

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**The University of Dublin**

**Trinity College**

**Minutes of Board Meeting, 12 December 2006**

- Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr D J Dickson)\*\*,  
Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr N J Biggar, Dr A  
Butterfield, Ms G Clarke\*, Ms M A Coffey, Dr A C Donnelly, Mr H Kearns, Mr R  
Kearns, Ms D Keogh, Dr J M Kelly, Dr M A Lynch, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J  
McGinley, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr E J O'Halpin, Ms R Pe Palileo, Dr J A N Parnell, Mr D  
Quinn, Dr J K Vij.
- Apologies* Dr W J Blau, Ms M Leahy, Dr A J Piesse, Mr B Sweeney.
- In attendance*
- (ex officio)* Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.
- (by invitation)* Mr T Forsyth, Chairman of the Audit Committee, and the Internal Auditor  
(for BD/06-07/093);  
Acting Academic Secretary (for BD/06-07/094).
- (present for)* \* BD/06-07/093-125  
\*\* BD/06-07/094 (part)-125

**SECTION A**

- BD/06-07/088 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 22 November 2006 were approved and signed.
- BD/06-07/089 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes BD/06-07/090, 091, 092).
- BD/06-07/090 Review of the Statutes (see minute BD/06-07/057 of 22 November 2006)** In the absence of the Registrar, the Secretary advised Board that the Standing Committee of Fellows had nominated Dr D Spearman to be a member of the Working Party established to review the Statutes. In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that all amendments to the Statutes proposed by the Working Group would require the assent of the Fellows in due course. The Board agreed that an additional Fellow would be co-opted to the Working Party, the nomination of whom would be presented to a future Board meeting for approval.
- BD/06-07/091 Nominations for Appointment (see minute BD/06-07/058 of 22 November 2006)** The Secretary advised Board that the queries which had been raised in relation to a number of academic job titles would be reflected in corrected Council and Board minutes in due course.

**BD/06-07/092 Entrance Exhibitions 2006 (see minute BD/06-07/076 of 22 November 2006)** The Board noted and approved the awarding of two additional Entrance Exhibition Awards as detailed in a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer dated 7 December 2006 which had been tabled.

**BD/06-07/093 Audit Committee Annual Report** The Provost welcomed Mr Forsyth, Chair of the Audit Committee, and the Internal Auditor, to the meeting. Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the Audit Committee's Annual Report for 2006 which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Committee, while taking account of the College's achievements during the year, has a duty to focus on the effectiveness of the management of any risks which might militate against the achievement of the College's objectives. The Board noted that the Committee had expressed concerns that, in the context of strategic management, there are a number of issues which, when taken together, may constitute a cumulatively high risk to the College. Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the following issues which collectively may pose a serious risk to College and the achievement of its strategic objectives, and the protection of its reputation:

- the absorption of the time and effort of the Board, Officers and Heads of School and administrative and support areas by the extended debate on proposed restructuring and ARAM;
- the lengthy decision making system resulting in uncertainty;
- the worsening financial situation;
- growing compliance requirements and other demands.

Mr Forsyth invited Board's attention to the Committee's recommendations in relation to the management of the above risks as follows:

- (i) that a timescale to bring the restructuring, including administrative restructuring, to an end as soon as possible should be established with adherence to an absolute deadline;
- (ii) that the risks associated with changes to ARAM be considered at the same time as proposals are being developed to alter it and that, following the completion of the current review, the fundamentals of ARAM should not be disturbed for a specified number of years;
- (iii) that the opportunity should be taken to address the delegated powers and authority of Principal Committees, the Executive Officers Group and the powers to be reserved to itself by the Board, to facilitate speedier decision-making. The Board should subsequently ensure that it does not receive proposals on areas with which its relevant Principal Committees should have dealt.

Mr Forsyth advised Board of the Committee's concerns in relation to the College's current difficult financial position, noting that, notwithstanding the inadequate resources available for the College's core academic functions, there are serious risks associated with the on-going moratorium on resources for administrative and support activities. The Bursar advised that following the Board's decision in July 2006, Heads of administrative and support areas were being invited to submit proposals for funding for 2007/2008, via the relevant Principal Committee, as part of the Estimates process in Hilary Term 2007.

Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the progress which has been made in developing the College's risk register and noted that more work needs to be done to formally embed risk management throughout the College. The Board noted that the revised High Level Risk Register would be considered by the Board at its meeting on 24 January 2007, following an initial review on its behalf by the Audit Committee. Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to the emerging Code of Governance for the sector

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

that will require the Board to ensure that a strong risk management system is in place and to verify its existence in an annual report. The Board noted that compliance with the Code of Governance will cause resourcing difficulties in the Secretary's Office and the Internal Audit function. Mr Forsyth advised that, unless sufficient resources were available to carry-out the necessary work within the College, the Board may have difficulty in complying fully with the Code's reporting requirements, particularly in relation to internal control systems.

The Board noted the Audit Committee's concerns about the necessity to produce two sets of financial statements each year - the Funding Statements which are prepared on sectorally agreed harmonised basis and the Consolidated Financial Statements prepared according to Generally Accepted Accounting Principles. The Board, noting that the preparation of two sets of accounts on different bases puts a very significant strain on the resources in the Treasurer's Office, noted the Committee's concerns about the value of the two sets of accounts. The Committee recommended that financial data and tools be developed to help resolve the uncertainties over levels of required surpluses and thereby support the College's and the sector's case that current funding levels are inadequate.

