

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 7 December 2011

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Mr R Bartlett, Professor S D C Barrett, Ms R Barry, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Professor M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Professor N Marples, Ms L Miller, Ms N Murray, Ms M O'Connor, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor E J O'Halpin, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H J Rice.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor D M Singleton.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer, Vice-Provost for Global Relations. Mr J Collins, Chair of the Audit Committee (for BD/11-12/095) Mr F Sheeran, Internal Auditor (for BD/11-12/095) Ms S A Fisher, Communications Officer (for BD/11-12/101) Dr J Hussey, Head of Discipline of Physiotherapy (for BD/11-12/103)

SECTION A

BD/11-12/095 Audit Committee Annual Report

Mr Collins, Chair of the Audit Committee, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the Audit Committee's Annual Report for 2011 which had been circulated, noting the following areas:

GeneSIS

Mr Collins advised Board that the success of the GeneSIS project is of crucial importance to the College. The Board noted that the Audit Committee had reviewed the process on a number of occasions and had identified concerns in relation to:

- (a) the development of the project's implementation plan and the role of the vendor in relation to same;
- (b) the need for greater internal consultation and partnership to finalise a plan;
- (c) the governance of the project, particularly the size of the governance board;
- (d) the independence of the quality assurance process;
- (e) the need to develop policy and planning for the change aspects of the project.

In response to queries raised by Board members, Mr Collins, the Internal Auditor and the Chief Operating Officer clarified a number of issues, including that:

- (i) the external quality assurance consultant had initially been procured as a supportive role to the project team and therefore the independence of the quality assurance element of the project must be addressed;
- (ii) the College must retain full ownership of the project in order to ensure buy-in from the College community;
- (iii) a report on the current status of the project will be presented to Board at its next meeting.

Noting the risks above and their implications for the management of the project, Mr Collins advised Board that there is every opportunity to take action to address these concerns at this stage and for the project to be successfully implemented if appropriate action is taken.

Strategic Planning

Mr Collins commended the efforts being made to deal with the financial challenges facing the College due to the current national economic crisis. However, he noted that, due to worsening external factors, the College, through the Planning Group, should consider taking further action to protect its financial position. He advised that this will necessitate a further linking of the strands of planning, resource allocation and risk management.

The Board noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer had initiated a review of the Strategic Plan in September 2011 and that the plan is currently under review by the Planning Group. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that, in light of the current economic environment, elements of the plan will require reprioritisation and this will be discussed at Faculty and School level in Hilary and Trinity Terms 2012 with the intention of presenting a report to Board by the end of this academic year.

Resource Planning Model

The Board noted that the Audit Committee, while acknowledging the progress which has been made to date, had expressed concern that the definition of the Resource Planning Model (RPM) still needs to be finalised and the model executed in full. Mr Collins advised that space allocation also needs to be carefully monitored and noted the absence of a full resource allocation process in this regard.

Noting the limited scope for strategic savings, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that work in relation to resource allocation is progressing through a combination of income generation and strategic savings. The Board noted that consultation is taking place with Schools through the annual budgeting cycle to discuss how resource allocation should be informed by RPM, noting that it will be used as a planning tool rather than a resource allocation model.

In addressing concerns raised in relation to space allocation, the Bursar advised Board that linking space to cost in the context of RPM could result in Schools foregoing space.

Risk Management

Mr Collins invited Board's attention to the recommendations of the Audit Committee outlined in the document circulated and advised Board that the College should

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

prioritise the management of risk at both central College and School levels. In response to a query, the Chief Operating Officer advised that the risk in relation to the student experience will be referred to the Dean of Students. The Provost advised Board that he has raised the risk to the Student Tutor Scheme with the Department of Education and Skills.

In response to a query, Mr Collins advised that upon his retirement from the Audit Committee, nominations for both his successor and the current vacancy on the Committee will be presented to Board at the earliest opportunity.

The Provost thanked Mr Collins for his very significant work for the College during his term of office and particularly as Chair since 2009.

The Board noted the 2011 Annual Report of the Audit Committee.

BD/11-12/096 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 9 November 2011 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

Academic Contract (see minute BD/11-12/070 of 9 November 2011)

The minute was amended to read: "The Board noted that IFUT have lodged a formal complaint with the Public Service Agreement Implementation Body regarding an alleged breach by the College of the Croke Park Agreement in relation to contracts of indefinite duration."

Faculty of Health Sciences/Trinity Health: Governance Arrangements (see minute BD/11-12/072 of 9 November 2011)

The following sentence was inserted at the end of the penultimate paragraph of the minute: "The Board noted that issues regarding the management of College properties on the two hospital sites by the Faculty of Health Sciences and the School of Medicine will be addressed at the next meeting".

BD/11-12/097 Matters Arising

A matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/11-12/098).

BD/11-12/098 Faculty of Health Sciences/Trinity Health: Governance Arrangements (see minute BD/11-12/072 of 9 November 2011)

The Board noted that the establishment of Trinity Health Ireland will not affect the management of College facilities at the two hospital sites and that space allocation will be dealt with by the School of Medicine and Faculty of Health Sciences through existing channels, whereby the School of Medicine will liaise directly with the Space Allocation Committee, in consultation with the Faculty Dean.

BD/11-12/099 Provost's Report

The Provost invited Board's attention to the following:

- (i) **Budget December 2011**

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted the Provost's comments on the Budget and its implication for the College's exchequer funding.

(ii) **Science Gallery**

The Provost advised Board that the Science Gallery has received a substantial donation to facilitate the establishment of an international network of science galleries. The Board noted that work is underway to establish a separate company to enable this and that proposals will be presented to Board at its meeting on 1 February 2012. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the source of the donation conforms to the College's Ethics Policy.

BD/11-12/100 START Update

The Bursar, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 28 November 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board on the progress of the START programme to date under the following headings:

(i) **Level of engagement with the College community**

The Bursar advised that the Taskforce had held eight public meetings, eleven taskforce sessions and over fifty face to face consultations with Heads of Schools and Heads of Administrative, Technical and Support areas.

(ii) **Overview of the College headcount**

The Board noted the College's structures analysed by staffing levels, contract type and funding sources.

(iii) **START website**

The Board noted that the START website has recorded over 5,000 visits and in excess of 500 comments which could be agreed/disagreed with by other commentators. The Bursar advised that these comments contributed to the perception of how the organisation is viewed and operates.

Noting the wider trends resulting from the consultation process, the Bursar invited Board's attention to the interim observations of the START Taskforce. The Board noted that, having regard to the results of a comparison exercise with other universities, it is apparent that the College is one of the only universities examined that separates its academic and administrative functions and that the College should consider reintegrating these functions. The Bursar advised that such integration will require setting five year objectives for the College which will see the consolidation of reporting lines, executive functions and physical infrastructure. The Board noted that a high level of both change readiness and change management will be required among the College community over the next year.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Bursar and the Provost clarified a number of issues, including that:

- (a) eleven out of nineteen taskforce sessions have been completed with the remainder to be undertaken in early 2012, together with 40 planned skip-level meetings with the wider College community;
- (b) small changes can be made within the College's current infrastructure as an interim measure;
- (c) the process auditing of areas in the Administrative, Technical and Support areas which will be necessary to progress their integration with Academic and

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- Research areas will not be done in a manner which will compromise the progress of the GeneSIS and FIS projects;
- (d) a summary of the interim findings of the START Taskforce will be circulated to the College community electronically and in hard copy where necessary;
 - (e) the START Taskforce will consider appointing an external "Change Ambassador" to assist in gaining necessary buy-in within the College community;
 - (f) the examination of the ratio of administrative to academic staff in other universities was for comparison purposes only and will not be used as a basis for informing any changes which may be necessary for the College.

The Board noted the report from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation as presented.

The Provost thanked the Bursar and the Chief Operating Officer.

BD/11-12/101 Communications Strategy

The Provost, introducing the item, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 28 November 2011, which had been circulated. He stressed the importance of the College engaging with its environment both internally and externally. The Board noted that having a strong Communications Strategy is particularly important in terms of forming global partnerships, attracting international students, sourcing research and industry sponsorship and philanthropic donations. The Provost advised that the College needs to be more proactive in this regard and that, in accordance with the College's Strategic Plan, a Communications Strategy for the College has now been devised.

The Communications Officer, present by invitation, advised Board that the document as presented takes into account the issues raised by Board members in the Board discussion in June 2011 (minute BD/10-11/268 of 29 June 2011 refers). The Board noted that a fundamental principle of the proposed strategy is that it will enable delivery of the College's key messages and demonstrate its achievements in education, research, innovation, student successes and community outreach.

The Communications Officer advised Board that, given the key role which academic staff play in communicating on behalf of College at many levels and in many fora, it is imperative that the College invests further in capacity and skills in order to support academic staff in these activities. Noting the priorities which it is hoped will be assisted by the introduction of the Communications Strategy, supported by a newly established Communications Forum, she outlined the proposed organisational structure headed by a Director of Communications encompassing the current Communications, Web and Enquiries Offices. The Board also noted the proposed enhanced marketing and Faculty Press Officer functions.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) the non-pay budgets proposed may be too low;
- (ii) it may be difficult to co-ordinate all the staff in various areas of the College who have a communications element as part of their roles;
- (iii) the staffing proposals may underestimate what is required as each function will require a specific skill set;
- (iv) consideration should be given to a long term plan of communication aimed at enhancing the reputation of the College;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (v) the strategy should place some focus on communicating with undergraduates as they are among the College's greatest ambassadors;
- (vi) the College should communicate with student societies to establish more formal arrangements to maximise publicity of successful student events;
- (vii) public relations should be a strategic and focused exercise to counteract the recent negative media reports;
- (viii) measures should be put in place to ensure that there are no overlaps in internal communication functions within the Faculties;
- (ix) internal communication should be given a priority.

In addressing the issues raised, the Communications Officer advised Board that the financial elements of the proposals will be considered by the Finance Committee in due course. The Treasurer advised that the College will have to make an initial investment in the area and thereafter the cost will be provided through annual budgeting processes.

The Board noted that the Communications Forum is intended to support a cohesive and co-ordinated platform for staff based in the Faculties who have a communication element in their role and so avoid duplication of effort. The Board further noted that the proposed Press Officers will be proficient in all forms of media, not just print, and that current staff within the Communications Office already have specific skills in social media which is regularly used as a method of communication by the College. The Provost advised Board that the College is now being more proactive in communicating with undergraduate students, noting that he addressed Junior Freshmen during Freshers Week. The Board noted that the Communications Strategy will support, and work in conjunction with, the proposed Global Relations Strategy. The Board, noting that in comparison to other universities, the proposed staffing arrangements are modest for a university of this size, acknowledged that a key role for the Director of Communications will be to develop communications strategies from both a domestic and international perspective.

The Board, noting that the newly-constituted Directorate of Communications will be within the remit of the Provost, approved the Communications Strategy as presented subject to the approval of the Finance Committee.

The Provost thanked the Communications Officer.

BD/11-12/102 Global Relations Strategy

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 1 December 2011, which had been circulated. She advised Board of the elements of the proposed strategy under the following headings:

- (i) **Process to date**

The Board noted that, following consultation with Executive Officers and the Provost in September 2011, a small Taskforce was established to assist in developing the strategy. The Taskforce, consisting of members of the College community and externally appointed members, in addition to the Vice-Provost for Global Relations, consulted with Heads of School, the Trinity Foundation and counterparts in other universities in the UK and Europe. The Board, noting that the principles of excellence, inclusivity, incentivisation and sustainability underpin the strategy, acknowledged that it is also intended that the strategy

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

will be aligned with the national strategy, promote good ethics and adhere to the College's social responsibility to society.

(ii) **Challenges**

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that there are a number of challenges facing the introduction and progression of the Global Relations Strategy including the economic environment, the College's and Ireland's reputation worldwide, the competitive global environment and the capacity of the current structures used by the College to attract international students. The Board recognised the success to date of the Trinity Foundation in fundraising in North America, the United Kingdom and Ireland and noted that the College's alumni should be viewed as a reputational asset to assist the College in reaching its goal of becoming a university of global significance.

(iii) **Trinity Global**

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that the proposed structure of Trinity Global will include:

- (a) an internationalisation division to promote global relationship building;
- (b) advancement through fundraising;
- (c) Alumni relations.

The Board noted that the intention was to bring all three elements of the strategy together in a cohesive and holistic manner and to increase capacity in the hope of trebling the annual funds raised and doubling the income from Non-EU Students.

(iv) **Benefits to the College**

The Board noted that the strategy will not only benefit the College but will also assist in rebuilding confidence in the country's economy in the global environment. The Board further noted that the strategy will provide a source of non-exchequer funding and help to attract high calibre staff and students to the College.

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that in order to enable the strategy it will be necessary to embed a global culture in the Schools and appoint a Global Officer for each School or cluster of Schools, noting that the Communications Strategy will feed into this approach. The Board noted that this will require clear job descriptions and incentivisation at School level. The Board also noted that, in order to enable the strategy, the College will have to engage in a reputation building exercise through a programme of sustainable marketing.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members, that:

- (a) consideration should be given to progressing the internationalisation programme within the EU as the reputational benefits will spread beyond Europe;
- (b) consideration should be giving to providing language training to international students in-house rather than by outsourcing as is the present practice;
- (c) realistic targets should be set for fundraising in light of the current economic climate;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (d) the College should consider introducing a comprehensive grade conversion policy;
- (e) a scoping exercise should be undertaken to assess what courses are in demand in Asia and the rest of the world;
- (f) the College will have to devise a mechanism for examining/assessing international students who only attend for one semester;
- (g) the government should be asked to contribute to the strategy;
- (h) the staffing increases proposed should not only be focused on North America.

In addressing the issues raised, the Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that relations with Erasmus students in Europe were extremely important and that this would be encompassed within the strategy. The Board noted that consideration will be given by the Senior Lecturer to a College-wide grade conversion policy and that provisions will be explored to allow students attending the College for one semester to be assessed within that semester. The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised that scoping exercises are underway in Asia to inform the College of what courses it should be offering in order to attract international students and that discussions have taken place with Trinity Foundation and the Department of Foreign Affairs on the strategy. Noting that fundraising efforts must have a worldwide focus, the Board noted that Trinity Foundation has been successful in North America with limited staff numbers based in New York and that it is intended to increase the number of staff in this office in order to maximise potential in the future.

The Board approved the high level Global Relations Strategy as presented.

The Provost thanks the Vice-Provost for Global Relations.

BD/11-12/103 Agreement with Singapore Institute of Technology

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 30 November 2011, which had been circulated. She advised Board that Singapore Institute of Technology (SIT) was established in 2010 by the Singapore Minister for Education to oversee relationships with universities overseas. She further advised Board that the Department of Physiotherapy had been approached by SIT to deliver a Bachelor of Science (Physiotherapy) in SIT. Noting that the proposals for the delivery of the course were approved by Council (Actum CL/11-12/051 of 23 November 2011 refers), the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that arrangements for employing staff in Singapore, exchange rate risk and the governing law of the contract between the College and SIT were still under negotiation.

In response to a query, Dr Hussey, Head of Physiotherapy, present by invitation, advised Board that the School of Medicine has a long history of links with Singapore and many physiotherapy graduates have been recruited to work there in recent years. The Board noted that the financial element of the proposals had been approved by the Finance Committee.

The Board approved the proposals as set out in the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer subject to the successful negotiation of the contract between the College and Singapore Institute of Technology.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/11-12/104 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 23 November 2011 subject to further comments covering CL/11-12/051, 063, 064, 066.

BD/11-12/105 Visitors

The Secretary advised Board of the outcome of a student appeal to the Visitors. The Board noted that the outcome of a second appeal which had been heard by the Visitors in November 2011 would be forthcoming in the next few weeks and that four further appeals had been referred to the Visitors.

BD/11-12/106 Media

Under Other Business, the Board noted a recent article in the media in relation to University pay scales and noted the importance of openness and transparency in this regard.

BD/11-12/107 College Secretary

Under Other Business, the Secretary advised Board that she intends to take early retirement in October/November of 2012. The Board noted that the recruitment process for a new Secretary would begin in early 2012 and that there would be a handover period to allow a smooth transition of the role. The Provost and the Board thanked the Secretary for her contribution to the Board and the College.

SECTION B**BD/11-12/108 Audit Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meetings of 10 November 2011 and 24 November 2011.

BD/11-12/109 Estates Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Estates Committee from its meeting of 22 November 2011, noting in particular:

EC/11-12/053 Accommodation for Irish School of Ecumenics (ISE), Loyola Institute and Student Services Registry

The Board noted that as this matter had not been considered by Executive Officers prior to it being referred to the Estates Committee, the decision would be deferred pending the investigation of other possible options. It was agreed that such matters should in future be considered by Executive Officers in advance of their discussion by Principal Committees.

EC/11-12/064 Any Other Business

The Board agreed the Registrar would consider the proposal to allow the President of the Graduate Students' Union to be a member of the Estates Committee.

EC/11-12/062 Space Allocation Sub Committee

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to concerns raised by a Board member, the Board agreed that the Secretary would write to the Chair of all Principal Committees to remind them that, in accordance with good governance, committee members should not participate in discussions the outcome of which will affect them personally.

BD/11-12/110 Finance Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 2 November 2011 and 30 November 2011.

BD/11-12/111 Human Resources Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Human Resources Committee from its meeting of 15 November 2011, noting in particular:

HRC 2011-12/6 Internationalisation of Academic Titles

The Board noted that the Working Group on formal use of Academic Titles will communicate its findings to the Committee in due course.

HRC 2011-12/9(i) Employment Control Framework

The Board noted that the Human Resources Committee make recommendations on the proposed round of promotions once the Working Group has reported.

HRC 2011-12/14 Fee Remission

The Chair of the Human Resource Committee agreed to report to Board on the number of staff who will be affected by the proposed cap on the fee remission scheme.

HRC 2011-12/15 Status of Retiring and Retired Staff in Relation to Research

The Board noted that the Human Resources Committee approved the proposal to establish a working group to review the Status of Retiring and Retired Staff in relation to Research with a view to reporting to Council and Board in Hilary Term 2012.

BD/11-12/112 Library and Information Policy Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 21 November 2011.

SECTION C

BD/11-12/113 Call-over of Board Business

The Board noted schedule from the Secretary to the College, as circulated.

BD/11-12/114 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 November 2011, as circulated.

BD/11-12/115 Proctors' Lists for Winter Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 29 November 2011.

BD/11-12/116 Aspirant School of Religions, Theology and Ecumenics - Acting Headship

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor M Junker Kenny as Acting Head of the School until the end of Trinity Term 2012.

BD/11-12/117 Committees

(i) **Administrative and Library Staff Review Committee**

The Board noted and approved the following recommendations from the Human Resources Committee

- (a) Professor H Rice to chair the committee, as an academic member of the Board;
- (b) Dean of Research, as a member of the committee and as Chair of the Technical Staff Committee, to assume the role of academic representative on the committee.
- (c) Dean of Research to act as Deputy Chair of the committee in the absence of the Chair.

(ii) **Estates Committee**

The Board noted the appointment of Professor C O'Farrelly as a member of the Estates Committee to replace Professor Allwright.

(iii) **Technical Staff Committee**

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor G Bennett as a member of the Technical Staff Committee for the academic year 2011/2012 and two further years thereafter, in place of Professor K Irvine.

BD/11-12/118 Representation - Board of Trinity Health Ireland

The Board noted and approved the nomination of the following to serve on the above Board, for three years:

Professor M McCarron, Dean of Health Sciences

Professor L O'Neill, Director, Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute

BD/11-12/119 Tutorship

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 23 November 2011.

BD/11-12/120 Prizes and Other Awards - Jean Montgomery Fund

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 21 November 2011.

BD/11-12/121 Reporting from External Bodies

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 29 November 2011.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings