

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 11 November 2009

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr C Cashman, Ms M A Coffey, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr B Sweeney, .
<i>Apologies</i>	Ms G Clarke, Mr P G Connell, Mr A Cooke, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr J K Vij.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer. Director of Strategic Initiatives (for BD/09-10/054 and BD/09-10/055) Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences and Professor B Singleton (for BD/09-10/054) Dr E O'Dell (for BD/09-10/056).

SECTION A

BD/09-10/047 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 14 October 2009 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

BD/09-10/029 Choice of Future Provosts At the bottom of page 4 the wording of the first sentence of the second paragraph was amended to read "In considering the proposals on the electorate, to which Dr Singleton noted his dissent, the following points were made by Board members:"

BD/09-10/048 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/08-09/049, 050, 051, and 052 below).

BD/09-10/049 Promotions (see minute BD/09-10/025 (ii) of 14 October 2009) The Provost invited Board's attention to the decision which had been taken by the Board to defer the decision to present candidates from the Senior Promotions procedure conducted during 2008/2009 to Board for approval (minute BD/08-09/279 (ii) of 17 June 2009 refers). Noting the continued financial uncertainty and the absence of an agreed Employment Control Framework, the Board agreed that this decision should be further deferred until Hilary Term 2010.

Noting the potential impact on staff morale and staff retention, the Board agreed that the Senior Promotions procedure for the current academic year would not now

proceed, but that the retention mechanism would be retained. The Board also agreed that the work of review committees in implementing contractually entitled progression would proceed.

BD/09-10/050 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/09-10/028 of 14 October 2009) Dr O'Neill advised Board of the importance of engaging with Senior Clinicians in the participating hospitals to ensure that agreement can be reached to progress the TAMC within the specified timeframe.

BD/09-10/051 Policy on Good Research Practice (see minute BD/09-10/32 of 14 October 2009) Dr O'Neill invited Board's attention to minute CL/09-10/007 of the University Council Meeting of 30 September 2009 relating to the Policy on Good Research Practice. Noting the serious matters addressed by the policy, in particular embryonic stem cell research and the potential implications the policy will have in College, Dr O'Neill stated that he felt it was necessary to have a full discussion on the policy at Board. The Provost advised Board that the policy had been circulated widely throughout College and had been debated comprehensively at meetings of the Research Committee and University Council.

Noting the issues raised, Board agreed that the operation of the policy will be reviewed in one year by the Research Committee and further considered by Council and Board at that time.

The Board noted Dr O'Neill's dissent.

BD/09-10/052 Self-Evaluation of the effectiveness of the Board (see minute BD/09-10/040 of 14 October 2009) The Provost reminded Board members to submit their completed self-evaluation form for inclusion in the analysis for consideration at Board in December 2009.

BD/09-10/053 Provost's Report At the invitation of the Provost, the Registrar advised Board that it was with regret that Commencement Ceremonies which were due to be held on Friday 6th November 2009 were rescheduled to Monday 9th November 2009 due to the risk of disruption as a result of the planned National Day of Protest. The Board noted that less than 10% of those affected were unable to attend on the rescheduled date.

BD/09-10/054 Proposed Development of the Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art (see Actum CL/09-10/034 of 28 October 2009) The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor B Singleton and the Director of Strategic Initiatives, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the memorandum dated 3 November 2009, which had been circulated.

The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences advised Board that arising from the work of the Forum on Actor Training, proposals were now being presented for the establishment of the Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art (IADA). (The final title is yet to be agreed).

Professor B Singleton, noting the need for international recognition and accreditation, advised Board that, with the assistance of funding from a philanthropic trust, the IADA would be established jointly with the Royal Academy of Dramatic Art (RADA). The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that proposals for the establishment of the following three courses will come to Council for approval in due course:

- (i) Three-year Bachelor in Acting (Hons) Programme - level 8 programme;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (ii) Two-year Higher Diploma in Stage Management and Technical Theatre - level 8 programme;
- (iii) One-year Masters in Fine Art (MFA) - level 9 course.

The Director of Strategic Initiatives advised Board that the IADA will be wholly owned by the College and will be established as a company limited by guarantee.

In the course of a discussion, the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor B Singleton and the Director of Strategic Initiatives clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members, including that:

- (a) the three year Bachelor in Acting will run for 40 weeks per annum;
- (b) the philanthropic trust will ensure the continued support of the RADA to the IADA;
- (c) capital funding is being provided for the first five years by the philanthropic trust;
- (d) the HEA is supporting the IADA and will assign a weighting of 1.7 to the courses;
- (e) it is projected that the IADA will reach a breakeven point after the first-five year period;
- (f) should School and Faculty funds not be adequate, an investment could be made from the College's Strategic Fund to meet any future deficits;
- (g) the College will include the rent foregone on the Pearse Street property when presenting financial data to the HEA;
- (h) the appointment of an Academic Director will ensure that the academic standards of the College are maintained.

The Treasurer advised Board that the Finance Committee has examined the costs, projections and financial risks of the IADA. The Board noted that the financial risk would be monitored on an on-going basis and it is expected that at the end of the third year some commercial activities would be established which would both generate revenue and reduce the risk.

The Board, approving the proposals, agreed that formal legal agreements should now be drafted and noted that the Memorandum of Association and the Articles of Association will come to Board for approval in due course.

BD/09-10/055 Pension Matters The Director of Strategic Initiatives, present by invitation, advised Board that discussions with the Department of Finance and the Department of Education and Science and the HEA are on-going regarding discretionary provisions in the Master Pension Scheme. The Board noted that, due to the variance of discretionary provisions in each of the Universities' pension schemes, the Universities are now negotiating with the government departments and the HEA on an individual basis. It was also noted that the economic climate has deteriorated since the discussions began.

The Director of Strategic Initiatives advised Board that, under the terms of the legislation transferring the pension assets and liabilities, the discretion remains in place: the power to exercise discretion was given to the Ministers for Education and Science and Finance and there is also provision to transfer the exercise of this power back to the Board. In response to a query, he confirmed that the added years provision at normal pension age i.e. 65, under the Master Pension Scheme, continues to apply to all staff in that Scheme.

The Board noted that, in light of the legitimate expectation of employees to these provisions, negotiations to secure the return of the discretionary power to the Board would continue and it was hoped that a final outcome would be reached before the next Board meeting.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/056 Statutes Review - Draft Ordinance - Procedure for Choosing Future Provost - Interview Process Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the memorandum from the Statutes Review Working Party (SRWP), dated 4 November 2009, which had been circulated outlining draft chapters relating to the Procedure for Choosing Future Provosts.

In the course of a detailed discussion, the Board approved the direction being taken by the SRWP on the issues as presented by Dr O'Dell and agreed to a number of technical amendments and inclusions which are necessary for the next stage of drafting by the SRWP, including:

- (i) the drafting amendments put forward by the Fellows in relation to Chapter XXVI, Section 11.1(b) and 16.2(e);
- (ii) that the Annual Officers and Faculty Deans should be treated equally within Chapter XXVI Section 11.5;
- (iii) the insertion of a clause in Chapter XXVI Section 11 to allow Board to regulate the process under which Annual Officers and Faculty Deans will step aside;
- (iv) the insertion of a clause in Chapter XXVI Section 11 to allow the Registrar, due to his/her role as Chair of the Steering Committee, to resign in a timely manner if he/she intends to announce his/her candidature;
- (v) the drafting amendments needed to clarify the definition of the electorate under Chapter XXVI section 17.1 and 17.2.

The Board noted that a final draft reflecting these inclusions would be forwarded to the Fellows for Assent. The Board thanked Dr O'Dell and the Working Party.

BD/09-10/057 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 28 October 2009 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/034, 035, 037, 041, 045, 046 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

BD/09-10/058 Research Quality Metrics (see Actum CL/09-10/035 of 28 October 2009) The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Research Quality Metrics Group which includes three Board members, the Registrar, the Bursar and Dr Allwright, have now met and are in consultation with the Undergraduate Studies Committee and Research Committee. He advised Board that proposals would come forward to Board for consideration in due course

BD/09-10/059 Academic Appeals Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/037 of 28 October 2009) The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council in respect of the Academic Appeals Committee recommendations from its meetings of 1, 2 and 5 October 2009.

Noting the concerns expressed by the Dean of Health Sciences, the Chair of the Academic Appeals Committee assured Board that these would be given due consideration as part of a wider review of aspects of the process of the Academic Appeal Committee which is in progress.

BD/09-10/060 Revised Policy on Risk Management Under Other Business the Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Interim Chief Operating Officer dated 9 November 2009, outlining additional changes to the Risk Management Policy (minute BD/09-10/062 below refers), which had been tabled.

BD/09-10/061 Museum of New Zealand - Te Papa Tongarewa Under Other Business, the Secretary, referring to the decision of Board to enter into negotiations with the Museum of New Zealand for the repatriation of artefacts currently in the possession of the College

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(minute 11/265 of 15 May 2002 refers), confirmed that the repatriation of those artefacts would take place on 25 November 2009.

SECTION B

BD/09-10/062 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 14 October 2009, with particular reference to:

AD/09-10/04 Risk Management Process in College Professor McGilp advised Board that the Audit Committee had welcomed the simplification of the risk management process noting the importance of clarity of risk ownership in terms of risk management processes within College.

AD/09-10/10 SAS - Risks prevalent in the current system Professor McGilp invited Board's attention to the comments of the Audit Committee in relation to the risks associated with delivering a new system within the agreed timeframe.

AD/09-10/12 Funding Risk Update Professor McGilp advised Board that the College was in a relatively strong financial position which should allow to the College take advantage of the strategic opportunities which currently exist.

BD/09-10/063 Research Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/041 of 28 October 2009) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meeting of 6 October 2009, with particular reference to:

RS/ 09-10/04 Research Quality Metrics (RQM) for the Resource Planning Model (RPM) Metrics In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the minutes of the Research Committee in relation to RQM and RPM would be brought to the attention of the Research Quality Metrics Group.

SECTION C

BD/09-10/064 Senior Fellowship and Senior Master Non-Regent The Board noted that Dr J M D Coey and Dr R A Stalley had been co-opted to Senior Fellowship and that Dr N Grene had been nominated as Senior Master non-Regent.

BD/09-10/065 College Ethics Policy (BD/09-10/031 of 14 October 2009 refers) The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 4 November 2009.

BD/09-10/066 Irish Language Scheme 2010-2012 The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Cathaoirleach, Coiste na Gaeilge, circulated, dated 3 November 2009 and the Irish Language Scheme 2010-2012, prepared in accordance with section 11 of the Official Languages Act 2003.

BD/09-10/067 Revised Policy on Risk Management The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Executive Officers, circulated, dated 3 November 2009.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/09-10/068 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 28 October 2009, as circulated.

BD/09-10/069 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 3 November 2009.

BD/09-10/070 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Entrance Exhibitions Report 2009** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 30 October 2009 and Entrance Exhibitions Report 2009;
- (ii) **Postgraduate Travelling Scholarship in Surgery 2009-2010/Sheppard Memorial Prize/Edward Halloran Bennett Medal in Surgery** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the committee that the above award be made to Mr James O'Riordan.

CL/09-10/071 Bequests and Benefactions The Board noted and approved the following memoranda:

- (i) **Cocker Lecture in Chemistry - Calendar Entry** a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 2 November 2009;
- (ii) **Dr John Cox Wilson Deceased** a memorandum from Head of the School of Medicine, circulated, dated 28 July 2009, further noting a bequest of €75,820.26 to fund initiatives in the School.
- (iii) **Financial Assistance - Student Parent Group - Jackie Akerele Fund - Calendar Entry** a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 29 October 2009.

BD/09-10/072 External Auditors - Letters of Engagement The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the Audit Committee, circulated, dated 16 October 2009.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: