Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 10 October 2012

Present Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L

Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Mr R Dunne, Mr D Ferrick, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Mr M J McAndrew, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Ms N Murray, Ms A S Ní Chonaire, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill,

Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H J Rice.

Apologies Ms J Byrne, Professor R Gilligan.

In attendance Ms S Mac Bride, Mr J Coman, Secretary Designate.

(ex officio) Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer, Vice-Provost for Global Relations.

Dean of Students, Professor A Piesse (for BD/12-13/045).

Professor Ó Siochrú read a statement contained in Appendix 1 to this minute.

SECTION A

BD/12-13/036 Declaration of Interest

The College Secretary, Ms Mac Bride and Mr Coman declared a conflict of interest in agenda item A6 (ii) and agreed to withdraw for the duration of that item.

BD/12-13/037 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 12 September 2012 were approved and signed subject the following amendment:

BD/12-13/017 Membership of Principal Committees

The first sentence of the third paragraph was amended to read "The Registrar also advised Board of a proposal that a representative from the College's Group of Unions be appointed to the Human Resources Committee, which had been the practice prior to the establishment of the Partnership Agreement."

BD/12-13/038 Matters Arising

A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/039, 040, 041, and 042 below).

BD/12-13/039 C&AG Special Report (see minute BD/12-13/009 of 12 September 2012)

The Provost advised Board that he had been in correspondence with the Chair of the Board of St. James's Hospital in relation to those administrative hospital staff who had been recruited by the College. The Board noted that he had received confirmation that one of the individuals would be relieved of his hospital duties for one day a week in order to attend to his College duties. The Board further noted that the other individual concerned had been seconded to the HSE and would not be available to fulfil his College duties.

In response to a query, the Provost clarified that if a similar arrangement was in place with Tallaght Hospital the College would require the same level of assurance. The Board noted that the reason for the original arrangements with Saint James's Hospital was to ensure that the College had engaged a suitably qualified professional to teach Health Service Practice.

BD/12-13/040 Public Accounts Committee (see minute BD/12-13/014(i) of 12 September 2012)

The Provost advised Board that he had attended the Public Accounts Committee on 27 September 2012 where the issues of cash balances, promotions, allowances and expenses were discussed. The Provost further advised Board that a proposal to amend the Universities Act was raised by the Department of Education and Skills (DES) at the Public Accounts Committee on 4 October 2012, noting that the proposed amendment, if implemented, would impact very significantly on the autonomy of Universities in term of staffing and remuneration.

The Board agreed that a strategy should be developed to seek changes to the amendment in its current form. The President of the Students' Union advised Board that the Students' Unions across the sector do not support the amendment proposed and will support their respective universities in opposing it following confirmation of the Students' Union's Executive and Council. The Provost, noting that the IUA is exploring taking collective action, advised Board that he is making arrangements to engage with the Minister for Education and Skills as a matter of priority.

BD/12-13/041 Code of Governance (see minute BD/12-13/016 of 12 September 2012)

The Secretary, noting that the HEA-IUA code had been approved at the previous meeting, invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Provost, dated 9 October 2012, which had been tabled, setting out the proposed membership of the Code of Governance sub-group to amend the College's Code of Governance in line with the sectoral code. The Board approved the following membership, noting that its priority task will be to develop guidelines to deal with conflict of interest on the part of Board members:

Registrar - Chair Professor John McGilp Professor Henry Rice Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú Professor Hugh Gibbons
Mr Fred Cowzer
Dr Olive Braiden
President of the Graduates Students' Union
Secretary to the College - secretary

BD/12-13/042 Towards a Future Higher Education Landscape (see minute BD/12-13/019 of 12 September 2012)

The Secretary advised Board of the legal advice obtained in relation to the proposed merger of Trinity and UCD recommended in the report of the International Panel on the future of Irish Higher Education.

BD/12-13/043 Provost's Report

The Board noted an update from the Provost on the following items:

(i) Bursar

The Board approved the nomination of Professor Gerard Lacey as Bursar to take effect from November 2012 and acknowledged its thanks to the out-going Bursar for his contribution to Board and the College.

(ii) HEA Landscape Document

The Provost advised Board that the HEA has deferred all engagement with the IUA and individual universities on the landscape of higher education until January 2013. Noting that the College's response to the HEA's Landscape document had now been published, the Board agreed to continue with its collaborative plans with other institutions.

In response to a query, the Provost clarified that proposals contained in the International Panel's report on collaboration in the area of teacher training had been intended to be progressed over a 20-year period and therefore, if adopted by the HEA, would be a long-term strategy. The Registrar advised Board that the Church of Ireland College of Education had withdrawn from negotiations with the College and had decided upon another collaborative partner despite the College exploring with the Church of Ireland College of Education many options to facilitate the proposed collaboration.

BD/12-13/044 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees

The Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred at Commencements ceremonies during 2012-2013 or as soon as possible thereafter.

BD/12-13/045 The Student Experience: Towards a Student-Centred University

The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a presentation under the following headings:

(i) Expanding Role of the Dean of Students

The Board noted that the College's aspiration to become a student-centred university has been embedded in the College's Strategic Plan (2010-14) and is demonstrated through the large numbers of students actively participating in

'learning outside the classroom' activities such as sports clubs, student societies, student to student mentoring etc. Noting that the role of the Dean of Students will be expanding under START, the Dean of Students advised Board that she is the Dean of *all* students irrespective of their status or career stage in College and that as the cohort of under-represented students expands so does the demand on student services. In response to a query, the Dean of Students undertook to explore the specific needs of Evening Students as part of her remit.

(ii) Student Support Services

The Dean invited the Board's attention to the number of students availing of student services such as the Careers Advisory Service, Student Counselling, Student Health, the Disability Service, Unilink, the Sports Centre and the Post-Graduate Advisory Service. The Board noted that student services are research-led and engage in establishing national models of good practice. The student experience has been greatly supported by the co-operation of the Students' Union and Graduate Students' Union through initiatives such as GSU Orientation, the Intern programme and a meet-and-greet for international students on arrival in Ireland. The Board further noted that the continued success of student services will be dependent on the College's ability to adapt to the needs of a diverse student body, the services' ability to work together, continued co-operation with the Students' Unions and appropriate communication channels and allocation of resources.

In response to a query, the Dean of Students advised Board that Student Counselling has a professional obligation to see students within a set timeframe and that no student can be allocated more than six consecutive appointments. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that previously identified staff shortages had been addressed within the budgetary process. The Board noted that, given the reliance of international students on student services, the Dean of Students is currently engaging with the Vice-Provost for Global Relations to discuss how best to deal with the expected increased pressure on student services.

(iii) Risks

The Dean of Students advised Board of the student service areas which are at risk including the Tutorial Service, Unilink and student learning development due to a lack of sustainable funding. The Board noted that discussions are taking place in order to make provision for these services in the event that funding ceases. She also drew attention to the urgent need for fit-for-purpose premises for the Health Centre in particular, for the Day Nursery and for the outdoor sports facilities at Santry. The Board also noted the importance of preserving the College's unique Tutorial Service and of ensuring that Tutors receive adequate recompense for their service.

In the course of a discussion, the Senior Lecturer acknowledged that there had been difficulties in relation to timetabling at the beginning of the academic year and that his office had worked in conjunction with the Heads of Schools in order to resolve these issues as quickly as possible. In response to a query regarding the lack of teaching assistants, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that provision for teaching assistants had been made in the context of the overall budget allocation made to Heads of Schools in May

2012 and that the decision as to how the allocation is spent is made by the individual Heads of Schools. The Board noted the importance of communicating with students when such issues arise in order not to undermine the student experience.

(iv) Service Delivery in the Future

The Board noted that the Dean of Students intends to bring forward evidence-based plans to look at the student experience in three stages: transition and orientation of first year students; retention of students; and progression of students through College towards employment. The Board noted that proposals in relation to the transition and orientation of first year students will be presented to Executive Officers during Michaelmas Term 2012. The Board also noted the Dean of Students' plans to update the Student Charter during the current academic year. The Dean thanked the Treasurer and the Chief Operating Officer in particular for their co-operation and support.

Noting that the Dean of Students has been co-opted on to University Council to assist her in fulfilling her brief, the Provost thanked the Dean of Students for her presentation to Board.

BD/12-13/046 Quality Reviews - Reports from the Provost

The Provost invited Board's attention to the reports on the quality reviews of the following areas carried out in accordance with the quality assurance procedures for administrative areas:

(i) Information Systems Services

The Provost invited Board's attention to a report on the review of IS Services, which had been circulated. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the report is extensive and detailed and takes into account the level of skills available within the College and the legacy issues because of a failure to invest in systems in the past. She advised Board of the thirty-five recommendations presented by the Reviewers and of the recommendations presented by the Provost, including the development of an IT Implementation Plan and College IT Strategy prior to the recruitment of a Chief Information Officer.

During the course of a discussion, a number of issues were raised by Board members including that:

- (a) students should be on the group developing IT Strategy;
- (b) students should not be expected to make a financial contribution to the provision of an ISS helpdesk facility;
- (c) the College should examine the ability of IS Services to deliver a wireless internet service to the College rather than outsourcing it;
- a Chief Information Officer should be appointed prior to the development of an IT Strategy in order that he/she may contribute to the process;
- (e) the recommendation to bring staff who have elements of their roles associated with information systems within the remit of IS Services should be examined in the context of their overall role in order to avoid creating a deficit of skills in other areas;

- (f) there should be better integration between IS Services and the Library;
- (g) the IS Services Helpdesk is a valuable service to the College and should not be outsourced;
- (h) the College should consider open-source access;
- (i) the College should consider whether IS Services has the correct skill set to deliver the IT strategy once developed.

In response to the issues raised, the Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the College did not intend to pass the cost of wireless services onto students and that all feasible options in relation to wireless internet services would be examined particularly as it is an issue of high priority to the College. The Board noted that student representation will form part of the high level working group which will be established to develop the IT Strategy on behalf of the College, noting that expert external advice will be procured when necessary. The Board also noted that it is the intention that the IT Strategy will inform the brief of the Chief Information Officer once appointed. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the examination of staff who have elements of their roles associated with information systems is primarily to avoid duplication of roles and to deliver greater efficiencies, noting that at present there is a skills deficit within IS Services which must be addressed. She further advised that the Library will be within the scope of the IT Strategy and that the issue of open-source access will be considered.

The Board approved the Provost's recommendations arising from the quality review report noting that the College will develop an IT Strategy before recruiting a Chief Information Officer and that an implementation plan will be presented to Board for consideration before the end of Michaelmas Term 2012.

The Secretary, Mr Coman and Ms Mac Bride withdrew from the meeting

(ii) Secretary's Office

The Provost invited Board's attention to a report on the review of the Secretary's Office, which had been circulated. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board of the positive outcome of the review and of the observations of the Reviewers. The Board noted the risks to the successful continuation of the services currently provided by the Secretary's office and the measures proposed to address these risks. The Provost invited Board's attention to his recommendations arising from the report.

During the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (a) the issue of over-reliance on key individuals and their loyalty to the office should be addressed;
- (b) the Secretary and the Secretary's office staff are to be commended for their diligence and contribution to Board and the workings of the College;
- (c) the recommendation that the College Solicitor should be released from administrative duties to concentrate on legal issues should be supported.

In response to the issues, raised the Provost advised Board that all risks identified would be addressed in the course of the proposed implementation plan.

The Board approved the report and the Provost's recommendations as presented.

The Secretary, Mr Coman and Ms Mac Bride rejoined the meeting

BD/12-13/047 Associated College - Royal Irish Academy of Music (see Actum CL/12-13/006 of 26 September 2012)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 1 October 2012, which had been circulated. Noting that the initiative had been welcomed at the previous meeting of Board, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the proposals to establish the Royal Irish Academy of Music as an Associated College had been approved by University Council following a presentation by Professor B Singleton, Head of School of Drama, Film and Music, on the educational benefits of the collaboration. The Board noted that, if approved, an implementation plan will be developed and a contractual agreement will be drawn up to manage the relationship between the institutions.

In response to a number of issues raised by Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that only programmes which satisfy the College's accreditation criteria will be offered by RIAM and that discussions are in progress with the Dean of Graduate Studies to explore the possibility of offering a professional doctorate programme in music performance.

The Board approved the proposal that the Royal Irish Academy of Music become an Associated College and noted that the contractual arrangement to facilitate this would now be progressed.

BD/12-13/048 Institutional Review - Report (see Actum CL/12-13/007 of 26 September 2012)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 1 October 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board that following the Institutional Review which took place during the previous academic year, the report on the College's performance had now been concluded. She further advised Board that the report contained a number of recommendations and that it is proposed to establish a Working Group to examine and respond to them. The Board noted that it is anticipated, that following an initial examination of the recommendations subgroups will be established to examine specific recommendations, in greater detail. It is anticipated that these sub-groups will be co-opted from members of Board, Council, Schools and the Student body.

The Board approved the following membership of a working group established to examine the recommendations from the review:

Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Chair) Senior Lecturer Dean of Graduate Studies

Professor Linda Hogan Professor Patrick Geoghegan Professor Veronica Campbell Associate Dean of Research Professor Derek Sullivan
Dean, Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Professor James Wickham

Sciences

Dean of Students Professor Amanda Piesse
Chief Operating Officer Ms Darina Kneafsey

Representative of Council Professor Aonghus McNabola

Union

The Board noted that responses to the recommendations will be presented to Board in due course.

BD/12-13/049 Seamus Heaney Professorship in Irish Writing (see Actum CL/12-13/017 of 26 September 2012)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 1 October 2012, which had been circulated. The Board noted the introduction of the Seamus Heaney Professorship in Irish Writing in the School of English and acknowledged the philanthropic support which enabled its establishment.

BD/12-13/050 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 26 September 2012 subject to further comments covering CL/12-13/006, 007 017 and 019.

BD/12-13/051 Ad Hoc Appeals Committee - Senior Promotions 2012

Under Other Business, the Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Senior Dean, dated 9 October 2012, which had been tabled. The Board approved the following membership of the Ad Hoc Appeals Committee:

Senior Dean (Chair) Professor Margaret O'Mahony Professor Marina Lynch

BD/12-13/052 Tutorship

Under Other Business, the Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, dated 9 October 2012, which had been tabled. The Board approved the nominations as presented.

BD/12-13/053 Visitors

Under Other Business, the Secretary advised the Board of the outcome of a recent Visitor case and noted that the outcome of one further case is awaited.

SECTION B

BD/11-13/054 Audit Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minute of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 19 June 2012, noting in particular:

AD/11-12/79 C&AG Special Report 78: Matters arising out of Education Audits Professor McGilp, Board Representative on the Audit Committee, advised Board that the Audit Committee are continuing their consideration of this matter and will report to Board in due course.

AD/11-12/80 Risk Assessment - Remuneration of Non Review Body Grades
The Board noted that the report on the Remuneration of Non Review Grades has yet to
be finalised.

AD/11-12/84 Payments to Hospital Staff

Professor McGilp, Board Representative on the Audit Committee, advised Board, that following a review of the governance structures for the appointment of Hospital Staff who perform academic duties, the Audit Committee had concluded that the process was weak and that measures should be put in place to address this including that the appointments in a School should be considered at the School Committee.

AD/11-12/85 Review of HR Department

The Board noted that the Audit Committee had sought further feedback from Human Resources on the recommendations in the Review Report, following which the Audit Committee will present their findings to Board in due course.

BD/12-13/055 Student Services Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minute of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 19 September 2012, noting in particular:

SS/12-13/06 Allocation of Global Relations Strategy funding to Student Services Professor Drew, Chair of the Student Services Committee advised Board of the Committee's view that the allocation of Global Relations Strategy funding for student services should be including in the annual budgetary cycle.

SS/12-13/07 Summer Internship Scheme

The Board noted that the Student Services Committee has welcomed the Students' Union's proposal for a summer internship scheme.

SECTION C

BD/12-13/056 Board Business

- (i) Self-Evaluation: Communicating Board Decisions The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 3 October 2012, advising of Board decisions now being placed on the College website after each meeting.
- (ii) Callover of Board Business

for noting.

BD/12-13/057 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 September 2012, as circulated.

BD/12-13/058 Prizes and Other Awards

(i) Gold Medals

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, tabled, dated 10 October 2012 (see Appendix 2 to this minute).

(ii) School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2012

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the School of Medicine, circulated, dated 18 July 2012.

BD/12-13/059 Statutes - Chapter on the Board s.10 and Chapter on Council, s.8, (see BD/12-13/031 (ii) of 12 September 2012)

The Board noted that following further consultation the closing date for the amendment to the Statutes would be 26 October 2012 (1700) and that the assents would be counted 30 October 2012 (1230) with observers present as provided for in s.3 of the Schedule 2 of the Chapter on the Fellows.

BD/12-13/060 School of Mathematics - Acting Headship

The Board noted that Dr S M Ryan, Associate Professor in Mathematics, had been nominated as Acting Head of the School of Mathematics, pending the results of the election to the headship.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signea:	
Date:	

Appendix 1 to BD/12-13/036

Statement read by Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú at the start of the Board meeting held on 10 October 2012 (Minute BD/12-13/035 of 12 September 2012 refers)

I am a Fellow of Trinity College Dublin and was elected to serve on Board back in June in the Fellows and Fellow Professors constituency for a four-year term. I take my oath as a Fellow and the declaration by new Board members very seriously indeed. I am on Board to serve in the best interests of College. I do not represent any particular group or sectional interest - Fellows, IFUT or anybody else - and I would utterly reject any suggestion, implication or inference to the contrary.

Appendix 2 to BD/12-13/058 (i)

Gold Medallists 2012

Course Name **Business Studies** Byrne, Clare Helena Margaret **Business Studies** Higgs, Sophie Chemistry with Molecular Modelling Temple, Douglas James (Sch) Children's and General Nursing Hill, Katie Clinical Speech and Language Studies McCarron, Abbi **Economic and Social Studies** White, James Richard **Economic and Social Studies** Landale, Charles David **Economic and Social Studies** Gardner, Peter Robert Diallo, Rachid **Economic and Social Studies Economic and Social Studies** Moriarty, Siofra **Economic and Social Studies** Kelly, Orla Education (Hons 4th year) Froebel College of Education Prendergast, Catherine Education (Hons 4th year) Froebel College of Education Kilcoyne, Laura Marie Education (Hons 4th year) Marino Institute of Education Mirolo, Natalie Engineering - Integrated: Electronic Engineering Ní Riada, Sinéad Cáit (Sch) Engineering - Integrated: Electronic Engineering Martin, Stuart Engineering: Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering Weldon, Peter Engineering: Electronic and Computer Engineering Clarke, Rebekah Ann Sophie Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering Irvine, Alan David (Sch) Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering Parle, Eoin (Sch) Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering Yates, Stephen (Sch) Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering Gibbons, Michael (Sch) Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering McDonnell, Gavin Engineering: Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering Culleton, Mark William (Sch) **English Studies** Leahy, Conor Eoin (Sch) **English Studies** Murphy, Cillian Alexander **English Studies** McDonagh, Cal-Ryan (Sch) History Burke, Sharon Elizabeth History and Political Science (equally for four years) Curran, Joseph Simon History and Political Science (equally for four years) O Reilly, Bruff Lentaigne Information Systems (Hons) Kennedy, Joseph McCauley, David (Sch) Law Management Science and Information Systems Studies Headon, Laura Brenda (Sch) Management Science and Information Systems Studies Ding, Jennifer Management Science and Information Systems Studies Keogh, Darragh James Management Science and Information Systems Studies O'Brien, Alan Richard (Sch) Mathematics Lee, Ciaran Mark (Sch) Mathematics O'Sullivan, John Christopher Mathematics Birmingham, Alison

MathematicsGleeson, Eavan (Sch)MathematicsBennett, Rowland TimothyMathematicsMurphy, Eoin Padraig (Sch)

MathematicsBrennan, FlannMedicinal ChemistryMcMullan, MichelaMedicinal ChemistryMurray, James

Medicinal Chemistry Keating, Alison Veronica

Medicinal Chemistry Burke, Helen

Medicine (5-year) Corry, Edward Michael Albert

Medicine (5-year)Heaney, Roisin MaryMidwiferyStrachan, ShonaghNatural Sciences: Biochemistry with ImmunologyMills, Evanna Louisa

Natural Sciences: *Botany*Natural Sciences: *Chemistry*Natural Sciences: *Geography*Natural Sciences: *Neuroscience*Natural Sciences: *Physics*Natural Sciences: *Physics*Natural Sciences: *Physics*Natural Sciences: *Physics*Lynch, Peter

Natural Sciences: Physics and Astrophysics Morosan, Diana Elena (Sch)

Natural Sciences: ZoologyFinlay, Sive (Sch)Nursing Studies: General NursingLalor, Joanne

Nursing Studies: *General Nursing*Pharmacy

Carroll, Anne-Marie (Sch)

Pharmacy Nevin, Fionnuala (Sch)
Pharmacy Timoney, Katie
Pharmacy O'Brien, Oliver
Philosophy Boylan, David (Sch)

Radiation Therapy Featherstone, Hannah Joan

Radiation Therapy Kierce, Sharon

Religions and Theology

Taylor, Keishia Rose Eileen

Social Studies

Murphy, Andrew (Sch)

Theoretical Physics

Hyland, Stephanie (Sch)

TSM A: Economics and Mathematics Ruane, Cian
TSM A: Economics and Mathematics Conway, Graham
TSM B: English Literature and History Kilbride, Deirdre

TSM B: English Literature and Philosophy

Moore, Gillian Elizabeth

TSM B: Geography and Sociology

Haettner, Elin Maria Gabriella

TSM B: Philosophy and French

TSM B: Russian and English Literature

TSM B: Spanish and Italian

Duffy, Huw (Sch)

Reevell, Patrick (Sch)

O'Sullivan, Lucy