

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 11 June 2003

- Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr J B Grimson), Bursar (Dr J W O'Hagan), Senior Lecturer (Dr S M Greene), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr B Connolly, Dr S Duffy, Dr J A Fitzpatrick, Dr H Gibbons, Dr J G Lunney, Dr J M Mossman, Mr I Moynihan, Dr A N M Ní Chasaide, Mrs J O'Hara, Mr W Priestley, Mr D Scammell, Dr F Shevlin, Dr T West.
- Apologies* Registrar (Mr R A Stalley), Dr L E Doyle, Ms A-M Gatling, Dr C Horn, Mr H Kearns, Ms M Leahy, Dr J C Sexton, Ms E K Stokes, Dr D L Weaire.
- In attendance*
- (ex officio)* Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.
- (by invitation)* Ms Sheila O'Donnell and Mr John Tuomey of O'Donnell & Tuomey Architects and the Director of Buildings attended for Minute 15/313.

The Chairman of the Adelaide and Meath Hospital, Dublin Incorporating the National Children's Hospital, Mr Alan Gillis, welcomed the Board of the College to the Hospital and expressed the hope that the meeting would be the first of such meetings. The Provost thanked the Chairman and the Chief Executive Officer, Mr Michael Lyons, for their invitation and stressed the importance of establishing strong links between the College and its affiliated hospitals.

15/309 Minutes The Minutes of the meeting held on 4 June 2003 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

14/296 - 2003/76 Non-EU Medical Fee The text of the minute was replaced with the following: 'In response to queries from a number of Board members, the Treasurer advised Board that consideration would be given by the Faculty to support mechanisms which might be required in the future by non-EU students and that the funding accruing from non-EU fees would be used as leverage to seek additional funding for the Faculty.'

15/310 Matters Arising from the Minutes A matter arising from the Minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see Minute 15/311).

15/311 Trinity Ball 2002 (see Minute 14/293 of 4 June 2003) In response to a query, the Secretary advised the Board that investigation into the theft at the Trinity Ball in 2002 had been completed by the Gardai and the College with no indication as to who had been responsible. The Board noted that insurance settlements had been made in respect of the theft and the financial loss to the College was minimal. It was also noted that additional security measures had been put in place for future events.

15/312 Financial Review Advisory Group Final Report The Bursar invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Provost dated 4 June 2003 and accompanying final report from the Financial Review Advisory Group which had been circulated. The Bursar, introducing the report, advised Board that the financial situation in 2003/2004 is likely to be worse than it is in 2002/2003 and that the College must plan accordingly.

The Bursar invited Board's attention to the report's recommendations in relation to:

- (a) *The maintenance of the pay targets previously set for 2004;*
- (b) *Non-pay savings targets for 2004*, noting the importance of achieving a pay:non-pay ratio of 70:30 as soon as possible and not later than 2006/2007. The Board noted the specific proposals in relation to non-pay savings for 2004, noting that of the proposed total of €4m, €3.25m had been identified. The Bursar invited the Board's attention to the conditions under which the recommendations might be adopted as specified in the memorandum from the Provost, namely:
 - (i) The Research Committee budget will be reduced, as proposed, as an interim measure while it reviews how College can best stimulate and support good research in the light of a still buoyant national research funding environment;
 - (ii) Postgraduate Student Awards, including the element of teaching, should, insofar as possible, be allocated strategically according to the priorities set out in the Strategic Plan;
 - (iii) The Conference Travel Grant should continue to operate with the minimum of bureaucracy and the Research Committee should be charged with reviewing the operation of the scheme and bringing forward recommendations.
- (c) *Proposals for income generation under four broad areas:*
 - (i) *Property Portfolio:* The Board noted that a report would be presented within a few months;
 - (ii) *Non-EU fees:* The range of courses being offered and the availability of accommodation were noted as important factors in attracting international students. The Board also noted the recommendation that the International Office build on work already undertaken and develop a business plan as soon as possible;
 - (iii) *Self-financing activities:* The Board noted the recommendation to impose a ten per cent fee on all self-financing departmental accounts except those that fall within defined categories of exemption;
 - (iv) *Parking and tourism:* The Board also noted the recommendation that no charge be introduced for car parking at this time and that the maximum possible income be obtained from tourism activities so long as the quality of the experience for visitors justifies the cost.
- (d) *Allocating Resources:* A report will be prepared by the Executive Officers' Group on the criteria for use in determining the distribution of funds which will build on the Strategic Plan and will be presented to Board at the end of 2003.
- (e) *Allocating Resources: Structures, Management and Systems:* The Board noting the recommendation that a specialist group be established by Executive Officers and Board to commence work by October 2003 at the latest, also noted the proposal to allocate €60,000 to this group to enable it to secure the expert advice it will require to address the issues raised.

The Board noted Mr Gibbons's comments in relation to entitlements of staff to Conference Travel support, further noting that, as specified in the first report of the Financial Review Advisory Group, proposals affecting individual staff members will require negotiation and agreement before changes can be implemented.

In discussing the proposals the following points were made by Board members:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (a) care has to be taken to ensure that students will not be unduly penalised by the imposition of additional charges for services;
- (b) Postgraduate Student Awards should be equitably distributed across disciplines and not be focussed solely on areas which currently receive external research funding. The Board agreed that such studentships should not be narrowly used to shore up a deficit in teaching but should be awarded in such a way that postgraduate students will be supported in their studies;
- (c) funding should be available to areas which are not in receipt of external research funds in order to promote and nurture excellence;
- (d) the principle of equal pain should be reconsidered when the criteria for resource allocation are being developed so that the College's core activities are supported to the maximum extent possible.

The Provost advised Board that the Unit Cost Management Working Party is currently preparing a report on the implications of the proposed pay cuts; this will be presented to the next Board meeting and that a proposal for the composition of the specialist group to review resource allocation would be presented to Board in due course.

Due to the pressure of time, the Board was unable to complete its discussion of the Financial Review Advisory Group's report and deferred a decision on its adoption until the next meeting. The Board, agreeing in principle with the proposed targets in non-pay costs, agreed that they could be communicated to the managers of the relevant areas to allow them begin planning for their implementation in the next academic year.

15/313 Capital Projects – Pearse Street

Ms Sheila O'Donnell and Mr John Tuomey of O'Donnell & Tuomey Architects and the Director of Buildings, present by invitation, attended for this item.

The Bursar, introducing the topic, invited Board's attention to his memorandum, dated 6 June 2003, which had been circulated, outlining the background to, and the timing of, Board discussions on the Pearse Street capital project. The Bursar advised Board that the implementation of a significant part of the Pearse Street capital project, which won the architectural competition held during 2002, is now being considered because of the possible availability of funding from a private donor for that part of the development. The Bursar advised Board that the purpose of the presentation and discussion at the meeting was to fully introduce the scheme. It was proposed that, at the Board meeting on 9 July 2003, a decision would be made as to whether the College should seek outline planning permission for the concept of the overall scheme and full planning permission for one element of the scheme to which a degree of urgency is attached.

Ms O'Donnell and Mr Tuomey, the winning Architects of the Pearse Street Development design competition, invited the Board's attention to the background and strategy of their competition entry. The Board noted that the current proposed elements of the development could be created in incremental stages providing residential accommodation adjacent to the Luce Hall and all of the new facilities on the western half of the site. The architects invited Board's attention to the linkages which the development created between the College and the surrounding areas and streets, including substantial refurbishment of the frontage of College properties on Pearse Street. The architects advised Board that implementation of the design in full would require the demolition of a number of properties on Pearse Street and within the campus. The Board also noted how the architects' plans were intended to enhance linkage between the east and west ends of the campus.

The Director of Buildings advised Board that the implementation of this proposal would involve the use of Section 50 and Section 843 tax arrangements, noting that in order to avail of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

the Section 50 arrangements the planning application for the residential accommodation must be submitted before the end of September 2003. The Board also noted that, while the density of the development would double that pertaining at present, the overall footprint is almost the same.

In the long and detailed discussion which followed, the architects and the Director of Buildings clarified a range of issues raised by Board members including the impact of the proposed development on student residences and on the proposed Student Centre in Luce Hall, the status of protected structures in the development, the issue of demolitions on which some Board members expressed reservations, the flow of traffic through the College campus and the implications for College security.

The Bursar advised Board that discussions had taken place with all departments and service areas whose accommodation might be affected by the proposed development. In response to a number of queries, the Director of Buildings advised Board that preliminary discussions had taken place with representatives of the Dublin City Council on the feasibility of the scheme and that discussions had taken place with the local community and will take place with other interested parties in due course.

The Provost thanked the architects who then withdrew from the meeting.

The Provost advised Board that much of the funding for the development of Phase 1 would come from a private donor and involve the creation of facilities for a Construction Industry Innovation Centre which would be developed in collaboration with the School of Engineering. The Board noted that, should a decision be made to apply eventually for full planning permission, the details of the proposal, including funding arrangements, would be elaborated by the Pearse Street Development Planning Committee over the coming months, further noting that the membership of this committee had been extended to ensure full participation of all interested parties.

The Board, noting that the Pearse Street development is an initiative identified specifically in the Strategic Plan, agreed that the matter would be considered in detail at the Board meeting on 9 July, where all issues associated with the proposal would be discussed.

- 15/314 Annual Officers 2003-2004** The Board noted, for approval at its next meeting, the nominations for the Annual Officers for the academic year 2003-2004 as presented by the Provost.
- 15/315 Distinction – Fellow of the Royal Society** Under Other Business the Board offered its congratulations to Professor J M D Coey on being admitted as a Fellow of the Royal Society.
- 15/316 Nomination for Appointment – Warden of Trinity Hall – Carmel O’Sullivan B.Ed. (N.U.I.), M.A. (C.England), P.G.Dip. (C.England), A.L.C.M.** Under Other Business the Board approved the appointment of Ms Carmel O’Sullivan to the Wardenship of Trinity Hall for three years from 13 July 2003, at the standard rate.
- 15/317 Disciplinary Matter** Under Other Business the Board noted the position in regard to the case before the Courts concerning a disciplinary matter.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

15/318 Future Board Meetings Under Other Business the Board noted that there will be an additional Board meeting on 2 July and that the meeting scheduled for 9 July will commence at 9.30am.

15/319 Personnel and Appointments Committee The Board approved the recommendations of the Personnel and Appointments Committee from its meeting of 3 June 2003, as circulated dated 4 June 2003.

15/320 Sealings The Board noted:

- (a) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street - Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 8 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Allegro technologies Ltd. [28/5/03]
- (b) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street - Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a surrender of Lease of Unit 17 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre by Virtual Access (Ireland) Ltd. [28/5/03]
- (c) **Enterprise Centre, Pearse Street - Lease** The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a lease of Unit 18 in the Trinity College Enterprise Centre to Virtual Access (Ireland) Ltd. [28/5/03]

15/321 Prizes and other Awards – Calendar Entries The Board noted and approved memoranda from the Treasurer, dated 28 May 2003 as follows:

- (a) Harry Hartford Prize;
- (b) Merrill Lynch Prize.

15/322 Higher Degrees

- (a) The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 3 June 2003;
- (b) The Board noted a correction in a name in the list of higher degrees approved by the sub-committee on 1 April 2003 and presented to Board on 16 April 2003: 'John O'Cadhla' to read 'John Anthony Mary O Cadhla'.

In response to a query the Secretary clarified the role of internal and external supervisors for postgraduate theses.

15/323 Headship of Department The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (a) **Physics** Professor D L Weaire – 13 July 2003 to 12 July 2006;
- (b) **Zoology** Dr C V Holland – 1 September 2003 to 31 August 2006.

15/324 Representation – Irish Committee for Specialist Training in Dentistry The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor J Clarkson and Professor B O'Connell as two representatives and Dr D MacCarthy as one alternative to take up office in September 2003 for a three year period.

15/325 Staff Matters – Early Retirements The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Staff Secretary, circulated dated 4 June 2003, as follows:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Dr J S Ridley (Centre for Language and Communication Studies) – 30 September 2003
 Dr R F Cox (French) – 30 September 2003
 Ms J Layng (Geology) - 30 June 2003.

15/326 Nominations for Appointment The Board approved nominations for appointment, as circulated (see Appendix 1 to these Minutes).

15/327 Nominating Committees The Board noted and approved the following:

- (a) **Graduate Studies Office – Administrative Officer Grade 1 (permanent post)**
 Dean of Graduate Studies
 Professor J N Parnell
 Academic Secretary
 Mr T Duff (Academic Registrar, DIT)
- (b) **Library – Assistant Librarian (Early Printed Books) permanent post)**
 Librarian
 Dr C Benson
 Dr N McLelland
 Ms S O'Rafferty (Royal Irish Academy)
- (c) **Library – Assistant Librarian (Medical Library) (part-time, three-year contract post)**
 Librarian
 Ms A Healy
 Mr T Peare
 Dr N P Kennedy
 Mr P Murphy (Deputy Librarian, RCSI)

Under Other Business:

- (d) **Broad Curriculum Lectureship in Globalisation, in Geography and Sociology (5 year contract)**
 Dean of Science
 Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies
 Professor D Taylor
 Professor R Holton
 Dr A Davies
 Ms H Tovey
- (e) **Non-Clinical Lectureship in Histopathology (permanent post)**
 Dean of Health Sciences
 Professor J J O'Leary
 Dr M Griffin
 Professor G J Atkins
 Dr R Landers (Waterford Regional Hospital)
- (f) **Lectureship in Social Policy and Ageing (3 year contract)**
 Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies
 Professor R H Gilligan
 Dr T E O'Sullivan
 Ms R V Torode
 Professor G F Whyte
 Dr A Good (National Disability Authority)

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (g) **Lecturer in Neuroscience (5 year contract)**
Dean of Science
Dr T Connor
Professor MA Lynch
Dr M C Henman
Dr S M O'Mara
Dr C V Holland
Professor K F Tipton

- (h) **Lecturer – School of Irish and Celtic Languages (permanent post)**
Dean of Arts (Letters)
Professor C G Ó Háinle
Professor P D J McManus
Dr M K Simms
Professor R Ó hUiginn (NUI Maynooth)

- (i) **Lecturer in German Linguistics (1 year contract)**
Dean of Arts (Letters)
Dr H H W Robinson-Hammerstein
Professor N M McGowan
Dr T R Jackson
Dr G S Martin

- (j) **Lecturer in Continental Philosophy (1 year contract)**
Dean of Arts (Humanities)
Dr J Levine
Dr L S Alweiss
Dr J E Nash
Dr F O'Murchadha (NUI Galway)

- (k) **Broad Curriculum Lecturer, English Department (5 year contract)**
Dean of Arts (Letters)
Professor N Grene
Dr R Lentin
Dr S J Matterson
Professor J C C Mays (NUI Dublin)

- (l) **Manager of the Centre for Learning Technology (2 year contract, Administrative Grade 1)**
Senior Lecturer
Academic Secretary
Director of I S Services
Mr V P Wade

Consideration of Agenda items B.1 (Finance Committee) and B.2 (Site and Facilities Committee) was deferred to the next meeting.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Appendix 1 to Minute 15/326

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	State Date	Termination Date (if contract)
Computer Science	Grid Manager, Ireland	WALSH, John, BA (Dubl), MSc (Dubl.),	01.06.2003	31.12.2006
Irish Art Research Centre	Director	SCOTT, Yvonne, BA (Dubl.), MA (NUI), MA Qualifier (NUI), PhD (Dubl.), Dip. History of European Painting (Dubl.).	01.10.2003	30.09.2006
Quality Office	Administrative Officer	DONNELLAN, Elizabeth, BSc (NUI), PhD (NUI)	05.08.2003	Indefinite Duration