

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 5 May 2010

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr S D C Barrett, Ms G Clarke, Mr P G Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Mr C Cashman, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Cooke, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer.

SECTION A

BD/09-10/223 Minutes

- (i) **Meeting of 31 March 2010** The minutes of the meeting held on 31 March 2010 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

BD/09-10/189 Trinity Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/09-10/154 of 3 March 2010) The first sentence was amended to read "The Provost, noting that, in accordance with the agreed procedure each institution had submitted its nominees, advised Board of the following membership of the first Committee of the TAMC:"
- (ii) **Meeting of 12 April 2010** The minutes of the meeting held on 12 April 2010 were approved and signed.

BD/09-10/224 **Matters Arising** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/09-10/225, 226, 227, 228 below).

BD/09-10/225 **College Safety Committee** (see minute BD/09-10/202 of 31 March 2010) The Secretary advised Board that the membership of the College Safety Committee conforms to the legal requirements. The Board noted the College Safety Officer had advised that members are receiving their notification of, and papers for, meetings in a timely manner.

BD/09-10/226 **Research Quality Metrics - Second Report** (see minute BD/09-10/196 of 31 March 2010) In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that risk assessment is part of the resource planning model process. Noting that all

policy issues relating to RPM had now been dealt with, he further advised that the Planning Group will report to Board in due course on how School deficits will be dealt with.

BD/09-10/227 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/09-10/189 of 31 March 2010) The Board noted that the membership of the Committee of the TAMC relates to the first committee only and does not set a precedent for the membership structure of future committees.

BD/09-10/228 Election to Scholarship (see minute BD/09-10/220 of 12 April 2010) The Board agreed that the issues raised by Board members in relation to Scholarship would be reviewed by the Undergraduate Studies Committee.

BD/09-10/229 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the following matters:

- (i) **Former Provost Dr Bill Watts** The Board noted with great sadness and regret the sudden death of former Provost (1981-1991), Dr Bill Watts, M.A., Sc.D., M.R.I.A., F.T.C.D., who died on 26 April 2010.
- (ii) **Statutes** The Board noted that the Restatement of the Statutes had received the assent of the Fellows and would now be sent to the Visitors for their considerations and approval.
- (iii) **Annual Meeting with the HEA** The Board noted that the annual meeting with the HEA had taken place during which the following issues had been discussed:
 - (a) **Promotions** The Board noted that the HEA had requested a report from the College in relation to Academic Promotions.
 - (b) **Employment Control Framework** The Board noted that the College has requested clarification from the HEA on the treatment of different income sources.
 - (c) **College finances** The Provost advised Board that he had drawn the HEA's attention to the on-going effects of the reduction in core grant coupled with the increase in the number of students. In response to issues raised by Board members, the Treasurer advised Board that adherence to the HEA's requirement of a zero deficit is essential to the operation of the current employment control framework. The Board noted that the HEA has agreed to consider proposals for multi-annual budgeting in the future.

BD/09-10/230 Associated Colleges - Report of the Working Group on the Partnership between Trinity College and the Associated Colleges of Education The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 27 April 2010, which had been circulated. Noting that an external review of the School of Education had taken place in 2008 as part of the College's quality review process, he advised Board that, on the recommendation of the reviewers and the Teaching Council, a Working Group had been established to consider the current arrangements with the Associated Colleges of Education (Marino Institute of Education, Froebel College of Education and the Church of Ireland College of Education) including disengaging from teaching modules in the Bachelor of Education (B.Ed) and Higher Diploma in Education (H.Dip).

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, noting the changes in the higher education environment and in the teaching education curriculum, invited Board's attention to the following recommendations of the Working Group:

- (i) beginning in the academic year 2010/11, the responsibility for:
 - (a) the delivery of the nine modules in educational studies ("foundation studies") in the B.Ed degree programme in Years 1, 2 and 3, and
 - (b) the delivery of the five modules in educational studies ("foundation studies") in the H.Dip (Primary)
 should be transferred from the College to the Associated Colleges of Education.
- (ii) noting the legitimate expectation of current students to complete their degree within the College, the Associated Colleges of Education should be licensed to deliver the B.Ed. Honor Year (Senior Sophister year) in 2010/11, and thereafter, on the College's behalf;
- (iii) the Associated Colleges of Education should take responsibility for the full delivery and administration of the B.Ed. programmes and the H.Dip. Primary, commencing with the new intake of students in the academic year 2010/11;
- (iv) that the University of Dublin should continue to accredit these programmes and put in place appropriate quality assurance processes.

The Board also noted the proposed establishment of an '*Associated Colleges' Degrees Committee*' to implement quality assurance processes and the establishment of a '*Transition Group*' to oversee the implementation of the proposed changes, in both cases consisting of representatives from each of the Associated Colleges of Education and the College. Noting that the recommendations of the Working Group had been approved by Council (Actum CL/09-10/146 of 21 April 2010 refers), the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that pending Board approval, the recommendations would be presented to the Finance Committee for consideration of the financial aspects of the proposed arrangements. He stated that Board approval was sought at this stage to enable communication of the new arrangements to the relevant students as soon as possible.

In the course of a broad ranging discussion a number of academic issues including the possibility that individual Schools within the College could contribute to the curriculum of the B.Ed and H.Dip and the potential risk to the College's reputation by awarding degrees which are taught by third parties, were raised.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified a number of technical issues, including that:

- (i) the loss of income to the School of Education will be made up by the introduction of new postgraduate courses in the School;
- (ii) the proposed merger of teaching theory and practice is in line with best practice;
- (iii) should the proposed financial plan be modified significantly by the Finance Committee it will be presented again to Board for approval;
- (iv) students have been consulted in relation to the proposed arrangements and their views have been taken into account;
- (v) it is expected that existing students will be able to avail of all student services within the College noting that arrangements have yet to be finalised;
- (vi) the student/staff ratio in the School of Education, which had previously been high, will now reach a standard level;
- (vii) the College will maintain control over the quality of the teaching programmes through the Associated Colleges' Degree Committee.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Noting the differing views of Board members on the benefits to the College and the Associated Colleges of the proposed arrangements, the Board approved the proposals for future partnership arrangements between the College and the Associated Colleges of Education, subject to agreement on the financial arrangements by the Finance Committee.

The Board noted the dissent of Dr Barrett and Dr Vij.

BD/09-10/231 Self-evaluation of the Board The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 27 April 2010, which had been circulated. The Secretary advised Board that the recommendations presented addressed the governance issues highlighted in the Board self-evaluation survey which had been considered by Board (see minute BD/09-10/086 of 8 December 2009). The Board noted that the recommendations had the support of the Executive Officers.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Secretary clarified a number of technical issues, including that:

- (i) training for Board members takes place every two years;
- (ii) provision can be made to provide training to student representatives on a yearly basis;
- (iii) independent training is provided by the Institute of Public Administration;
- (iv) consideration will be given to holding informal meetings to facilitate informal strategic discussions and consultation;
- (v) efforts will be made to communicate decisions of the Board to the wider College community.

The Board, noting that some recommendations may not come into effect until the academic year 2010/2011, approved the proposals outlined.

BD/09-10/232 Annual Governance Statement The Board approved the draft Annual Governance Statement to the HEA which had been circulated and authorised the Provost to sign it on its behalf.

BD/09-10/233 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 21 April 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/144(i), 148, 153, 154, 161, 162 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

BD/09-10/234 Bonus Points for Mathematics (see Actum CL/09-10/144(i) of 21 April 2010) The Board noted that the Minister for Education and Science had requested third level institutions to consider the reintroduction of awarding bonus points for Higher Level Leaving Certificate mathematics.

BD/09-10/235 Review of Examinations in the New Academic Year Structure (see CL/09-10/148 of 21 April 2010) The Board noted that the Undergraduate Studies Committee will consider methods of reducing workload pressures in the second teaching term.

SECTION B

BD/09-10/236 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 12 March 2010, noting in particular:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

AD/09-10/52 Haughton Institute -Review of Managed Funds The Board noting that the Haughton Institute is reducing its operations in anticipation of the formation of the Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC), noted the Audit Committee's recommendation that a clear plan should be put in place to facilitate this transition.

AD/09-10/54 Status of Audit Committee Recommendations The Board noted that the Executive Officers are preparing a response to the recommendations contained in Audit Committee's Annual Report.

BD/09-10/237 Finance Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 13 April 2010, noting in particular:

FN/09-10/65 Research and Related Accounts The Board noted that the risk associated with the lack commitment accounting is being addressed through the eStrategy Finance Project. Comments in relation to support for Principal Investigators were also noted.

FN/09-10/67 Residential Rent Review The Board noted that, in response to a query, the Treasurer will provide details of the financial impact of semesterisation including the effect on revenue from on campus accommodation.

BD/09-10/238 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/154 of 21 April 2010) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 14 January 2010.

BD/09-10/239 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 20 April 2010.

BD/09-10/240 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/153 of 21 April 2010) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 2 February 2010, noting in particular:

SS/09-10/35 Tutorial Service The President of the Graduate Students' Union advised Board of the success of the Post Graduate Advisory Service since its introduction in March 2010 and invited Board's attention to the need to secure future funding for the service.

SECTION C

BD/09-10/241 Schedule of Board and Council Meetings 2010-2011 The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 27 April 2010.

BD/09-10/242 Constituencies for College Elections The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary, circulated, dated 26 April 2010.

BD/09-10/243 Board Minutes of 3 March 2010 - Correction The Board noted and approved the following minute:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/186 Scholarship - Intermission of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, circulated, dated 22 February 2010.

BD/09-10/244 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 7 and 21 April 2010, as circulated.

BD/09-10/245 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 20 April 2010.

BD/09-10/246 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Minchin Bursary** The Board noted and approved the 2010-2011 awards to:
Mr C Costello (€2,000)
Mr K Coleman (€2,000)
- (ii) **Canadian Studies Travel Scholarship 2009-10** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Dean of Graduate Studies of Ms C Hogan (06141161) for the award of €2,500.

BD/09-10/247 Bequests and Benefactions

- (i) **Estate of Dr John Cox Wilson Deceased** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 23 April 2010.
- (ii) **Legacy from Gwendolen Gertrude Bransby** The Board noted a memorandum from the School Administrator, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 15 April 2010, and approved the establishment of the **Desmond O'Connor Roe Fund**.

BD/09-10/248 Coiste na Gaeilge - Membership (see BD/09-10/213 of 31/3/10 refers) The Board noted and approved the addition of the following to membership of Coiste na Gaeilge:
Dámh na nEalaíon agus na nDaonnachtí: Dr C O'Sullivan
Dámh na nEolaíochtí Sláinte: Professor J Barry
An Limistéar Riaracháin agus Tacaíochta: Ms C Ní Chochláin

BD/09-10/249 Student Services Committee The Board noted and approved the following nominations, for the remainder of the academic year 2009-2010:

- (i) Interim Chair: Dr E Mac Cárthaigh in place of Dr A Piesse;
- (ii) Dr S Barrett to fill a vacancy on the committee.

BD/09-10/250 Senior Tutorship The Board noted that the Tutors had elected Dr C Laudet as Senior Tutor for three years from 3 July 2010.

BD/09-10/251 Framework Co-operation Agreement - School of Cosmic Physics, DIAS and the School of Physics (see Actum CL/09-10/079 of 16 December 2009) The Board noted that this agreement was signed on 8 March 2010.

BD/09-10/252 **Scholarship - Intermission of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 27 April 2010.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

The following item of business was deferred to the next meeting:

A.6 Annual Office

Signed:

Date: