



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting 27 February 2019

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Ms A Connolly, Mr J Cunningham, Mr S De Rís, Ms J Donoghue, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Mr J Keogh, Professor R Moss, Professor B O'Connell, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor F Sheerin, Professor A Seery, Mr O Vince Coulter.
- Apologies* Professor K McTiernan, Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler), Deputy Chief Financial Officer (Ms L Ryan).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman).
- (by invitation)* Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

SECTION A

In noting the apologies, the Provost, on behalf of the Board, recorded his condolences to Mr Reynolds on the recent passing of his father.

BD/18-19/146 Statement of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflicts of interest had been received.

BD/18-19/147 Statutory Declaration

At the invitation of the Provost, the new member of the Board, Professor Brian O'Connell, made the Statutory Declaration as required by the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/18-19/148 Minutes

The following amendments were made to the draft minutes of 30 January 2019, which had been circulated:

(i) BD/18-19/120 Provost's Report

An amendment made so that the minute reads as follows:

'Following comments from a Board member in respect of works being conducted on Fellows Square, it was agreed that the Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the contractor conducting the works in relation to the storage of tools and equipment in the vicinity of the sculpture by Alexander Calder there.

Action/Decision 120.01 It was agreed that the Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the contractor conducting works on Fellows Square in relation to the storage of tools and equipment in the vicinity of the sculpture by Alexander Calder there.'

**(ii) BD/18-19/126 Any Other Urgent Business
Outstanding Student Fees Issue**

An amendment made so that the last paragraph reads as follows:

‘Following further queries from Board members, including a query from a Board member on whether the matter should be addressed by the statutory Board, the Chief Operating Officer noted further steps that are being taken to minimise the risk of any possible reoccurrence and noted that the Director of Student Services position had been filled.’

BD/18-19/149 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The following items were raised under matters arising:

(i) BD/18-19/119 Matters Arising from the Minutes

(i) BD/18-19/056 Gender Action Plan - Progress Report

The Secretary to the College advised that in respect to the agreed Equality Review, Professor Jadranka Gvozdanovic, from the University of Heidelberg had been selected as a reviewer and that Professor Gvozdanovic would work with a consultant in organisational structures.

(ii) BD/18-19/121 Brexit Risk Working Group Update

The Board noted that the President of the Students’ Union had been invited to join the Brexit Risk Working Group. It was also noted that the Procurement Office is conducting an exercise to identify UK suppliers and logistic routes to identify alternatives and minimise any potential risks which may arise.

BD/18-19/150 Provost’s Report

This item was deferred until the next meeting of the Board.

Professor Phelan joined the meeting at this point.

BD/18-19/151 Strategic Plan Update

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited the Board’s attention to his memorandum dated 20 February 2019 and the presentation, dated 27 February 2019, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an overview of the Strategic Planning process to date and outlined the proposed Vision, Mission and Values of the new Strategic Plan 2019-2024. He advised the Board that the Pivot Group Chairs were now holding weekly meetings and that a Strategic Planning Away Day is scheduled for 7 March 2019. He also advised that further reports would also be brought to the Board in advance of the draft Strategic Plan being brought to the Board for approval.

Responding to concerns expressed by Board members in respect of the composition of the Pivot Groups, the knowledge and experience of the members as proposed was noted and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the proposed members were not there to represent their respective units but to bring together particular expertise for the good of the whole university. It was also acknowledged that the list of members for each group was not exhaustive and that others could be invited to participate as appropriate.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, responding to queries from Board members, advised that consideration is to be given to student support services in the Plan and clarified some queries

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

in respect of the need to facilitate the University in being able to respond to change in a timely manner.

In response to comments from Board members, it was agreed that further consideration is to be given to the surrounding narrative so that the intended interpretation of the word 'Citizenship' is portrayed in the context of community.

The Provost closed the item thanking Board members for their helpful contributions and useful feedback.

Action/Decision

151.01 The Board received the update from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

BD/18-19/152 Planning Group Report #19

With reference to his memorandum dated 20 February 2019 and to his presentation, dated 27 February 2019, which had been circulated, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer provided the Board with a summary of the five main priorities on which the Planning Group had focused its work over the course of the year. The first being the wider environment and the future planning the university will need to take account of both in terms of demographic projections and the current limited scale of the response to this growth in terms of state funding. The remaining priorities included the support for strategic initiatives, financial and budgetary matters, Employment Control Framework (ECF) staffing levels and progress on the Strategic Plan 2014-19.

In response to queries from Board members, it was noted that discussions are on-going with the Higher Education Authority (HEA) in respect of the ECF and it was noted that a revised framework had been anticipated in 2017, but to date had not been received. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also clarified some of measures being taken internally to facilitate the required growth in staffing levels in order for the University to continue to meet its objectives. Following further comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, acknowledging earlier comments from the Chief Operating Officer, advised that it is proposed, in the first instance, to change the coding of some staff from 'core' funding to 'non-core' funding as appropriate to meet the constraints of the ECF and then to enter in to discussions with the HEA in respect of a removal of the cap on staffing levels as has been applied to the Sector for several years. It was noted that this issue is actively being monitored by the Faculty Deans at Planning Group, and the recoding would have no impact on individuals' salaries or terms of employment.

Responding to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that further consideration is to be given to the long term sustainability of the Science Gallery and that measures are being taken to minimise any potential short-term disruptions to activity.

Action/Decision

152.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 20 February 2019 and the accompanying Planning Group Report #19.

BD/18-19/153 Trinity Business School (TBS) Update

Trinity Business School Project Sponsor, Professor Gerard Lacey; Independent Monitor, Mr Leo Harmon; and Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power attended for this item.

The Board noted the apologies of Mr Mervyn Greene, TBS Steering Group Chair, for this item.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Professor Lacey, with reference to his presentation dated 27 February 2019, which had been circulated, provided the Board with a composite update in respect of this project. He advised the Board that resource difficulties across the construction sector in Dublin are likely to impact on the completion date for the project and that the contracted standard of finish must be adhered to.

Mr Power advised that the catering contractor is preparing to commence on site and is preparing safety information. However, he acknowledged supply chain issues being faced by the construction sector and noted the negative impact this was having on the timely completion of the project.

Mr Harmon, provided Board members with an overview of his Independent Monitor's Report dated 19 February 2019, which had been circulated. He advised the Board that with less than three months to final completion it may be the case that the construction team, supported by the client and design team, needs some added management resource to get the project completed. Mr Harmon advised that the budget for the project remains very tight and echoed the concerns of the team in respect of the supply chain issues being experienced by the Construction Sector.

In response to queries from a Board member in respect of the Sectoral Employment Order (SEO), it was clarified that the University rejected the Contractor's claim outright, which was then referred to a formal dispute under the contract and that external legal advice had been sought in respect of this matter. It was noted that the University should not be placed in a similar situation in future projects as the Government contracts have now been changed to incorporate all SEOs. It was noted that other contingencies, including funds arising from performance of the Business School could be used to fund the associated costs.

The Provost thanked the team and it was noted that it is envisaged that the Board will hold its first meeting in the Trinity Business School on 22 May 2019.

Action/Decision

153.01 The Board received an update on the Trinity Business School.

153.02 The Board noted the memorandum from the Independent Monitor dated 19 February 2019, and the memorandum from the Steering Group Chair dated 26 February 2019.

Dr Lacey, Mr Harmon and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.

BD/18-19/154 Commercial Loans for Capital Projects

Project Appraisals Manager, Financial Services Division, Mr Paul Coote attended for this item.

The Provost welcomed Mr Coote to the meeting. Mr Coote invited the Board's attention to his memorandum, dated 20 February 2019, and his presentation, dated 27 February 2019, which had been circulated. He advised the Board, that the Finance Committee and the Board had recently approved financing proposals to put in place European Investment Bank (EIB) financing and commercial loan financing in order to fund the University's capital programme noting that an interest rate for the EIB loan had subsequently been approved. Mr Coote then provided the Board with an overview of the commercial offers received/negotiated and set out the Financial Services Division's (FSD) recommendations to the Board on proposed terms subject to contract.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to queries and comments from Board members, Mr Coote advised that a significant body of work had been conducted to minimise any potential risks to the University and the attractive position of current market rates was noted. He noted that the repayment of loan commitments is subject to the relevant project business cases performing as had been projected and advised that a level of confidence could be taken from the fact that financing offers had been made to the University by several external parties.

The Provost thanked Mr Coote and the team in FSD for their work on this item and welcomed the progress being made in bring forward key capital projects.

Action/Decision

154.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Project Appraisals Manager, Financial Services Division, dated 20 February 2019 and the recommendations contained within.

Mr Coote left the meeting at this point.

BD/18-19/155 2010 Consolidated Statutes – Proposed Changes

With reference to her memorandum dated 19 February 2019 and to her presentation, dated 25 February 2019, which had been circulated, the Registrar provided the Board with a summary of the proposed amendments to the Schedules of the 2010 Consolidated Statutes, which had been reviewed by the Schedules Working Party. She advised that the proposed amendments to the wording related to three categories of change:

- (i) Changes to facilitate further implementation of electronic voting;
- (ii) Review of Latin passages contained in two Schedules;
- (iii) The addition of new degrees approved by Senate.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified that paper-based voting would continue to be provided for those colleagues without computer and online facilities.

Action/Decision

155.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 February 2019 and the accompanying amendments to the Schedules as presented.

BD/18-19/156 Audit Committee Annual Report 2017/18 – Response to Board

The Deputy Chief Financial Officer, with reference to the memorandum from the Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 20 February 2019 and to her presentation, dated 27 February 2019, provided Board members with an overview of updated Executive Officers' responses to Board on the issues highlighted in the Audit Committee Annual Report for 2017/18. She summarised the key focus of responses and outlined some of the current actions taken by the Executive Officers' Group. The Provost advised that he had met with the Chair of the Audit Committee to discuss the report and that members of the Audit Committee had also met with various College Officers and concluded that there were no factual inaccuracies and that any differences which had arisen were of interpretation. The Provost had accepted that and was happy to proceed. Actions taken to address some of the risks identified by the Report, including the appointment of a Chief Risk Officer and a Data Protection Officer, were noted.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the minimisation of potential risks arising from subsidiaries, Ms Ryan advised Board members that the Financial Services Division

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(FSD) had conducted a review of the internal environment of the Trinity subsidiaries, and a report would be presented to Finance Committee in June 2019 and the Secretary to the College advised the Board that the subsidiaries submit 6-monthly reports to the Board in addition to their financial statements on an annual basis. It was also noted that Internal Audit are scoping out a potential audit of the governance of the subsidiary companies.

Following comments from Board members in respect of the Financial Information System (FIS), it was agreed that the Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the Interim Chief Financial Officer to provide details of the benefits realised from the FIS project and will report to the Board on this matter at a future meeting. Ms Ryan advised the Board that there has been several user-groups and workshops provided to assist with benefits realisation and that measures were being taken to address any issues as they arise.

The Provost, responding to a query from a Board member, advised that clarification on the categorisation of items on the Audit Committee Recommendations Log had been circulated to minimise the potential for a lack of clarity in this respect in future.

Action/Decision

156.01 The Board considered and noted the Document from Executive Officers dated 20 February 2019.

156.02 The Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the Interim Chief Financial Officer to provide details of the benefits realised from the FIS project and will report to the Board on this matter at a future meeting.

BD/18-19/157 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 13 February 2019.

In response to comments from Board members in respect of minute CL/18-19/ 115 Postgraduate Course Proposals, (ii) M.Phil. in Identities and Cultures of Europe, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer agreed to discuss this item with the Dean of Graduate Studies and to provide an update to the Board at a future meeting, in particular in relation to the language content of the course

In respect of minute CL/18-19/114.1 Quality Review of the School of Creative Arts, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that it is proposed to establish a Task Group to support the implementation of the Quality Review recommendations.

BD/18-19/158 Any Other Urgent Business

There were no items of other urgent business.

Professor Burke left the meeting at this point.

BD/18-19/159 Research Excellence Strategy and Research Charter

The Dean of Research, Professor Linda Doyle, joined the meeting for this item.

The Dean of Research invited the Board's attention to her presentation which had been circulated. She advised the Board of the process which had been followed over the last year which had led to the development of the Research Charter and the Research Excellence Strategy and outlined the key components of both. The Dean of Research provided a summary of the 7

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Principles underpinning the research Charter and outlined the 6 action-areas on which the Strategy is based. She advised that a launch is planned in the coming months and that the Dean of Research would be reporting back regularly on the progress on the implementation of the Strategy.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Dean of Research advised that it is planned to launch a research website in the coming weeks which will contain a dedicated area to facilitate the showcasing of on-going research in the University to the College community and the broader public.

The Strategy was welcomed by Board members and, in particular, acknowledgement was given to the collegiate nature of the approach presented and the positive ethos of the Strategy.

In response to comments from Board members, the Dean of Research clarified that the Strategy applies to both basic and applied research and that she would review the wording again to reflect that balance. She also advised that she intends to systematically work with each School and the relevant Research Committees to assist with the implementation of the Strategy. The opportunities available across all Faculties and Schools in moving forward the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) agenda was acknowledged.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research, the Associate Deans of Research and the team for their contribution to the development of the Charter and the Strategy, noting that it is envisaged that the Strategy will be launched in the coming months.

Action/Decision

159.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Dean of Research, dated 22 February 2019, and the accompanying Research Excellence Strategy and Research Charter.

The Dean of Research left the meeting at this point.

SECTION B

BD/18-19/160 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 30 January 2019.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 30 January 2019.

BD/18-19/161 Finance Committee

The Deputy Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to Board members.

Action/ Decision

161.01 The Commercial Director is to be invited to present on update to the Board on the activities and performance of the subsidiary company Trinity Brand Commercial Services Ltd.

161.02 The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Finance Committee dated 4 February 2019.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/18-19/162 Library and Information Policy Committee

The Chair of the Committee invited the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to Board members.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee dated 26 November 2018.

BD/18-19/163 Quality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Quality Committee dated 1 February 2019 with the Implementation Plan for Estates and Facilities attached as Appendix 1.

BD/18-19/164 Research Committee

The Board noted the minutes of the Research Committee of the meeting of 22 January 2019 and it was noted that minutes from this committee are to go to meetings of Council for approval.

The Secretary to the College provided the Board with an update on the General Data Protection Regulations (GDPR) Implementation Plan, noting that Trinity had been the first Irish university to appoint a Data Protection Officer in October 2017. Since then a project proposal had been approved by the Executive Officer Group and funding allocated to assist the university in meeting its compliance requirements. This has resulted in the appointment of a Project Lead, an additional Solicitor and the use of external expertise. However, the Secretary noted that while progress is being made, there are some challenges to be faced. The most significant being the introduction of the Health Research Regulations 2018 which require additional measures to be taken to ensure compliance in relation to processing personal data for the purposes of health research. The Secretary advised that discussions are on-going with the Deans and the Director of Trinity Research and Innovation as to how best this matter might be addressed.

BD/18-19/165 Audit Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meetings of the Audit Committee dated 12 November 2018 and 11 December 2018.

SECTION C**BD/18-19/166 Related Entity Financial Reporting**

The Board noted the memorandum from the Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 18 February 2019, and the associated reports, circulated.

BD/18-19/167 Italian Prize

In respect of the memorandum from the Head of the School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies, dated 11 February 2019, agenda item C.20, it was agreed that the School should explore alternative methods of financing the Italian prize and provide the Board with an update at the next meeting.

BD/18-19/168 Paul Richard Turner Newham Prize

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of the School of English, dated 20 February 2019, circulated.

BD/18-19/169 Jackie Akerele Fund

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Senior Tutor's Office, dated 19 February 2019, circulated.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/18-19/170 Higher Degrees

The Board noted the Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 February 2019, circulated.

BD/18-19/171 Sealings

The Board noted the Sealings, circulated and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute.

This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

BD/18-19/172 Financial Services Division Annual Report 2017/18

The Board noted and approved the Financial Services Division Annual Report 2017/18, circulated.

BD/18-19/173 Senate Business – Recommendations for the Award of the Degree MA (jure officii)

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 February 2019, circulated.

Action/Decision

173.01 In response to comments from Board members, it was agreed that the Registrar would conduct a review of the awarding of the MA degree as conducted by the University and, in particular the correlation between this process and membership of the Senate with a view to preparing a report for consideration by the Board at a future meeting.

BD/18-19/174 Science Gallery International

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the CEO of Science Gallery International dated 12 February 2019, circulated.

BD/18-19/175 Fitness to Practice Committee

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 21 February 2019, circulated.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings