

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 11 December 2007

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr A Butterfield, Ms G M Clarke, Dr J F Donegan, Dr A C Donnelly, Mr A Frenda, Ms U Faulkner, Dr J M Kelly, Ms M Leahy, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J McGinley, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr J A N Parnell, Dr A J Piesse, Dr H J Rice, Mr B Rock, Mr M A Slevin, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Mr A Byrne, Ms M A Coffey, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr S M Ryan.
<i>In attendance</i>	
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary, Acting Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chair, Audit Committee (Mr T Forsyth) and Internal Auditor (Mr F Sheeran) (for BD/07-08/113). Staff Secretary (Mr P A McMahon) (for BD/07-08/120).

SECTION A

BD/07-08/113 Audit Committee Annual Report The Provost welcomed Mr Forsyth, Chair of the Audit Committee, and the Internal Auditor, to the meeting. Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the Audit Committee's Annual Report for 2007 which had been circulated. Introducing the report, he stated that, while there had been achievements during the year, the delay in resolving key issues identified in the previous year's report is a cause of serious concern to the Committee.

Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the following five areas.

Risk Management: The Audit Committee is concerned about the lack of substantial progress in developing effective systems of risk management in line with the Board approved Risk Policy. Mr Forsyth advised Board that failure to implement a full risk management system militates against the Board prioritising the many, and often conflicting, demands on the College's resources. The Board noted that the Audit Committee will comment further on risk management when the College's High Level Register will be considered at the next Board meeting.

ARAM: The Audit Committee is concerned that, due to high workloads of key personnel, ARAM has not been fully implemented. The Board noted the Committee's recommendation that there is an urgent need to achieve stability and more certainty in the financial planning process, particularly because of the emergence of the new HEA funding model.

Decision Making: The Audit Committee, welcoming the implementation of the recommendations in relation to Principal Committees, had noted the emergence of a number of new groupings which have assumed responsibilities which would have previously been within the remit of Principal Committees and Executive Officers. Mr Forsyth noted the risks associated with the creation of such additional groupings and the associated potential erosion of good governance.

Financial Position and Systems: The Audit Committee had noted that under-funding, pension liabilities, FTWA, outdated IT systems and the lack of a strategic fund continue to hamper the College in achieving its objectives.

Administrative resources: The Audit Committee, noting that the needs of administrative areas are being met to a substantial extent from non-core funding, is concerned about the sustainability of administrative areas operating on baseline grants from 2003/2004.

Mr Forsyth stated that the fact that the volume of changes currently in train is diverting management time away from other important core strategic issues is a matter of concern to the Committee and he invited the Board's attention to the following recommendations:

- (i) that existing changes are finalised speedily;
- (ii) that the capacity of the College to manage and deliver change in a reasonable timescale is factored into future decisions on major initiatives using a risk management approach;
- (iii) that caution is exercised before embarking on further major initiatives until those currently in progress are fully implemented and working satisfactorily.

He also advised Board that, because of the significance of these issues, the Audit Committee will perform a mid-term review so as to provide a further update to Board in Trinity Term 2008.

Mr Forsyth invited Board's attention to the work carried out by the Committee during the past year and the Committee's recommendations. He noted, in particular, the compliance requirements placed on the Board by the recently adopted *Code of Governance for Universities* and the role which the Internal Audit function will be required to play in this regard. The Board noted the limitations which the lack of a fully developed risk management system place on the audit approach and the impact which the current relatively low level of resources in the Internal Audit function will have on providing the required assurances.

Mr Forsyth invited Board's attention to the proposals for future work for the Internal Audit function as outlined in the Committee's report, noting that this was a rolling programme of work from year to year and that priority would be given to those areas of most significance to the Board and the College. He invited the Board to identify priorities which it would like the Audit Committee to address in the coming year.

In conclusion, he expressed his thanks to the members of the Audit Committee and the College community for their support during the year. He also thanked the Internal Auditor and his Assistant, the Committee Secretary and the College's external auditors for their contributions to the Committee's work.

In the course of a long discussion, Mr Forsyth, in response to queries from Board members, clarified the Audit Committee's recommendations in relation to risk management and the steps which the College needs to take to embed it in the management of both academic and administrative areas. He also clarified the role which risk management can play in assisting the Board to identify priority actions and allocation of resources. He advised of the necessity to bring the current change programme to fruition before embarking on any further major initiatives. He also advised Board of the Committee's view that all proposals for change being considered by the Board should be accompanied by a full risk assessment.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the discussion which had taken place at the Heads' Committee on 13 November 2007 (minute HC/07-08/13 (ii) refers). The Board noted that Heads of School feared that, if the compilation of a School risk register was not professionally managed, it could result in an outcome that would put individual Schools and the College at even greater risk. The Senior Lecturer advised

Board that the Heads' Committee had recommended that: (i) there should be a central management of the risk assessment process; (ii) a College Risk Manager should be appointed who would work with Schools and ensure a common, informed and structured approach; and (iii) a mechanism should be put in place to address, and, if necessary, finance high level risks.

Board members stressed the importance of adopting the Audit Committee's recommendations and it was stated that there is a need to integrate the College's complex activities so as to ensure maximum success for the College in the achievement of its strategic objectives. The need to link the assessment of the College's risks to the objectives of the Strategic Plan was also noted.

The Board thanked the Chairman and the Internal Auditor for the very clear report and agreed that there would be a full discussion on the College's high level risks at the next Board meeting.

BD/07-08/114 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 21 November 2007 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

Dr Rice replaced Dr Lynch on the list of those present.

BD/07-08/080 Working Group on the Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer The word 'query' on the top line of the second page was replaced with the following text 'concern about an advertisement appearing on the College's website'.

BD/07-08/088 Election of the Dean of Health Sciences The first two lines of the fourth paragraph were replaced with the following text 'The Board, approving the proposal as presented, agreed that new Dean will develop proposals for approval by Board on:'

BD/07-08/115 Matters Arising from the Minutes A matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minutes BD/07-08/116 and 117).

BD/07-08/116 Working Group on the Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer (COO) (see minute BD/07-08/080 of 21 November 2007) On the nomination of the Provost, the Board approved the Librarian as a member of the Interview Committee for the post of Chief Operating Officer.

BD/07-08/117 Election of the Dean of Health Sciences (see minute BD/07-08/088 of 21 November 2007) The Board agreed that the Secretary to the College would assist the Dean of Health Sciences in developing the criteria for the definition of electorates for future elections of Deans of Health Sciences.

BD/07-08/118 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the provisions made for the education sector in the Government's recently-published Book of Estimates. He stated that while it is difficult, on the basis of the high level data available, to predict the exact outcome for Trinity, it is expected that the availability of competitive research funds will increase and that there will be additional funds available for capital investment in the sector as a whole. The Board noted with concern that it is likely that core recurrent funding will not meet the College's required level and that this shortfall is likely to be exacerbated by the implementation of the HEA's RGAM.

BD/07-08/119 ARAM The Bursar invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 3 December 2007, which had been circulated. He advised that an ARAM workshop had taken place

on 7 November 2007 to which Board and Council members and members of the Heads' ARAM Sub-Group had been invited. The Bursar summarised the topics which had been included in the ARAM Report circulated in advance of the workshop and the issues which he and the Treasurer had presented on the day, noting that the presentation had been circulated subsequently to all Heads of School. The Bursar advised Board that, following the previous year's workshop and issues which had arisen in the implementation of ARAM, recommendations on a number of matters from the ARAM Task Force had been included in the ARAM Report. The Board noted that addressing the impact on the grant arising from the HEA RGAM is an urgent next step in the implementation of ARAM and that the impact of the recommendations outlined in the ARAM report should, in the view of the ARAM Taskforce, bring ongoing certainty to the operation of the model, allow for stability in the ARAM calculations, and facilitate planning in the medium term.

The Bursar invited Board to consider the impact of: (i) changes already agreed; (ii) the 'Parnell Model' as outlined in Section C of the ARAM Report; and (iii) the issues raised in Section B of that report. He advised Board that the timescales associated with any changes need to be agreed as well as the impact of the changes on the stability of College. The Board also noted a recommendation that the Board review the possibility of full (100%) implementation of ARAM with the appointment of new Faculty Deans in early 2008.

The Bursar invited Board's attention to the discussion which had taken place at the Heads' Committee on 13 November (minute HC/07-8/14 refers). The Heads' Committee had agreed that its ARAM sub-group should continue and that this sub-group should consider the implications of full ARAM implementation at Faculty level. The Bursar also invited Board's attention to the discussions which had taken place at the Resource Management Committee on 3 December 2007 (minute RMC/07-08/04 refers) in which the need for stability in order to plan and to manage on a day-to-day basis had been stressed.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the detail of the discussions at the Heads' Committee and the Resource Management Committee (RMC) both of which had concluded with a recommendation that College implement the ARAM in full when it establishes the three-faculty structure, with the RMC recommending that the ARAM Taskforce should work out the details of how this would be achieved. He advised Board that Heads had expressed the strong view that the current partial implementation of ARAM is causing too much uncertainty in the financial planning for Schools and that speedy decisions are required.

The Board also noted the Heads' Committee recommendation that a realistic slice of the Faculty budget be reserved for strategic purposes and to assist 'overfunded' Schools in meeting their targets. The Bursar advised Board that Faculties being in deficit did not allow for such slicing of the budgets.

In the course of a long discussion, the following points were made by Board members:

- (i) a moderating mechanism similar to that used in the implementation of the HEA RGAM should be introduced in an effort to maintain stability;
- (ii) it would put an excessive burden on the new Faculty Deans to give them responsibility for the full implementation of ARAM at the start of their terms of office;
- (iii) care has to be taken to ensure that Board's decision-making is based on the best available information and that its committees accept and adopt the decisions made;
- (iv) there is a need for absolute clarity in the ARAM decision-making relationships between Faculties and Schools.

In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the future of the Heads' Committee was being considered as part of the overall review of the College's Principal Committees.

The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the Heads' Committee had requested that the decision to move to the full implementation of ARAM be made by Board at that meeting so as to address the risks associated with the current arrangements. He stated that the Board will be required to make decisions on the principles and parameters of ARAM and that the implementation details will be developed by the ARAM Taskforce.

The Board agreed that, as there was insufficient information available to it to make decisions at that meeting, a detailed paper outlining proposals for change, including simulations indicating clearly the impact of the proposals, would be presented to the Board meeting in February 2008 at which decisions on the future of ARAM would be made.

BD/07-08/120 Staff Office Annual Report (see Actum CL/07-08/057 of 5 December 2007) The Provost welcomed the Staff Secretary to the meeting. The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to the Staff Office Annual Report 2006/07 which had been circulated and commended the Staff Secretary and his staff for preparing such a thorough document.

Introducing the key staff-related policies outlined in the Report, the Vice-Provost stated that effective policies on staff recruitment and retention underpin the College's strategic success and their impact would be an integral part of all future reports.

She invited Board's attention to policies on staff planning, recruitment and retention. She noted that while, in the past, it had been Trinity's policy to recruit only at the Lecturer grade, in 2006, following consultation with staff representative bodies, it had been agreed that recruitment into the Senior Lecturer and Associate Professor grades could be progressed, thereby improving the College's competitiveness in this regard. The Board noted that the introduction of three-year Strategic Staffing Plans for Schools in 2005/06 had been very successful in assisting Schools but had placed a very significant additional resource burden on the Staff Office. The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to the protocols for the transfer of academic staff, in certain circumstances, from fixed term and indefinite duration contracts to permanent posts, thereby offering the College, in exceptional circumstances, the opportunity to retain key staff. Staff retention was also addressed by the removal of promotion quotas and through the revised academic promotion procedures introduced in 2006/07.

The Staff Secretary, present by invitation, explained the overall organisational structure of the Staff Office which deals with recruitment and employment; staff planning; promotions review committees; staff relations and pensions service; staff development.

He outlined the volume of work undertaken by the Recruitment Section, noting that almost six hundred posts had been filled in the academic year 2006/07 and that over fifteen hundred employment contracts had been issued. He advised that future reports will present comparative trends in these data. He noted the benefits of the appointment of a Staff Planning Officer in an era of a significant increase in staffing, particularly in the research area. He also invited Board's attention to the impact which the increased research activity is having on the Payroll section and to the external demands for detailed staffing information, the provision of which is also the responsibility of the Planning and Payroll section. The Board noted the activities of the Staff Relations section and the College's successful submissions to the Education Sector Performance Verification Group. The Staff Secretary advised Board of the additional work required to comply with the pension requirements of the Fixed Term Workers Act and the burden this has placed on existing staff and the reduced service which can be provided to the College community until the backlog is cleared.

He noted the arrangements in place in the Staff Office for managing performance, and highlighted the difficulty in forward planning and improving quality when one third of the staff is funded from external sources. In conclusion, he expressed his thanks to the Staff Office staff and commended the achievements of the Office despite the very serious staffing shortage during 2007.

In discussing the report, the Board noted the high number of staff on short-term contracts linked to external sources of funds and the difficulties this creates for retaining staff within the Staff Office. In response to a query, the Staff Secretary advised Board that one of the biggest risks for the area was the lack of insight into the Casual Payroll and the potential legal liabilities for the College. The lack of involvement by the Staff Office in the recruitment of research staff was also identified as a risk to the College which is now being addressed by the Personnel and Appointments and the Research Committees.

The Board thanked the Staff Secretary and his staff for the very useful and interesting report.

- BD/07-08/121 Acta of the University Council** The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 5 December 2007 subject to further comments covering CL/0708/056, CL/07-08/057, CL/07-08/060, CL/07-08/061, CL/07-08/062, CL/07-08/063, CL/07-08/066, CL/07-08/070, CL/07-08/071. (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes.)
- BD/07-08/122 Senior Lecturer's Annual Report (see Actum CL/07-08/056 of 5 December 2007)**
This item was deferred.
- BD/07-08/123 Graduate Studies Committee - Business requiring approval of Council - Academic Appeals Committee for Graduate Students (see Actum CL/07-08/066 (i) of 12 December 2007)** The Board confirmed the terms of this Actum.
- BD/-7-08/124 Pension Trustees** Under Other Business the Board agreed that the former Treasurer, Ms Dempsey, should remain as a trustee of the College's Pension Fund until the current discussions with the Department of Education and Science and the Department of Finance are complete.

SECTION B

- BD/07-08/125 Audit Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 27 November 2007.
- BD/07-08/126 Finance Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 26 November 2007 with particular reference to:
- FC/07-08/18 Quarterly Accounts to September 2007** In response to a query concerning the inclusion in the Minutes of information relating to an overspent balance on a specific research account, it was agreed that this was not a matter for the Board.

BD/07-08/127 Heads of School Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/060 of 5 December 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Heads' Committee from its meeting of 13 November 2007 with particular reference to:

HC/07-08/13 (ii) Risk Register See minute BD/07-08/113 above.

BD/07-08/128 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/-7-08/061 of 5 December 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meetings of 25 October 2007.

BD/07-08/129 Research Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/062 of 5 December 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meetings of 25 October 2007.

BD/07-08/130 Resource Management Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Resource Management Committee from its meetings of 3 December 2007. See minute BD/07-08/113 above.

BD/07-08/131 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/063 of 5 December 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 16 October 2007.

SECTION C

BD/07-08/132 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 November 2007, as circulated.

BD/07-08/133 Proctors' Lists for Winter Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 4 December 2007.

BD/07-08/134 Headship of School of Chemistry The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor D Grayson as Head of the School of Chemistry, from 15 December 2007 to 12 July 2010.

BD/07-08/135 Graduate Students' Union - Vice-President The Board noted that Mr G Magee had been elected to serve as Vice-President of the Students' Union in place of Ms M Doros.

BD/07-08/136 Representation - HEAnet Ltd The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr D Lloyd as a Director of HEAnet Ltd in place of Mr M Nowlan, with effect from 1 January 2008.

BD/07-08/137 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) The Board noted and approved the institution of the following prize and *Calendar* entry:
Paul Higgins Memorial Medal - Cahill May Roberts Ltd Prize in Pharmaceutical Chemistry The prize is awarded annually by Cahill May Roberts Ltd to the candidate who receives the highest mark in pharmaceutical chemistry in the B.Sc (Pharm) degree examination.

- (ii) **Lucy Gwynn Prize, Calendar, S61** The Board noted and approved the membership of the committee for the award of this prize:
Dr E Patten (English)
Dr M Sharp (Computer Science)
Ms J Hussey (Physiotherapy)
- (iii) **Gold Medal - Additional Award** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Senior Lecturer that Mr J Brennan (02837412) be awarded a Gold Medal on the basis of his performance at his final examinations in 2007.
- (iv) **Entrance Exhibitioners** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Senior Lecturer that Entrance Exhibitions should be awarded to the following students (upgrade in points):
Mr E McFhionnain (07070080)
Ms S Memon (07322775)

BD/07-08/138 Change of Title - International Student Affairs The Board noted and approved change of titles as follows:
 (i) the Office to be designated, 'International Office';
 (ii) the title of the Director to be changed to 'Director of the International Office'.

BD/07-08/139 Scholarship - Request to Intermit The Board noted and approved the request of the Senior Lecturer that the following Scholars should be allowed to intermit Scholarships in the academic year 2007-2008:
 (i) 06132600 (Foundation Scholar) - a second year of intermission, having previously intermitted in 2005-2006;
 (ii) 01379097 (Non-Foundation Scholar) - a third year of intermission, having previously intermitted in 2005-2006 and 2006-2007.

BD/07-08/140 E-Strategy Steering Group - Minutes of meeting of 23 November 2007 The Board noted the minutes of the E-Strategy Steering Group from its meeting of 23 November 2007, as circulated.

BD/07-08/141 Committees - Resource Management Committee The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr M A Slevin (Board member) to this committee, in place of Mr H Kearns, who had retired.

SECTION D - Personnel Matters

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: