the unusual circumstances.

**(iii) Covid-19**

The Provost advised that he had conducted a call with residents in College (via Zoom), with another scheduled for later that day, to keep communication open in these difficult times.

With respect to Commencement ceremonies, the Registrar advised that the first remote Commencement ceremony had taken place on 7 April 2020 where 532 students were conferred with their degrees in absentia. A special Commencement ceremony for medical students is also scheduled for 28 April 2020.

The Provost also advised of the management structures that have been put in place in response to Covid-19 as follows:

- **Major Emergency Management Team (Reports to EOG)**

Chair: Secretary to the College as nominee of the Provost

The Major Emergency Management Team (MEMT) invoked by the Provost under the Emergency Management Plan is required to manage and provide direction and support to all areas of the university during an emergency.

- **Emergency Financial Management Group (Reports to EOG)**

Chair: Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer

The overall objective of this group is to develop implementation plans to address the financial impacts of Covid19 on University revenues, costs and cashflow.

- **Trinity Futures Group (Reports to EOG)**

Chair: Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation

The purpose of this group is to develop a discussion paper for EOG to consider topics such as Trinity's future approach to remote working, online learning and strategic projects in a post-Covid era. The Bursar briefly advised the meeting on the work to be undertaken by the Group.

- **Recruitment Sub-Group (Reports to EOG)**

Chair: Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer

This group was established to make decisions on recruitment and staffing, in the context of the decision of EOG that a hiring freeze would be put in place with immediate effect with a process in place to approve limited exceptions.

In response to queries and comments raised by some members about student admissions in 2020/21, the Provost outlined that a reduction in international students would result in a significant reduction in income for the University. The Provost expressed his great appreciation for the huge efforts being made by staff and students to continue activities, especially assessments and examinations, during the Pandemic.

#### **BD/19-20/212 Board Review Working Group Update**

*Mr Dermot McCarthy, Chair of the Board Review Working Group and Ms Sinead Ryan, Project Advisor joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.*

Mr McCarthy introduced this item with reference to his presentation dated 22 April 2020 and the memorandum dated 16 April 2020, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an update on the work of the Working Group to date noting that a revised wording on the role and responsibilities of the Board was now being proposed. In line with its workplan, recent Working Group discussions have focused on the desirable skills and competencies for the Board.

Mr McCarthy then summarised the proposed competency framework for the Trinity Board, which was informed by such frameworks in place elsewhere, and invited contributions from Board members in respect of selection systems for external and internal Board members. He also gave an overview of the recommendations of the Group in respect of the work of the Board, agenda-setting, the role of committees and frequency of meetings. Mr McCarthy concluded his presentation by noting that the next steps would be for the Group to consider outstanding issues from the terms of reference, including size and composition of the future Board.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Provost clarified that adoption of the recommendations of the Working Group could require changes to the Consolidated Statutes 2010 and noted that it was important for Board to discuss and agree any changes before wider College engagement. Any proposals agreed by the Board in that regard would involve further consultation in College.

Responding to comments from Board members about its relevance in a University context, Mr McCarthy advised that having a competency framework in place could bring many benefits to the work of the Board. He noted that a system of internal selection involving a Nomination Committee could have several merits and that a similar system is in use for the election of the Provost. Mr McCarthy also clarified that a reduction in the number of Board meetings was proposed, alongside an agenda with a strategic focus, with a view to optimising and reducing demands on members' time and thereby potentially increasing the pool of people who may be in a position to serve on the Board.

Some Board members expressed support for and acknowledged the benefits of introducing a competency-based framework. The importance of representation, diversity, self-governance and collegiality was noted and a number of members noted the benefits in maintaining the election process and in continuing to seek views of the electorate. It was suggested in that context that a competency framework agreed by Board could usefully inform the electorate.

The unique aspects of Trinity's governance and, in particular, its legal structure, were also acknowledged and some concern was expressed regarding the proposal to amend current practices.

Mr McCarthy welcomed the feedback from Board members noting that the objective of the Working Group is to propose a process that will enable the Board to perform its roles and responsibilities in the most effective manner possible.

Some Board members expressed reservations to the proposal to introduce a Nominations Committee for the selection of internal members, but it was noted that such a committee could be of benefit in the selection of external members. Reflecting on comments from Board members, Mr McCarthy advised that further consideration would be given to the size of the Board and the balance of membership.

The Provost closed the item thanking Mr McCarthy and Ms Ryan for their contribution to the work of the Working Group.

#### **Action/Decision**

**212.01** The Board considered the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, the Chair of the Board Review Working Group and the Project Advisor, dated 16 April 2020 and approved the proposed revised wording on the Role and Responsibilities of the Board.

**212.02** It was noted that the Competency Framework and proposals in respect of the selection of internal and external Board members are to be further developed and brought to a future meeting of the Board.

*Mr McCarthy and Ms Ryan left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/19-20/213 Project Update-Printing House Square**

*Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly and the Deputy Head of Capital Projects, Mr Greg Power, joined the meeting via Zoom. The Independent Monitor, Ms Denise Kennedy, joined the meeting by phone.*

Professor O'Kelly introduced this item with reference to his presentation dated 22 April 2020, which had been circulated. He advised Board members that further to the announcement by the Government regarding restrictions to reduce the spread of COVID-19, the construction site was shut down on Saturday 28 March 2020. The site was made safe, secure and as weather-tight as possible and was continuously under surveillance.

Professor O'Kelly informed Board members that consultancy services works are continuing during the shutdown period including regular scheduled conference/video meetings in place to progress all design and programming issues and also advised of the status of the project up to March 2020. He also provided a financial update including delays being experienced due to Covid-19 and the impact on programme and budget of decisions taken by the Government. It was noted that this matter is also being actively discussed with the contractor.

The Independent Monitor provided the Board with an update on the project with reference to

her memorandum dated 10 April 2020, which had been circulated. Her update focused on budget, programme, quality, health and safety and team performance.

To conclude Ms Kennedy advised that the impact of the COVID-19 outbreak on the project, from both a commercial and programme perspective, is still unknown, so the focus for now needs to be on progressing outstanding design issues so these have no impact on programme when works do re-start. She also advised of the importance of concluding any negotiations with the contractor to bring a level of certainty regarding costs and the completion date.

In response to a query from a Board member, Mr Power clarified the position around the financial status of contractors in the construction sector.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of a likely completion date, Professor O’Kelly advised that when operations resume a reduction in productivity may be observed and Ms Kennedy noted that there are presently a lot of unknowns and that financial forecasting and scenario planning will be required. Professor O’Kelly further advised that a completion date that coincides with the incoming first year student intake is preferable at this point, but is currently unknown.

#### **Action/Decision**

**213.01** The Board considered and discussed the update on the Printing House Square Project from the Project Sponsor, and the memorandum from the Independent Monitor dated 10 April 2020.

*Professor O’Kelly, Mr Power and Ms Kennedy left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/19-20/214 Public Affairs and Communications Strategy**

*Mr Tom Molloy, Director of Public Affairs & Communications joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.*

Mr Molloy introduced this item with reference to his document dated 15 April 2020 and his presentation dated 22 April 2020, which had been circulated. He thanked colleagues across the University for their input in to and engagement with the development of the Strategy and also extended his thanks to the Secretary to the College for his guidance on the Strategy.

Mr Molloy provided Board members with the rationale behind the development of the Strategy including the links to the new Strategic Plan 2020-2025 and other strategies such as Global Relations, Research Excellence and Estates. Mr Molloy then referenced the three pillars of the Strategy and summarised how each would translate in to practice across the University. In particular, he noted the changing communications landscape and the increasing move to online content and use of technology and social media. He advised Board members that the Strategy endeavours to bring all key communications staff in the University together informed by the expertise in Trinity to make better documents, articles and videos with a simplified and branded message.

Mr Molloy also informed Board members that it is envisaged to introduce a new intranet system by the end of the year in addition to doing significant upgrades and improvements to the main Trinity website, which would make it easier to refresh and upload new content.

*Professor Moss left the meeting at this point.*

Responding to comments from a Board member, Mr Molloy clarified that it is the intention to work with all relevant staff, students, clubs and societies across the University to ensure that communications are accurate and correctly branded with a unified message, while supporting the need for open discussion and debate of ideas..

The Registrar welcomed the specific highlighting of Sustainability and Civic Engagement under Pillar 3 in the Strategy. She also suggested revisions in respect of Sustainability (under section 3.4.10) and Local Community and Civic Engagement (section 3.5). The Registrar proposed that to strengthen this part of the Strategy it could be linked with the work of the Civic Engagement Officer and Engagement Advisory Group.

In response to comments from Board members in respect of inclusivity and public perception, Mr Molloy advised that elements of the Strategy will make it easier to make changes to content on the website while also assisting with delivery of a clear and simple style of communication. The importance of the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion and the Athena Swan initiative were also acknowledged as was the recent very high ranking of Trinity for gender and equality.

The Secretary to the College, read out some comments of support for the Strategy from Professor Burke, who due to prior commitments, was unable to attend the meeting. The Board noted that internal communications will become increasingly more important over the next few years if Trinity decides to make considerable use of remote working. With a much lower level of face to face contact, internal communications will become a major source of information for colleagues about all matters relating to work and the organisation. A proposed amendment to the reported number of marketing staff in the Trinity Business School was also acknowledged.

In response to further comments from other members in relation to measuring the impact and influence of our communications, it was agreed that while there were many good elements of the Strategy, some revisions to the Strategy were required in the light of the discussion and it is to be brought back to a future meeting of the Board. It was also noted that a proposed launch would need to be rescheduled accordingly. The Provost emphasised the importance of following the approved governance structures and the important role of the Board in the approvals process was acknowledged.

#### **Action/Decision**

**214.01** The Strategy is to be revised and brought to a future meeting of the Board for approval.

*Professor O'Halpin left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/19-20/215 Institutional Quality Review – Institutional Profile**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer Introduced this item with reference to his memorandum and presentation dated 15 April 2020, and the accompanying Institutional profile dated April 2020 which had been circulated. He advised the Board that the Institutional Review of Trinity is scheduled to take place from the 23-27 November 2020 noting that at this stage there has been no indication from QQI that the timing of the review will be impacted by the current COVID-19 crisis.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board members that the purpose of the Institutional Profile (IP) is to provide context and institutional-level data to the Review Team to frame their approach to the review and the review report. He noted that the IP has drawn on existing College-level publications such as the Provost's Annual Report for approved institutional data, and the various chapters of the document have been approved by relevant College Officers.

It was also noted that the IP was approved by the Quality Committee and the Institutional Self-Evaluation Team on the 2 April 2020 and by Council on the 8 April 2020 and the contribution of the Quality Office team was acknowledged.

#### **Action/Decision**

**215.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 15 April 2020 and the accompanying Institutional Profile, dated April 2020.

#### **BD/19-20/216 Visitors**

The Board received the verbal update from the Secretary to the College.

#### **BD/19-20/217 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 8 April 2020. It was noted that Council had amended its recent decision regarding the delegation of authority to include a possible delegation to the Dean of Graduate Studies.

#### **BD/19-20/218 Any Other Urgent Business**

There were no other items of urgent business.

### **SECTION A.2**

#### **BD/19-20/219 Revised Web Policies and Cookie Policy**

This item was deferred.

### **SECTION B**

#### **BD/19-20/220 Board Business**

##### **(i) Callover**

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 25 March 2020.

##### **(ii) Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 25 March 2020.

#### **BD/19-20/221 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 26 November 2019.

#### **BD/19-20/222 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of the meetings of:

- (i) 4 November 2019;
- (ii) 3 February 2020, and Appendices:
  - a. Revised Old Library Exhibitions Policy
  - b. Revised Consistent Approach to Labelling Policy



**SECTION C****BD/19-20/223 Pro-Chancellors of the University (see BD/19-20/117 of 18 December 2019)**

The Board noted that the following had been elected by the Senate as Pro-Chancellors of the University of Dublin:

- (i) Shane Patricia Ann Allwright M.A., M.S.P.H. (CALIF.), PH.D., HON. F.F.P.H.M.I., Fellow Emeritus
- (ii) Ignatius Thomas McGovern B.SC. (BELF.), M.A., PH.D. (BELF.), F.INST. P., Fellow Emeritus

**BD/19-20/224 Extension of Annual Officerships**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 15 April 2020.

**BD/19-20/225 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 8 April 2020.

**BD/19-20/226 Prizes and Other Awards****(i) Updated Wording for Music Prizes**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of Creative Arts dated 3 April 2020.

**(ii) Trinity Joint Honours (TJH) students to be eligible for Two-Subject Moderatorship (TSM) prizes**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the TJH & TSM Course Director, dated 11 March 2020.

**BD/19-20/227 Scholarship - Intermission**

This item was deferred.

Following discussion, it was agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate are to conduct a review of Intermission of Scholarship and bring proposals in respect of Intermission to a future meeting of the Board.

**BD/19-20/228 Board Membership - Students' Union**

The Board noted that the following have been elected, and will serve as members of the Board of the College for the academic year 2020-2021:

President – Eoin Hand  
Welfare Officer – Leah Keogh  
Education Officer - Megan O'Connor

**SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted