

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting of 30 April 2014

Present Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J H Ohlmeyer), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bourgoche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Mr G J Garrahan, Mr S Garry, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr R Kenny, Mr J Leahy, Mr T Lenihan, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H Rice.

Apologies Professor M Ó Siochrú.

In attendance Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms Victoria Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr John Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr Ian Mathews).

(by invitation) Interim Chief Operating Officer (Ms Geraldine Ruane).

The Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery Dublin and Acting Director of the Science Gallery attended for item BD/13-14/243.

The Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager attended for item BD/13-14/245.

SECTION A

BD/13-14/236 Statement of Interest

There were no statements of interest.

BD/13-14/237 Minutes

(i) **Meeting of 26 March 2014;**

The minutes of 26 March 2014 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

BD/13-14/196 (ii) amend the last line of the 4th paragraph to read: 'It was also noted that the roll-out of the iProcurement module had been paused for 2 months to allow for additional staff training and workshops.'

(ii) **Meeting of 26 March, reconvened on 2 April 2014;**

The minutes of 26 March, reconvened on 2 April 2014 were approved and signed.

(iii) **Meeting of 7 April 2014.**

The minutes of 7 April 2014 were approved and signed.

BD/13-14/238 Matters Arising from the Minutes

Two matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/13-14/239 and /240).

BD/13-14/239 Quality

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer updated Board in relation to minute BD/13-14/196 noting that Dr Brenda Cullen was allocating the majority of her time to working with Science Gallery Dublin.

BD/13-14/240 Incident at Front Gate

In relation to minute BD/13-14/207, the Chief Operating Officer advised the Board that the cost of repairs to the front gate would be pursued through the College's insurance policy.

BD/13-14/241 Provost's Report

The Provost provided a report to the Board on the following items:

(i) **Board Membership**

Dr Olive Braiden left the meeting for this item.

The Provost advised the Board of an upcoming vacancy on the Board for an external member and invited the Secretary to brief the Board on the requirements and previous method of selection. With reference to Section 3(2) (g) of the Trinity College Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000 the Secretary advised the Board of the requirement to establish a sub-committee of the Board which would be chaired by the Provost and consist of two other members.

The Board approved the establishment of a sub-committee of the Board with the following membership:

Provost (Chair), Professor Cliona O'Farrelly and Mr Frederick Cowzer.

It was agreed that this committee is to bring to a future meeting of the Board a list of organisations from which nominations for an external member of Board could be sought.

(ii) **Work Programme 2013-14**

The Provost addressed the following items of work to be completed by the end of 2014:

- Trinity Identity Initiative

It was noted that this item would be addressed under item A.7 on the Agenda.

- START
The Provost provided an update in relation to the START initiative noting the importance of restructuring and realigning the administrative and support functions of the College. In particular he noted the creation of the 3 divisions: Academic Services Division, Financial Services Division and the Corporate Services Division which were now formally established. It was also noted that a Deputy Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer is in the process of being appointed. The Provost advised that both the GeneSIS and FIS projects were progressing and that it is envisaged that the benefits realisation phases of both projects were ongoing.
- Strategic Plan 2014-2019
The Provost reminded Board members of the need for the College to diversify funding sources and emphasised the importance of integrating several of the ongoing College strategies to achieve the revenue targets which had been set. In particular he highlighted the Trinity Business and Innovation Hub and the E3 strategy, noting that both of these initiatives represented key infrastructural developments for the College which would result in significant reputational enhancement as well as additional revenue streams.

The Provost also advised Board members that it is envisaged that a plan to build student accommodation on the Oisín House site would come to a future Board meeting for consideration. The Bursar, in response to a query, clarified that the Enterprise Centre was an option for the development of student accommodation.

The question of Higher Education Funding would also be addressed with the symposium on 29 September 2014 as previously noted, to which Board members would be invited. The Provost informed Board members that the Vice-Chancellor of the University of California, Berkeley has been invited to address the symposium.

In response to a comment, the Provost advised the Board of the need to examine the future of Higher Education within Ireland, with particular reference to the expected applications of some Institutes of Technology for Technological University status, to ensure that diversity in the educational system is maintained.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Provost advised that line managers should engage and communicate with Staff during the START process and that further consideration should be given to appropriate methods of communication. It was noted that engagement between the START project team and Staff representative bodies should be encouraged.

In support of a comment from a Board member, the Provost commended the staff involved in the GeneSIS and FIS projects to date. The Chief Operating Officer, responding to a query in relation to benefits realisation from the two projects, advised the Board that a review of reassignment, realignment and voluntary redundancy possibilities arising from the implementation of GeneSIS and FIS was in progress. The Provost confirmed that he was examining this issue in conjunction with the Chief Operating Officer, the Director of Human Resources, the Director of Change Management and an external expert.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/13-14/242 Strategic Plan 2014-2019 - Update

The Board noted the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 22 April 2014.

Referring to the decline in public sector funding which has been experienced since 2008, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer emphasised the importance of having a clear and strategic approach for the funding of future activities, while continuing to argue for adequate funding from the government. She then invited Board's attention to an analysis on the issue of the future scale of Trinity College, prepared by Indecon, which included a discussion of the appropriate internationalisation ambitions for the College. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board members of the need for the College to build on its existing reputational strengths, to seize opportunities and to grow appropriately. Such successes had been achieved by comparable universities in other countries. She advised the Board that it is envisaged that initial targets regarding the percentage of non-EU student recruitment will be brought to a future meeting of the Executive Officer Group and to Board for consideration.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and opened the item for discussion.

The following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) The need to focus on quality and quality maintenance;
- (ii) The importance of adequately encouraging academic units to develop suitable programmes to attract non-EU students and rewarding those areas who actively engage in the process;
- (iii) The need to introduce a flexible examination system which would enhance the non-EU student experience and increase student recruitment potential;
- (iv) The opportunities represented by the US and Norwegian markets.

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the 5 UK Universities used as comparators in the document were chosen as they were high quality universities which had internationalised in a very short period of time.

At the invitation of the Provost, the Vice-President for Global Relations addressed the Board, advising members of the potential represented by the Asian student recruitment market and the importance of the College being prepared to build on this opportunity.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, in response to a query, clarified that the data in the document related to 2012/13 student data, which represented the most recently published and verified data. She also advised the Board that while the International Student Barometer highlighted some deficits in the international student experience, there were many changes which could be made internally, which were relatively inexpensive and would address a number of the issues raised.

In response to a query in relation to student accommodation, the Bursar informed the Board that plans were being made to double the size of available student accommodation, with a view to ensuring adequate facilities for the potential growth in international students.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that the document was to aid initial discussion and it was noted that the draft strategic objectives will be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

It was agreed to organise a special purpose Strategic Planning session for Board members at an off campus venue. It was also agreed that the supporting documents as prepared by Indecon would be made available to Board members to facilitate this planning session.

BD/13-14/243 Science Gallery - Annual Review 2013

The Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery Dublin and Acting Director of the Science Gallery attended for this item.

The Board noted the Science Gallery Annual Review 2013.

The Acting Director of the Science Gallery provided the Board with a summary of the activity in the Science Gallery Dublin in 2013 including the following:

- (i) There were 339,264 visitors to the Science Gallery, the core group of which were 15-25 years old;
- (ii) 7% of CAO applicants noted that the Science Gallery Dublin was a direct influence on their choice of course and 38% noted that they had attended the Science Gallery;
- (iii) Both Google and ICON renewed their support for a further 5 years;
- (iv) New funding of €1.8 million from the Wellcome Trust to support a 5 year collaboration between the Science Gallery and the Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute(TBSI);
- (v) Exhibitions toured Moscow and Canada with a further tour planned for San Diego;
- (vi) An Taoiseach, Enda Kenny T.D., launched the 2014 programme.

The Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery drew the Board's attention to the following points:

- (i) The need to keep the Science Gallery exhibitions fresh and to continue to attract top quality exhibitors;
- (ii) The fact that the Science Gallery is fully cognisant of the need to be sustainable and that further fundraising was being actively addressed;
- (iii) The importance of Science Gallery International to Science Gallery Dublin, particularly in relation to revenue streams.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Bursar clarified that the Science Gallery Dublin is not currently part of the Commercialisation Strategy but the possibilities will be explored particularly in relation to public outreach opportunities. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer also advised Board that on an annual basis the Science Gallery Dublin has covered associated costs and it is envisaged that start-up costs will be repaid within the next ten years.

The Vice-President for Global Relations emphasised the importance of the Science Gallery Dublin and Science Gallery International to the Global Relations Strategy and the significant contribution both make to international student recruitment and the showcasing of research.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to a query from a Board member, the Acting Director clarified the breakdown of the €1.8m funding from the Wellcome Trust noting that it has contributed to 1 shared post between the Science Gallery Dublin and the Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute (TBSI).

In response to a comment from a Board member regarding the importance of emphasising the Trinity connection to the Science Gallery Dublin, the Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery advised Board that the Director of Communications and Marketing was actively involved in discussions with the Board of the Science Gallery and the Acting Director confirmed that the College Branding Policy, as agreed by the College Board, is in place.

The Provost thanked the Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery Dublin and Acting Director of the Science Gallery and wished the Science Gallery Dublin well for the coming year.

BD/13-14/244 Amendments to KPIs

The Provost, noting the importance of annual budgetary discussions being informed by reliable and accurate data, invited the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to introduce the item.

Noting that there is currently very little discretionary income available to Schools, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, referred to the previously circulated memorandum, outlining the proposed refinement of the current KPIs under 8 Headings.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Board that when the College's Strategic Plan is complete and at implementation stage, it is envisaged that consideration will be given to how the objectives of the plan might be translated into School-level KPIs.

The Provost opened the item for discussion.

Responding to a query in relation to measuring the output from teaching, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that at present this data is captured at individual School level and that there was no College-wide process for capturing such data which could result in comparable and measurable metrics.

In response to a suggestion from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer agreed to give consideration to capturing gender data in the KPIs. In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that only postgraduate students in timescale are to be included in the calculations for the proposed KPI on postgraduate research students per Faculty.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Board that as there is currently no migration of resources between Faculties, possible ways to re-allocate resources are being explored.

The Board noted the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 17 April 2014.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board approved the proposed amendments to the Key Performance Indicators subject to the following additional changes:

- KPI 1 is amended to show Income- Expenditure/ Expenditure x100% so the percentage deviation from income is visible.
- KPI 2 should be removed.
- KPI 7 should refer the information on Research Institutes to the relevant Heads of School so that Institute activities remain associated with the Schools.
- An additional KPI is included to track the percentage of non-EU students in a School's cohort, benchmarked as appropriate.

It was noted that information from an exit survey of graduating students could also be added to the process and that the proposed KPIs may need to be revised in light of the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 (once finalised).

The Vice-Provost/ Chief Academic Officer agreed to prepare a paper for a future meeting of the Board outlining the norms and acceptable deviations, minimum and maximum outcomes for each of the KPIs and the context in which such metrics are to be used.

It was also noted that the full set of KPIs, showing the performance of each School would be brought back to a future meeting of the Board and that the trends in the performance of each School should be captured.

BD/13-14/245 Identity Initiative Logotype

The Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager attended for this item.

The Board noted the memorandum from the Marketing Manager, dated 21 April 2014.

The Provost, introducing the item, informed Board of the consultation process which had been conducted since the meeting of Board on 26 March 2014, including Town Hall meetings with staff and students. He advised the Board of the significant level of interest which had been expressed in relation to this item and in particular the general view that there is a need for consistency in Trinity's visual identity to maximise impact. Noting the importance of further consultation with the College community and alumni, the Provost invited the Marketing Manager to provide an update to the Board on the initiative.

The Marketing Manager invited the Board's attention to a presentation outlining the variations to the proposed logotype which reflect the previous comments from the Board as well as the feedback received as part of the discussion and consultation with the College community. It was noted that the logotype was just one part of the overall visual identity which included other aspects such as photography, a recommended colour palette and an identity toolkit for use by the College community in presentations, brochures and other documents.

During the course of discussion the following views were expressed by Board members:

- (i) The comprehensive consultation process was welcomed and the debate to date demonstrated the College's openness to dialogue;
- (ii) That closing the book and reviewing the colour be considered.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (iii) Upon completion, it will be important for the new logotype to be used consistently and maximised in areas of high visibility;
- (iv) The proposal to use the words 'Trinity College Dublin' was welcomed;
- (v) The Provost may consider issuing a communication to the College community on the developments with the initiative and the proposed next steps.

The dissent of Professor Barrett was noted.

In response to comments from two Board members suggesting that a final decision should be made immediately, the Provost and the Senior Lecturer emphasised the importance of continuing the consultation process.

In response to a query, the Marketing Manager provided a summary of the costs of the initiative to date and advised the Board that adoption of a consistent visual identity could result in an ongoing saving of up to 15% on current graphic design costs, which were currently engaged on a fragmented and ad hoc basis.

It was agreed that consultation with the College community, including alumni, would continue, led by the Provost or a nominated College Officer and the Marketing Manager. Following that consultative process, this item would be discussed further at a future meeting of Board, with a view to having final agreement in place later in 2014.

Noting that the Board considered the amendments to the proposed logotype to be an improvement, the Provost thanked the Director of Communications and Marketing and the Marketing Manager who then left the meeting.

BD/13-14/246 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the meeting of 16 April 2014.

BD/13-14/247 Any Other Urgent Business

Elections to the Board, Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency.

Ms Sheila Dunphy left the meeting for this item.

The Secretary invited the Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 29 April 2014, which had been tabled. He provided a summary of the procedure which had been followed in relation to the elections to the Board in the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff constituency.

The Board noted and approved the action of the Returning Officer/Secretary to the College as outlined in the tabled memorandum.

Section B

BD/13-14/248 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 26 March, reconvened on 2 April 2014.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(ii) **Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meetings of 26 March and 2 April 2014.

BD/13-14/249 Equality Committee

The Board noted and where a decision was required, approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 14 April 2014.

In relation to minute Eqal/13-14/26 the Registrar informed the Board that this item is to be considered by the Schedules Working Party.

The Board, following clarification from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, reaffirmed the requirement that completion of the LEAD training programme is mandatory for all staff on selection panels.

BD/13-14/250 Finance Committee

The Board noted and where a decision was required, approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 24 March 2014.

SECTION C

BD/13-14/251 Board and Council 2014-2015

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 15 April 2014.

BD/13-14/252 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 March 2014 and 16 April 2014, as circulated.

BD/13-14/253 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 8 April 2014.

BD/13-14/254 Revised Annual Leave for Staff

The Board noted and approved revised Procedure No 26, with effect from 7 January 2014, as circulated.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings