

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 7 May 2008

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Mr A Byrne, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Frenda, Ms U Faulkner, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr J A N Parnell, Dr A J Piesse, Dr H J Rice, Mr B Rock, Mr M A Slevin, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dr A Butterfield, Ms G M Clarke, Dr J F Donegan, Dr A C Donnelly, Dr J M Kelly, Dr K J McGinley, Mrs P E Murphy, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr S M Ryan.
<i>In attendance</i>	
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary, Treasurer (Acting), Assistant Secretary.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Director of Buildings (for BD/07-08/270), Dr E O'Dell (for BD/07-08/271).

The Provost welcomed Dr O'Mahony, the newly-appointed Bursar, to her first meeting of Board.

BD/07-08/265 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 2 April 2008 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/07-08/255 Restructuring - Annual Officers

- (iv) **Term of office of the Vice-Provost:** The phrase 'and would be nominated in accordance with the Statutes' was added to the end of the section.
- (v) **Feasibility of the proposed role of the Vice-Provost:** The phrase 'in some respects' was inserted before the word *comparable* on the third line.

The phrase 'and would be a member of both the Academic Management Group and the Senior Administrative Management Group' was added to the end of point (j) on page 3.

The word 'some' was replaced with the word 'considerable' on the fourth line of the third paragraph on page 4.

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/07-08/255 The phrase 'and nominated in accordance with the Statutes' was added to the end of Footnote 2 on page 8.

BD/07-08/266 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/07-08/267, 268).

BD/07-08/267 Restructuring - Annual Officers (see minute BD/07-08/255 of 23 April 2008) The Board approved the Provost's proposal that his proposed named nominee for the post of Vice-Provost would be invited to the next Board meeting.

BD/07-08/268 College Ethics Policy (see minute BD/07-08/262 of 23 April 2008) The Secretary stated that he would advise Board, at a future meeting, of issues related to College investments.

BD/07-08/269 Provost's Report The Provost advised Board that it was anticipated that the call for proposals under PRTL 5, which had been expected at the end of March, would not now take place until the new Government Cabinet was in place. He also advised Board that he hoped to present a nomination for the Chief Operating Officer to the next Board meeting.

BD/07-08/270 Director of Buildings Office - Annual Report 2006/7 The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, introducing the first formal Annual Report for his area, outlined the scope of the work of the three broad functions which fall within the area's remit, viz. Director of Buildings Office (property management, procurement, capital projects, telephones, insurance, asset register, health and safety), Buildings Office (maintenance, transport, utilities and stationery) and Facilities (security, attendants, grounds, mail and waste).

He invited Board's attention to the staffing initiatives which took place during 2006/7 and to the proposals to align the area's services to the new academic structures by the appointment of premises managers. The Board noted the split between pay and non-pay costs in the area, noting the benefits to the College from retaining staff in service areas, which might otherwise be provided by external contractors. In response to a query, the Director of Buildings advised Board that many of the services provided by the Buildings Office are provided by contractors, appointed following a tendering process.

In considering future challenges, the Director highlighted the inadequacy of funding for on-going maintenance of the College's buildings, as well as the need to secure funds for backlog maintenance and conservation, health and safety and accessibility projects.

The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to the impact which the very significant rise in the cost of utilities is having on the College and to the need to adopt a pro-active approach to energy conservation. The Board, noting the difficulty of implementing regulatory energy rating standards in older buildings, agreed that every effort should be made to adopt sustainable energy systems and practices in all new College buildings. The Board noted the suggestion that Executive Officers give consideration to introducing a 'green fund' to support College conservation initiatives. It was also noted that effective energy conservation will only be possible if individual members of the College community act responsibly in this regard.

The Board noted that total capital expenditure in 2006/7 was in the order of €24m, compared to €28m in the previous year.

The Board thanked the Director of Buildings and his staff for their very hard work in a challenging environment.

BD/07-08/271 Capital Projects Report The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to the confidential Capital Projects Report, dated February 2008, which had been noted by the Site and Facilities Committee at its meeting on 12 February 2008 (minute SF/07-08/83 refers).

The Board noted that that the conversion of the Provost's House Stables for the Trinity Art Research Centre, the refurbishment of the Buttery Bar and Café areas and the completion of the Sports Centre and the Naughton Institute were the main capital achievements during the last year. The Board also noted that the College's

Development Control Plan will be up-dated and presented to Board in Michaelmas term 2008.

The Director advised Board that future capital developments will include the proposed Biosciences Institute, Foster Place, the Long Room Hub, Luce Hall and the School of Nursing building in Tallaght as well as developments in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus. He also invited Board's attention to the work of the Property Management Group in investigating possible property acquisitions and disposals for the College.

The Board noted the projects for which the College was successful under the HEA's Research Enhancement Scheme and the College's intended submission for capital funds under PRTL 5.

The Director of Buildings advised Board that the College has insufficient funds to undertake necessary backlog maintenance and restoration projects. He also stated that meeting the universal access requirements of the Disability Act is presenting significant challenges to Trinity and other universities in the sector.

In response to a query, the Director advised Board that it was hoped to begin work on the Biosciences building in mid-May, subject to the clarification of some issues with the HEA.

The Provost thanked the Director of Buildings for the very useful report.

BD/07-08/272 Academic Risk Register The Secretary, in the absence of Dr O'Donovan, the Board member on the Audit Committee, invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Chairman of the Audit Committee, dated 26 March 2008, which had been circulated. The Board noted that, while the Audit Committee welcomed the work to date on the development of risk management processes in College, it had concerns about the lack of clarity on the ownership of the risks and the absence of specified time-scales for their management and amelioration.

The Secretary invited the Board's attention to the Audit Committee's comments about the overlap between the Academic and the Administrative Risk Registers and the need for a greater focus on the core academic issues that are within the College's ability to manage and control. The Board noted that, in the view of the Audit Committee, there is a need to assess academic risks at local levels which would then form part of the input to the high level College Academic Risk Register.

As stated in the Chairman's memorandum, the Audit Committee welcomed the allocation of additional resources to support the management of the risk process but noted that the new support role would not be a substitute for the ownership and management of risks. The Secretary invited the Board's attention to the Audit Committee's conclusion that the College does not presently have an effective system to identify, assess, manage and monitor all key risks in a structured, visible and coordinated manner.

The Provost advised Board that, while the management of risk is implicit in all of the College's decision-making processes, the language and/or reporting methods may not yet conform to the Audit Committee's framework but that the College is moving in that direction.

In the course of a discussion, during which the value of the academic risk register as a management tool was noted, the following points were made by Board members:

- (i) a review of ARAM as an action to ameliorate risks to the undergraduate academic profile would be insufficient and too great a reliance should not be placed on ARAM to safeguard the reputation of the College;

- (ii) curriculum innovation needs to be recognised as a mechanism whereby the College's academic objectives can be achieved;
- (iii) the key actions to address the identified risks are not adequate;
- (iv) the ownership of risks and the associated actions needs to be unambiguous so as to ensure that risks are managed effectively.

In response to a query, the Secretary agreed to refer concerns about Science Foundation Ireland's funding criteria to the Dean of Research.

In conclusion, the Board agreed that the Faculty Deans would be requested to consider the issues raised by the Audit Committee and by Board members and to bring forward a revised Academic Risk Register in due course.

The Provost thanked the Audit Committee for its contribution to the College's risk management process.

BD/07-08/273 Estimates 2008 The Provost, referring to the previous Board discussion on the 2008 Estimates of Income and Expenditure, (minute BD/087-08/194 of 27 February 2008 refers), invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 30 April 2008, which had been circulated outlining proposals for the disbursement of once-off funds to ameliorate key risks to the College. He advised Board that the shortage of core funding and the need to provide for the College's liabilities under the Fixed Term Workers Act (FTWA) had prevented the College addressing these risks in a more timely manner, but that circumstances now prevailed whereby circa €10m could be released from the FTWA provision, which, together with monies from a HEA supplemental grant in December, and the release of certain other provisions held at 30 September 2007, brought the total amount available for allocation to circa €13m. In outlining the proposed allocations, the Provost noted that this once-off sum, in the context of annual expenditure was small, but was nonetheless welcome in the current funding environment.

The Board noted that the contingency provision of circa €3m contained in the 2008 Estimates remains uncommitted at this time as it may ultimately be required to meet an unforeseen need. The Provost stated that Executive Officers would review the likelihood of unforeseen/unplanned expenditure before the start of the next academic year with a view to making further allocations should the contingency funds not be otherwise required.

In response to queries, the Treasurer (Acting) clarified a number of issues associated with the proposed allocations and the status of the College's accumulated deficit and the substantial provision which the College has made to meet the College's liabilities under the FTWA. The Secretary advised Board that it was hoped that there would be a satisfactory resolution to the pension issues associated with the implementation of the FTWA.

In discussing the proposals, the need to allocate funds for IT Disaster Recovery and for the refurbishment of academic space was noted by Board members. In response to a query, the Secretary agreed to seek clarification on the costs associated with a specific refurbishment project in the School of Natural Science.

The Provost advised Board that discussions would take place with Faculty Deans and other relevant budget holders to agree the mechanisms for the allocation of funds.

The Board approved the allocation of funds as proposed.

BD/07-08/274 Statutes Review Dr O'Dell, Chair of the Statutes Review Working Party, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 25 March 2008, which had been circulated. He outlined the format and style being adopted for the revision

of Chapter 12 of the Statutes. He noted that the Universities Act and the Private Act were presented by way of footnote together with the relevant sections of the Statutes. He advised Board that a new section had been drafted on the re-establishment of the Board following a Legislative Visitation, noting that this matter had not been addressed in the current version of the Statutes.

Dr O'Dell invited Board's attention to the proposed time-table for the completion of the work of the Statutes Review Working Party as outlined in a document which had been tabled.

Following a brief discussion on the optimal time period for Fellows to assent to the revised Statutes, the Board noted that it is expected that all procedures for the adoption of the revised Statutes (including the seeking of the assent of the Fellows and Visitors) would be completed by 29 January 2009.

The Board also agreed that there would be a further discussion of the proposed revisions to the Statutes at the Board meeting on 18 June.

The Board thanked Dr O'Dell and the Working Party for their very thorough work to date.

BD/07-08/275 Academic Year Structure and Modularisation The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 28 April 2008, which had been circulated outlining proposals for the Academic Year Structure and Modularisation.

1. **Academic Year Structure:** Introducing the recommendations, the Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the extensive consultation process which had taken place over a two-year period and he advised Board that the need for coherence in the timing of the College's academic activities, and the efficient use of College resources, were the primary objectives underlying the proposals. He outlined the following recommendations, in each case noting the rationale for the proposal and the situations where there may be a need for Council to consider and approve deviations from the agreed approach:
 - 1.i **The academic year structure**
College should adopt the academic year structure as outlined in Appendix 1 to this minute
 - 1.ii **Teaching outside statutory terms**
All teaching should be confined to the two 12-week terms - Michaelmas and Hilary. Any deviation from this will require Council approval
 - 1.iii **The timing of examinations and Scholarship**
 - (a) *University examinations should normally be confined to the University annual and supplemental examinations periods as published in the Almanack. Any deviation from this will require Council approval.*
 - (b) *The Board noted that the Working Group on Scholarship was awaiting the outcome of the decision on the proposed academic year structure before finalising its report.*
 - 1.iv **Reading weeks, field trips and professional placements**
 - (a) *Where applicable, Schools should determine in advance the timing of reading weeks, field trips and professional placements. In doing so, they should ensure that there are no timetabling conflicts between teaching requirements, field trips and/or placements.*

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) *Where applicable, there should be uniformity in the timing of reading weeks at Faculty level.*
 - (c) *Schools should publish, where practicable and applicable, in the course handbook or on the web, the timing of reading weeks, field trips and professional placements.*
- 1.v **Administrative and Support Services**
- (a) *Staffing issues in respect of work practices, especially during the transition period, should be addressed through consultation with staff representative bodies and heads of areas.*
 - (b) *College should identify and provide the necessary resources to allow the implementation of the academic year structure in 2009/2010. (It is envisaged that these will be required only in the transition period).*
 - (c) *College should minimise the loss of commercial revenue by making a timely decision on the adoption of the proposed new academic year structure.*

The Secretary invited Board's attention to comments which had been submitted by Dr McGinley, who could not be present at the meeting. The Board noted Dr McGinley's view that, as the proposals were not within the ambit of normal ongoing change, their implementation could possibly benefit from the use of a mutually agreed external facilitator. Dr McGinley had also expressed the expectation that the College would honour all its current agreements and obligations in the implementation of the proposed changes.

In the course of a discussion on the proposals, the need for flexibility in relation to field trips and clinical placements in relevant disciplines was noted. In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that recommendations in relation to reading weeks would be addressed at Faculty level.

The Board approved the proposals as presented, subject to Council approval, and to some changes in the terminology describing the proposed structures.

2. **Modularisation:** Introducing the recommendations, the Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the consultation process which had taken place since the matter had been considered previously by Council (minutes CL/06-07/158 of 9 May 2007 and CL/06-07/217 of 27 June 2007 refer) and Board (minutes BD/06-07/316 of 30 May 2007 and BD/06-07/374 of 4 July 2007 refer). He stated that the Heads of School and the Directors of Undergraduate Teaching and Learning had assessed the courses on offer in their Schools in the context of the proposed course structure, arising from which the following recommendations were being presented for consideration by Council and Board:

- 2.i *College should implement as soon as practicable the revised course structure CS3 which comprises a core curriculum and an elective curriculum.*
- a. The *core curriculum* will normally comprise a maximum of 220 ECTS credits over a four year programme. This will include mandatory and optional courses within the students' programme of study.
 - b. The *elective curriculum* will normally comprise a minimum of 20 ECTS credits over a four year programme. Of this at least 10 ECTS credits will comprise personal or professional skills development, and these may include for example, placements, dissertations and research

skills. The elective curriculum will also provide the opportunity for students to take 10 credits outside the students' main programme(s) of study.

c. Any deviation from CS3 will require Council approval.

2.ii The Senior Lecturer's Office should begin now to assess and make provision for the changes required to course regulations, assessments, administration and systems supports to enable the full implementation of CS3, and following this assessment, propose an implementation schedule to Council.

2.iii Subject to time-tabling constraints and module availability, all new undergraduate degree programmes should comply with the revised CS3.

2.iv Effective from 2008-09, all students taking a Broad Curriculum course, including Broad Curriculum language modules, where they are permitted by their home regulations, will obtain the associated credits within their 60 ECTS workload and have their Broad Curriculum mark incorporated within their end-of-year overall result, and the School offering the Broad Curriculum course will be assigned the corresponding FTSE/ARAM credit.

In response to queries from Board members, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the proposals will apply to all College undergraduate degrees, unless otherwise decided by Council. He also stated that it will be Council's responsibility to determine what constitutes a non-cognate discipline in the context of a student's course of study. The Senior Lecturer confirmed to Board that his office would undertake the tasks outlined in the recommendation 2.ii above, noting that consultation with relevant areas of College will be an integral part of this exercise.

The Board approved the proposals as presented, subject to Council approval.

BD/07-08/276 Scholarship 2008 The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 30 April 2008, which had been circulated. He stated that seventy-one Scholars were proposed for election on Trinity Monday, of whom eleven were Foundation Scholars. He invited Board's attention to the distribution of the Foundation Scholars across Faculties as agreed by the Central Scholarship Committee and noted that twenty six scholarships were awarded to female candidates and forty five to male candidates.

SECTION B

BD/0708/277 Finance Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 22 April 2008.

BD/07-08/278 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/143 of 9 April 2008) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 4 March 2008.

BD/07-08/279 Research Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/144 of 9 April 2008) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meetings of 21 February and 12 March 2008.

- BD/0708/280 Resource Management Committee** The Board approved the recommendations of the ARAM Task Force, as approved by the Resource Management Committee, and outlined in a memorandum from the Bursar and Senior lecturer, dated 14 April 2008.
- BD/0708/281 Site and Facilities Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 1 April 2008.

SECTION C

- BD/07-08/282 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on
 (i) 1 April 2008;
 (ii) 29 April 2008.
- BD/07-08/283 Restructuring - Annual Officers (see minute BD/07-08/255 of 23 April 2008)** The Board approved the revised document subject to the incorporation of the amendment specified above (minute BD/07-08/265).
- BD/07-08/284 Pension Fund Trustees** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr F Cowzer as the nominee of SIPTU as a Pension Fund Trustee, in succession to Mr P Cullen.
- BD/07-08/285 Disciplinary Panel - (Staff) - Deputy Chair** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr J McBratney, SC as Deputy Chair of the Disciplinary Panel (Staff), with the agreement of the Academic Staff Association.
- BD/07-08/286 Graduate Students' Union - Sabbatical Officer on-Campus Accommodation** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Graduate Students' Union, dated 25 April 2008.
- BD/07-08/287 Prizes and Other Awards**
- (i) **Minchin Bursary** The Board approved the award of the Minchin Bursary for this academic year to Mr C M Hyland (096363091), value €1,270.
 - (ii) **Anita Newell Scholarships** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 29 April 2008;
 - (iii) **P J Drudy Prize in Economics** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 22 April 2008;
 - (iv) **Postgraduate Ussher Fellowships** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 29 April 2008;
 - (v) **Deloitte Management Consulting Prize** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 21 May 2008;
 - (vi) **Arnould Prize** The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Treasurer, dated 25 April 2008.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:.....

Date:.....

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Proposed Academic Year Structure

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/07-08/275

Cal. Wk	Dates 2009/10	Outline Structure of Academic Year	Notes
1	31-Aug-09	Supplemental Examinations	Statutory Term (Michaelmas) begins 2 weeks earlier than at present to fit in + 2 teaching weeks & +1 reading week before Christmas. Supplemental exams require 2 weeks as at present.
2	07-Sep-09		
3	14-Sep-09	PG Registration	
4	21-Sep-09	UG New Entrant Registration/Freshers' Week	
5	28-Sep-09	Teaching Week 1 Registration continuing studs	<u>Michaelmas Lecture term</u> begins 2 weeks earlier than at present
6	05-Oct-09	Teaching Week 2 Registration continuing studs	
7	12-Oct-09	Teaching Week 3	
8	19-Oct-09	Teaching Week 4	
9	26-Oct-09	Teaching Week 5	
10	02-Nov-09	Teaching Week 6	
11	09-Nov-09	Teaching Week 7	
12	16-Nov-09	Teaching Week 8	
13	23-Nov-09	Teaching Week 9	
14	30-Nov-09	Teaching Week 10	
15	07-Dec-09	Teaching Week 11	
16	14-Dec-09	Teaching Week 12	
17	21-Dec-09		
18	28-Dec-09	Christmas Period	Break between teaching terms 4 weeks (as at present)
19	04-Jan-10		
20	11-Jan-10		
21	18-Jan-10	Teaching Week 1	Hilary Term begins
22	25-Jan-10	Teaching Week 2	-
23	01-Feb-10	Teaching Week 3	
24	08-Feb-10	Teaching Week 4	
25	15-Feb-10	Teaching Week 5	
26	22-Feb-10	Teaching Week 6	
27	01-Mar-10	Teaching Week 7	
28	08-Mar-10	Teaching Week 8	
29	15-Mar-10	Teaching Week 9	
30	22-Mar-10	Teaching Week 10	
31	29-Mar-10	Teaching Week 11	
32	05-Apr-10	Teaching Week 12	
33	12-Apr-10	Revision	<u>Hilary Term</u> ends.
34	19-Apr-10	Revision	<u>Trinity Term</u> begins
35	26-Apr-10	Annual Examinations 1	Annual Examination period: 4 weeks at present followed by 4 weeks for marking, examiners' meetings, publication of results, Courts of First Appeal and Academic Appeals. In practice this activity is likely to extend up to the end of statutory term.
36	03-May-10	Annual Examinations 2	
37	10-May-10	Annual Examinations 3	
38	17-May-10	Annual Examinations 4	
39	24-May-10	Marking/Courts of Examiners/Results	
40	31-May-10	Marking/Courts of Examiners/Results	
41	07-Jun-10	Marking/Courts of Examiners/Results	
42	14-Jun-10	Marking/Courts of Examiners/Results	
43	21-Jun-10	Courts of First Appeal/Academic Appeals	
44	28-Jun-10		
45 to 52	05-Jul-10 to 23 August 10	Postgraduate dissertations/theses / Research 1-8	Eight weeks between end of statutory (Trinity) term and commencement of statutory (Michaelmas) term. This period is also used for writing up Masters dissertations and research theses due for submission in September.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings