

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 27 February 2013

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor M Bourouche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Mr R Dunne, Mr D Ferrick, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr M J McAndrew, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Ms N Murray, Ms A S Ní Chonaire, Professor D O'Neill, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H J Rice.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor S D C Barrett, Professor C O'Farrelly.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer, Vice-President for Global Relations.

BD/12-13/177 Declaration of Interest

The Secretary declared that he had a potential conflict of interest in Agenda item D.2. The Board agreed he would remain present for the item.

BD/12-13/178 Minutes

- (i) The minutes of the meeting held on 23 January 2012 were approved and signed.
- (ii) The minutes of the meeting held on 30 January 2013 were approved subject to the following amendments:

BD/12-13/149 Trinity Foundation Report - November 2012

The text in point (iii) on Pg 4 was amended to read: "there should be clear channels of communication between the Foundation and Schools and Faculties and within Schools and Faculties;"

The last sentence of the second last paragraph was amended to read "The Board further noted that the College Secretary will liaise with the Trustees and request that the Foundation present their proposed ethics principles on sources of funding to the Board in due course."

BD/12-13/179 Matters Arising from the Minutes

Several matters arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/180, 181 and 182 below).

BD/12-13/180 Funding Statements for year ended 30 September 2012 (see minute BD/12-13/134 of 23 January 2013)

In response to a query raised at the meeting of 23 January 2013, the Treasurer advised Board of the sum that the College Collections are valued at for insurance purposes and of the premium for such insurance. The Board noted that the sums to be insured and the inventories for the collections are updated by the curators responsible for the various collections.

BD/12-13/181 College High Level Risk Register (see minute BD/12-13/136 of 23 January 2013)

The Board noted that the President of Students' Union had received a response to his letter regarding the Tutorship Scheme to the Minister for Education & Skills. The Minister's letter stated that the Department's reason for discontinuing remuneration was that it considers the role of Tutors as part of the overall role of the academic service to students. The Board also noted that the President of the Students' Union had also written to the Chair of the Oireachtas Committee on Social Protection & Education who is in support of the Tutorship Scheme and that she has agreed to include it as an item on the agenda at a meeting of the Committee.

BD/12-13/182 BD/12-13/149 Trinity Foundation Report - November 2012 (see minute BD/12-13/149 of 30 January 2013)

In response to a query regarding fundraising activity referred to in the School of Medicine's submission for quality review purposes, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Office advised Board that she would investigate the matter with the Head of School of Medicine.

BD/12-13/183 Provost's Report

The Board noted an update from the Provost on the following items:

(i) Landscape Process

The Board noted an update from the Provost on the Landscape Process and on the meeting with the HEA on 14 February 2013, noting that a copy of the agreed minutes from that meeting will be sent to Board members in due course. The Provost advised Board that he had informed the HEA of the College's preference to advance collaboration with other Universities and other organisations by offering students pathways between the institutions similar to the College's current collaboration with University College Dublin via the Innovation Alliance, noting that he did not see the necessity for formal mergers. The Provost further advised that he was positive regarding the establishment of Technological Universities should the criteria be met, but noted that the prospect of Technological Universities had perhaps inhibited the discussion of pathways between Institutes of Technology and universities in the Dublin region. The Board noted that it was the College's preference to

continue to collaborate through the Innovation Alliance, and in the areas of Creative Arts and Education.

The Provost advised Board that the HEA recognised the value of the College's existing collaborations and that the College was not only a regional one but a University for the whole country and one of consequence on the world stage. The Provost further advised Board of the HEA's views regarding forming a regional cluster and that he had voiced the College's preference for a light form of governance over any proposed cluster. The Board noted the HEA were open to take the College's views on board in this regard.

The Provost advised Board that he had expressed disappointment regarding the decision of the Church of Ireland College of Education to transfer its links from the College to Dublin City University, but the matter is now settled and we wish them well in their new arrangements with Dublin City University. The Board noted the College may have an opportunity to collaborate with Carlow College in the area of Arts & Humanities. The Board noted that once the HEA have concluded their series of meetings with other institutions they will present their recommendations to the Minister of Education & Skills.

In the course of a discussion, the following views were expressed by Board members:

- (i) it is positive that the Department of Education & Skills accepts that the collaboration in the area of creative arts adds value to the College;
- (ii) the focus in future collaborations in the area of creative arts will be on increased mobility of students rather than on any structural changes to the way creative arts education is managed in the Dublin region;
- (iii) any request for the College to collaborate with other institutions should be considered carefully with a view to the reputation and the brand of the College internationally;
- (iv) any cluster-governance proposal from the HEA that would see a governance body sit above the Board of the College would be a cause for grave concern;
- (v) the College should be mindful of any consequences which may arise from College engagement in a cluster;
- (vi) the College should develop a set of principles upon which it is prepared to engage in a cluster.

In response to the issues raised by Board members, the Provost advised Board that a cluster may be a positive step for the College if the correct governance and branding arrangements could be agreed. The Board noted that any recommendations from the HEA on clusters will be presented to the Department of Education & Skills for consideration and at present it is difficult to predict what the final proposals for clustering will involve, noting that the Minister for Education & Skills has expressed the view that he does not propose to introduce primary legislation to implement clustering. The Provost advised that the governance of the higher education system could introduce a number of reforms which may be positive for the higher education sector.

The Board agreed that a paper from Executive Officers on the principles, including governance arrangements, upon which the College would engage in a cluster would be presented to Board for consideration at its next meeting.

(ii) **CRANN**

The Board noted that CRANN had been awarded funding for its AMBER Centre under the recent SFI funding announcement for research centres.

BD/12-13/184 Annual Budgetary Cycle: Principles and Process

The Provost, introducing the item, advised the Board of the challenges experienced by the College under previous resource allocation models and that it is intended that the proposed Annual Budgeting Cycle (ABC) principles and process will bring greater alignment of College's resources with its core objectives of supporting excellence in teaching and research and of directing investment towards strategic priorities.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 18th February 2013, which had been circulated. She advised Board that, notwithstanding the College's current limited flexibility to manage costs, it is important that the refined ABC principles be adopted. The Board noted that for the next few years the College is likely to be faced with allocating diminishing resources until the College's income generation strategies come to fruition.

The Board noted that following a review of the 2012/13 ABC process, a number of refinements are proposed, namely:

- (i) planning in the context of consolidated income and expenditure so that Planning Group can have a full overview of the College's finances and plan accordingly;
- (ii) the introduction of 3-year, multi-annual planning for all areas;
- (iii) the incorporation of the costs associated with self-financing courses into the primary allocations to Schools;
- (iv) the introduction of a mechanism to allow Schools to enjoy the financial benefits of new and incremental income generating activities;
- (v) the development of the process to facilitate a transition from a historic, cost-based budgetary allocation to a more strategic allocation. The Board noted that when surpluses are generated through approved income strategies, the level of resources available for strategic allocation will increase;
- (vi) the incorporation of academic Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) into the ABC process (in two phases).

The Board noted that the proposed academic KPIs, which will not be weighted, will cover research, teaching quality, society engagement and innovation, recognizing that there is no single performance indicator for Schools. The Board noted that work is ongoing in relation to establishing a capital reserve fund in order to manage and plan for capital replenishment. Noting the College's current financial position, the Treasurer advised Board that the College had engaged strategies with the aim of generating sustainable funding streams for the future.

During the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (a) particular consideration should be given to identifying appropriate KPIs for teaching,

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) the College should consider partnership with the SU in order to deliver 'learning outside the classroom' programmes;
- (c) Schools should be given an incentive to generate income;
- (d) under the proposal for KPIs Schools will have to perform well in all four areas in order to receive the portion of funding linked to KPIs;
- (e) there should be transparency in relation to the mechanism for allocating space;
- (f) KPIs for non-academic areas should be included in service level agreements;
- (g) the College should have an appropriate contingency fund;
- (h) the distinction of discipline specific KPIs is a positive step forward;
- (i) it is difficult to precisely define what innovation is and how to measure it;
- (j) the College should be mindful of making strategic investments which have the potential of becoming an on-going core cost to areas.

In response to the issues raised the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that it is important to have a process to capture the quality of teaching as well as research noting the desire to move away from capturing quantity and move towards capturing quality. She further advised that a difficulty also existed in capturing the number of staff who generate research income noting that this is particularly prevalent in the area of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences. The Board noted the challenges in capturing teaching quality metrics however that progress has been made in the area of student evaluation.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that further consideration is necessary in relation to the proposed KPIs and this was the first step in the process. The Board noted that the ABC process is intended to facilitate Schools to undertake new activity and acknowledged that Schools need a mechanism to benefit from income they generate. The Treasurer advised Board that the issue of space allocation will be addressed through the Quality Review Implementation plan of the Office of the Director of Buildings and that it will not form part of the current ABC process. The Treasurer further advised Board that future allocations to non-academic areas will be based on a certain percentage of total budget and that all non-academic areas will be required to enter into the service level agreements under the START process. The Board noted that the College will develop a general contingency fund through generating a surplus, noting that it is not permitted to have general provisions under GAAP.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that a consultation process will take place in order to determine how best to define KPIs and that a progress report on KPIs will form part of the next Planning Group Report to Board. The Board noted the annual allocation to Faculty Deans and the Chief Operating Officer for strategic allocations and the strategic staff reserve fund. Noting that all strategic allocations are currently reported twice a year to the Planning Group, the Board agreed that proposals for a strategic allocation should be approved by the Planning Group in advance to ensure that the allocations are clearly strategic in nature.

The Board approved the proposed principles and process as presented noting that a report on Key Performance Indicators will be included in the next Planning Group Report to Board.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Treasurer.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/12-13/185 Planning Group Report No 8

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated, 19 February 2013, which had been circulated, under the following headings:

1. **Mid-term review of the Strategic Plan (see minute BD/12-13/147 of 30 January 2012)**
2. **Annual Budgetary Cycle (see minute BD/12-13/184 above)**
3. **Financial Update**

The Treasurer advised Board of the level of retained resources required to achieve a breakeven outturn in 2011/12 and of the planned shortfall of income over expenditure projected in June 2012 under the finalised 2012/13 ABC. He advised Board that a detailed update will be provided at the next meeting however indications are that the shortfall of income over expenditure will be in excess of that originally forecasted in June 2012 due to a decrease in projected student numbers and falling bank interest rates. The Board noted that once the clarifications of the new proposed terms of the Croke Park Agreement are received these will be factored into the College's financial forecasts.
4. **Income generation**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer the Board that the College had made investments in the following three strategies:

 - (a) **Global Relations Strategy**

The Board noted that it is expected that the income targets set for 2012/2013/2014 will be achieved and that indications are that an increased number of applications from international students will be received by the College.
 - (b) **Philanthropy**

The Board noted that increased emphasis is being placed on philanthropic efforts in order to maintain current activities in light of decreasing funding from the State.
 - (c) **Commercialisation (see minute BD/12-13/187 below).**
5. **Allocation of Strategic Funds**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Planning Group receives a detailed report on the allocations made for strategic purposes by the Faculty Deans and the Chief Operating Officer, noting that a percentage of the funds under the remit of the Chief Operating Officer not utilized will revert into the strategic fund.
6. **Fee Income**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that there has been no increase in student fees over the last number of years and that it is now necessary to undertake a market analysis of Non-EU Undergraduate and EU and Non-EU Postgraduate fees. The Board noted that this analysis will be presented in the next Planning Group Report to Board. The Board also noted that at present the College does not operate a pay per module system and that this could place the College at a disadvantage in terms of collaboration progress with institutions which do operate this model.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

7. Human Resources Strategy

The Board noted that work on the Human Resources Strategy is progressing led by the Director of Human Resources and that the Planning Group have examined the management of resources within the constraints of the Employment Control Framework (ECF). To date this has been achieved by assigning staff to non-exchequer funding streams, noting that the College has maintained the required balance between senior and junior staff as required under the ECF. Recognising the importance of academic recruitment to the achievement of the College strategic priorities, the Strategic Staffing Subgroup (supported by HR) has undertaken a review of the recruitment processes for senior academic positions. The Board noted that workload models for each School are currently being developed and a report on the model each School will adopt and how it will be implemented will be provided to the Vice-Provost/CAO.

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) the Dean of Students should be assigned a portion of the strategic fund;
- (ii) increasing student fees significantly could have a negative effect on attracting students to the College;
- (iii) the College should not introduce a pay per module model for students who go off-books;
- (iv) the issue of the incomplete data on student numbers should be of concern to the College;
- (v) the College should consult with Trade Union Groups in relation to the Human Resources Strategy, in particular the workload model;
- (vi) the College should take steps to address the reducing number of students being provided through the Foundation course delivered by Study Group International;
- (vii) the College should make a co-ordinated effort to capitalize on the opportunity to attract PhD students from Brazil who will receive funding for their studies;
- (viii) the College should take steps to address any financial shortfall which may arise in the interim period before the College's income generation strategies come to fruition.

The Provost advised Board that a commitment had already been made to the Dean of Students to make funds available for the implementation of the Orientation Review and that further allocations had been made to other student services through the Chief Operating Officer Strategic Fund, noting that only Faculty Deans and Chief Operating Officer receive an allocation from the Strategic Fund.

In response to the issues raised, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that all workload models have been developed in consultation with the Schools to ensure they will be fit for purpose and will be workable within the Schools. Noting that the College does require a Foundation Course provider, the Vice-President for Global Relations advised Board that the students who enter the College after completing the Study Group International Foundation course are achieving high academic standards although the number of students remains low. She further advised the Board that a co-ordinated approach to attracting Brazilian PhD students has been adopting, noting the contribution of the Dean of Graduate Studies in this regard.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Provost advised Board that it was unacceptable that Faculties could not provide complete student number data noting that some delays may have been caused by implementation issues with GeneSIS and SITS. The Board noted that there were no plans to introduce fees for off-books students however acknowledging that a review of all fees should be undertaken. The Treasurer advised Board that the financial projections to June 2012 were based on a number of assumptions, some of which may no longer be as relevant. He further advised Board that he would not be supporting future cumulative underlying deficits and that it is the intention that the approved income generation strategies will enable the College achieve a break-even/surplus position in the future.

The Board noted the Planning Group Report as presented by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Treasurer.

BD/12-13/186 Quality

The Provost invited Board's attention to the reports on the quality reviews and implementation plans of the following areas carried out in accordance with the quality assurance procedures for administrative areas:

(i) **Implementation Plan for the Director of Buildings Area**

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to the Implementation Plan for the Director of Buildings Area, which had been circulated. Noting the recommendations, she advised Board that the implementation plan related to areas such as the structure of the office, management, outsourcing, KPIs, IT systems, training and communication. She advised Board that the issue of charging for space had been considered but that no recommendation would be made in this regard at present. In response to a number of queries, the Chief Operating Officer advised that space allocation will be facilitated through a corporate services division delivered through the START process and the needs of key stakeholders, including student-led organisations, should be considered in all decisions relating to space allocation. The Board also noted that the existing Estate Management information systems (GVA) will be replaced as part of the final stage of the College's eStrategy implementation and as a major IT system it will support the rolling out of an 'on line' help desk.

The Board approved the Implementation plan as presented, noting that the details of the implementation plan (actions, ownership and timings) would be reviewed, approved and amended as required via the START process.

(ii) **Provost's Report to Board for Human Resources.**

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to the Provost's report to Board for Human Resources (HR), which had been circulated. She advised Board of the Provost's recommendations to Board for the area following the review and to the Reviewers' recommendations on areas such as the HR Strategy, HR advisors in Faculties, HR system development, hr metrics and staff development. The Board noted the challenges faced by HR, noting that recruitment and selection processes were viewed as positive but that the timelines could be improved.

During the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (a) consultation between HR and Trade Union Groups should be improved;
- (b) recommendations that the College should establish an internal forum to deal industrial relations issues should be re-categorised as medium priority;
- (c) recommendations 11 and 12 which are indicated as low priority have a high cost implication for the College if not implemented and should be re-categorised as medium priority;
- (d) communication of promotion processes should be clearer;
- (e) the timeframe for recruitment of new staff should be addressed;
- (f) the College should invest in the HR IT system as well as all other IT systems in the College;
- (g) there are stresses on the systems, due to a number of different projects progressing at the same time, which should be taken into consideration when reviewing deadlines and requirements.

The Board noted there is a backlog regarding recruitment processes in HR and recognised the need to prioritise succession planning within HR. Noting the issues raised by Board members, the Provost advised that the Board should consider the establishment of an internal forum for industrial relations issues.

The Board approved the recommendations, noting that an implementation plan will be presented in due course taking account of the issues raised by Board members.

BD/12-13/187 Commercialisation Report

The Bursar invited Board's attention, to a memorandum dated 14 February 2013, which had been circulated, under the following headings:

- (i) Review of Commercial Activities;
- (ii) Proposed Ancillary Revenue Unit;
- (iii) Objectives for the Commercial Director.

The Bursar advised Board that it is necessary to ensure the quality of experience for visitors to the College in order to maximize revenue generating opportunities on campus. The Board noted that in order to explore these opportunities it is proposed to establish an Ancillary Revenue Unit (ARU) which will have its own Governance Board consisting of seven members, four of which will be external non-College members. The Board also noted the ARU Governance Board will report directly to Executive Officers and through the Finance Committee and that the Commercial Director will report to the ARU Governance Board and the Chief Operating Officer.

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (a) the accommodation needs of students should be prioritised during the academic term;
- (b) students should not be subject to a Sports Centre levy;
- (c) the terms of reference of the ARU Governance Board should make it clear that all decisions which will amend current College policy must be made by Board;
- (d) the catering strategy should be widened to include more mid-range options as well as focusing on high-end facilities;
- (e) the Commercial Director should communicate regularly with the College Community;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (f) due consideration should be given to the services supplied for staff and students.

The Bursar advised Board that the Commercial Director will explore the level of scope to generate income from accommodation on campus noting that currently the Sports Centre is not within the remit of the role. He further advised Board that the ARU Governance Board will be tasked with identifying where changes to College policies are necessary to facilitate their commercial plans and pursuing these changes through the current College governance structure. The Board noted that changes to accommodation and catering facilities should include a consultation process with student representatives as appropriate. The Board also noted that the Commercial Director will bi-annually convene an Advisory Group with representatives of students, academic staff, non-academic staff to review the range and quality of services provided to the College community. In response to a query, the Bursar advised that the Commercial Director will have four members of staff reporting to him or her.

The Board approved the proposed structures for the Ancillary Revenue Unit, noting that where changes in College policies are required they must be pursued through the established College governance structures.

BD/12-13/188 Fellowship

The Board approved the nominations for Fellowship as presented by the Provost.

Noting the comments from Board members in relation to the underrepresentation of candidates by gender and from certain disciplines, the Board agreed that the College Secretary would write to the Secretary of the Equality Committee to request a report on how any imbalance, on the basis of gender and/or discipline, among those who have applied for Fellowship over the past number of years could be addressed.

BD/12-13/189 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 13 February 2013 subject to further comments covering CL/12-3/082, 095 and in particular:

CL/12-13/118 Search Committee - Librarian and College Archivist

The Board noted the membership of the Search Committee for the Librarian and College Archivist, noting that candidates will be required to make a presentation to the College Community.

BD/12-13/190 Any Other Urgent Business

- (i) **Recent Death of Colleague**
The Provost advised Board of the recent death on 26th February 2013 of Professor Tom Connor, (B.Sc. N.U.I, M.A., Ph.D. N.U.I., F.T.C.D. 2007), Professor in Neuroscience, Department of Physiology, School of Medicine.
- (ii) **Board Membership - Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency - Library Assistants, Senior Executive, Executive and Secretarial Staff Category**

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted the resignation of Ms Jackie Byrne as a member of the above constituency with effect from 26 February 2013 and further noted that Mr Gerard J Garrahan is deemed elected to the Board for the remainder of Ms Byrne's term of office, to the end of the academic year 2015-2016.

BD/12-13/191 GeneSIS

Under Any Other Urgent Business, the Board noted that a presentation on the current status of the GeneSIS project will be made at the next meeting of Board.

SECTION B

There was no business in this section.

SECTION C

BD/12-13/192 Board Callover

The Board noted the Callover, as circulated.

BD/12-13/193 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 February 2013.

BD/12-13/194 Trinity Ball 2014 - Friday 4 April 2014

The Board noted and approved the request of the Trinity Ball Committee that the Trinity Ball 2014 may be held on Friday 4 April 2014.

BD/12-13/195 Prizes and Other Awards Minchin Bursary - 2013

The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Student Support Officer, circulated, dated 19 February 2013.

BD/12-13/196 Memorandum of Understanding - Royal Irish Academy of Music

The Board noted that a Memorandum of Understanding between the College and the Royal Irish Academy of Music was signed by the Provost on 6 February 2013.

BD/12-13/197 Agreement - Trustees of the Dublin Cemeteries Committees

The Board noted that an agreement between the College and the Trustees of the Dublin Cemeteries Committee trading as Glasnevin Trust was signed by the Provost on 7 February 2013.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings