

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 12 October 2011

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Mr R Bartlett, Professor S D C Barrett, Ms R Barry, Dr M Bourouche, Dr O Braiden, Professor M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Professor N Marples, Ms L Miller, Ms N Murray, Ms M O'Connor, Professor E J O'Halpin, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H J Rice.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor D M Singleton.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer, Vice-Provost for Global Relations.
	Director of Human Resources (Mr T McMahon) (BD/11-12/039, 040) Director of Trinity Foundation (Mr N Sparrow) (BD/11-12/043) Chair of Trinity Foundation (Mr D Went) (BD/11-12/043)

SECTION A

BD/11-12/036 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 14 September 2011 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

BD/11-12/020 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees

The following sentence was added to the end of the minute: "The Board noted a concern that too much focus was being placed on nominating candidates for honorary degrees to coincide with certain commemorative events. It was also noted that consideration should be given to nominating contributors to the philosophical and historical aspects of subject areas."

BD/11-12/037 Matters Arising

One matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/11-12/038 below).

BD/11-12/038 Legal Services (see minute BD/11-12/017 of 14 September 2011)

In response to a query the Secretary clarified that legal services were not used excessively to deal with industrial relations matters and that the majority of issues were dealt with through established industrial relations channels within the College.

BD/11-12/039 Academic Contracts

The Director of Human Resources, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to revised contract provisions and draft pro-forma contract which had been tabled. He advised Board that revision of the contract was a modernisation initiative contained in the Croke Park Agreement and that the College had sought, through a consultation process, to develop the main terms of the contract in an effort to make it more suitable for the College's academic staff. The Board noted that the amendments presented were a result of further engagement with IFUT and the Standing Committee of Fellows and that these discussions had been positive and constructive. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the contract was substantially complete subject to minor amendments proposed by IFUT and the Standing Committee of Fellows and it was envisaged that engagement will continue to ensure these are incorporated into the final contract.

In the course of a discussion the Director of Human Resources clarified a number of issues raised by Board members, including that:

- (i) the preamble will form part of the notification of the contract revisions;
- (ii) the contract is based on a public service agreement which has been accepted by IFUT and applies to both current and new academic staff whether they are members of a union or not;
- (iii) the working title "academic contract" was to facilitate discussion within the College;
- (iv) new staff will be required to sign the contract while existing staff will be informed as to the terms of the revised contract.

Board members expressed views that it was hoped that a consensual approach would be adopted as to how the terms of the contract will be interpreted by Heads of School in giving direction to academic staff. It was noted that there is a need to recognise academic staff members' responsibilities for the pastoral care of students in the contract without it conflicting with the role of the Tutorship Scheme.

The Board approved the academic contract as presented subject to minor drafting amendments which will be made in consultation with IFUT and the Standing Committee of Fellows. The Board agreed that the final version of the contract would be presented for noting in due course.

The Board noted the dissent of Mr Dowling and Dr Gibbons.

BD/11-12/040 Promotions

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated October 2011, which had been circulated. She advised Board of the recommendation to initiate the promotions process for academic and administrative, technical and support staff in this academic year. The Board noted that the terms of the current employment control framework allowed for promotions within the constraints of staff numbers and staff ratios between grades.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the tables outlining the effects the constraints will have in terms of the College's current staff numbers and advised that Executive Officers, having considered this effect and future staffing plans, are confident that there is scope for a limited number of promotions. She advised Board that there are a number of risks associated with initiating the process including financial and compliance risks and limited capacity to reward excellence. The Board noted that it is recommended that a working group of the Senior Promotions Committee develop process guidelines for promotions within the restrictions, that the Human Resources Committee review the promotions process and that a full costing of promotions be undertaken by the Planning Group.

In the course of a discussion, a number of issues were raised by Board members, including that:

- (i) there could be a perception that academic staff have already been promoted due to the recent change in academic titles;
- (ii) there is a strong argument for promotion of administrative, technical and support staff;
- (iii) movement across certain grades is considered progression rather than promotion;
- (iv) even a small number of promotions will be a boost for staff morale;
- (v) the constraints of the employment control framework have necessitated a reversion from merit based promotion to a quota based promotion system;
- (vi) the university sector has delivered significant savings under the terms of the employment control framework and should not be expected to be constrained any further;
- (vii) staff should be clearly informed of the limited capacity for promotion in an effort to manage expectations.

In response to the issues raised, the Provost advised Board that in the interest of equity, should the Board agree to reinstate the promotion process it must be open to all staff. The Board noted that, although the promotion process must operate within the constraints of the employment control framework, promotion will be based on merit. The Director of Human Resources, present by invitation, advised Board that the College was still awaiting a response from the Department of Education and Skills regarding the College's proposals for an Early Retirement Scheme and therefore little could be done through that approach to provide more scope for promotion given the limits on current staff numbers.

The Board approved the recommendations on the reinstatement of the promotion process as presented by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

BD/11-12/041 Administrative Renewal

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation invited Board's attention to a memorandum from him and the Chief Operating Officer, dated 29 September 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board of the proposal to establish a Taskforce that will conduct an assessment of current administrative and support services within the College after which recommendations for any reform deemed necessary can be implemented. The Board noted that the Taskforce is specifically charged to examine,

consider and report on the suitability of existing organisational structures to meet the College's strategic aims in teaching and research.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised Board that he would chair the Taskforce and that the proposed membership comprised the Chief Operating Officer, Dr Diarmuid O'Brien (Executive Director of CRANN), Mr John Herlihy (Vice-President-Advertising Operations, Google), Ms Etain Doyle (former Director of ComReg).

The Board noted that a consultative approach with the College Community will be adopted including a series of 'town hall' meetings. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised Board that consultation will also take place with Heads of Administrative Areas and a website will be set up to allow members of the College Community express their views.

The Chief Operating Officer, inviting Board's attention to a tabled risk assessment, advised that as the project was at the consultative stage the risks were considered to be medium. She outlined the possible risks in relation to the proposed timelines and the challenges associated with implementation of major change processes within the College.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) as students are the main users of support services consideration should be given to having student representation on the Task Force;
- (ii) consideration should be given to inviting a Senior Fellow onto the Task Force;
- (iii) it is important that any recommendation coming from the review does not add further layers of administrative bureaucracy;
- (iv) the consultative timeframe should take into account the workload of Heads of areas which are under-resourced and provision should be made to allow them to engage in the process;
- (v) the Taskforce should provide Board with an interim report;
- (vi) the town hall meetings should be held so as to allow those who commute long distances to work attend the meetings;
- (vii) part-time and research funded staff should be included in the consultative process;
- (viii) consideration should be given to including international representation on the Task Force;
- (ix) engagement should take place with trade union groups.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised Board that it is the intention of the Task Force to meet with the President of the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union on a regular basis as well as consulting with the Directors of Student Support areas. He further advised that the membership of the Task Force is deliberately small in order to facilitate quick decision making and adherence to the proposed timeframe, noting that should views of specific cohorts of the College Community be required a representative from that cohort would be invited to meet with the Task Force. The Board noted that should external expertise be required this could be facilitated by co-opting further members if deemed necessary.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised Board that the town hall meetings are necessary to facilitate direct engagement with the College Community and the schedule for the meetings includes lunch time and evening sessions. The Board noted that engagement will take place directly with trade union groups and that interim

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

reports on the progress of the overall consultation process will be presented to Board throughout the course of the project.

The Board approved the process for the consultative stage of the Administrative Renewal project taking into account the issues raised by Board members.

BD/11-12/042 Governance - Appointment of Head of School (Actum CL/11-12/014(ii) of 28 September 2011)

The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 5 October 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board that a condition of the current procedures for appointment to headship of school require the candidate to be on the Senior Lecturer grade or above. The Board noted that owing to the moratorium on promotions some Schools were experiencing difficulty in identifying candidates for the role owing in part to the lack of staff on the Senior Lecturer grade or higher. The Board further noted that Council had approved a recommendation that the current procedures be amended to state that candidates for election should *normally* be on the Senior Lecturer grade thereby allowing those on the Lecturer grade to go forward in exceptional cases.

In considering the recommendation the Board noted that the Provost must approve all candidates who wish to stand in a Head of School election and therefore it would only be in exceptional circumstances and in the best interests of the College that the revised procedure would be implemented. It was also noted that the recent changes in academic titles for those on the Lecturer grade may lead to a perception in the international arena that a very junior academic was appointed Head of School which may not be advantageous to the reputation of the particular School or the College. Board members expressed concern that the procedure would be viewed by senior academic staff as a mechanism for avoiding taking on the Headship and that pressure may be placed on more junior staff to go forward.

Noting the concerns raised and acknowledging that the Board is responsible for the governance procedures of the College, the Board agreed that proposals setting out the circumstances when it would be appropriate for a Lecturer to stand for a Head of School election would be presented for consideration at the next meeting.

The Board approved the proposed amendment to the Regulations concerning the date of appointment for Heads of School necessitated by the change in the academic year structure.

BD/11-12/043 Trinity Foundation Activity Report

The Provost welcomed Mr Went, Chair of Trinity Foundation, and Mr Sparrow, Director of Trinity Foundation, advising Board of the important role the Foundation plays in assisting the College.

Mr Went invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated September 2011, which had been circulated outlining the activities of the Foundation during 2010/2011, the integrated fundraising strategy for College, Alumni relations and details of the associated risk analysis. He advised Board of the Foundation's new Alumni strategy and of the successful implementation of the new Alumni database. The Board noted that in order for the Foundation to be in a strong position to maximise its potential for

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

revenue generation for the College, the College must support its activities, noting the importance of involving academic leaders, and in particular the Provost, to attract international support.

Mr Went advised Board of the new members of the Trinity Foundation Board, noting that all members are committed to achieving the Foundation's strategic goals. He further advised Board that he has served on the Trinity Foundation Board for over ten years and that it is his intention to retire from this position in June 2012 when a new Chair will be appointed.

In the course of a discussion, Board members noted that there was a particular skill to seeking philanthropic donations and that models used in other countries do not always lend themselves to Ireland due to cultural differences. Mr Sparrow advised Board that the Foundation had a good record of success, noting that future success rates are dependent on the involvement of the College community and that the Foundation is working with the Planning Group in this regard. The Board noted that the Foundation is also working with the Schools to ensure that they can benefit directly from Alumni who wish to make specific donations to their former School.

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations commended Dr Went and Mr Sparrow for their work and advised Board that the strategies outlined in the report were in accordance with best practice in the area. The Board noted that success in this area will be contingent on the continued combined efforts of the Trinity Foundation, Trinity Association and Trust and through direct engagement with Heads of Schools.

The Provost thanked Dr Went and Mr Sparrow.

BD/11-12/044 Pro-Chancellor- Statutes: Chapter on the Chancellor, Section 8(3)

The Registrar advised Board that the recent retirement of Dr Anthony O'Reilly as Pro-Chancellor has created a vacancy for Pro-Chancellor. The Board agreed that the process to elect a new Pro-Chancellor should commence in accordance with Section 8(3) of the Chapter on the Chancellor in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/11-12/045 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 20 September 2011 and 28 September 2011 subject to further comments covering CL/10-11/003, 013, 014(ii), 025.

CL/11-12/003 Chair of Childhood Research (2004) / Director of the Children's Research Centre.

The Board noted the importance of the attendance of all Council Members when the appointment to Chair positions is being considered.

CL/11-12/013 Quality

The Board noted the Quality progress and implementation plan for the College. Concern was expressed at elements of the forthcoming legislation to amalgamate different bodies in the sector.

BD/11-12/046 University Philosophical Society

Under Other Business, the Provost advised Board that Mr Nick Griffin of the British National Party had been invited to speak at a University Philosophical Society debate and that the College was making appropriate safety arrangements.

BD/11-12/047 University Rankings

Under Other Business, in response to a query, the Board noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer's area is reviewing the outcome and basis for recently published University Rankings.

SECTION B**BD/11-12/048 Estates Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Estates Committee from its meeting of 20 September 2011, noting in particular:

EC/11-12/039 Proposed Additional Student Residences

The Board noted that the College will be required to provide an additional €100k towards the cost of the procurement exercise.

The Board approved a memorandum from the Director of Buildings, dated 5 October 2011, which had been circulated noting that the official name of the biosciences development at Pearse Street is the Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute. In response to a query, the Chair of the Estates Committee advised Board that it will be possible to rename the building should a sponsorship opportunity arise.

BD/11-12/049 Finance Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 21 September 2011, noting in particular:

- (i) Memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 4 October 2011;
- (ii) Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements, year ended 30 June 2011;
- (iii) Draft Letter of representation from the Provost and Treasurer, dated 12 October 2011;
- (iv) Letter from KPMG, dated 4 October 2011;
- (v) Memorandum from the Secretary to the Audit Committee, dated 6 October 2011.

The Board, noting the confidential nature of the Trust Funds, approved the Audited Trust Funds (Benefactions) Financial Statements 2010-2011 as presented and authorised the Provost and the Treasurer to sign them, and the associated Letter of Representation, on behalf of the Board.

FN/11 - 12/1 Consolidated Financial Statements for year ended 30.09.2010

The Treasurer advised Board of the requirement by the US Government, for foreign institutions in receipt of monies through student federal loans schemes, to prepare financial statements under US GAAP in the future.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

SECTION C

BD/11-12/050 Deanship of Health Sciences

The Board noted that Professor M McCarron had been elected to the Deanship of Health Sciences from 1 October 2011 for a period of five years.

BD/11-12/051 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 28 September 2011.

BD/11-12/052 New Degree Titles

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 4 October 2011, and approved the following:

(i) Master in Fine Arts

Latin Title: *Magister in Arte Scaenica*

Abbreviation: M.F.A.

Gown: Black

Hood: Pale blue, lined with pale blue fur

(ii) Bachelor in Science (Education Studies)

Latin Title: *Baccalaureus in Scientiis una cum Studiis Educationis*

Abbreviation: B.Sc. (Ed. St.)

Gown: Black

Hood: Dark green, lined with black

(iii) Bachelor in Acting

Latin Title: *Baccalaureus in Histrionia*

Abbreviation: B.Hist.

Gown: Black

Hood: Pale blue, lined with white fur

(iv) Master in Medicine

Latin Title: *Magister in Medicina*

Abbreviation: M.M.

Gown: Black

Hood: Crimson, lined with crimson, edged with black

BD/11-12/053 Master in Arts (*ad eundem Oxon*)

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 23 September 2011.

BD/11-12/054 Prizes and Other Awards

The Board noted and approved the following:

(i) Gold Medals

Report from the Senior Lecturer, dated 12 October 2011, tabled (see Appendix 1 to this minute).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (ii) **School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2010-2011**
A memorandum from Ms A Wade, circulated, dated 18 August 2011.

CL/11-12/055 Tutorship

The Board noted a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 7 October 2011 and approved the following appointments from 1 October 2011:

Professor N Cox, Law School, for five years
Professor Brian Lucey, School of Business, for one year

BD/11-12/056 Representation - NIBRT

The Board noted and approved the nomination of the Dean of Research to replace Professor D Lloyd as a Member of NIBRT.

BD/11-12/057 Related Entity Financial Reporting

The Board noted a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 4 October 2011 together with the 2010 directors' reports and financial statements in respect of:

- (i) Molecular Medicine Ireland (MMI, formerly DMMC);
- (ii) NDRC.

Finance Committee minute FN/11 - 129 of 21 September 2011 refers.

BD/11-12/058 Memorandum of Understanding - National University of Rwanda

The Board noted that a memorandum of Understanding was signed on 14 April 2011 with the National University of Rwanda.

BD/11-12/059 School of Nursing and Midwifery - Headship (2011-2014)

The Board noted that Professor A Higgins had been elected to the headship of the School of Nursing and Midwifery.

BD/11-12/060 Committees

- (i) **Principal Committees 2011-2012**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 5 October 2011 and approved the nominations of Deans and Heads of School on Principal Committees for 2011-2012, following consultation with Deans and Heads of Schools:

Committee	Faculty Dean	Head of School
Estates	Engineering, Maths and Science	Head of the School of Engineering Head of the School of Drama, Film and Music
Finance	Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences	

Committee	Faculty Dean	Head of School
Human Resources	Engineering, Maths and Science	Head of the School of Law Head of the School of Mathematics
Library and Information Policy	Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences	Head of the School of Histories and Humanities Head of the School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
Student Services	Health Sciences	Head of the School of Languages, Literature and Cultural Studies
Equality	Health Sciences	Head of the School of Psychology to be advised
Irish Language	Health Sciences	to be advised

- (ii) TCD/ESRI Steering Committee (see Minutes BD/09-10/122 of 3 February 2010 and BD/09-10/172 of 3 March 2010)

The Board noted and approved the following membership:

TCD: Professor P Lane; Professor V Timonen; Professor J Wickham;

ESRI: Professor P O’Connell; Professor J Siedschlag; Professor J Williams.

SECTION D - Personnel Matters

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Appendix 1 to BD/11-12/054(i)

Gold Medallists 2011

Course	Name
Business Studies	Donnelly, Roisin (<i>Sch</i>)
Business Studies	O'Doherty, Philip
Computer Science (BA)	Dolan, Stephen (<i>Sch</i>)
Computer Science (BA)	Cleary, Jimmy (<i>Sch</i>)
Dental Science	Brody, Sarah
Economic and Social Studies	Gaffney, Emmet
Economic and Social Studies	Walsh, Christoph (<i>Sch</i>)
Economic and Social Studies	Power, Ian
Economic and Social Studies	Quinn, Aoife (<i>Sch</i>)
Economic and Social Studies	O'Sullivan, Michael
Economic and Social Studies	Cummins, Joseph (<i>Sch</i>)
Economic and Social Studies	Kotschack, Mikaela Birgitta
Economic and Social Studies	Philbin Bowman, Daniel
Economic and Social Studies	Rafter, Neill James
Economic and Social Studies	Lobelle, Amandine (<i>Sch</i>)
Education (Hons 4 th year)	Gilheaney, Sinead
Education (Hons 4 th year)	McMahon, Linda
Education (Hons 4 th year)	Nic Charthaigh, Ciara
Education (Hons 4 th year)	Quinlivan, Siobhan
Engineering	Lyons, Mathew (<i>Sch</i>)
Engineering	O'Reilly, Simon
Engineering	Cullen, Ailbhe (<i>Sch</i>)
Engineering	Farrell, Sharon
Engineering	Kelly, Ian Joseph
Engineering - Double Diploma	Leroyer, Adrien
Engineering - Double Diploma	Gallego Guirao, Sullivan
English Studies	Barrett, Fionnuala
English Studies	Griffin, Emma
English Studies	Hammond, Clare Elizabeth
European Studies	Loehr, Magdalena (<i>Sch</i>)
European Studies	Hassett, Dónal (<i>Sch</i>)
European Studies	Laing, Alexander James Ellsworth
European Studies	Flynn, Sarah Rose
History	Sanderson, William Francis
History and Political Science (equally for four years)	Teevan, Chloe (<i>Sch</i>)
History and Political Science (two part mod)	Redmond, Joan Elizabeth (<i>Sch</i>)
Information Systems (Hons) (BSc)	De Vleeschouwer, Ruth
Law and French	Sammon, Garret (<i>Sch</i>)
Management Science and Info. Systems Studies	McGreevy, Enda (<i>Sch</i>)
Management Science and Info. Systems Studies	Tobin, Ciarán Thomas
Management Science and Info. Systems Studies	Maguire, Cailín (<i>Sch</i>)
Mathematics	Dervan, Ruadháil (<i>Sch</i>)
Mathematics	O'Criodain, Cian Tomas (<i>Sch</i>)
Mathematics	Tobin, Robin Joshua (<i>Sch</i>)
Mathematics	Hellmayr, Christoph Stefan (<i>Sch</i>)

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Medicinal Chemistry	McCormack, Martha
Medicinal Chemistry	McAdam, Catherine
Medicine (5-year)	Ferris, Helena Ann Louise
Music Education	Cronin, Sarah
Music Education	Gormley, Colleen
Music Education	Treacey, Clare Ellen
Natural Sciences	Murphy, Graham Patrick (<i>Sch</i>)
Natural Sciences	Poynton, Fergus (<i>Sch</i>)
Natural Sciences	Kennington, Charlotte Guenevere
Natural Sciences	Lacchia, Anthea
Natural Sciences	Healy, Kevin
Natural Sciences	Kenny, Gavin (<i>Sch</i>)
Natural Sciences	McCaughan, Jack
Natural Sciences	Phelan, Aisling
Nursing Studies	Burns, Gemma
Nursing Studies	McEntaggart, Laura
Nursing Studies	Wilson, Ruth
Pharmacy	Corcoran, David
Pharmacy	Donohue, Stephanie
Pharmacy	Martin, Ellen
Pharmacy	Mullins, Claire Elizabeth (<i>Sch</i>)
Philosophy	McKeever, Matthew Patrick Ivan (<i>Sch</i>)
Philosophy and Political Science (two part mod)	Niker, Fay (<i>Sch</i>)
Physics and Chemistry of Advanced Materials	Wirtz, Christian (<i>Sch</i>)
Physics and Chemistry of Advanced Materials	Farrell, Leo
Radiation Therapy	Gill, Elaine Marian
Radiation Therapy	Connolly, Philippa
Radiation Therapy	Healy, Kate Patricia
Radiation Therapy	Mahon, Michelle Cathriona
Religions and Theology	Wharton, Geoffrey (<i>Sch</i>)
Social Studies	Mongey, Ruth
Theoretical Physics	Ó Conchúir, Seán Breannán (<i>Sch</i>)
TSM B: Economics and Psychology	Somerville, Jason (<i>Sch</i>)
TSM B: English Literature and French	Smyth, Tim (<i>Sch</i>)
TSM B: History and English Literature	Mansfield, Thomas Haddon
TSM B: Psychology and English Literature	Ní Choisdealbha, Áine (<i>Sch</i>)