

# Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

## Minutes of Board Meeting of 31 January 2018

Present Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior

Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Professor S M Draper, Dr D Fayne, Ms S Farrell, Professor R Gilligan, Mr K

Keane, Mr J Keogh, Professor C Laudet, , Ms A MacPherson, Professor C McCabe, Mr D McClean, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor A Seery, Professor R Timoney.

Apologies Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Ms S Dunphy, Mr T Keohane, Professor B M Lucey,

Professor D R Phelan, Professor S Alyn Stacey.

In attendance Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).

(by invitation) Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

#### **SECTION A**

BD/17-18/108 Statement of Interest

There were no statements of interest.

BD/17-18/109 Minutes - Meeting of 13 December 2017

The minutes of the Board meeting of 13 December 2017 were approved and signed.

## BD/17-18/110 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The following items were raised as a matter arising:

# (i) BD/17-18/081 Trinity Business School (TBS) Report to Board

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation updated the Board on this item noting that she had contacted the Dean of the Business School and it was confirmed that the relevant rooms in the new Business School are to be entered in to the CMIS Room Booking System. It was noted that the Business School would require a settling in period to adjust to the new building. In addition, she advised the Board that the Business School will be one of the first buildings to participate in the Trinity Way-Finding Initiative.

## (ii) BD/17-18/082 Printing House Square (Oisín House) Project

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised Board members that the process to appoint an Independent Monitor for the project had commenced and that the name of the person and a summary of their experience will be brought to Board for approval in due course. She also advised the Board that due consideration was being given to the appointment of a female Independent Monitor, where possible.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation also advised that a 3D model of the new building had been ordered and would be placed on display in the Senior Common Room once available.

# (iii) BD/17-18/093 Any Other Urgent Business

# (i) Baseline Budgeting Model

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the Baseline Budgeting Model (BBM)

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

had been approved by the Board in June 2017, following consideration by the Finance Committee.

(iv) BD/17-18/084 Tobacco Policy Committee: Tobacco Free Zones Report
The Secretary to the College advised the Board that he had contacted the President of the
Students' Union on this matter and that a poll of students is to be conducted shortly.

## BD/17-18/111 Provost's Report

The Provost provided a report to the Board under the following headings:

#### F3

It was noted that the design brief for the project had now concluded and that the Design Group had been dissolved. A number of architects are to be invited to attend clarification meetings in early March 2018 after which the selection of an architect for the project will be made.

# Memorandum of Understanding with the Sejong City Government

The Provost advised the Board that a memorandum of understanding has been signed with the Sejong City Government to explore opportunities for collaboration in education and research between Trinity College Dublin, South Korean academic institutions and industry. The partnership will explore and promote the establishment of a joint campus with South Korean universities in Sejong, South Korea's new administrative capital. A feasibility study is now to be conducted with a focus on evaluating the extent of postgraduate opportunities.

#### • Innovation District Concept

It was noted that the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer had met with Cambridge Innovation Center (CIC) with a view to identifying the potential of the site, the master plan for which will be completed in the coming months.

The Provost with the CEO of the IDA and other interested parties are meeting key stakeholders to consider the catalysts behind the innovation campus in the Boston Innovation District and to reflect on the possibilities for a similar project in Dublin.

#### Public Affairs

- (i) The Board noted the recent appointment of Mr Jim Miley as the Director General of the Irish Universities Association.
- (ii) The Board also noted the review of how State funds are allocated in the Third Level Education Sector, as published by the Higher Education Authority and how the Minister for Education and Skills, Richard Bruton TD, has indicated that changes to the allocation of the block grant are to be anticipated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that a sector-wide implementation group to consider the recommendations of the review has been established, of which the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer is a member.
- (iii) The Provost advised that Minister of State for Higher Education, Mary Mitchell O'Connor TD, has established a taskforce to make recommendations in respect of gender balance in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Level Education sector. It was noted that a series of one-to-one unconscious bias training sessions had recently been conducted with members of staff in the university and the importance of ensuring that all talents are used to the maximum to meet Trinity's strategic objectives was acknowledged.
- (iv) The Provost advised the Board that he had been invited to speak at the first European Education Summit which was held in Brussels and was attended by both Ministers of Education and University Presidents from all across Europe. He had given a talk in relation to access to third level education and there had been interesting discussion on the possible creation of European education networks.

# TCD Seminar Series led by Minister Zappone

The Provost informed Board members that Trinity will host a series of structured conversations with a group of Trinity students together with the Minister for Children and Youth Affairs, Dr Katherine Zappone,TD.

The topics chosen will reflect those issues which are particularly current. The seminars are to take place across three Thursday evenings as follows:

- Thursday 8 March 2018: Brexit;
- Thursday 29 March 2018: Abortion;
- Thursday 19 April 2018: Poverty and child homelessness.

It was noted that the participating students will be randomly selected and broadly representative of the College student body.

#### Burkitt Medal Award

The Provost advised the Board that the 2017 Burkitt Medal was presented by him to Professor Mariano Barbacid, AXA-CNIO Professor of Molecular Oncology at the Spanish National Cancer Research Centre, at a celebratory event earlier this month.

# • TCD Schwarzman Scholar Recipients

The Provost informed the Board that two recent graduates of Trinity's Business, Economics and Social Studies (BESS) programme have been awarded prestigious 2019 Schwartzman Scholarships at Tsinghua University in Beijing. Sarah Mortell and Philip Callan were the only Irish recipients among 142 Scholars from 39 countries who were selected from over 4,000 applicants.

#### Medium Voltage (MV) Project

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, at the invitation of the Provost, informed the Board that the MV Project was now concluded and had been completed on time and within budget. Noting the complexities of the project in delivering a new ESB supply for the university, she extended her thanks to the staff members of Estates and Facilities: Mr Emmet Dalton, Mr Kieron McGovern and Mr Greg Power, who had contributed significantly to the delivery of this project.

#### BD/17-18/112 Commercial Revenue Strategy - 2016/17 Results, 2017/18 Budget & Forecast.

The Commercial Director, Mr Adrian Neilan, joined the meeting for this item.

Mr Neilan, invited the Board's attention to his presentation, dated 31 January 2018, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with a review of the financial year 2016/17 noting that 2016/17 represented a strong financial performance by the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU). In particular he advised Board members that in 2016/17 a turnover of €42.5 million had been observed with a contribution to the university of €23.25million which exceeded budgeted targets.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation provided the Board with an update in relation to Trinity's commercial subsidiary company: Trinity Brand Commercial Services Ltd (TBCSL). She advised the Board that the Board of Directors of TBCSL and its Remuneration Committee had met several times in the last year. She also advised that while the actual sales figures were somewhat below targeted budget projections the cost base of the company's activities had been well managed. She informed the Board the significant consideration had been given to ensuring that the company operated in keeping with the Trinity Identity Guidelines and that a high quality product range was currently being developed. She noted that a risk register for the company has been developed and considered by its board and that an unqualified audit opinion from KPMG is anticipated.

Mr Neilan stated that the need to support the academic mission was fully understood and provided Board members with some examples of the deployment of funds generated by the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU) across the university including investment in accommodation upgrades such as the installation of double-glazed windows in Botany Bay, the Arts Building refurbishment, the MV project, the funding of academic posts and PhD Scholarships. He also informed the Board that accommodation at Kavanagh Court and the Binary Hub was now also contributing to the financial targets of the CRU.

He further advised the Board that a 17% increase had been observed in the number of visitors to Trinity in this financial year compared to a comparable period last year and that a revised Campus Tour Policy was currently being finalised to further enhance the visitor experience.

Mr Neilan concluded his presentation by providing the Board with an overview of the current financial year 2017/18 and an updated long-term forecast noting that a 6% growth in contribution is projected for 2017/18.

The Provost thanked the Commercial Director and opened the item for discussion.

Mr Neilan, responding to comments from Board members in respect of the student accommodation at Kavanagh Court and the Binary Hub, noted that while the accommodation had been late coming to the student rental market considerable efforts had been made by the Global Relations Office and the CRU to minimise any potential deficit and that he did not foresee further potential risks in this regard for the current year.

In response to queries from a Board member in respect of the Book of Kells Exhibition and the Library Shop, Mr Neilan informed the Board that almost 1 million visitors had come to Trinity in the last year and that additional resources are required to ensure a positive visitor experience for all concerned. He advised that a timed-entry process and the Trinity Visitor Experience should also enhance the experience and commended the work of his team in managing that volume of visitors to date.

In response to queries from a Board member in respect of the figures presented in the presentation regarding the long-term forecast for CRU, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified the difference between management accounts and the overall financial statements and advised that a reconciliation of the figures would be contained in the presentation of the 2016/17 Financial Statements.

With reference to queries from a Board member in relation to signage the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation informed the Board that a signage committee, a subgroup of the Identity Management Committee, had been established and a way finding expert had been engaged. Mr Neilan also clarified that the CRU would be engaging with this group and improvements in signage were envisaged.

The Provost, noting the significant contribution of the Commercial Revenue Unit to the funding of academic posts and the refurbishment and maintenance of buildings, thanked Mr Neilan and the team in the CRU for their contributions to date. In addition, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the contribution generated by the CRU was now almost at a par with the amount of funding received from the State.

# **Action/Decision**

**112.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Commercial Director, Mr Adrian Neilan, dated 22 January 2018, and approved the update on the Commercial Revenue Strategy as provided.

Mr Neilan left the meeting at this point.

#### BD/17-18/113 2010 Consolidated Statutes – Proposed Changes to Schedule 3 to the Chapter on the Fellows.

The Registrar introduced this item with reference to her memorandum dated 29 November 2017, which had been circulated. She advised Board members that at its meeting of 24 May 2017, the Board approved a recommendation of the E-Voting Working Party which proposed to conduct a pilot for the taking of the Assents of Fellows to the election of new Fellows in 2018 through electronic means. This pilot is to run in parallel with the paper-based system and that a company, which provides electronic voting services, had been chosen to facilitate the trial process.

The Registrar then informed the Board that in order to run the pilot transitional changes to the wording of the Schedule to the Chapter on the Fellows (Schedule 3 on the Procedures for taking the Assents of the Fellows to the Election of New Fellows) in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes are required and invited the Board's attention to the draft wording as had been circulated. The Registrar then clarified the wording would revert to the current form at the end of the process and that should the Board decide to proceed with the electronic system for future taking of Assents to the election of new Fellows, the text of a revised Schedule 3 to the Chapter on Fellows would be brought to Board for approval.

# Action/Decision

**113.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 29 November 2017 and approved the proposed temporary additions to the text set out in blue in the document which was attached.

# BD/17-18/114 Linked Provider Quality Assurance Procedures

The Registrar invited the Board's attention to her memorandum dated 24 January 2018, which had been circulated. She advised Board members that concerns had emerged regarding the responsibility and potential liability placed on Trinity under the current policy 'Approval of Higher Education Institutions (Linked Providers) Quality Assurance Procedures' which had been approved by Council in January 2017. Having sought legal advice it was now proposed to rescind the current policy and that a new policy, which would include an element of self-certification by the Linked Provider, be drafted and brought through committees for approval.

# **Action/Decision**

114.1 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 24 January 2018 and approved the rescinding of the current policy on the Approval of Higher Education (Linked Provider) Quality Assurance Procedures (January 2017). The Board also approved in principle the proposed approach to the approval of Linked Provider Quality Assurance Procedures with a new policy to be brought through relevant committees in due course.

# BD/17-18/115 Modular Billing and Fees for Supplemental Examinations

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to his memorandum, dated 24 January 2018, which had been circulated. He provided the background to this proposal noting that the proposal had been previously approved by the Planning Group and the Finance Committee. He advised Board members that analysis conducted by the Academic Registry suggests that there could be an approximate shortfall in tuition fee income of €1m annually from 2019/20 onwards resulting from a move to modular billing. As this shortfall would not be sustainable given the current deficit of the university a number of different fee structures for supplemental examinations had been considered by the Finance Committee at its meeting of 18 December 2017.

The Vice- Provost/Chief Academic Officer further advised that after a series of consultations with Academic Registry (AR) and members of the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union, where it had not proved possible to achieve consensus, the proposal, in keeping with the recommendation of the Finance Committee that the introduction of modular billing for supplemental examinations be cost neutral, was now before the Board for approval.

Following comments from Board members, the potential financial and non-financial implications of this proposal for students was acknowledged. The implications for students who are 'off-books' and for those students who are solely assessed by continuous assessment were also considered.

The Provost and Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, responding to comments from Board members, noted the importance of a decision being made on this item particularly as there was a significant project to be undertaken in the AR to facilitate modular billing and a tight timeline for delivery.

In response to comments from Board members elected by students, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that no dissent had been noted in the minutes of the Finance Committee of 18 December 2017, where this proposal had been approved, and emphasised the importance of any change to billing methods being cost neutral. Following some further clarifications from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer consideration was given to the fee to be charged, the impact on postgraduate students, and the introduction of a possible cap on the total amount to be charged to a student.

The Provost in summary, and taking on board the views of the Board members, noted that the proposal before the Board was one for modular billing and fees for supplemental examinations and would be referred to the Student Life Committee. However, it was also agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to liaise with the President of the Students' Union regarding a cap on the amount of fees to be charged to students taking supplemental examinations. This proposal together with further information in respect of those who will be liable to pay and confirmation of the sectoral average is to be brought to the next meeting of the Board with a view to finalising the matter.

In addition, it was agreed that the Academic Registry is continue the work in adapting the student information system (SiTS) to facilitate modular billing.

## Action/Decision

**115.1** The Board considered the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 24 January 2018.

**115.2** The Provost noted that the proposal before the Board was one for modular billing and fees for supplemental examinations and would be referred to the Student Life Committee. It was also agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is to liaise with the President of the Students' Union regarding a cap on the amount of fees to be charged to students taking supplemental examinations. This proposal together with further information in respect of those who will be liable to pay and confirmation of the sectoral average is to be brought to the next meeting of the Board with a view to finalising the matter.

**115.3** In addition, it was agreed that the Academic Registry is continue the work in adapting the student information system (SiTS) to facilitate modular billing.

# BD/17-18/116 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 17 January 2018.

# BD/17-18/117 Any Other Urgent Business

The President of the Students' Union brought the Board's attention to some of the events which were scheduled to take place as part of a series of events being organised for Raise and Give (RAG) Week including a charity boxing match and cycling marathon.

## **SECTION A.2**

# BD/17-18/118 Fraud Policy

The Secretary to the College provided the Board with an overview of the revisions which had been made to the existing Fraud Policy which had been originally approved by the Board in 2001. He noted that the revised policy had been broadened to include possible fraud if conducted by students and that it should be read in conjunction with other policies such as the Protected Disclosures Policy and the Good Research Practice Policy.

Following comments from Board members it was agreed that some further revisions to the wording should be considered. The Secretary to the College also clarified that following an investigation under the Fraud Policy, that should follow-up actions be required, the Staff Disciplinary Procedures would be followed. It was also acknowledged that wider consultation with those parties who hold a role of responsibility under the policy would be beneficial.

## Action/Decision

**118.1** The decision on this item was deferred. A revised version of the policy is to be brought to a future meeting of the Board following further discussion and consultation at such fora as the Executive Officers' Group and the Heads of School Committee.

#### **SECTION B**

### BD/17-18/119 Board Business

- (i) Callover
  - The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 13 December 2017.
- (ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 13 December 2017.

# BD/17-18/120 Audit Committee

Professor Gilligan provided the Board with a summary of the items most recently considered by the Audit Committee.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Secretary to the College advised that the Data Protection Officer, who is a staff member in the Secretary's Office, is currently conducting a gap analysis in respect of the university's readiness for compliance with the General Data Protection Regulation. Should this analysis result in the need for additional resources being identified such resource requirements will be addressed at that point.

Following comments by a Board member in relation to the High Level Risk Register, it was noted that a review of the outstanding Internal Audit Recommendations had recently been conducted. Much progress had also been made on the development of the High Level Risk Register and Risk Register templates for the different units across the university.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meetings of 5 and 15 December 2017.

# BD/17-18/121 Equality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 30 November 2017.

# BD/17-18/122 Estates Policy Committee

The Secretary to the College confirmed that the minutes of 24 November 2017 had been circulated in error as they had been approved at the Board meeting of 13 December 2017.

# BD/17-18/123 Finance Committee

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to those minutes of relevance to Board members. The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 18 December 2017.

## BD/17-18/124 Quality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 14 December 2017.

#### **SECTION C**

BD/17-18/125 Higher DegreesThe Board noted Higher Degrees as circulated, approved by the Sub-Committee of Board and Council on 17 January 2018.

# BD/17-18/126 Associated Companies – Reports of Directors to Board

The Board considered and approved the Memorandum, as circulated, from the Secretary to the College dated 23 January 2018.

# BD/17-18/127 Prizes and Awards: Rewording of the Julian Boldy prizes in Geology, to accommodate the new TR062 Geography & Geoscience moderatorship

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, as circulated, from the Head of Geology, Dr David Chew, dated 15 December 2017.

#### BD/17-18/128 Head of School of Medicine

The Board noted and approved the appointment of Professor Michael Gill as Head of the School of Medicine for 3 years (2017-2020) from 14 December 2017 (first term).

# BD/17-18/129 Related Entity Financial Reporting

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, as circulated, from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 24 January 2018.

# BD/17-18/130 Updated Audit Committee Annual Report Response

The Board noted and approved the document, as circulated, from the Chief Financial Officer dated 24 January 2018.

## BD/17-18/131 Representation – Board of Tallaght Hospital

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor Anne-Marie Brady as Trinity's representative on the above Board.

## BD/17-18/132 Financial Services Division Annual Report 2016-17

The Board noted and approved the document from the Chief Financial Officer.

# **SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:	
Data	
Date:	