



**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**Minutes of Board Meeting of 28 February 2018**

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Mr S Collins, Dr D Fayne, Professor R Gilligan, Mr K Keane, Professor C Laudet, Ms A MacPherson, Professor C McCabe, Mr D McClean, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor R Timoney.
- Apologies* Dr O Braiden, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Dunphy, Ms S Farrell, Mr J Keogh, Professor B M Lucey, Professor R Moss, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
- (by invitation)* Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane).

**SECTION A**

**BD/17-18/137**

**Statement of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised that he had contacted each of the student Board members regarding item A.6 Modular Billing & Fees for Reassessment to identify any potential conflicts of interest. Having discussed the matter with each member, the Secretary to the College could confirm that there were no potential conflicts of interest in relation to this item as each of the Board members concerned had completed all examinations and assessments associated with their courses.

The Secretary to the College also advised that he had contacted a number of Board members in respect of item C.19 Board Elections. It was noted that several Board members could have a potential conflict of interest as they are eligible to stand for re-election. The Secretary to the College recommended, and it was agreed, that the relevant individuals would remain in the meeting for this item, as the timetable for Board elections was set down in the Statutes, unless a Board member asked for that item to be discussed.

The Secretary to the College advised that he had received a statement of potential conflict of interest from the Assistant Secretary in respect of item C.21. Senate Business-Recommendations for the award of the degree MA (*jure officio*). The Secretary to the College recommended, and it was agreed, that the Assistant Secretary would leave the meeting for this item.

**BD/17-18/138**

**Minutes - Meeting of 31 January 2018**

The minutes of the Board meeting of 31 January 2018 were approved and signed subject to the adoption of the minor amendments to minutes BD/17-18/111 and BD/17-18/115 which had been tabled.

Following further discussion, and noting the comments of Board members, it was agreed that minute BD/17-18/115 is to be further amended so that the first line of the second last paragraph should read as follows:

'The Provost in summary, and taking on board the views of the Board members, noted that the proposal before the Board was one for modular billing and fees for supplemental examinations and would be referred to the Student Life Committee.'

In addition, Action/Decision 115.2 would then also be amended to read as follows:  
'The Provost noted that the proposal before the Board was one for modular billing and fees for supplemental examinations and would be referred to the Student Life Committee. It was also...'

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that Professor O'Halpin is to be recorded in the list of attendees.

**BD/17-18/139 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

There was one item raised as a matter arising as follows:

**(i) BD/17-18/084 Tobacco Policy Committee: Tobacco Free Zones Report**

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that the results of the student poll are to be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

**BD/17-18/140 Provost's Report**

There was no report provided by the Provost on this occasion as an extensive report had been provided at the previous meeting.

A discussion ensued regarding the adverse weather conditions being experienced that morning, which were likely to continue in the coming days, and the University's decision to remain open that day.

Responding to comments and queries from Board members, the Provost advised that the situation would be kept under review and that a further communication would be issued to staff and students later in the day. The importance of timely communications to staff and students in such circumstances was noted.

The concerns of Board members regarding the safety of students and staff travelling in the conditions were acknowledged and the Provost advised the Board that staff members in Estates and Facilities were working hard to clear pathways and minimise potential risks on the campus.

**BD/17-18/141 Cultural Diversity Working Group Report to Board**

Professor Gilligan invited the Board's attention to the report of the Working Group which he chaired, dated 20 February 2018, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with a summary of the consultation process followed to date noting that the Cultural Diversity Working Group had met on four occasions. Acknowledging that there is currently a significant level of good practice in place, he advised the Board that while much progress had been made within College, some issues remain and as such the report contained a series of recommendations for further consideration. Professor Gilligan provided an overview of the different profiles of students studying at Trinity and noted an opportunity for Trinity to show leadership in the area of cultural diversity, which would enrich the College community and offer great learning opportunities for students and staff. He provided a summary of the key recommendations and noted the importance of prioritising work on this item in the next strategic plan.

The Provost congratulated Professor Gilligan and the working group for the work that has been conducted to date suggesting to the Board that the recommendations be forwarded to the relevant Principal and Compliance committees for consideration and action as appropriate.

In response to comments from a Board member, Professor Gilligan advised the Board of the importance of having a curriculum which is developed from a global perspective which

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

considers the multiple models and ways of teaching. The Senior Lecturer, agreeing with the importance of being open to other cultures when designing the curriculum, advised that a relevant elective module is currently being developed as part of the suite of Trinity Electives.

Following comments from a Board member, the importance of increasing cultural diversity awareness amongst student clubs and societies was acknowledged.

Responding to comments and queries from Board members regarding the possibility of Trinity becoming a university of sanctuary, the Senior Lecturer clarified that a working group has been formed to consider the possibilities in relation to becoming a university of sanctuary. The Registrar also advised that a subgroup of the Engagement Advisory Group has recently been established (provisionally called the Partnership Advisory Group), to examine the possibilities for and facilitate participation of asylum seekers and refugees within the College Community, both academics and students. She advised that this is reported in the minutes of the Engagement Advisory Group (November 24th), presented at the Board meeting for approval.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Board members that it is envisaged cultural diversity will be integrated in to the next strategic plan which will provide a further opportunity to reflect on the changing nature of our society. The Provost thanked Professor Gilligan and the Working Group for their work.

#### **Action/Decision**

**141.1** The Board noted and approved the document from the Chair of the Cultural Diversity Working Group, Professor Robbie Gilligan, dated 20 February 2018.

**141.2** It was noted that the document is to be circulated to the relevant Principal and Compliance committees of the Board to consider how the recommendations in the report may be progressed.

#### **BD/17-18/142 Planning Group Report #17 to Board**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item noting that the majority of the work of the Planning Group since June 2017 had focused on the implementation of and follow-through on the Baseline Budgeting Model which had been approved by the Board. He advised the Board that having established a multi-annual budgeting platform, Planning Group was examining the means by which this can be used as the basis for strategic planning at school level across the University. Noting the financial situation of the University, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised of the importance of developing a strategy for managed growth and development.

A Board member, acknowledging the contribution of the Financial Planning and Risk Manager to the report, expressed concerns regarding the on-going projected deficit. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted the importance of continuing to engage with Faculty Deans and Heads of Schools to identify areas of growth. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised of the importance of diversifying income streams noting the strong performance to date of the Commercial Revenue Unit, the continued growth in research and increased philanthropic activity. He further noted that in order to provide a baseline level of expenditure, it is imperative to have growth in activities as there were limitations in the ability to reduce costs.

In response to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the student number data returned to the Higher Education Authority were accurate. He also clarified that the financial modelling had been conducted with input from Heads of School.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, responding to queries from a Board member, advised that responsibility for the management of budgets was at a devolved level and that it is envisaged that a baseline level of resource for Schools would provide an incentive to develop new

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

activities. He also clarified that the forecasts as presented were based at a point in time and as such fluctuations can be observed.

Responding to a query from a Board member in relation to the five-year forecasts, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that previous forecasts were available and he agreed to circulate revised graphs of financial forecasts which demonstrate the accuracy of the financial forecasts in recent years.

The Provost, responding to comments from Board members, reminded the Board of the importance of maintaining the University's reputation and performance in teaching and research and cautioned against unregulated growth in student numbers. He also noted that consideration could be given to further reducing costs should the Board decide to give that direction. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also noted the importance of identifying areas for strategic growth without impacting on the quality of the education provided by the University.

Noting concerns from Board members regarding the on-going projected deficit, it was agreed that the Board would consider a mandate to deliver a balanced budget at a future meeting. It was also agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to monitor the proposals outlined in the report in relation to the quality of the University's teaching and its research performance.

#### **Action/Decision**

**142.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 22 February 2018 and the report from the Planning Group contained within its strategy for managed growth and development.

**142.2** It was agreed that the Board would consider a mandate to deliver a balanced budget at a future meeting. It was also agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to monitor the impact of the strategy outlined in the report on the quality of the University's teaching and its research performance.

**142.4** It was noted that the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer is to circulate revised graphs of the financial forecasts which demonstrate the accuracy of the financial forecasts in recent years.

#### **BD/17-18/143 Modular Billing and Fees for Reassessment**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item noting that it followed on from the meeting of the Board on 31 January 2018 (BD/17-189/115), and he had some consultation with the President of the Students' Union in the interim. He noted that the introduction of modular billing would financially benefit those students repeating modules and noted that the Finance Committee had approved the introduction of modular billing on a cost-neutral basis. He also noted that to introduce modular billing alone would result in an increase of €1m in the university's existing deficit, which would not be financially responsible. He invited the Board's attention to his memorandum dated 28 February 2018, which had been circulated. He advised Board members that contained in the memorandum was the original proposal as considered by the Board on 31 January 2018 as well as two alternative models and provided an overview of each of the options: Option 1 €200 per module for all students; Option €200 per module for undergraduates only and capped at 7 modules; and €450 flat fee for undergraduates only.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and opened the item for discussion.

Some Board members advised the Board of their concerns regarding the proposals as presented by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the level of fees contained within, noting that some of the academic committees of the Council had not had an opportunity to consider this item. The Board were also advised of the results of the recent student preferendum conducted

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

by the Students' Union on supplemental fees and it was highlighted that the proposed fees would apply to all forms of re-assessment not just to re-sitting written examinations.

In response to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that alternative methods of meeting the costs of the introduction of modular billing had been explored but that none had proved feasible. He also noted that students who are currently fee exempt will also be exempt from the supplemental fee and that students facing financial difficulty can apply to the Student Hardship Fund.

Following comments from some Board members in support of the proposals the benefits of the proposals including modular billing were acknowledged. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, referencing the current financial position of the university, noted that the original proposal, as approved by the Finance Committee, was that the introduction of modular billing would be on a cost-neutral basis.

In response to comments from a Board member, it was noted that all other universities in Ireland charge a fee for students who present for re-assessment within a given academic year and that details of those charges were included in the Memorandum.

The Chief Operating Officer, responding to comments from a Board member in relation to student support services, advised the Board that many student services are provided to students at no cost.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies clarified that academic transcripts would reflect, as appropriate, the fact that repeat examinations had been taken by students.

In response to concerns expressed regarding possible hardship on students, a number of Board members supported a suggestion that a fund be provided, via the Senior Tutor, to deal with any cases of student hardship which might arise as a result of the proposals being implemented.

Following comments from some Board members regarding possible amendment to the proposals to take account of the varying credit values of modules, the Provost provided the Board with a summary of the three options as presented by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer. He proposed that the Board adopt Option 3 regarding re-assessment, i.e. the introduction of per-module billing on a pro-rata basis for repeating students and a flat fee of €450 for re-assessment for undergraduate students, as outlined in the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 28 February 2018. It was noted that the approved Option 3 would see the cost of introducing modular billing not being met on a cost-neutral basis. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer indicated that he had fundamental concerns and could not support a decision that did not result in full cost neutrality in view of the university's financial position and the Board's desire to deliver a balanced budget within a reasonable timeframe. The Board endorsed Option 3, with dissent of Mr Collins, Mr Keane, Ms MacPherson and Mr McClean noted.

Noting that a decision had now been made, the Provost thanked everyone for their contributions to this item. It was noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to liaise with the Senior Tutor regarding the provision of a financial fund to which undergraduate students undertaking reassessment or repeating modules, who are encountering financial hardship, may apply for financial assistance. An update on this item is to be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

**Action/Decision:**

**143.01** The Board endorsed the introduction of per-module billing on a pro-rata basis for repeating students and approved Option 3: a flat fee of €450 for re-assessment for

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

undergraduate students, as outlined in the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 28 February 2018.

**143.02** It was noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to liaise with the Senior Tutor regarding the provision of a financial fund to which undergraduate students undertaking reassessment or repeating modules, who are encountering financial hardship, may apply for financial assistance. An update on this item is to be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

**BD/17-18/144 Self-Evaluation of the Board**

The Secretary to the College invited the Board's attention to his memorandum, dated 21 February 2018 and the proposed self-evaluation template which had been circulated. He summarised the proposed process for conducting the self-evaluation and comments were invited from Board members.

Following a query from a Board member, it was agreed that an amendment to provide further clarification in relation to question 1.1 would be made and that the self-evaluation of the Board process is to proceed.

**Action/Decision**

**144.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 21 February 2018.

**144.2** It was agreed that an amendment to provide further clarification in relation to question 1.1 would be made and that the self-evaluation of the Board process is to proceed.

**BD/17-18/145 Associate Deans of Research**

The Provost invited the Board's attention to his memorandum which had been tabled. He advised the Board that Professor Martina Hennessy had resigned from the position of Associate Dean of Research. In addition, Professor Peter Gallagher had resigned from the university to take up a position elsewhere. The Provost thanked Professor Hennessy and Professor Gallagher for their work as Associate Deans of Research. As such, the Provost proposed that the following staff members be appointed as Associate Deans of Research with immediate effect:

- Professor Andrew Bowie, School of Biochemistry and Immunology;
- Professor Lorraine Leeson, School of Linguistics, Speech and Communication Sciences.

**Action/Decision**

**145.1** The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Provost, dated 28 February 2018, which had been tabled, and approved the appointment of Professor Andrew Bowie and Professor Lorraine Leeson as Associate Deans of Research with immediate effect.

**BD/17-18/146 Fellowship 2018**

The Board approved the nominations for Fellowship and Honorary Fellowship as presented by the Provost.

**BD/17-18/147 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the Acta of the Council meeting of 14 February 2018.

**BD/17-18/148 Any Other Urgent Business**

**Board Membership**

The Board noted that the Provost is to convene a sub-committee of the Board, which he will Chair, to commence the process of identifying a replacement for external Board member, Dr Olive Braiden who will have completed her second term as a Board member at the end of this academic year. The Provost will propose the membership of the sub-committee at the next meeting of the Board.

The Board noted the resignation of Mr Tony Keohane as a member of the Board with effect from 12 February 2018. The Provost thanked Mr Keohane for his contribution as a member of

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

the Board. As a nominee of the Minister for Education and Skills, the Minister has been written to and is to consult with the Provost regarding a possible replacement.

#### SECTION A.2

##### **BD/17-18/149 Paternity Policy**

*The Director of Human Resources joined the meeting for this item.*

The Provost welcomed the Director of Human Resources who provided the Board with a summary of the requirement to implement paternity leave in line with current paternity leave legislation. With reference to the memorandum from the Deputy Director of Human Resources, dated October 2017, which had been circulated, she advised that the University would now be offering paid paternity leave for a period of 26 weeks and clarified those members of staff who would be eligible to apply for such leave.

Following a brief discussion it was noted that this policy applies to staff members only and that consideration could be given by the Chief Operating Officer and the Director of Student Services to the development of an appropriate set of policies for student parents.

##### **Action/Decision**

**149.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Deputy Director of Human Resources dated October 2017, and the Paternity Policy as presented.

*The Director of Human Resources left the meeting at this point.*

#### SECTION B

##### **BD/17-18/150 Board Business**

###### (i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 31 January 2018.

###### (ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 31 January 2018.

##### **BD/17-18/151 University Safety Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 27 September 2017.

##### **BD/17-18/152 Equality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 29 January 2018 with the following clarification. The Secretary to the College advised that Ms Dunphy was not in a position to take part in a number of meetings of the Committee but that her resignation from the Board had not been received.

##### **BD/17-18/153 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of 4 December 2017.

##### **BD/17-18/154 Engagement Advisory Group**

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meetings of 23 March 2017 and the draft minutes of the meeting of 23 November 2017.

##### **BD/17-18/155 Quality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the revised minutes of the meeting of 14 December 2017 and the revised Linked Provider Appeals Procedure.

#### SECTION C

##### **BD/17-18/156 Board Elections 2018**

The Board noted the memorandum, as circulated, from the Secretary to the College dated 21 February 2018.

**BD/17-18/157 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees as circulated, approved by the Sub-Committee of Board and Council on 14 February 2018.

**BD/17-18/158 Senate Business – Recommendations for the award of the degree MA (jure officii)**

*The Assistant Secretary left the meeting for this item.*

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, as circulated, from the Registrar dated 26 February 2018.

**BD/17-18/159 Headship of School**

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor Mark Bell to the Headship of the School of Law from 2 July 2018 to 1 July 2021.

**BD/17-18/160 Date of the Trinity Ball 2019**

The Board noted the Memorandum, as circulated, from the Secretary to the College, dated 31 January 2018.

**BD/17-18/161 Sealings**

The Board noted the sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this minute.  
**This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.**

**BD/17-18/162 Irish School of Ecumenics - Trinity College Dublin Advisory Board**

The Board noted the minutes, as circulated, of their meeting of 11 April 2017 for information.

**BD/17-18/163 Representation – Marino Institute of Education**

The Board noted and approved the nomination, as circulated, of Professor Linda Hogan, Confederal School of Religions, Peace Studies & Theology, as a Trinity representative on the above Board.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....