



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

### Minutes of Board Meeting of 24 February 2016

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast)(in the Chair), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Bursar (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G Martin), Dr O Braiden, Mr C Clancy, Ms K Crowther, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor S Draper, Professor E Drew, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr G J Garrahan, Professor R Gilligan, Ms M Kenny, Mr T Keohane, Professor B Lucey, Professor C McCabe, Professor J F McGilp, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill, Professor A Seery, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor D R Phelan, Ms L Ruane.
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Acting) (Ms Sandra Kavanagh).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr John Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr Ian Mathews).
- (by invitation)* Chief Operating Officer (Ms Geraldine Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

### SECTION A

#### BD/15-16/168 Statement of Interest

Mr Dermot Frost made a statement in relation to a potential conflict of interest in relation to agenda item C.20 Board Elections 2016, as he was eligible to be a candidate for election. The Secretary to the College advised the Board that he had discussed the matter with Mr. Frost. The Secretary recommended to the Board that, as the timetable for Board elections was set down in the statutes, Mr Frost should remain in the meeting for that agenda item, unless a Board member asked for that item to be discussed. That recommendation was accepted.

#### BD/15-16/169 Minutes - Meeting of 27 January 2016

The following corrections to the draft minutes of the Board meeting of 27 January 2016 were noted and the minutes were approved as amended:

##### **Minute BD/15-16/128** Provost's Report

##### (v) 1916 and Decade of Commemorations

A Board member mentioned that a Trinity Engineering graduate had played a prominent role in the 1916 Rising. With no further information available, it was noted that the issue could be explored further with the Decade of Commemorations Committee.

##### (vi) Notable Events

A LOFAR telescope will be installed at the Birr Castle estate enabled through the kind donation of land by the Earl of Rosse and with funding support from SFI.

##### **Joint Board and Council meeting of 20 January 2016.**

The draft minutes of the Joint Board and Council meeting of 20 January 2016 were approved and signed.

**BD/15-16/170 Matters Arising from the Minutes****BD/14-15/128 Quality – Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services**

Prof O'Neill commented on the issue of catering on campuses other than the main campus, which he had raised previously. The Chief Operating Officer reassured the Board that the Commercial Revenue Unit will address this issue and present an update at a future Board meeting.

**BD/15-16/128 Provost's Report (vii) Notable Events**

The Secretary to the College confirmed that the Director of Public Affairs & Communications will raise the point regarding the Trinity Engineering graduate who played a prominent role in the 1916 Rising with the Decade of Commemorations Committee.

**BD/15-16/133 Quality - Implementation Plan for the Disability Service**

The Chief Operating Officer confirmed that mental health is covered under Irish disability law and is a disability supported by the Disability Office for reasonable accommodation in the academic environment.

The Chief Operating Officer informed Board that the Disability Service was not consulted on the mini-tender for the VLE provider. However, the mini-tender was run in full compliance with legislation, College Board-approved governance and the Accessible Information Policy. The Disability Service will be consulted on future VLE tenders.

**BD/15-16/136 Establishment of Al-Maktoum Centre for Islamic Studies**

The Secretary to the College reported that the final legal agreement for the establishment of the Al-Maktoum Centre for Islamic Studies will be presented to the Board for approval at the meeting of 23 March 2016.

**BD/15-16/138 Acta of the University Council**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the Revised Proposal for a Tenure-Track System for entry level academics was approved at the Board meeting of 27 January 2016, through the draft Acta of University Council of 13 January 2016 (Minute CL/15-16/083 Revised Proposal for a Tenure-Track System). However, the revised proposal had not been appended to the Acta. The revised proposal will be circulated as an A2 item at the Board meeting of 23 March 2016, to ensure full visibility for the Board.

**BD/15-16/143 Audit Committee**

As agreed, the Audit Committee findings on FIS were discussed by the Executive Officers Group. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Chair of the FIS Steering Group will discuss the findings with the Audit Committee directly at the next Audit Committee meeting. The FIS project would not be closed until such time as the Finance Committee and Board agree to its closure. The draft minute of the Finance Committee meeting of 15 February 2016 on this topic had been circulated to the Board meeting under agenda item B.18(ii).

**BD/15-16/171 Annual Equality Monitoring Report 2014-15**

With agreement from the Board, agenda item 4 (Annual Equality Monitoring Report 2014-15) and agenda item 17 (draft minutes and update from the Equality Committee) were brought forward.

Professor Catherine McCabe, Chair of the Equality Committee, introduced the draft Annual Equality Monitoring Report 2014-15, as circulated.

Following the recommendations made at the Equality Committee meeting of 21 January 2016, the draft report was approved by the Committee for onward consideration by the Board.

Professor McCabe drew the Board's attention to some of the highlights of the report, including:

- Key findings of the report, as summarised in pages 5-7 (inclusive);
- Trends in key figures over the past 5 years is included in tabulated form;

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

- Full reports from the Disability Service, Trinity Admissions Programmes and Mature Students Office are included;
  - Data in the recruitment diversity monitoring section of the report are significantly more reliable than previously, as the voluntary recruitment diversity monitoring form is now embedded in the e-Recruitment process;
  - The merit bar, previously referred to as promotion, is now considered progression;
- The comprehensive report contains a significant amount of data and interpretation, and invited comments from Board members.

Comments from Board members included:

- The report is helpful, informative and a good use of resources;
- The inclusion of ethnicity data for undergraduate and postgraduate student populations is welcome;
- The age profile of students would be a helpful addition, as the Equality Committee looks to create a strategy for an age-friendly campus;
- The increase in part-time students indicates that the diversification strategy is having an impact;
- The profile of the membership of the Equality Committee could be re-considered;
- Consistent shading and colouring would increase the legibility of the report.

A Board member queried the percentage increase in Irish students as presented in the report, as this figure seems contrary to the data in Planning Group Report no. 14 (as circulated). The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responded that the reports are not directly comparable, as nationality and fees status are not mutually exclusive and the reports address cohorts from different academic years. There is a slight increase in Irish students at undergraduate level, while the dominance of home-based students at postgraduate taught level remains.

The Provost drew the Board's attention to occupational gender data, highlighting staff imbalances in areas such as security and the day nursery. The Provost commented that similar imbalances can be seen in academia gender data and reminded Board that addressing these imbalances is an important issue.

A Board member commented that many administrative and executive grades are dominated by women, but the trend is reversed in senior administrative grades. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer replied that this will be analysed further in the Gender and Trinity Staff: Trends in Populations, Recruitment and Progression report due before Board at the meeting of 23 March.

A Board member highlighted a slight inconsistency in the ethnic background data of first year undergraduates. Professor McCabe will raise this issue with the Equality Officer and amend the report as appropriate.

The Board noted and approved the draft Annual Equality Monitoring Report 2014-15.

The Provost thanked Professor McCabe, the Equality Officer and the members of the Equality Committee for their work in preparing the report.

The report was noted by the Board.

#### **BD/15-16/172 Equality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 21 January 2016, as circulated.

Professor McCabe informed the Board that the Equality Committee had recommended amendments to both the draft Irish Sign Language policy and the draft Diversity and Inclusion

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Strategy and had considered the ten principles for an age-friendly university, as presented by Professor O'Neill.

### **BD/15-16/173 Provost's Report**

The Provost informed Board that the report of the Expert Group on Future Funding for Higher Education, expected to be published in December 2015, had been delayed to incorporate the findings of Ireland's National Skills Strategy 2025 and the inclusion of more detailed implementation costs.

Mr Peter Cassells, Chair of the Expert Group, addressed the University Presidents in February, informing attendees that the revised report was due to be presented to the Minister for Education and Skills in late February for subsequent publication and discussion.

The Provost informed the Board of some of his personal analysis of the current higher education environment in the context of the expected findings of the report, including:

- The current recurrent grant allocation model for third level funding has resulted in an increase in the numbers of Irish students attending higher education institutions, while the actual funding per student has fallen;
- The growth in numbers attending Irish universities is fuelled by students traditionally recruited into Institutes of Technology. As Institutes of Technology seek to fill their courses, there has been a subsequent detrimental knock-on effect on recruitment into PLC courses and apprenticeships;
- The aim is for 72% of Irish secondary school leavers to enter further or higher education. This represents one of the highest rates in the EU, with one of the lowest levels of funding per head;
- Drop-out rates in the higher education sector can exceed 20%. The drop-out rate averages 10% across Irish universities. At 7%, Trinity had the lowest drop-out rate in the country;
- The current funding model makes it difficult for students who drop-out to re-enter higher education;
- Current, capital and student maintenance funding issues are lately to be addressed.

The Provost informed the Board that the Cassells report, when published, will enable a proper debate on options for higher education funding at this critical period for institutions of higher education in Ireland and with a view to the next programme for government.

A Board member asked the Provost if he has had an opportunity to raise the College's position with the Minister and the Department of Education and Skills. The Provost replied that, with the general election, College continues to liaise with key people in the Department and will engage with the Minister following the formation of a new government.

In reply to a query from a Board member, the Provost stated that each university approached the issues from their individual circumstances.

A Board member commented that any strategy on the future funding of higher education institutions should include strong student union input.

A Board member raised a concern that changes to the student maintenance grant, in particular a badly considered student loan scheme, could erode the good work done on diversifying the student profile in Trinity. The Provost replied that, while the maintenance grant is essential, sustainable methods for its funding should be considered. The Provost stated that the issue of whether a loan system could encounter difficulties recouping repayment from emigrating students may indeed be addressed in the Cassells report but we must await publication to see what level of detail is considered. The Provost cautioned against pre-empting the recommendations of the report on this issue.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

*Professor Catherine McCabe left the meeting at this point.*

A Board member mentioned that students are concerned that fees will not be capped and will continue to rise, pushing students towards courses with a guaranteed economic return. The Provost replied that, in the event that fees were introduced, it is likely that fee levels would be regulated in some way by the State.

The Provost confirmed that Trinity considers the whole island of Ireland to be its hinterland when recruiting students, and does not see the unfunded growth in student numbers at all costs as sustainable.

In response to a request from a Board member, the Secretary to the College will distribute links to 'Ireland's National Skills Strategy 2025' and 'Royal Irish Academy Advice Paper on the Future Funding of Higher Education in Ireland' reports to all Board members.

The President of the Students' Union requested that the Provost send an email to Heads of Schools, requesting that classes on 26 February should be rescheduled to allow students the opportunity to return home to vote in the general election. The Provost requested that the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies liaise with the President of the Students' Union following the Board meeting.

#### **BD/15-16/174 Planning Group Report No 14**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer presented the Planning Group Report no. 14, as circulated.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that Planning Group Report no. 14 was collated in the context of:

- Overseeing the implementation of the Strategic Plan 2014-2019, and receiving reports on progress on deliverables;
- Considering the revised financial forecasts for 2016/17-2020/21;
- Analysing trends in student numbers across all cohorts, in the context of HEA policy of unfunded growth;
- Monitoring the Board-approved business plans for Global Relations, Online education, Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU), Research Diversification and Industry Engagement Strategies;
- Reviewing and analysing the Annual Budgetary Cycle 2016/17;
- Reducing pay costs within a 12 month time-frame, as mandated by Board in June 2015 (BD-14-15/304)
- Providing opportunities for early drafts of human resource policies to be considered and assessed from the perspectives of academic and administrative/support units. In this period consideration has been given to the development of the Strategic Resource Plan, staff reassignment, the Fixed-term workers Act and revised process for re-engaging retired staff.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that despite gains in cost reduction and funding diversification, work remains to secure College's future financial sustainability.

In line with the Board instruction of June 2015 (BD/14-15/304 Planning Group Report No 13) to reduce pay costs, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that staff cost reductions have been achieved by non-renewal of contracts and consolidation of work in administrative areas. The Chief Operating Officer and the Director of Human Resources are leading a project to incorporate greater flexibility into the administrative services of College.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer updated the Board on the progress made against the College Strategic Plan 2014-19, noting that the ambitious requirements of the plan had put

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

demands on many areas of College although achievement of the Plan's targets would help to deliver financial sustainability.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the Trinity Education Policy (TEP) will be key to academic sustainability and good practices, and that critical TEP decision points are due before Council and College Committees in the coming months.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that final enrolments of non-EU students for 2015-16 is expected to exceed the target. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer highlighted both the increase in the numbers of non-EU undergraduate and postgraduate taught students and the signs that non-EU postgraduate research student numbers were starting to recover. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reiterated that international partnerships will be vital to achieving the ambitious 2016-17 non-EU targets. Although the 2015-16 Global Relations Strategy targets were met, the Board noted that realising 2016-17 non-EU targets will be challenging.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer referred to the Online Education Strategy, highlighting that College is on track to develop a good portfolio of programmes and student enrolments by 2018-19 but that the overall target of 1,000 online students in the Strategic Plan 2014-19 will be a challenge.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer drew Board's attention to Section 3 of the report setting out the summary update to the Financial Forecasts 2016/17 – 2020/21 along with the primary revisions from the May 2015 forecasts along with Section 4 that outlined the current status of the Annual Budgetary Cycle of 2016/17.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that income is projected to grow, with the Global Relations and Commercial Revenue income-generating strategies performing well and that the financial performance before depreciation will turn from a projected deficit to a projected surplus by 2018/19 however a projected deficit is forecasted to 2020/21 after depreciation. The forecasted negative cumulative revenue reserves were highlighted by the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer. The risk previously highlighted by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer regarding the increase required to meet 2016-17 non-EU student targets was reiterated by the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that while cost savings have been achieved, they remain insufficient to significantly impact the forecasted deficit. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer highlighted the cost of depreciation and of maintaining the College's infrastructure to the Board.

The Board noted that the C&AG have expressed concern as part of their annual audit in relation to the University's financial sustainability in the context of reported annual losses and accumulated negative revenue reserves. It was noted that this concern is also shared by the Audit Committee.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that the Annual Budgeting Cycle (ABC) meetings with Schools are scheduled to begin in late March 2016, the outcome of which will be brought to Executive Officers Group and then to the Board. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that the current projected deficit for 2016-17 is being addressed to meet the Board mandate of a planned balanced budget.

Following the update, a Board member welcomed the report as comprehensive, timely and detailed. A Board member commented that relative change, as well as actual change, in percentage reduction/increases was necessary to capture the full extent of variances across years.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

A Board member queried the indirect costs of research as quoted in the report, enquiring if it could be underestimated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the issue of the indirect costs of research is recognised on the risk register.

A Board member enquired if the structure of Trinity Online Services Limited would enable proper oversight of the company. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responded that the Bursar chairs a group which will enable oversight of the various initiatives that relate to digital education.

A Board member mentioned that the report showed progress against all goals in the College Strategic Plan 2014-19 except the 'Promote Student Life' goal which remains red. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responded that the status update represents a snapshot in time but in respect to that particular goal its red status reflected the slow progress on appointing a First Year Experience Officer, however there was now a plan to ensure that would happen.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that in the course of overseeing the strategic plan, Planning Group reports concerns to the Executive Officer Group (EOG) through the minutes of Planning Group which are an agenda item at each EOG meeting. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that levels of recurrent funding when combined with the level of ambition in the Strategic Plan continued to be a concern for Planning Group. It was hoped that the forthcoming report from the Expert Group on future funding for Higher Education will result in increased investment.

The Vice-President for Global Relations informed the Board that the Global Relations Office is working to produce guidelines around international partnerships, and would welcome any input or engagement from Board members.

The Board noted and approved Planning Group Report no. 14.

#### **BD/15-16/175 Commercial Revenue Unit – Trinity Commercial Services Business Plan**

The Provost welcomed Mr Adrian Neilan, Commercial Director, who joined the meeting for this item.

Mr Neilan presented the Trinity Commercial Services Business Plan and requested the Board's approval to establish a new subsidiary, Trinity Commercial Services Limited (TCSL), to focus on new commercial opportunities in the area of Brand Internationalisation.

Mr Neilan informed the Board that the business case as presented had been considered by the Library and Information Policy Committee and by the Finance Committee, where it was recommended for onward consideration and approval by the Board.

Mr Neilan, with advice from the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU) Advisory Board, has implemented a broad range of new commercial approaches and initiatives since 2014 resulting in:

- Total commercial revenue increasing significantly year-on-year;
- Increase in visitor numbers to the Book of Kells, with the Library Shop now making a substantially improved financial contribution to College;
- The CRU Advisory Board is confident that the CRU is firmly on track to meet, and probably exceed, projected revenue for 2015-16.

To build on this success, the business case for the TCSL subsidiary has been drawn up with reference to best practise in the university and private sector internationally, and is designed to recruit specialist personnel in retail and marketing. The TCSL organisational structure will have the flexibility required to function in a commercial environment.

Mr Neilan highlighted the following to the Board members:

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**



- Trinity is a distinctive brand of global consequence which will be attractive to partner companies;
- The business case promotes the use of proven business approaches, such as offering high-quality, handcrafted Irish products inspired by the Book of Kells, which has seen revenue growth of 35% in the Library Shop since 2014;
- Commercial approaches have been used to generate revenue for College in the past, but with additional focus and the correct operational model the rate of return will increase;
- The business plan proposes a multi-channel sales strategy, including using students, staff and alumni as key brand ambassadors, and increasing the online presence;
- The creation of the subsidiary will ensure the continued licensing of the Trinity brand and intellectual property;
- Alliances with strategic retail partners have the potential to provide substantial commercial opportunities, especially in North America;
- The business plan proposes a scaled, incremental hiring plan;
- With oversight by the CRU Advisory Board, staff will be employed under the right terms and conditions for commercial success;
- TCSL will employ specialist marketing and retail staff on a competitive salary range within a performance related remuneration scheme;
- The Commercial Director reassured Board that TCSL will not be used to outsource existing activity or staff;
- In relation to governance, the company would report to the Finance Committee every 6 months and onwards to the Board;
- The risk register had been reviewed and updated;
- The subsidiary will be fully owned and controlled by Trinity College Dublin, with the draft legal Agreement and Memorandum and Articles of Association, with legal advice and drafted in association with the Secretary's Office, to come before Board in due course.

Following the presentation, the Board members comments included:

- The plan provides a very exciting opportunity for College;
- A Board member warmly welcomed the additional revenue generated for the College;
- To protect the Trinity reputation, products should be of a consistently high standard of design;
- The supply chain should be validated, to ensure partner organisations hold to the same values as Trinity;
- Engagement with staff representative associations would be welcome;
- That the choice products should be carefully considered, with reference to the Trinity ethos;
- A member questioned whether all alumni should retain @tcd.ie email addresses.

A number of Board members were anxious that practices such as zero hours contracts should not be permitted, and questioned if the creation of a subsidiary will allow human resources standards to be lowered or reduce workers' rights and benefits. Mr Neilan responded that no sharp employment practices or zero hour contracts would be tolerated or allowed in this new entity. He outlined that the basis of the success of this venture would be enhancing the Trinity brand and poor employment practices would run counter to this purpose. Mr Neilan also confirmed that the subsidiary will not be subject to the TUPE (Protection of Employees' Rights on Transfer of Undertakings) Regulations as it is anticipated that no existing Trinity employees would be moving across to this new venture. In response to a comment from a Board member, the Commercial Director reassured the Board that staff would be paid competitive market rates for their work and that the company would not engage in any employment or other practices which would take from Trinity's reputation and image.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**



Mr Neilan informed the Board that the increased commercial revenue will additionally allow him to regularize contracts and bring more security to existing Trinity employees who work in the Commercial Revenue Unit.

A Board member questioned why the company cannot exist within current College staffing and structures. The Commercial Director responded that attracting the right people required them to be incentivised appropriately, and the flexibility of the subsidiary structure will allow this.

A Board member mentioned that some areas of College can be unsightly and littered, especially with extra visitors in fine weather. The Commercial Director responded that the revenue generated through commercial activities will enable better services, as evidenced by a new Service Level Agreement being put in place with Estates and Faculties for maintenance and clean-up. Such agreements are a good example of how commercial activities can be of benefit to College.

A Board member mentioned that oversight of the financial aspects of the subsidiary will be managed through the Finance Committee, but questioned the lack of oversight of the human resources aspects apart from the establishment of a Remuneration Committee by the proposed company. The Commercial Director will address this concern in the next update to Board.

The Chief Operating Officer informed the Board members that the Commercial Director has been liaising closely with students and staff, who are pleased with the proposals and the opportunities afforded by the business plan. The Commercial Revenue Unit worked very well with other units in the Corporate Services Division.

*The Chief Operating Officer left the meeting at this point.*

A member of the Board praised both the Commercial Director and the CRU Advisory Board who are working to maximise the Trinity brand in a sustainable manner. A member reassured the Board that the aim of TCSL is to leverage the Trinity brand without damaging it in any way, and reiterated that the governance of the subsidiary will ultimately fall to the Trinity Board and its members. A Board member stated that the Commercial Director and the CRU Advisory Board have superb commercial acumen, and it would not be in their interest to steer College in the wrong direction.

The Provost informed the Board that College will be protected through the Memorandum and Articles of Association of the company, the legal Agreement and brand/trademark agreements with the new subsidiary. The Provost reminded the Board that it is in the interest of the College to further develop its commercial potential and revenue.

A Board member stated that a small framework document, drawn up with input from staff representative bodies, would go a long way in alleviating any human resource concerns.

The Provost praised the work of the Commercial Director and highlighted some examples of the good returns seen to date, including the Ussher II recruitment programme.

The Provost thanked the Commercial Director, who left the meeting at this point.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer confirmed that the Commercial Director will remain a Trinity employee, and that the company would reimburse the university for the time devoted to company activities.

The Board noted the Trinity Commercial Services Business Plan and Presentation from the Commercial Director. The Commercial Director is to present the draft constitution of the subsidiary company and the draft legal Agreement for approval by the Board.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

The Commercial Director is to draft a short framework document on terms and remuneration for employees and a short document on governance of brand reputation for presentation to the Board in due course, both of which could form part of the legal agreement or the Memorandum and Articles of Association.

**BD/15-16/176 Statutes**

The Registrar reported to the Board that a majority of the Fellows had granted their Assent to the recent Ordinance to amend the Statutes. The proposed amendments had been forwarded to the Visitors for final consideration and approval. A Board member commented favourably on the manner in which the matter had been dealt with by the Registrar.

**BD/15-16/177 Estates Review**

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation updated the Board on the Estates Review as informed by the external international expertise provided by Turnberry Consulting Limited. The update had also been provided to the Estates Policy Committee.

Turnberry visited campus to conduct interviews, prepare special case studies and compare College to comparable universities. The initial findings of the report include:

- An estates strategy is necessary to create an effective and sustainable campus and that such a strategy should be prepared prior to developing an Estates Master Plan;
- Trinity is ranked amongst the best historical campuses, but suffers from elements in the current approach to estates management, including deferred maintenance;
- Infrastructure quality has not been optimised and, as a result, the campus is not presented to its maximum potential;
- The dominance of large scale projects resulted in limited small scale and refurbishment projects;
- Trinity should conduct a feasibility study regarding improvements in the Hamilton and the Arts Building – with modest investment these areas could be improved substantially;
- Trinity has a traditional approach to learning, and lags behind other comparable universities when offering informal breakout and education spaces;
- Sub-optimal use of current lecture theatres and reflective spaces;
- Students are increasingly intolerant of outdated resources;
- Trinity offers low residential provision across comparable universities;
- The West End requires exterior and landscape improvements;
- Providing parking spaces is inhibiting further development;
- Lack of sufficient qualitative data regarding usage patterns impairs decision making across the campus. Data on efficiency and use of spaces, a register of learning spaces and a conditions survey is required;
- Recommend the development of a plan for campus growth, and the implications of such a plan for estates management.

*Mr Keohane left the meeting at this point.*

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation would welcome input from Board members.

Professor O'Farrelly, Chair of the Estates Policy Committee, advised that the Estates Policy Committee are convening a special meeting to address the report in detail.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation informed the Board that the report was presented to Executive Officers Group, who recommended the correction of some factual errors, and then onward presentation to Board.

The Board noted the Estates Review as presented by the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation is to present the findings of the Turnberry Report at the Board meeting of 23 March 2016.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

*Professor O'Neill left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/15-16/178 Foundation Scholarship 2014/15 – Election to Scholarship**

Board members recited the Declaration to be made by members of Board when Electing Fellows and Scholars in their choice of language, as circulated. The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 28 January 2016, awarding one additional Non-Foundation Scholarship for 2014-15. As per the Statutes, the tenure of the new scholar should commence from 1 July 2016.

**BD/15-16/179 Proposal for Tobacco Free Zones**

This item was deferred to the meeting of 23 March 2016.

**BD/15-16/180 Fellowship 2016**

The Board approved the nominations for Fellowship and Honorary Fellowship as presented by the Provost.

**BD/15-16/181 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of meeting of 10 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/182 Any Other Urgent Business**

There were no items of any other urgent business.

**SECTION A.2**

**BD/15-16/183 Draft Dignity and Respect Policy**

The draft Dignity and Respect Policy was referred to the HR Committee, and will be returned to Board for consideration at a later date.

**BD/15-16/184 Trinity Website URL Policy**

The Board noted and approved the Trinity Website URL Policy, as circulated with the draft minutes of Library and Information Policy Committee of 7 December 2015 (Agenda item B.17)

**SECTION B**

**BD/15-16/185 Board Business**

**(i) Callover**

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 27 January 2016

**BD/15-16/063 Global Brain Health Initiative**

In response to a query from a Board member, the Secretary to the College reported that a new set of guidelines in relation to whether Board needed to note large research projects would be brought to the Board meeting of 23 March 2016.

**BD/15-16/071 Human Resources Committee**

Mr Frost, Chair of the Committee, reported that a proposal in relation to contracts for Administrative and Support Staff had been considered by the Committee and would be forwarded to the Board for consideration.

**(ii) Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 27 January 2016.

**BD/15-16/186 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 7 December 2015, as circulated.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Under LIPC/15-16/13, Professor Ó Siochrú, Chair of the Committee, raised concerns regarding the uncoupling of the Research Collections Study Centre from the first phase of the Trinity Visitors Experience. Professor Ó Siochrú informed the Board that the Library and Information Policy Committee (LIPC) believed the study centre was integral to the Trinity Visitors Experience strategy.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation responded that, although initially part of the Trinity Visitors Experience, including the study centre would have resulted in the loss of 100 reading spaces in the current Library. Alternative locations for the study centre are under active consideration with the Librarian and College Archivist, and will be informed by a feasibility study of the Library estate. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation will attend a future meeting of the LIPC to update the Committee members on progress on securing space for the study centre.

*The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/15-16/187 Finance Committee**

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 22 January 2016.

The Board noted and approved the extract from the draft minutes of meeting of 15 February 2016 in relation to the FIS project (FN/15-16/98).

**BD/15-16/188 College Safety Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 11 November 2015, and the change of the name of the Committee to the University Safety Committee.

**SECTION C**

**BD/15-16/189 Board Elections 2016**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 15 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/190 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/191 Senate Business - Recommendations for the award of the degree MA (jure officii)**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 17 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/192 Prizes and Other Awards**

- (i) **School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2014/2015**  
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Medical Student Coordinator Sophister Years, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 20 January 2016.
- (ii) **Patrick O'Sullivan Prize**  
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Deputy Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 15 February 2016.
- (iii) **Visual and Performing Arts Fund 2015/2016**  
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 12 February 2016.
- (iv) **Taylor Exhibition**  
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Professor of Music, circulated, dated 8 February 2016.
- (v) **Student Prizes in the School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences**  
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, circulated, dated 12 February 2016.
- (vi) **Franz Fasenfeld Prize**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of School of Computer Science and Statistics, circulated, dated 1 February 2016.

(vii) **Minchin Bursary**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Student Support Officer, circulated, dated 9 February 2016.

(viii) **Jackie Akerele Fund**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Student Support Officer, circulated, dated 16 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/193 Benefactions - Seamus Heaney Chair in Irish Writing**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of School of English, circulated, dated 30 October 2015.

**BD/15-16/194 Approval of New Degree Title – Master in Pharmacy**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 17 February 2016.

**BD/15-16/195 Appeals Process for the decisions of the Review Committees for Administrative, Professional and Support Staff**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 15 February 2016.

#### **SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.