Mr Forsyth invited the Board's attention to a recommendation that immediate consideration be given to amending Chapter XII, Section 9 of the Statutes so that the Funding Statements would not have to be considered by Board at its first meeting in Hilary Term each year. This would facilitate the simultaneous consideration of the Funding Statements and the Consolidated Financial Statements by the Finance Committee, the Audit Committee and the Board. This approach would also relieve some of the pressures in the Treasurer's Office and bring greater clarity to the overall interpretation and presentation of the College's financial situation both internally and externally.

The Board, noting that there had been a number of significant improvements in IT security arrangements over the past year, noted the Audit Committee's recommendation that the College's IT Disaster Recovery Plan, including consultation with Executive Officers on the identification of priorities for a recovery schedule, should be tested as a matter of priority.

Mr Forsyth invited Board's attention to the proposals for future work for the Internal Audit function as outlined in the Committee's report, noting that this was a rolling programme of work from year to year and that priority would be given to those areas of most significance to the Board and the College. He invited the Board to identify priorities which it would like the Audit Committee to address in the coming year. In conclusion, he expressed his thanks to the members of the Audit Committee and the College community, in particular the Secretary to the College and the Treasurer and her staff, for their support during the year. He also thanked the Internal Auditor and the College's external auditors for their contributions to the Committee's work.

In the course of a long discussion on the Audit Committee's report, Mr Forsyth, in response to queries, advised Board that:

- (a) while it is not possible to set a definitive time-scale for any restructuring exercise, the Audit Committee is of the view that, for the overall good of the College, decisions should now be taken in a timely manner, even though there will inevitably be a section of the College Community which may not fully support the actions taken;
- (b) the Terms of Reference of Principal Committees will determine the level of policy development and delegated decision-making which any Committee can undertake on behalf of the Board, noting that this may vary according to individual Committees' objectives;

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

- (c) the relationship between the University Council and Board had not been included in the Terms of Reference of the Governance Working Party;
- (d) the Audit Committee believes that, when consideration is being given to the establishment of multi-institutional joint ventures, the checklist which had been developed in consultation with the Dean of Research should be used in every case so as to try and minimise risk exposure to the College;
- (e) the Audit Committee, while not commenting on the definitions and operation of ARAM *per se*, is very concerned that, following the current review of ARAM, there will be a period of stability and certainty in its application;
- (f) the legal regulatory environment in which the College is currently operating puts an ever-increasing pressure on administrative and support areas which the College will have to address in allocating resources. He noted that the embedding of risk management in the College will assist the Board in setting priorities in this regard;
- (g) the College should use every opportunity, including its Annual Report, to advise the Government, and external stakeholders, of the College's very difficult financial position, including the financial liabilities associated with the implementation of the Protection of Employee (Fixed Term Work) Act, 2003 and the current deficit on the pension fund.

In response to a query, the Provost undertook to report to Board on the membership of the Steering Committee established to oversee the development of the proposed Academic Medical Centre.

In response to a query, the Bursar advised Board that the Dean of Research had been requested to develop a policy on research overheads for consideration by the Heads of School Committee and, in due course, by the Board. He also advised Board that increased funding had been made available this year to Schools to meet their direct costs and that no equivalent increase had been made available to administrative and support areas.

The Board noted comments about the need to develop a plan for the resourcing of administrative and support areas so as to avoid crisis decision-making on the part of the Board.

The Board, noting the proposed future work plan, thanked the Chairman, the Internal Auditor and the Audit Committee for their very clear report.

**BD/06-07/094 Academic Divisions (Clusters)** The Acting Academic Secretary attended for this item. The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 8 December 2006, which had been circulated, together with the outcomes of the consultation process as outlined in a Report of the Working Group on Restructuring. He invited Board's attention to the proposal to introduce a three-cluster governance model, noting that if this model were to be adopted it would be necessary to address the substantive issues identified during the consultation process as soon as possible. The Senior Lecturer noted that it was also proposed to begin the programme of administrative reform in parallel with the process of addressing academic governance.

The Senior Lecturer advised that if the three-cluster model were not adopted, it was proposed that the Board approve the continuation of the existing academic governance structure, noting that, if this were the case, it would be necessary to address the weaknesses in the existing structure and to commence a programme of administrative reform.

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

The Board noted the Senior Lecturer's proposal that, regardless of which model was adopted, a comprehensive implementation plan should be developed and brought to Board for approval during Hilary Term.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the programme of consultation on the paper prepared by the Working Group on Restructuring, which had taken place between 23 November and 6 December 2006 and to the following issues which had arisen in the course of discussions:

- (a) Timing
- (b) Representation
- (c) Budgets and devolved decision-making
- (d) Governance of clusters
- (e) Costs and administration
- (f) Nomenclature

He invited Board's attention to issues which had arisen in relation to the proposed grouping of Engineering and Science and to the view held by many staff in these Faculties that their component disciplines cannot be successfully administered as one cluster. He noted that the parity of representation in the proposed Engineering and Science cluster had been identified as an important issue and that the School of Mathematics had argued that the title of the cluster should be 'Engineering, Mathematics and Science'. The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to staffing-related issues and to the use of polls in the consultation process.

He noted that there was widespread acceptance that there cannot be devolved budgetary functions and decision-making to twenty four academic units and that there is a need to complete academic restructuring and commence administrative reform. He stated that the College needed to achieve stability in its governance and management structures as soon as possible and that the risks associated with 'analysis paralysis' and change fatigue had been articulated throughout the College during the consultation process.

Board members acknowledged the extensive consultation process which had taken place over a relatively short period and the Senior Lecturer thanked Professor Parnell, Professor O'Halpin and the President of the Students' Union for their assistance in this regard.

In the course of a long and detailed discussion the following issues were raised by Board members.

***Impact of three-cluster model:*** A number of Board members stated that, while they had concerns in relation to issues raised by individual Faculties and Schools during the consultation process, they felt that a three-cluster model would be the best option for the College as a whole. Queries were raised by individual Board members on the proposed mechanisms for devolving budgets to clusters and the relationship with ARAM at departmental/discipline level. Concern was expressed about the possible costs of introducing a three-cluster model, noting that experience in a similar university in the UK suggests that administrative costs could increase in a devolved environment. It was noted that the relationship between the Heads of clusters and the Board would be an important aspect of the proposed model.

***Engineering and Science Faculties:*** The points which had been raised by members of the Engineering and Systems Sciences Faculty and the Science Faculty were noted by the Board and it was agreed that these views should be taken into consideration when developing implementation plans for the new structures. The Board noted that the Student Representatives in both Faculties had supported the three-cluster model.

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

Individual Board members clarified concerns which had been expressed in relation to the impact of ARAM on some Schools within the Science Faculty should they be managed as one financial unit together with Schools in the Faculty of Engineering and Systems Science. Issues in relation to the future balance of disciplines within the Science Faculty and the different undergraduate and postgraduate student profiles in the two Faculties were also noted, as were the potential research opportunities for some Science and Engineering disciplines by administering them as one cluster. It was stated that a lack of information on the detailed implementation of the proposed clusters had resulted in a rejection of the three-cluster model by some junior staff and that greater clarity on specific governance issues would be beneficial in this regard.

**Nomenclature:** There was general support for the use of the term Faculty to describe clusters and the maintenance of the term Dean to denote the Head of the Faculty.

**Implementation:** It was stated that there is a need to complete both the academic and administrative and support restructuring as soon as possible and that a tentative schedule for the reform of administrative and support areas should be drawn-up as a matter of priority. The Board noted that there will be a need for an extensive consultation process when implementation plans are being developed and the role of Partnership discussions as defined in the 'Towards 2016' agreement was also noted. The value of achieving consensus on the proposed changes throughout the College was highlighted as was the expectation that, when administrative and service areas restructuring would be fully implemented, services to researchers and students would improve.

It was noted that the demarcation of responsibility and authority in relation to the financial management of clusters and Schools needs to be absolutely clear and to operate for the overall good of the College. It was also stated that the mechanisms for governing clusters and devolving budgets should be developed simultaneously and put in place as soon as possible.

**Statutory change:** Care needs to be taken to ensure that all proposed changes conform to the Statutes and that should statutory change be required, the support of the Fellows is vital.

In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the second round of SIF could offer opportunities to secure funds for the implementation of the new structures. In response to a query relating to the benefits attaching to the proposed changes and their consideration in the context of the associated costs, he stated that while there would be additional costs in introducing and implementing the new structures it was believed that there would be long-term benefits for the College as a whole.

In response to a query concerning the academic impact of the proposed restructuring, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that it was intended to involve the University Council in developing the implementation plan for whichever model would be adopted by the Board, noting that Council had previously approved the three-cluster model in principle (minute CL/05-06/212 of 28 June 2006 refers).

In conclusion, the Board agreed the following:

- that a three-cluster academic structure would be adopted;
- that the term Faculty would be used to describe the cluster and that each Faculty would have a Dean;
- that an implementation plan would be drawn up during Hilary Term for approval by Board, following consideration by Council, which would address governance, financial and other issues raised during the consultation process, including concerns expressed by the Science and Engineering and Systems

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

Sciences Faculties and other areas. (Professor Kelly's and Professor Vij's comments in this regard were noted);

- that the administrative restructuring to support the three-Faculty model would proceed as soon as possible and that it would include an extensive consultation process with all those concerned.

The Board thanked the Senior Lecturer, the Acting Academic Secretary and the Working Group on Restructuring for their very intensive and productive work over the previous three months.

**BD/06-07/095 Strategic Planning - Recruitment** The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to the following documents which had been circulated:

- (i) memorandum from the Vice-Provost dated 5 December 2006;
- (ii) memorandum from the Chair of the Resource Management Committee, dated 5 December 2006;
- (iii) minutes of the Resource Management Committee from its meeting of 4 December 2006.

Introducing the proposals for staffing for 2007/2008, the Vice-Provost advised Board that, following the preparation of School strategic staffing plans for the three years 2006/2009, in March 2006, and the approval of a recruitment schedule for 2006/2007 by the Board in June 2006, Schools had been invited to submit revised staffing plans for 2007/2008 in November 2006, in the context of existing ARAM data and the 50% target approved by the Board. The Board noted that the following guiding principles had been applied in the consideration of the 2007/2008 staffing plans by the Strategic Planning Taskforce:

- (1) the College should not plan to go into deficit and the ARAM distribution internally must stay within the overall budget;
- (2) any reserve funds within Schools should be considered in assessing the budget required to meet new recruitment requests;
- (3) each post should be assessed on the basis of its strategic case, regardless of whether it is a new post or a replacement post;
- (4) a strong strategic case can be made for posts which will result in increased research activity aligned with the College's strategic plan, including postgraduate supervision;
- (5) a strong strategic case can be made for posts within innovative Schools, including those which have brought together several disciplines.

The Vice-Provost advised Board that the revised plans from Schools contained proposals for over 160 posts for 2007/2008, including new posts, replacement posts and new costs arising from posts reverting as charges to Schools from other sources of funding, such as the Change Fund. The Board noted that the recommendations of the Strategic Planning Taskforce had been informed by input from the Personnel and Appointments Committee and that the resource implications of the proposed Recruitment Schedule had been considered by the Resource Management Committee. The Vice-Provost thanked the Staff Office, the Treasurer's Office and the Senior Lecturer's Office for their considerable work in facilitating the assessment of proposals within a very short time period. She noted that, following a review of the proposals received, and in light of the College's financial situation, recommendations for staffing for 2007/2008 comprised sixty eight posts - forty five academic positions and twenty three administrative/support positions within Schools.

The Board noted that the strategic planning process for recruitment is an interactive one and most Heads of School had met with the Vice-Provost and other Executive Officers since the Strategic Planning Taskforce's final meeting on 5 December, to discuss their

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

submissions and the reasons for decisions made in relation to them. The Vice-Provost advised Board that the interactive process allows necessary refinements and modifications to the recruitment schedule on an on-going basis to ensure that Schools can work towards achieving their strategic objectives and to clarify further their strategic priorities. The Board noted the significant change that has occurred with the Schools' development of their strategic planning.

The Vice-Provost invited the Board's attention to the recommendation of the Strategic Planning Taskforce that all academic appointments should be aligned to the achievement of the College's strategic objectives by being of the highest standard of excellence, even if maintaining high standards in appointments results in the recruitment process in Schools taking some time.

In response to queries, the Provost and Vice-Provost advised Board that:

- (a) funding is being put in place for the proposed joint TCD/IMI position;
- (b) the relationship between Schools and Research Centres when recruiting new staff will be addressed at a general level across the College;
- (c) decisions taken by the Resource Management Committee and the Strategic Planning Taskforce were based on detailed information on each School's resources;
- (d) unspent balances in Schools are not sufficient to meet pay costs for permanent positions. It was noted that unspent balances would be addressed as a separate issue in due course;
- (e) some of the replacement posts for the School of Nursing and Midwifery as reported in minutes of the Personnel and Appointments Committee have arisen because positions approved by Board in June 2006 were filled on a one-year contract basis for the year 2006/2007 within the School's ring-fenced funding arrangements pending approval by the Strategic Planning Taskforce and will now be filled as permanent positions as previously approved;
- (f) proposals from the School of Medicine will be presented to Board in the near future and proposals from the Therapy Schools will be considered in the context of the School's Strategic Plan;

The Board approved the staffing proposals, subject to the clarifications and refinements of titles and positions as noted.

The Provost advised Board that it is intended that proposals for staffing for 2008/2009 would be presented to Board in June 2007.

The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the Resource Management Committee's approval of the ARAM Task Force's recommendation that the weighting of Radiation Therapy within the School of Medicine be amended from 1.3 to 1.7. (Minute RMC/06-07/13 (b) refers).

Mr Kearns invited the Board's attention to the discussions which are currently underway with the Irish School of Ecumenics in the context of restructuring, noting that the School's ring-fenced funding status will cease in 2009. (Minute RMC/06-07/13 (a) refers).

**BD/05-06/096 Appointment of Provost – Working Party Membership and Draft Terms of Reference**  
The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum dated, 6 December 2006, which had been circulated.

Following clarification of the appointment procedure to the Working Party, the Board approved the proposed membership as follows:

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

Dr T N Mitchell, Chair  
 Dr Sheila Greene  
 Dr Michael Jones  
 Dr John Scattergood  
 Dr Hugh Gibbons  
 Mr Brian Murray  
 Mr Ray Keaveny  
 1 External Member (to be nominated by the working Party)

The Board approved the following amended Terms of Reference:

Taking account of the College's history and tradition of collegiality and commitment to democracy, and considering the current statutory position, the provisions of the Universities Act 1997, the Trinity College, Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000 and good governance guidelines, to review and make recommendations to Board on:

- (i) the term of office of the Provost;
- (ii) the role of the Provost as Chief Officer of the College and the Chairman of the Board;
- (iii) options in regard to the process of appointment of the Provost following a review of current practice;
- (iv) the statutory constraints and obligations in regard to any such process of appointment;
- (v) the role of the Board of the College in the appointment process;
- (vi) the role of the Fellows of the College in the appointment process;
- (vii) the definition of any electorate, if election is recommended as part or all of the appointment process;
- (viii) any other relevant matters which the Working Party considers appropriate.

The Board noted that it was intended that the Working Party would report in June 2007.

**BD/06-07/097 Acta of the University Council** The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its Special Meeting of 29 November 2006. The Board noted that the Acta from the Council meeting held on 6 December 2006 would be considered at the Board meeting on 31 January 2007.

**BD/06-07/098 Marino Institute of Education** The Registrar advised Board that further to his report to Board on 5 July 2006 (minute BD/05-06/395 refers) discussions have proceeded with the Marino Institute of Education on the establishment of a Co-Trust between the Institute and the College. He noted that it is expected that all due diligence associated with the proposal will be completed early in 2007 at which time there will be a further report to Board.

**BD/06-07/099 Nominations for Appointment (see Actum CL/06-07/058 of 6 December 2006)** The Board approved Nominations for Appointment, as tabled (see Appendices 1 and 2 to this Minute).

**BD/06-07/100 Chair of International Business and Development (see minute BD/06-07/028 (i) of 25 October 2006)** Under Other Business the Board noted the tabled nomination for Professor F G Barry, BA (NUI), MA (Essex), PhD (Queen's University, Ontario), to commence with effect from 1 January 2007, on the terms set out on the nomination form.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**BD/06-07/101 Joly-O'Morchoe Exchange Fellowship Fund Agreement** Under Other Business the Board approved the establishment of the Joly-O'Morchoe Exchange Fellowship according to the terms outlined in a memorandum, tabled dated 8 December 2006 from the Administrator, School of Medicine. The Board extended its appreciation to Dr Charles O'Morchoe for his generosity in establishing the Fellowship.

**BD/06-07/102 Technical Staff Committee – 2006 Review** Under Other Business the Board noted a memorandum from the Staff Relations Manager, tabled dated 11 December 2006 and approved the promotion of Mr R Goodhue (Geology) to the grade of Senior Experimental Officer, with effect from 1 October 2006.

**BD/06-07/103 Administrative and Library Staff Review** The memorandum from the Acting Secretary to the Administrative and Library Staff Review Committee dated 6 December 2006 which had been tabled was withdrawn.

## SECTION B

**BD/06-07/104 Audit Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 21 November 2006.

**BD/06-07/105 Equality Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 6 December 2006 with particular reference to:

**Eqal/06-07/07 Prevention of Bullying and Harassment** The Board, noting the resignation of Ms Anne-Marie Diffley as a Contact Person for the prevention of Bullying and Harassment, approved the appointment of the following as Contact Persons:

Ms Orla McCarthy, Senior Lecturer's Area  
Mr Michael Slevin, School of Engineering  
Mr John Munnely, Buildings Office

**BD/06-07/106 Finance Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 29 November 2006 with particular reference to:

**FN/06-07/17 Action List – Explanatory Guidelines for Financial Management of Research Grants and Contracts** The Board noted Mr Kearns's concerns about the content of an email received by a member of staff in the Treasurer's Office, noting that all staff, carrying out their duties on behalf of the Board should be treated with respect by all colleagues at all times.

**FN/06-07/21 Science Gallery** In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that a report on the fund-raising for the Science Gallery would be available for the next Board meeting.

**BD/06-07/107 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/06-07/061 of 6 December 2006)** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 31 October 2006, which had been considered by Council at its meeting on 6 December 2006, with particular reference to:

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**IPC/06-07/08 Any Other Business - SAS Project** In response to a query from Professor O'Halpin, the Secretary advised Board that consultants had been engaged to carry-out a review of the Student Administration System and that they had not yet delivered their final report, noting that when the report had been considered by the SAS Steering Committee it would be forwarded to the Information Policy Committee.

**BD/06-07/108 Personnel and Appointments Committee (see Actum CL/06-07/062 of 6 December 2006)** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meetings of 18 October 2006 and 15 November 2006, which had been considered by Council at its meeting on 6 December 2006.

**BD/06-07/109 Research Committee (see Actum CL/06-07/063 of 6 December 2006)** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meeting of 19 October 2006, which had been considered by Council at its meeting on 6 December 2006, with particular reference to:

**RS/06-07/05 HEA PRTL I** In response to a query the Provost advised Board that no call had yet been received for the fourth phase of PRTL I. The Board also noted Professor Vij's concerns that there is no engineer on the Research Committee.

**BD/06-07/110 Resource Management Committee – Minutes from its meeting of 4 December 2006**  
See minute BD/06-07/095 (iii) above.

**BD/06-07/111 Site and Facilities Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 28 November 2006 with particular reference to:

**SF/06-07/18 Provost's House Stables** Dr McGinley invited Board's attention to the outcome of the tender process for the building works on the Provost's House Stables, noting that it was anticipated that the project will be completed within budget.

**SF/06-07/25 Pearse Street Development** Dr McGinley advised Board that planning permission for the Pearse Street development had been granted, apart from the demolition of houses 183-201 Pearse Street. The Board noted that significant decanting or relocation will be required to allow the development to proceed, noting that it was hoped to carry-out the project on a phased basis over a period of about ten years.

**SF/06-07/26 An Post Site Development** The Board noted that funding in the order of €1.5m will be made available by the College and a further €1m will be sought from PRTL I to allow this project to proceed to the design stage.

**BD/06-07/112 Student Services Committee** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 20 October 2006, which had been considered by Council at its meeting on 6 December 2006, with particular reference to:

**SS/06-07/4 Quality Reviews - Student Disability Service** The Secretary invited Board's attention to Committee's decision that in future the Disability Services Coordinator should report to the Secretary to the College on administrative matters

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

whilst continuing to work with the Senior Tutor and Dean of Students on policy matters. The Board noted the recommendation that in light of the College's obligations under the Disability Act 2005 that consideration be given to expanding the remit of the Disability Service to include staff-related matters, further noting that this was likely to have resource implications in the future.

### SECTION C

**BD/06-07/113 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 28 November 2006.

**BD/06-07/114 Proctors' Lists for Winter Commencements** The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 5 December 2006.

**BD/06-07/115 Sealings** The Board noted:

(i) **National Digital Research Centre (NDRC) Members' Agreement** The Seal of the College was put to six copies of a Members' Agreement relating to the National Digital Research Centre (NDRC) between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Dublin City University, Dún Laoghaire Institute of Art, Design and Technology, the National College of Art and Design, University College Dublin and National Digital Research Centre Limited.

[14/11/06]

(ii) **The Enterprise Centre Bioincubator – Unit 7** The Seal of the College was put to put in duplicate to an Agreement and Conditions of Contract for Building Work relating to the Enterprise Centre Bioincubator – Unit 7 between the Board of Trinity College Dublin and Eamonn Dunne of Dunne Contracting Limited.

[30/11/06]

**BD/06-07/116 Prizes and Other Awards - Lucy Gwynn Prize (Calendar S60) – Committee** The Board noted and approved the following members of the committee:

Dr S Smyth (Russian)

Dr E V Patten (English)

**BD/06-07/117 Bequests and Benefactions - Gift of Portrait Miniatures** The Board noted and recorded its appreciation of the following gift:

(i) *Portrait Miniature of a Lady by Nathaniel Hone, the Elder, RA (1718-1784) measurement, 1½", signed and dated on the front with initials 'N.H.' and the date 1766, presented by Mr Patrick J Murphy, a graduate, in memory of the late Michael Brendan Wynne, MSA, PhD, formerly of the National Gallery of Ireland;*

(ii) *Portrait Miniature of Captain Bruce Wakefield Lee by Sampson Towgood Roche signed on the reverse, ['Mr Roch/M.Painter/Bath/ April 1809', measurement 2¾" high, also presented by Mr Murphy.*

- BD/06-07/118 Representation – Irish Committee for Specialist Training in Dentistry** The Board noted and approved the nomination of the Dean of Dental Affairs and Professor J Nunn, to represent the College on the above committee, with Mr B Murray as an alternate member.
- BD/06-07/119 Technical Staff Committee – Recommendation** The Board approved the promotion of Ms D Delahunty (Chemistry) to the Senior Laboratory Attendant grade.
- BD/06-07/120 Permissions – Library – Loan of Manuscripts to Centre Pompidou** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Librarian, circulated dated 29 November 2006.
- BD/06-07/121 Title of Personal Chair** The Board noted and approved that Professor W T Coffey's Personal Chair should be 'Chair of Electrical Engineering'.
- BD/06-07/122 Equality Committee – Membership - 2006-2007** The Board noted and approved the following changes to the membership:
- Assistant Academic Secretary/Admissions Office to be replaced by Mature Students Officer  
Equality Officer to be added to the membership of the committee.
- BD/06-07/123 Memorandum of Understanding between TCD and Makerere University** The Board noted that a Memorandum of Understanding between TCD and Makerere University was signed by the Provost and the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs and Head of School of Medicine on 24 November 2006 for the purpose of establishing teaching, research and clinical links and to encourage research.
- BD/06-07/124 Nominations for Appointment** The Board approved the circulated Nominations for Appointment, as set out in Appendix 3 to this minute.
- BD/06-07/125 Nominating Committees** The Board noted the following memberships:
- (i) **Accommodation Office – Accommodation and Conference Administrator – Administrative Grade 1 Scale (permanent)**  
Senior Dean  
Director of Accommodation and Catering  
Assistant Secretary to the College  
Accommodation Officer  
Ms D Mulligan (Fáilte Ireland)
  - (ii) **Communications Office – Press Officer (3-year contract)**  
Secretary to the College  
Professor E J O'Halpin  
Acting Academic Secretary  
Associate Dean of Research  
Communications Officer  
Director Trinity Foundation  
Mr M Moloney (Setanta Communications)

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (iii) **School of Education – School Administrator – Administrative Grade 3/2 (permanent)**  
 Acting Head of School (Professor A M E O'Moore)  
 Dr M Shevlin  
 Dr M Murchan  
 Dr M Ní Bháin  
 Ms H O'Hara  
 Dr M Killeavey (UCD)
- (iv) **Staff Office**
- (a) **Pensions Administrator – Administrative Grade 1 (permanent)**  
 Secretary to the College  
 Dr H Delany  
 Mr B Bowden  
 Ms A Taylor  
 Ms M Agnew (UCD)
- (b) **Staff Planning Officer – Administrative Grade 1 (one year contract)**  
 Secretary to the College  
 Professor D G Little  
 Mrs P H Daly  
 Ms A Taylor  
 Ms S Dillon (Eircom)
- (c) **Recruitment Officer – Administrative Grade 1 (one year contract)**  
 Secretary to the College  
 Professor D G Little  
 Mrs P H Daly  
 Ms A Taylor  
 Mr M Sherlock (SRS Technics)
- (v) **Treasurer's Office**
- (a) **Financial Accountant – Administrative Grade 1 (Permanent)**  
 Deputy Treasurer  
 Ms J Byrne  
 Mrs I L I Hook  
 Mr S Roche (HEA)
- (b) **Administrative Officer (Systems Development Team) – Administrative Grade 2 (contract of indefinite duration)**  
 Deputy Treasurer  
 Professor V Cahill  
 Mr T Dunne  
 Mr N Fitzpatrick  
 Ms C Acton (UCD)
- (vi) **Trinity Centre for Bioengineering – Administrative Officer – Administrative Grade 3 (one-year contract post)**  
 Secretary (or nominee)  
 Professor P J Prendergast  
 Dr K O'Kelly  
 Dr V A Campbell  
 Mr M A Slevin

Signed: .....

Date: .....

## Appendix 1 to Minute BD/06-07/099

**Nominations for Appointment (See Actum CL/06-07/058 of 6 December 2006)**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Post</b>	<b>Name and Qualifications</b>	<b>Start date</b>	<b>Termination date (if contract)</b>
Centre for Global Health	Research Fellow	SAMMAN, Emma, D.Phil. (Oxon.), M.Sc. (Lond), B.A. (Swarthmore College, England)	01-11-2006	31-08-2007
Chemistry	Research fellow	EICHLER, Matthias, Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-11-2006	30-09-2007
Chemistry	Post- Graduate Course Coordinator	QUINN, Susan Jane, B.Sc., Ph.D. (N.U.I.)	01-10-2006	Indefinite duration
Chemistry	Research Fellow	CALDWELL, Lorraine, B.Sc. (Qld.), Ph.D. (ANU)	20-12-2006	19-12-2008
Children's Research Centre	Research Fellow	DOYLE, Erika, B.A. (Open (UK))	01-09-2006	18-06-2009
Clinical Medicine	Research Fellow	DUNICAN, Dara James, Ph.D. (Dubl.)	15-11-2006	14-11-2007
Clinical Medicine	Visiting Part- time Lecturer	WALSH, Ronan, MRCPI, FRCPC, MB., B.Ch., B.A. (N.U.I.)	01-02-2007	31-01-2010
Clinical Microbiology	Research Fellow	WALSH, Fiona, B.Sc. (N.U.I.), Ph.D. (Edin.)	01-10-2006	20-09-2009
CRANN/ Medicine	Research Fellow	O' DOWD, Frank, B.Eng, M.Sc. (N.U.I.)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
CRANN/ Physics	Research Fellow	DE, Sukanta, Ph.D. (Jad.), M.Sc. (Calc.)	01-12-2006	30-11-2007
CRANN/ Physics	Research Fellow	SUN, Zhenyu, Ph.D. (Chinese Academy of Sciences)	01-11-2006	31-10-2007
CRANN/ Physics	Research Fellow	GUNNING, Robert Denis, B.A. (Dubl.)	01-11-2006	31-10-2007
CRANN/ Physics	Research Fellow	SOFIN, Sumesh, B.Sc., M.Sc. (M.Gandhi)	01-11-2006	31-10-2007
Drama	Part-time Lecturer	FLANAGAN, Orla, B.A. (Dubl.), Advanced Dip. (Institute of Music, Hungary)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
Economics	Part-time Lecturer	COLLINS, Michael, B.A., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-01-2007	30-06-2007
Engineering	Part-time Lecturer	DOYLE, Eamonn, B.Sc. (N.U.I.), M.Phil. (Dubl.)	09-10-2006	08-10-2007
Engineering	Research Fellow	PERSOONS, Tim, M.Sc., Ph.D. (Katholieke Universiteit, Leuven)	01-11-2006	31-10-2007
Engineering	Research Fellow	OWENS-PERIĆEVIĆ, Ian, B.Eng. (Salf.)	13-11-2006	12-02-2008
English	Part-time Lecturer	STEVENS, Julie Anne, B.A., M.A. (N.U.I.), M.Phil., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	29-09-2006	28-09-2007
English	Lecturer	SLOTE, Samuel, B.A. (Wesleyan), M.A., Ph.D. (Wis.)	01-01-2007	Permanent

***Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings***

Genetics	Research Fellow	JESTER, Brian, B.Sc., M.Sc. (Milwaukee), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-09-2006	31-08-2007
Genetics & Microbiology	Research Fellow	CAMPBELL, Matthew, B.Sc., Ph.D. (N.U.I.)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
Genetics & Microbiology	Research Fellow	O'SEAGHDHA, Maghnus Niall, B.A. (Dubl.)	01-01-2007	31-12-2010
Haematology	Research Fellow	CUNNINGHAM, Sarah Moya, M.B., B.S. (Belf.)	01-10-2006	30-09-2008
Hispanic Studies	Visiting Language Assistant	GONZÁLEZ, Virginia Segura, B.A. (Seville), M.Phil. (Dubl.)	01-10-2006	31-07-2007
Histories & Humanities	Research Associate	RUSSELL, Ian Alden, B.A. (Dubl.)	06-11-2006	05-04-2007
Irish & Celtic Studies	Part-time Lecturer	DE PAOR, Pdraig, B.A. (N.U.I.), Ph.D., PaCE. (Belf.)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Irish & Celtic Studies	Part-time Lecturer	LYONS, Patrick Joseph, B.A., M.Litt. (Dubl.)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Irish & Celtic Studies	Part-time Lecturer	DOHERTY, Jim, B.A. (Belf.), M.Phil. (Dubl.)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Irish & Celtic Studies	Part-time Lecturer	NI FHRIGHIL, Riona, B.A., Ph.D. (N.U.I.)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Mathematics	Research Fellow	KOVACS, Stefano, B.A., Ph.D. (Rome)	01-09-2006	31-08-2008
Medical Gerontology	Clinical Research Nurse	DILLON, Sheila, M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01-12-2006	30-11-2007
Medicine	Clinical Skills Tutor	MORRIS, Marie, RGN, Dip. in Professional Practice (Luton), B.Sc. (Hatfield)	13-11-2006	12-11-2009
Medicine	Clinical Skills Tutor	MARTIN, Clare, RGN, BSN, Dip in Nursing Studies (Belf.), B.Sc. (Dubl.)	13-11-2006	12-11-2009
Nursing & Midwifery	Lecturer	DONNELLAN, Claire, RGN, B.Sc. (Lond.), Dip. Statistics (Dubl.),	01-01-2007	31-12-2007
Nursing & Midwifery	Lecturer	KELLY, Jacinta, M.Sc. (N.U.I.), H.Dip. (Waterford I.T.), Cert. in General Nursing (Cork Regional Hospital)	09-10-2006	08-10-2007
Nursing & Midwifery	Lecturer	SHEERIN, Fintan, BSN, RGN, Pg.Dip.Ed., Ph.D. (Ulster.)	13-11-2006	Permanent
Social Work & Social Policy	Research Fellow	O' DWYER, Ciara, B.A., M.Sc. (Dubl.)	16-11-2006	15-11-2009
TCIN/ Genetics	Research Fellow	ORSO, Genny, B.Sc., Ph.D. (Padova)	01-12-2006	30-11-2008
TCIN/ Genetics	Research Associate	KIM, Susy, B.Sc. (College of William and Mary)	19-10-2006	15-02-2007

## Appendix 2 to Minute BD/06-07/099

**Nominations for Appointment (See Actum CL/06-07/058 of 6 December 2006)****Research Fellows converted to Contracts of Indefinite Duration in compliance with the Protection of Employees (Fixed-Term Work) Act, 2003**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Post</b>	<b>Name and Qualifications</b>	<b>Start date</b>	<b>Termination date (if contract)</b>
Biochemistry & Immunology	Research Fellow	KEATING, Sinead, B.Sc. (N.U.I.), Ph.D. (Wales)	01-12-2006	Indefinite duration
Biochemistry & Immunology	Research Fellow	CARTY, Michael, B.Sc., Ph.D. (Belf.),	01-12-2006	Indefinite duration
Histopathology and Morbid Anatomy	Research Fellow	GALLAGHER, Michael, B.Sc., Ph.D. (N.U.I.)	01-01-2007	Indefinite duration
Physics	Research Fellow (Part- time)	CHANDOLA, Sandhya, B.Sc. (Delhi.), M.Sc., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-01-2007	Indefinite duration

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

## Appendix 3 to Minute BD/06-07/124

**Nominations for Appointment**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Post</b>	<b>Name and Qualifications</b>	<b>Start date</b>	<b>Termination date (if contract)</b>
Histories & Humanities	Part-time Extramural Administrator	DUNGAN, Leonora,	08-09-2006	Indefinite duration
Information Systems Services	MIS Programmer	KIELY, Kevin, B.E., M.Sc. (N.U.I.)	01-12-2006	Permanent
Physics	NANOMAG Project Manager	MC EVOY, Ciaran, B.Sc., M.Sc. (N.U.I.), M.Sc. (Dubl.)	01-10-2006	30-03-2007
Social Work & Social Policy	Job Placement / Career Consultant	CLEARY, Michelle, B.Sc., H.Dip. (N.U.I.)	20-11-2006	19-11-2007
Staff Office	Administrative Officer	MAXWELL, Gillian, Dip. in International Business and French (HETAC)	29-01-2007	28-01-2008
Staff Office	Pensions Administrator	KEOGH, Anita, B.A. (NCEA), Dip in Marketing, Advertising and P.R. (Institute of Commercial Management), Grad. (C.I.P.D)	01-11-2006	Permanent
Trinity Access Programme	Administrative Officer	KELLY, Helen, B.A. (N.Lond.), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	06-11-2006	01-08-2007

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*