

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 26 September 2007

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Mr A Byrne, Dr J F Donegan, Dr A C Donnelly, Ms U Faulkner, Mr A Frenda, Dr J M Kelly, Ms M Leahy, Dr M A Lynch, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J McGinley, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr J A N Parnell, Dr A J Piesse, Mr B Rock, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.

Apologies Dr A Butterfield, Ms G M Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Dr E J O'Halpin.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

The Provost welcomed Board members attending their first Board meeting.

SECTION A

BD/07-08/001 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 4 July 2007 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

BD/06-07/374 Academic Year Structure The word 'Board' was replaced with 'Broad' on the third line of the second paragraph on page 8.

BD/07-08/002 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/07-08/003, 004, 005, 006).

BD/07-08/003 Strategic Recruitment Schedule (see minute BD/06-07/372 of 4 July 2007) In response to a query, the Vice-Provost advised Board that discussions are on-going with the Heads of School and Directors of Research Institutes to address financial arrangements, including recruitment costs, for Research Institutes, and that staffing issues would be addressed by the Strategic Planning Taskforce in due course.

- BD/07-08/004 Student Administration System (see minute BD/06-07/262 of 4 July 2007)** The Provost advised Board that, following the last Board meeting, he had met with the Managing Partner of the firm of consultants which had advised the College on the Student Administration System. He stated that they had a very positive and constructive meeting and that he was now satisfied that the College should have no ongoing difficulties in its relationship with the firm in question. The Provost also advised Board that, following meetings with the consultants and the Internal Auditor, he had advised the Chairman of the Audit Committee that he was fully satisfied with all aspects of the Audit Committee's report and that the recommendation in relation to the external consultants had been fully addressed. The Board noted that this had been reported to the Audit Committee at its meeting on 18 September 2007 (minute AD/07-08/06 refers). The Board noted that work is under way to implement the other recommendations arising from the Audit Committee's review. The Board approved the minute of the discussion at the 4 July meeting for internal and external circulation.
- BD/07-08/005 Restructuring (see minutes BD/06-07/363 of 4 July 2007 and BD/06-07/352 of 26 June 2007)** The Secretary advised Board that Dr Vij had referred the Board's decision on restructuring on 26 June 2007 to the Visitors. He stated that the College's legal advisors had indicated that, while the Board was at liberty to progress the implementation of the Board's decisions on restructuring, it had been advised not to conclude matters, pending the outcome of the appeal.
- BD/07-08/006 Graduate Students' Union (see minute BD/06-07/415 of 4 July 2007)** The Board noted that Mr P Laird replaces Ms R Pe Palileo as Treasurer of the GSU until the GSU's Annual General Meeting.
- BD/07-08/007 Outlook 2007-2008** The Provost, introducing his Outlook for 2007-2008, invited Board's attention to the College's achievements in the past academic year and to the awards made to the College in the recent round of PRTL Funding (€25 million) and the HEA equipment award (€6 million) and to Trinity Foundation's fundraising achievements. He advised Board that, arising from the HEA's audit of student numbers and the application of its Recurrent Grant Allocation Model (RGAM), it is expected that the core grant for 2007 will increase by 3% instead of the expected 5%, and that it was expected that there would be a further reduction of 2% in 2008.
- The Provost advised Board that the University Presidents had a very constructive meeting with the Minister for Education and Science on

the previous day, during which they had discussed the following four key areas of concern:

- (i) the need to coordinate, at Government level, the streams of income coming to the sector from different Government Departments so as to avoid potential confusion and conflicting criteria;
- (ii) the lack of adequate funds for research overheads being provided by the Government and other research funders, resulting in an ever-increasing share of individual institutions' core grant being used to support research activities at the expense of teaching and student support;
- (iii) the severe shortage of funds in the sector which is limiting its ability to meet the Government's and society's expectations in relation to university education and research, with the consequent need for the Government to increase its level of funding and to develop a funding policy which would assist the sector in its external fund-raising activities;
- (iv) the requirement for matching funds as specified in the Call for Proposals for Phase 2 of the Strategic Innovation Fund (SIF) which is limiting the proposals which universities can submit and thereby hindering the change process which the fund itself is designed to support. The Board noted that unless the interpretation of the requirement for matching funds is relaxed there will be further, and significant, pressure on each institutions' core grant.

In looking to the year ahead, the Provost advised Board that, in line with the objectives of the Strategic Plan, the College would continue to pursue its objectives of maintaining and increasing quality in all its activities by:

- strategically increasing the number of undergraduate, research and international students, noting that integrated targets would be agreed for each School by December 2007 and that staff recruitment for 2008-2009 would proceed on the basis of Schools participating in this exercise;
- increasing the level of philanthropy;
- reducing the College's cost base;
- using the College's assets wisely;
- engaging with Government and other stakeholders at individual, institutional and sectoral levels.

The Board noted that, while it was likely that the proposed strategy would result in a budgetary deficit in the period 2007 to 2009, it was expected that, if successful, it would result in the College achieving financial balance by 2010-2011. In order to achieve this objective there will be careful monitoring of the achievement of targets across all areas.

The Provost, noting the detailed implementation schedule prepared by the Senior Lecturer, advised Board that work would continue to bring the restructuring programme to a conclusion, noting in particular, that:

- (a) the recruitment of the Chief Operating Officer was under way;
- (b) Deans of the new Faculties would be in place by 1 January 2008;
- (c) the Chief Academic Officer would be in post by July 2008;
- (d) there would be a phased roll-out of the required information systems;
- (e) implementation of the Board's recommendations in relation to modularisation would proceed, noting the emphasis placed by the HEA in this regard.

The Provost concluded by inviting Board's attention to a number of specific issues which were currently under way, viz. progressing relationships with other institutions, the preparation of proposals for the second phase of the Strategic Innovation Fund, ensuring the sustainability of the College's Research Institutes and the capital development of Pearse Street.

In the course of a long discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

- in the course of the current restructuring exercise, staff need to be reassured about the future of their livelihoods in Trinity and communications with staff need to be sensitive to these concerns;
- care should be taken in the use of the term 'institute' when it is being applied to buildings so as to avoid confusion with academic activities which are also denoted as institutes, while at the same acknowledging that many of the College buildings at the East End have the title of Institute;
- Research Institutes have the potential, together with Schools, to contribute significantly to the recruitment of undergraduate and postgraduate students;
- Schools are not always the entry point for undergraduate courses and there is a need for all academic entities to work together in their recruitment activities;
- Potential failure rates and drop out rates should be taken into account when setting targets for student recruitment.

In response to queries, the Secretary, the Treasurer, the Bursar and the Provost advised Board that:

- (1) the recent limited early retirement arrangements were funded by an unexpected Supplementary Grant, noting that when the funds were made available for this purpose it was intended that they would be used to facilitate, particularly, the early retirement of those who had submitted requests to that effect over the past number of years. It was agreed that should the opportunity arise in the future for an early retirement package it

would be presented to Board and information would be openly available to all staff;

- (2) a Panel had been established representing all academic areas of College, which had been chaired by the Bursar, as Pro-Dean of Research, to allocate the funds from the HEA Equipment Grant which had been announced during the summer vacation. The Board noted that the criteria for the allocation of the grant had been defined by the HEA and that an open call for proposals had been issued to all academic areas in College. The Bursar advised Board that, within the defined criteria, Schools had received almost all of the funding they had sought;
- (3) it was expected that a report on the Academic Medical Council would be presented to Board in December 2007;
- (4) the number of undergraduate students is currently below the level set in the Strategic Plan, and the need to maintain the quality of teaching for students has to be balanced with the fact that student numbers are the basis of the HEA's funding model.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the proposals which the College expects to submit in its SIF 2 application, noting that collaboration across the sector will be the main criterion employed in the assessment of proposals. He also reiterated the Provost's comments in relation to the difficulties being imposed by the need to secure matching funds to support proposals. The Board noted that there had been a meeting with the HEA to try and clarify these and other related issues.

BD/07-08/008 HEA Student Audit for the Recurrent Grant Allocation Model (RGAM) and Implications for Trinity The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 September 2007, which had been circulated together with the correspondence from the HEA in relation to the Final Report on the Phase 1 of the audit of student numbers. He noted, in particular, the HEA's comments in relation to the value of modularisation in apportioning FTEs between subjects in a transparent manner. The Board noted concerns which the HEA stated had arisen in relation to TCD student data arising from the external panel's report, which may have an impact on the 2008 Recurrent Grant. The Senior Lecturer advised Board that a meeting will be sought with the HEA to discuss their concerns and that work would continue in a timely fashion to implement the Board's and Council's decisions in relation to modularisation (minutes CL/06-07/217 of 27 June 2007 and BD/06-07/374 of 4 July 2007 refer) and to present proposals on course structures to Board in Hilary Term 2008.

BD/07-08/009 Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 5 July 2007 subject to further comment covering CL/06-07/240.

BD/07-08/010 Chair of Neural Engineering (see Actum CL/06-07/240 of 5 July 2007) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, appointed Richard Reilly, B.E. (N.U.I.), M.Eng.Sc. (N.U.I.), Ph.D. (N.U.I.), M.I.E.I., M.I.E.E., S.M.I.E.E., from a date to be arranged.

BD/07-08/011 ARAM The Bursar advised Board that, while the review of ARAM had been largely prepared in Hilary Term 2007, there were a small number of issues which had not been fully addressed at that time, due to the pressure of other work required of key Officers. He stated that sufficient work had now been completed to facilitate the further development of ARAM and he recommended that a joint Board and Council ARAM workshop be held, after the submission of the College's SIF proposal on 19 October 2007. He proposed that, arising from the discussion at the workshop, recommendations would be submitted to Board for decision as soon as possible thereafter.

In response to a query, the Bursar advised Board that Executive Officers were committed to the changes in the operation of ARAM agreed by Board last year (minute BD/06-07/024 of 25 October 2006 refers) but that the way in which these changes were to be implemented had yet to be decided.

Board members, noting that very high workloads being carried by Officers and key administrative staff had contributed to the delay in considering this matter, approved the Bursar's proposal.

BD/07-08/012 Statutes Review Working Party The Registrar invited the Board's attention to a memorandum from the Statutes Review Working Party, dated 19 September 2007, which had been circulated. Noting apologies from Dr O'Dell, the Chair of the Working Party, he advised Board that the Working Party would undertake the redrafting of Chapter XII on Board and Chapter XIII on Council during Michaelmas Term and that the Board's views were being sought on the appropriate content for the next drafts of these Chapters. The Registrar stated that Board guidance was being sought on the following issues:

- Resolution of conflicts between Board and Council and between the Senate and the Board
- Membership of Council
- External Relations
- Fitness to Practise
- Faculty Residence Requirements

The Board, noting that the matter of staff discipline had been raised in a number of fora and discussions during the consultative process, also noted the Working Party's position that the Statutes would be

re-drafted to take account of any new Board policy in this regard to replace the existing Schedule to Chapter XII.

The Board also noted concerns that Council should continue to have an appropriate balance between senior and junior academic staff among its membership.

In the course of a brief discussion, the Board noted that the Dean of Students was chairing a Sub- Group of the Student Services Committee to develop a policy on Fitness to Practise for approval and implementation in due course.

The Board, noting that the Working Party had requested a formal response on the issues raised by the end of November, agreed to submit their individual comments to the Registrar, who, it was also agreed, would present proposals at the next meeting on the issues raised for consideration by the Board.

BD/07-08/013 Trinity Foundation - Funding The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 18 September 2007, which had been circulated outlining the funding arrangements for Trinity Foundation to date and its recent very successful fundraising achievements. He stated that the Board of the Foundation had recently approved a Foundation Business Plan with ambitious fundraising targets over a seven year period. The Secretary invited Board's attention to the proposal to provide €1.3m per annum for five years, commencing in October 2007, from the Trust Funds (income from which may be used to support Capital Developments, funds for which are raised through the Foundation) to support the operational costs incurred by the Foundation in the achievement of its stated objectives.

The Board approved the proposal as presented, noting that Trinity Foundation might consider giving priority to the further development and completion of the Luce Hall as a Student Centre.

BD/07-08/014 Restructuring Implementation Plan The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the draft Restructuring Implementation Plan which had been circulated, noting, in particular, the draft schedule for the election of Faculty Deans. The Board noted two amendments to the proposed schedule whereby the Provost replaced the Senior Lecturer as the person responsible for reviewing the role of Annual Officers and the Dean of Research was added to the list of those responsible for developing guidelines for Strategic Planning in the College, Faculties and Schools.

In the course of a discussion on the draft schedule, the need for timely negotiation with staff representative groups on a number of

the proposed actions was highlighted. It was also agreed that the electorate for the election of Deans would be defined so as to ensure that those eligible to vote would have been in employment in the College for the previous twelve months.

In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that proposals in relation to the membership of Council which would require a Statutory change would be referred to the Fellows for assent in due course.

In the course of a long discussion on the proposal to appoint consultants to assist in the revision of the current committee structure, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that it was proposed to retain consultants with specific expertise in this area who had been involved in similar exercises in universities in the UK. Concern was also expressed that a review of the committee structure might be premature, in light of the proposed appointments to the positions of Chief Operating Officer and Chief Academic Officer. Noting that there may be occasions when the effective management of the College may require the College to employ consultants to supplement the College's internal expertise and/or resources, the Board agreed that, in principle, consultants should only be used when absolutely necessary and that the fact of their employment and the associated costs would be reported to Board at the earliest opportunity.

The Board approved the membership of the Restructuring Implementation Oversight Group as proposed.

The Treasurer withdrew from the meeting.

BD/07-08/015 **College's Conservation and Development** The Board noted Dr Parnell's request that as requested previously, (minute BD/06-07/177 of 28 February 2007 refers) the Executive Officers would present a paper to Board on current practice and opportunities for conservation and green policies with a view to moving towards carbon reduction on campus.

BD/07-08/016 **Circulation of Papers for Board meetings** The Board, recognising that Officers and administrative staff are currently working under pressure, requested that, apart from very exceptional circumstances, all papers for consideration by Board should be included in the circulation sent by the Secretary's Office one week in advance of the meeting in question. The Board agreed that, in line with the practice adopted by Principal Committees, it would review its own operation during Hilary Term.

BD/07-08/017 Resignation - Treasurer The Provost advised Board, with great regret, that the Treasurer had tendered her resignation with effect from 30 November 2007. He stated that she would be a great loss to the College and that, in her role as Treasurer for the past ten years, her contribution to the College, not only in the financial area, but at the highest management and strategic levels was inestimable. On behalf of the Board, he wished the Treasurer well, noting that there would be further opportunities to pay tribute to her dedication and professionalism.

SECTION B

BD/07-08/018 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 18 September 2007.

BD/07-08/019 Safety Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Safety Committee from its meeting of 19 June 2007.

SECTION C

BD/07-08/020 Vacation Procedures The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated dated 19 September 2007. Appointments made under Vacation Procedures are set out in Appendix 1 to this minute.

The Board also noted that the Vice-Provost replaced the Senior Lecturer as Chair, and Professor J M Kelly replaced Professor J A N Parnell as a member of the nominating committee for the post of Academic Secretary.

BD/07-08/021 Board Membership The Board noted the following changes to membership of the Board, 1 October 2007 to 12 September 2010, as set out below and also noted a list of the current members of the Board:

- (i) **Fellows and Fellow Professors** Professor N Biggar having resigned with effect from 30 September 2007, Dr S M Ryan is deemed to be elected in his place;
- (ii) **Non-Academic Staff** Mr H Kearns having retired from the College with effect from 30 September 2007, Mr M Slevin is deemed to be elected in his place.

In response to a query, the Secretary clarified the Regulations for the replacement of Board members, noting that the current

Regulations had been approved by the previous Board prior to the last election. It was agreed that the Regulations for the 2008 elections would be presented to Board for consideration during Michaelmas Term.

BD/07-08/022 Proposals on Academic Restructuring - Final Decisions (see BD/06-07/278 of 23 May 2007 and BD/06-07/395 of 4 July 2007) The Board approved the proposals as presented in relation to:

- (i) **Role and Responsibility of Faculty Dean** The Board noted comments in relation to the difficulties being experienced by Research Institutes as a result of the decision to allocate financial responsibility for Research Institutes to Deans particularly where the scope of the Research Institute falls within the remit of more than one Faculty. The Board noted that this is particularly acute in the case of TCIN whose activities span three Faculties and whose potential is being curtailed by the College's regulations in this regard. The Senior Lecturer advised Board that discussions are on-going to address these matters and the Bursar advised Board that, as soon as arrangements for the financial governance of Research Institutes are agreed, the wording in the governance documents will be changed accordingly.
- (ii) Procedures for the Selection of Faculty Dean;
- (iii) Budgeting Arrangements for New Faculties;
- (iv) Guiding Principles for New Faculty Governance;
- (v) New Faculty Office;
- (vi) Appendix A - Existing Five-Faculty Functions and Processes and Recommendations for Streamlining processes in the New Three-Faculty Structure.

BD/07-08/023 Chaplains The Board noted the resignation of Revd Katherine Meyer with effect from 27 September 2007 and recorded the Board's appreciation of Revd Meyer's service to the College community during her ministry in College.

BD/07-08/024 Prizes and Other Awards - Gisele Schmidt Scholars Fund for Travellers - Trinity Access Programme The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 16 August 2007.

BD/07-08/025 Sealings The Board noted:

- (i) **North East Corner - Wayleave Agreement** The Seal of the College was put to a Wayleave Agreement for works at the North East corner (An Post) site between the Provost, Fellows

and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, Coras Iompair Éireann and Iarnród Éireann. [6/7/07]

- (ii) **Centre for Deaf Studies - Letting Agreement for 40 Lower Drumcondra Road - Renewal** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to the renewal of letting Agreement for 11 months from 1.09.2007 between the Catholic Institute for the Deaf and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin for accommodation for the Centre for Deaf Studies in 40 Lower Drumcondra Road. [30/8/07]
- (iii) **Lands at Caherciveen, Co Kerry - Sale of Freehold Interest** The Seal of the College was put to a Memorial and Deed of Conveyance of lands at Caherciveen by the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin to O'Shea and Others. In response to a query the Secretary clarified the context for this sealing. [30/8/07]

BD/07-08/026 Science Gallery - Proposed Governance Structure The Board noted and approved a document from the Interim Steering Committee, circulated dated 6 September 2007.

BD/07-08/027 Campus Companies - Authentik The Board noted and approved the nomination of Ms Audrey Crosbie (Industry Liaison Manager) as a member of the Board of Authentik.

BD/07-08/028 Agreement - TCD and Naas General Hospital The Board noted that an agreement was signed between the College and Naas General Hospital, in August 2007, to establish teaching, research and clinical links; to provide a suitable environment for undergraduate and postgraduate training and education in medicine; and to encourage research.

BD/07-08/029 Committees

- (i) **Business and Industry Committee** The Board noted and approved revised terms of reference which had been circulated;
- (ii) **Student Services Committee** The Board noted and approved a change in membership of the Committee from 'GSU President' to 'GSU President or nominee'.

Section D - Personnel Matters

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.