

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 29 February 2012

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Mr R Bartlett, Professor S D C Barrett, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Professor M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Professor N Marples, Ms L Miller, Ms N Murray, Ms M O'Connor, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor E J O'Halpin, Professor H J Rice, Professor D M Singleton.
<i>Apologies</i>	Ms R Barry, Professor D O'Neill.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer, Vice-Provost for Global Relations. Dean of Research (Professor V Cahill) (for items BD/11-12/173) Professor G Whyte (for items BD/11-12/174) Professor E O'Dell (for item BD/11-12/175 and item BD/11-12/176)

SECTION A

BD/11-12/168 Minutes

- (i) The minutes of the meeting held on 25 January 2012 were approved and signed.
- (ii) The minutes of the meeting held on 1 February 2012 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment.

Minute BD/11-12/142 Promotion Procedures - Revision

The first sentence of the second paragraph was amended to read "In response to a query about consultation with the Trade Union in developing the revised procedures, the Provost invited Board's attention to the membership of the working party which included two IFUT representatives."

BD/11-12/169 Provost's Report

The Provost advised Board in relation to the following issues:

- (i) **The Higher Education Landscape document issued by the HEA**
The Board noted that the HEA, following the publication of a document entitled 'Towards a Future Higher Education Landscape', has requested that those institutions that receive funding from either the HEA or the Department of Education and Skills enter into negotiation with a view to co-operation, collaboration and in some instances possible mergers. The Provost, noting that a Working Group of College Officers has been established to develop the College's response to this request, which must be submitted by the end of July 2012, advised that this is a unique opportunity for the College to gain access to specialist knowledge areas which will contribute to the development of the College's Global Relations Strategy. In response to a query, the Provost advised that the College response will primarily focus on improving pathways to education between institutions which would allow students study multifaceted disciplines across institutions. The Board noted that the document also sets out the criteria for Technology University status.
- (ii) **University Governance**
The Board noted that the College had received a request from the Minister for Education and Skills to review University governance arrangements. The Provost advised that any substantial change to the current governance arrangements may require an amendment to the Trinity College, Dublin (Charter and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000. The Board noted that the College will be represented by the Provost and Secretary at a sectoral working group which is preparing a response to the Minister's request. In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the IUA Secretaries Group is currently updating the sectoral Code of Governance, much of which is already embedded into the College's governance.
- (iii) **National Children's Hospital**
The Board noted the decision by An Bord Pleanála to refuse permission for the plans on the Mater Hospital site for the new National Children's Hospital and the possible impact this decision may have on the College.

BD/11-12/170 Associate Dean of Research

The Board approved the nomination of Professor Derek Sullivan as Associate Dean of Research.

BD/11-12/171 Institute of Population Health

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 22 February 2012, which had been circulated. Noting the discussion which had taken place at the previous Board meeting on the proposed purchase of the upper three floors of a property in Tallaght to house the Trinity College Institute of Population Health (minute BD/11-12/140 of 1 February 2012 refers), she advised Board that the total purchase price, including VAT and associated fees is €4.7 million. The Board noted that the fit-out cost of the building is estimated between €2.3 and €2.5 million and that the final figure once known will be brought to Board for approval.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board, noting that due diligence in relation to the vendor had been completed, approved the purchase price as presented.

BD/11-12/172 Planning Group Report No 6

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 22 February 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board that it is the role of the Planning Group to address the ongoing funding issues facing the College and to co-ordinate the development and implementation of the College's Strategic Plan 2009-2014. The Board noted that this is the sixth Planning Group Report presented to Board and that it contains an update on the recommendations of the previous Report and focuses on the Strategic Plan Mid-term Review, the Global Relations Strategy and the START administrative reform process.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that an audit of the actions in the Strategic Plan had taken place which identified critical issues which will require further consideration. The Board noted that as it is likely that the target to increase the number of registered students to 18,000 by 2014 will be met, the College will need to consider the composition of the student body in the context of the Global Relations Strategy which aims to increase the number of international students. The Board also noted that, given the result in Hilary term 2011 of the student referendum not to proceed with the student levy, the action outlined in the Strategic Plan to open a Student Centre will have to be revisited.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that in order to advance the actions outlined in the Strategic Plan under the heading of Knowledge Generation and Transfer, it is necessary to focus on recruitment and retention of Principal Investigators and to employ a robust approach to international rankings, noting that the College's ability to succeed is primarily linked to the availability of funding.

The Board noted that in order to address the current financial challenges facing the College, the Planning Group, on behalf of Executive Officers, has been actively monitoring and analysing the College's 5-year financial forecasts. Recognising the seriousness of the financial situation, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that it will be necessary to set ambitious targets in the areas of commercialisation, philanthropy, research income and cost reductions. The Board noted that, following the approval of the Annual Budgetary Cycle in March 2011, a series of meetings had taken place with the Heads of Schools which included discussions on the adequacy of RPM. Noting that it is essential that the College have a forward facing RPM, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the adequacy of the current model will require further discussion and examination.

The Board also noted that the Planning Group reviewed plans for recruitment and staff development for the next academic year with a view to working within the parameters of the Employment Control Framework and that engagement with the Department of Education and Skills was on-going in relation to the Student Tutor Scheme.

In the course of a discussion, a number of issues were raised by Board members, including:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (i) as the projections for income generation from commercialisation are intended to support central expenditure, in particular staff costs, the College should ensure the projected figures are realistic;
- (ii) the projected figures in relation to the commercialisation strategy focusing on the Book of Kells brand seems unrealistic and consideration should be given to including a marketing professional on the commercialisation group, noting that all plans should be in line with the College's Communications Strategy;
- (iii) the implications for the Library should be taken into consideration in all plans for commercialisation of the Book of Kells brand and all branding issues should be dealt with in a timely manner to allow the project to proceed;
- (iv) the College requires a workable method of assessing research quality with clear criteria;
- (v) the College should consider proposals on how to deal with the loss of experienced long-serving members of staff;
- (vi) care should be taken to ensure equity of recruitment among departments;
- (vii) financial provision should be made for the Student Tutor Scheme and Student Counselling.

In response to the issues raised, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the overall College estimates included a projected conservative figure from commercialisation rather than the more ambitious figure contained in the report. The Chief Operating Officer advised that income from the commercialisation strategy will be aligned to the College's strategic objectives. She noted that the current financial arrangements with the Library regarding the Book of Kells exhibition will remain in place and that any digression from this would be presented to Board for consideration. She also advised that progress had been made on all outstanding branding issues. The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that marketing and branding are incorporated into the College's Communications Strategy and the College must be mindful of not depleting the Library of much needed resources.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that investment in staff recruitment is a priority for the College in order to ensure that the College meets its strategic objectives and she stated that the College has already made an investment through the newly established Ussher posts. She further advised that recruitment in terms of replacing staff will be made on a one in three basis in the context of available funding. The Board noted that although agreement had not yet been reached with the Department of Education and Skills in relation to the Student Tutor Scheme, staff are continuing to participate in the scheme. The Board also noted that there is provision to make emergency funds available to Student Counselling. Addressing the issue of RPM, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, noting the value of retaining some measures of research quality, acknowledged that consideration should be given to the appropriateness of using an algorithm such as the RPM in such a complex organisation.

The Treasurer advised Board of the importance of prioritising the College's strategic investment in the future and taking further action to address the College's financial outlook given the extent of the projected deficits from 2013 onwards.

The Board noted the memorandum as presented by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and agreed that consideration would be given to the appropriateness of using RPM as a tool for allocating funds in the future. The Provost thanked the Vice-

Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Chief Operating Officer and the members of the Planning Group.

BD/11-12/173 Research Strategy Update

The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, which had been circulated. He advised Board of the following issues.

- (i) **The College's Research Strategy Implementation Plan**

The Board noted that a process of engagement has commenced through a series of town-hall meetings in order to identify sets of multi/interdisciplinary areas in which research strength exists with the intent of facilitating collaboration in those areas. The Dean of Research advised that representatives from the College met with key individuals within the European Commission and the Irish Permanent Representation to the European Union in February 2012 in order to promote Trinity as a leading European research university. The Board noted that the College's proactive approach and its strategy for multi/interdisciplinary research had been well received.
- (ii) **National Research Policy**

The Board noted that the Report on the National Research Prioritisation Exercise will be launched on 1 March 2012 in the Science Gallery. The Dean of Research advised Board that Science Foundation Ireland has launched a new research centres programme based on its previous Centres for Science, Engineering and Technology (CSET) and Strategic Research Clusters (SRC) programmes.

The Dean of Research advised that a draft national policy on the management of intellectual property arising from public sector research as well as a framework for industry engagement with public research has been produced, supported by Forfas. The Board noted that while the College is supportive of the overall concept of such a policy, it is currently engaging with Forfas to ensure that a number of concerns will be addressed in the final policy.

The Board noted concerns that the National Research Prioritisation Exercise placed little focus on research in Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences.
- (iii) **Research funding diversification**

The Board noted that, based on the projections produced by the Planning Group, there is a critical need to develop and invest in robust strategies for research funding development and diversification.
- (iv) **Research productivity and participation in funded research**

The Dean of Research advised that, based on the current Research Quality Metric criteria, approximately 70% of core staff are research productive, noting that the percentage varies considerably across individual Schools. He further advised that, while changes to the criteria would influence this figure, it suggests that there is a need to take measures to improve research productivity across College. The Board noted that, at present, a large proportion of research income is generated by a limited number of Principal Investigators.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to a query, the Dean of Research advised Board that a range of incentives including, but not limited to, the implementation of workload balancing models and financial incentives should be considered in order to achieve a higher level of research activity throughout the College. The Provost noted that such incentives might be considered by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Dean of Research in the context of revised proposals on RPM to be considered in due course. The Board noted that measures must be put in place to allow junior staff the opportunity to participate in research, and in this context the College should consider the introduction of a Sabbatical Policy to ensure teaching loads are distributed appropriately while staff are absent so as to allow junior staff avail of this opportunity.

The Board noted the memorandum as presented and the Provost thanked the Dean of Research.

BD/11-12/174 Child Protection Policy

Professor Whyte, the former Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 22 February 2012, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Child Protection Policy takes account of current national guidelines and that legislation in the area is expected to be introduced in the near future. Noting that the statutory definition of a child refers to any individual under the age of eighteen, he advised Board of the implications this definition places on the College due to the cohort of registered students under that threshold.

The Board noted that, under current procedures, all staff who work directly with children are Garda vetted and sign a declaration of suitability. Volunteers who have regular and unsupervised access to children are also Garda vetted as are registered students working with children as part of academic research. The Board also noted that in instances where students partake in placements or extra-curricular activities with partner organisations the obligation to vet students is transferred to such organisations. Professor Whyte advised Board that where reasonable grounds exist for suspecting that child abuse may have taken place, the policy places a duty on the Child Protection Officer to report such suspicions to the civil authorities, noting that if the Child Protection Officer fails to pass on a complaint of child abuse or neglect to those authorities, a report can be made directly to the HSE by any individual concerned about the situation. The Board noted that the principles of natural justice and fair procedure will apply to any allegations made.

The Board, welcoming the Policy, noted the concerns of Board members on the implementation of the policy for students under the age of eighteen and noted that in the context of Garda vetting, representations had been made to the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Justice, Defence and Equality outlining the sector's position. The Board also noted that the processing time for Garda vetting is currently having an adverse effect on the ability to vet staff in a timely manner.

The Board approved the Child Protection Policy as presented and agreed that the policy should be reviewed annually.

BD/11-12/175 Statutes - Governance - Board - Schedules

The Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 February 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board that following the adoption of the Consolidated Statutes in 2010, the decision was made to set aside certain issues which could be dealt with in the Schedules until a later date to allow appropriate consideration of the issues to take place. In this context, the Board noted that these issues will now be presented to Board in a series of Schedules with the intent of concluding the process by the end of the Academic year 2011/2012.

Professor O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the following Schedules to accompany the Chapter on the Board:

- (i) Schedule 1: Rules on Board Elections;
- (ii) Schedule 2: Standing Orders of Board;
- (iii) Schedule 3: A guide to the reserved business of Board.

The Board approved the Schedules and Errata as presented subject to minor drafting amendments and the inclusion of a provision to reflect the current practice of voting in Board elections by secret ballot.

BD/11-12/176 The Visitors

The Registrar, noting that a Dubium had been referred to the Visitors, advised Board of the determination that the Consolidated Statutes 2010 do not provide Board with power to establish Vice-Provost positions. The Board agreed to examine strategies to allow the Board give effect to its decision to appoint a Vice-Provost for Global Relations.

In response to a query, Professor O'Dell advised Board that the decisions of those staff currently using Vice-Provost titles were valid as all decisions are ultimately ratified by the Board either directly or indirectly. He also stated that in his opinion the use of the titles could continue until a suitable enabling strategy, through an amendment to the Statutes, could be brought to Board for consideration. The Board agreed that the Schedules to the Chapter on Officers should also be considered in conjunction with any necessary statutory amendment.

The Secretary advised Board of the decision of the Visitors to refuse jurisdiction of a Section 8 appeal by a former student.

BD/11-12/177 Honorary Degrees

The Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred at Commencements ceremonies during 2012-2013 or as soon as possible thereafter.

BD/11-12/178 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 15 February 2012 subject to further comments covering CL/11-12/100, 101, 110 and 111 noting in particular:

CL/11-12/100 Working Group on Admissions and Curriculum

The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the H-PAT test is not functioning as it was intended and that consideration should be given to an alternative application process for entry to Medicine.

CL/11-12/101 Open Day 2012

The Board noted that the College Open Day will be held on a Saturday in December 2012.

BD/11-12/179 Self-Evaluation of the Board

The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 February 2012, which had been circulated with a draft form for the self-evaluation of the Board's activities. The Board noted the proposed format and agreed that any comments should be addressed to the Secretary directly.

BD/11-12/180 Standing Orders of Board

Under Other Business, the Board noted the request from Dr McGinley that, in relation to substantive items presented to Board, a discussion should take place at one meeting and the decision deferred until the next meeting to allow due consideration of the item.

SECTION B**BD/11-12/181 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Coiste na Gaeilge from its meetings of 17 November 2011 and 23 February 2012 together with the Official Languages Act Implementation Group Report. The Board noted the positive report from the Irish Language Commissioner in relation to the implementation of the Irish language Scheme and the areas of weakness which the College should address. Professor Dowling, Chair of the Committee, advised Board of the success of a recent symposium held on the Official Languages Act 2003 in conjunction with the School of Law and noted that a paper was submitted to the government, based on the recommendations and questions raised, to assist its review process of the implementation of the Act.

SECTION C**BD/11-12/182 Board Elections 2012**

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 20 February 2012.

BD/11-12/183 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 15 February 2012, as circulated.

BD/11-12/184 Senate Business

- (i) **Degree of MA (*jure officii*)**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 22 February 2012;
- (ii) **Winter Commencements Schedule 2012**
The Board noted a revised memorandum from the Registrar, tabled, dated 28 February 2012 and approved that Winter Commencements should be held on:

Monday 3 December 2012
Tuesday 4 December 2012
Thursday 6 December 2012
Friday 7 December 2012
- (iii) **Permission to alter names in which graduates were admitted to degrees in 2011**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 20 February 2012;
- (iv) **Amendment of Degree awarded**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 22 February 2012.

BD/11-12/185 Panel of Enquiry (Student Cases) - Chairperson

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr A Owens, SC as Chairperson of the Panel of Enquiry for three years from 1 March 2012 to 28 February 2015 in accordance with the 2010 Consolidated Statutes of Trinity College Dublin and of the University of Dublin, Chapter on Student Conduct, Schedule 1, Section 18 (2).

BD/11-12/186 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Minchin Bursary 2011-2012**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 15 February 2012;
- (ii) **Studentships 2011-2012**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Programme Manager of the School of Medicine, circulated, dated 17 February 2012;
- (iii) **Sinead Darcy Prize**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 22 February 2012;
- (iv) **Margaret McLoughlin Prize**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 22 February 2012.

BD/11-12/187 Gold Medals - Revision to Gold Medal Criteria

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 21 February 2012.

BD/11-12/188 Representation - Board of Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Dublin incorporating the National Children's Hospital, Tallaght

- (i) The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor R Reilly as the College's representative on the above Board;
- (ii) to note that the Provost had been nominated to the Board of the Hospital as one of the three nominees of the President of the Board, the Archbishop of Dublin.

BD/11-12/189 Headship of School of Genetics and Microbiology, 2011-2014

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor K Devine as Head of the School of Genetics and Microbiology, 2011-2014.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: