

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 30 May 2007

- Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr N J Biggar, Ms M A Coffey, Dr A C Donnelly, Mr H Kearns, Mr R Kearns, Dr J M Kelly, Ms D Keogh, Ms M Leahy, Dr M A Lynch, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J McGinley, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr J A N Parnell, Ms R Pe Palileo, Dr A J Piesse, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
- Apologies* Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Dr A Butterfield, Dr J F Donegan, Ms G M Clarke, Dr E J O'Halpin, Mr D Quinn.
- In attendance*
- (ex officio)* Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.
- (by invitation)* Dean of Students (for BD/06-07/315), Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs and Head of School of Medicine (for BD/06-07/317).

SECTION A

- BD/06-07/307 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 23 May 2007 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/06-07/277 Proposals on Academic Restructuring The following paragraph was inserted after the third paragraph on page 3. 'The Board noted comments in relation to the value of the Restructuring Advisory Group, offering as it does, a process whereby proposals from Executive Officers are discussed and evaluated by representatives of the College community prior to being submitted to Board for consideration. The importance of retaining this procedure was emphasised.' The following clause was inserted at the end of the final paragraph. 'noting that the final versions will be submitted to Board for final approval in due course.'

BD/06-07/278 Proposals on Central Management and Administrative and Support Services Reform The following phrase was inserted after the opening phrase *It was stated that* in the second sentence of the second paragraph on page 6, 'the College's IT systems in their entirety need to be addressed and that'. The following sentence was added to the end of the fourth paragraph on page 6, 'It was also stated that the additional costs of administration should not be at a cost to academic areas.'

- BD/06-07/308 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/06-07/309, 310, 311, 312, 313).

- BD/06-07/309 Proposals on Central Management and Administrative and Support Services Reform (see minute BD/06-07/278 of 23 May 2007)** Following a discussion on the need to assess the risks associated with the proposed administrative and services reform, the Board agreed that the financial risks, including costs and value for money, would be addressed by the Finance Committee and reported to Board before any final decisions would be made on restructuring. The Board noted the Senior Lecturer's comments that the proposals on restructuring were intended to address structural risks to the College which had been previously identified in the College's high level risk register. The Provost indicated that the relevant Principal Committees would address other risk issues as appropriate.
- BD//06-07/310 Science Gallery (see minute BD/06-07/273 of 23 May 2007)** The Provost advised Board that a response was awaited from the Government in relation to funding arrangements for the Science Gallery.
- BD/06-07/311 Projection Facilities in the Board room (see minute BD/06-07/274 of 23 May 2007)** The Board welcomed the installation of the new projection facility in the Boardroom.
- BD/06-07/312 Student Administration System (see minute BD/06-07/275 of 23 May 2007)** The Provost advised Board that the Audit Committee review of the Student Administration System would be presented to Board on 4 July 2007.
- BD/06-07/313 Proposals on Academic Restructuring/Proposals on Central Management and Administrative and Support Services Reform (see minutes BD/-6-07/277-278 of 30 May 2007)** The Secretary advised Board that it was proposed to hold an additional Board meeting on either 26 or 27 June 2007 to facilitate the timely consideration of proposals in relation to restructuring. Dr Vij objected to additional Board meetings at this time of the academic year.
- BD/06-07/314 Provost's Report** The Provost advised Board that a meeting had taken place with the HEA on 29 May 2007 on the likely impact of its funding model. He noted that, as the model is based on the number of undergraduate students in individual universities, without any reference to quality measures, there were clear indications that the outcome, when finalized, would have serious financial implications for the College in the future. The Provost stated that there would be a full discussion on the model and its implications at the Board meeting on 20 June. In response to a query, he agreed that the outcome of the model, if known, would be made available to the Fellows for their meeting on 18 June.
- In response to queries from Board members, the Treasurer clarified a number of technical issues in relation to the proposed model. She also advised Board that proposals in relation to pension issues and the Fixed Term Workers Act were being considered by the Department of Finance.
- BD/06-07/315 Dean of Students – Report to Board** The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a document which had been circulated, noting that this was a personal report at the end of his three and a half years as the first Dean of Students. At the outset, he acknowledged the work of many people in Student Services, Accommodation Services, the Student Unions, clubs and societies and other parts of College in contributing to the achievements during that period. He noted the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

importance of the student experience in the College and reviewed activities under a number of headings. The Dean stated that the Student Services Committee was working well at an appropriate strategic level under the new governance arrangements, although he felt that its membership required further consideration especially in regard to the representation of Heads of Student Services. He advised Board that considerable progress had been made in implementing the Student Services Strategic Plan, a report on which will be made to Board in the next Student Services Annual Report. The Board noted that the increasingly diverse student population will present challenges across all academic and social activities in College in the future.

The Dean invited Board's attention to the staff changes which were taking place in the College Health Service, including the impending retirements of the two College Psychiatrists. The Board noted that the issue of student mental health in Trinity is being addressed through the development of a *Student Mental Health Policy and Guidelines*.

The Board noted the opening of the new Sports Centre which will add significantly to the life of students and staff in College. The Dean advised Board that the accommodation currently available to many other services is inadequate and in some cases is not accessible to students with mobility impairment. He noted that the planned refurbishment of Luce Hall will only go some way towards addressing these needs. The Board noted the Dean's positive comments in relation to the residences in Trinity Hall and, in particular, that the Residences Management Committee is reviewing how further expansion in student residences will be achieved to allow all students from overseas and outside Dublin to live in rooms in their first year.

The Dean invited Board's attention to proposals which are currently being developed to support student participation in the life of the College and he also noted the voluntary activities in which students are involved, the Trinity Annual Fund Student Awards and the need to set priorities for the allocation of space in the refurbished Luce Hall to support student activities. The Dean concluded by inviting Board's attention to the challenges to maintaining and enhancing the student experience during this period of change and the Board noted his comments on the opportunity which now exists to review the role of the Dean of Students and the effectiveness of that role in developing College policy and decision-making.

The Board, welcoming the report, noted the comments of the Students' Union Education Officer on the importance of the role of Dean of Students for the student population and the need to facilitate the Dean's participation in College decision-making at the highest levels. In response to concerns expressed by Board members at the impending retirements in the College Health Service, the Secretary advised that the positions will be filled and that plans are being developed for an enhanced psychiatric service to be put in place over the next few years.

The Provost and the Board thanked the Dean of Students for his report and his excellent achievements during his term of office.

BD/06-07/316 **Modularisation – Initial Proposals (see CL/06-07/158 of 9 May 2007)** The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a report of the Working Group on Modularisation and Academic Year Structure, dated April 2007, which had been circulated. He noted the background issues, the membership of the Working Group, the main issues arising in the discussions and consultations, and final recommendations. The report had also been circulated for discussion to several committees and other *fora* in College and open forum discussion sessions had been held on the 23rd and the 30th of April 2007.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Senior Lecturer stated that the Working Group had treated course structure and academic year structure separately and he outlined the broad options for course structure that had been considered. He invited Board's attention to the Working Group's preferred option, viz. 'College should consider introducing into its undergraduate degree programmes the structured but flexible combination of core and elective curriculum, incorporating the existing Broad Curriculum'. The Board noted that the implementation of this recommendation would necessitate further detailed work and consultation with Schools.

The Senior Lecturer also outlined the main options considered by the Working Group in relation to the structure of the academic year and he invited Board's attention to the recommendation that College should adopt the academic year structure with a twelve-week Michaelmas Term and a twelve-week Hilary Term and a Trinity term devoted to preparing for, and conducting, the examination process. It was also recommended that both twelve-week terms would incorporate a Reading Week.

In discussing the report on Modularisation and Academic Year Structure the following points were made by Board members, noting that academic decisions in relation to modularisation would largely be the responsibility of Council:

- (i) there should be a consistent term structure across all areas of the College, noting that its implementation would cause teaching difficulties in some disciplines;
- (ii) there is a need for Council to develop clear and unambiguous recommendations in relation to the timing and phasing of agreed changes;
- (iii) the needs of students should inform the decisions made in relation to modularisation and they should not be compromised to preserve the Scholarship tradition which impacts on about three percent of the student population;
- (iv) the development of personal and professional skills and community outreach should be an integral part of all students' university education;
- (v) any changes to the working arrangements for term-time workers, arising from the implementation of modularisation, will have to be negotiated in accordance with normal procedures;
- (vi) new modularisation arrangements should retain the College's current philosophy of developing skills and knowledge over a four-year period and a modular approach to examinations should not be introduced. Consideration should be given to allowing more examinations for first-year students to ease the transition from second level to university education;
- (vii) new modularisation arrangements will have to be supported by appropriate administration systems, particularly as there are likely to be administrative pressures arising from the proposed earlier start for the academic year.

There was general support for the concept of a two-term academic year and it was noted that a large number of taught postgraduate courses and some undergraduate courses already operate a modular system. The need to co-ordinate the Reading Week element of the proposed arrangements was noted. The Board noted a suggestion that consideration be given to over-laying the proposed new system on the existing term structure.

In response to queries the Senior Lecturer advised Board that:

- (a) the Working Group had not considered that the Board Curriculum initiative was amenable to extension and that, as there were no more resources available to support its expansion, it was being recommended that it be merged into the College's overall teaching programme;
- (b) issues associated with Scholarship, and Trinity Monday, had been considered by the Working Group. The Board noted that the report of the Working Group examining the Scholarship examination process was awaiting the outcome of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- the decisions in relation to modularisation before it concluded its work. The Trinity Experience Forum will also address these and other related issues;
- (c) the current IT systems will have to be upgraded to meet the requirements of the proposed arrangements;
 - (d) retaining the research period during the long vacation is a key principle of the Working Group's deliberations.

In conclusion, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the Working Group on Modularisation is aware that there will be a need for a phased approach to the introduction of changes and that its priority is to ensure that the changes will be based on sound academic policies. He noted that the introduction of the ECTS system would be a pre-cursor to modularisation and that the introduction of any changes to the arrangements for the academic year would be the first step in the process towards modularisation, noting that this might take a number of years to effect and would require statutory change.

The Senior Lecturer thanked the Board for its comments which he undertook to refer to the Working Party.

BD/06-07/317 Hospital Governance Arrangements - Academic Medical Centre (AMC) Professor Kelleher, the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs and Head of the School of Medicine, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 8 March 2005, and to a draft outline proposal to create an Academic Medical Centre, which had been considered at the Board meeting held on 4 April 2007. The minute of that discussion (minute BD/06-07/206) and the minute of the Council meeting held on 9 May 2007 (actum CL/06-07/157) were tabled, as was a paper presenting a basic framework for re-examining university-academic medical centre relationships.

Professor Kelleher, referring to the previous Board discussion, and to the success of this model in other countries, invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- the mission, vision and strategic planning concerns of the AMC;
- the academic philosophy and organisation of the AMC;
- governance, corporate and organisational structures and strategic partnerships;
- economic models, financial structures and policies;
- illustrative common services;
- compliance and risk management issues;
- research and technology transfer;
- community outreach;
- philanthropy, development and foundations;
- government relations and economic development.

He also invited Board's attention to the issues raised by Council members, noting that the Therapy Schools were integral to the partnership and that he welcomed student input into the development of the AMC.

Professor Kelleher advised Board that approval was now being sought to establish a Transitional Executive to develop a joint executive function reporting to the constituent boards of the AMC. This will be charged with the identification and resolution of the obstacles to integration at a governance and operational level. It was also proposed that the Transitional Executive would report to the individual stakeholders through the AMC Steering Committee.

Mr Sweeney, Chair of the AMC Steering Group, invited Board's attention to the benefits of establishing the Transitional Executive, noting that education, research and patient

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

services are the three primary activities of the proposed AMC. The Treasurer's comments in relation to the inclusion of professional experts in finance, human resources and property on the Transitional Executive were noted as was the need to ensure that the membership will reflect the Partnership approach, as required in *Towards 2016*. It was also agreed that consideration will also be given to having representation from the Therapy Schools on the Transitional Executive. Mr Sweeney advised Board that it was envisaged that the membership would be adjusted from time to time to reflect the Executive's on-going work. He also noted the value of sub-groups to address specific issues.

In response to queries from Board members, Professor Kelleher advised Board that:

- (i) the Boards of the constituent hospitals are represented on the AMC Steering Group and the Board of St James's Hospital has approved the establishment of the Transitional Executive and that it will be considered by the Board of the Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Dublin Incorporating the National Children's Hospital (AMNCH) in due course.
- (ii) the importance of risk management has been recognised from the outset by the Steering Group and it will be crucial to ensure that any future arrangements will not involve the College in medical risk or liability;
- (iii) there will be additional costs associated with the operation of the proposed AMC, and the HSE, which is also represented on the Steering Group, is aware of this. The Board noted that financial safeguards have been successfully established in European AMC arrangements;
- (iv) one of the main objectives of the proposed AMC is to bring consultant staff in hospitals closer to the College, both in terms of teaching and research but it is acknowledged that not all consultant staff may engage closely with the College in this regard;
- (v) the concept of the Transitional Executive means that the process can be stopped if the Boards of the constituent bodies so wish;
- (vi) the Transitional Executive will hopefully be in a position to ensure that academic medical issues are key elements in the hospitals' planning and development;
- (vii) the School of Medicine will bear the costs of providing the secretariat to the Transitional Executive.

Following a long discussion of the issues raised, the Board approved the establishment of the Transitional Executive as proposed, subject to:

- (a) regular reporting arrangements to Board being put in place, including reports from professional human resources and financial experts as required;
- (b) the definition of the conditions necessary for the College's involvement being clearly articulated in the regular reports to Board;
- (c) appropriate membership of the Transitional Executive and its sub-groups to address the concerns expressed by Board members.

SECTION B

BD/06-07/318 College Safety Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the College Safety Committee from its meeting of 27 February 2007.

BD/06-07/319 Equality Committee The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 8 May 2007.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

SECTION C

BD/06-07/320 Schedule of Board and Council Meetings for 2007-2008 The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated dated 11 May 2007.

BD/06-07/321 Almanack 2007-2008 The Board noted the Almanack for 2007-2008.

BD/06-07/322 Working Party on the Appointment of the Provost – External Member The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor J Ritzen, President of the University of Maastricht, as the external member on this committee.

BD/06-07/323 Technical Staff Committee The Board noted that Mr G Doyle and Mr C Deevey have been elected as representatives for Constituency Two and Four respectively on the Technical Staff Committee for 2007-2009.

BD/06-07/324 Library – Loan of MSS The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Librarian, circulated dated 8 May 2007.

BD/06-07/325 Board Membership – Student Representatives The Board noted the following elections:

- President: Mr A Byrne
- Welfare Officer: Ms U Faulkner
- Education Officer: Mr B Rock

Signed:

Date: